Traversing the Spiritual Path
Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s
Presentation of the Grounds and Paths
with Dan-ma-lo-chö’s
Oral Commentary

Elizabeth Napper

Edited by Jeffrey Hopkins

UMA INSTITUTE
FOR TIBETAN STUDIES
Traversing the Spiritual Path

Website for UMA Institute for Tibetan Studies (Union of the Modern and the Ancient: gsar rnying zung `jug khang): uma-tibet.org. UMA stands for "Union of the Modern and the Ancient" and means "Middle Way" in Tibetan. UMA is a non-profit 501(c)3 organization.
Traversing the Spiritual Path

Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s
Presentation of Grounds and Paths
Beautiful Ornament of the Three Vehicles

with
Dan-ma-lo-chö’s
Oral Commentary

Elizabeth Napper

Edited by Jeffrey Hopkins

UMA Institute for Tibetan Studies
uma-tibet.org
Translating texts from the heritage of Tibetan and Inner Asian Buddhist system, the project focuses on Great Indian Books and Tibetan commentaries from the Go-mang College syllabus as well as a related theme on the fundamental innate mind of clear light in Tantric traditions. A feature of the Project is the usage of consistent vocabulary and format throughout the translations.

Publications available online without cost under a Creative Commons License with the understanding that downloaded material must be distributed for free: http://uma-tibet.org. UMA stands for Union of the Modern and the Ancient (gsar rnying zung 'jug khang). The UMA Institute for Tibetan Studies is a non-profit 501(c)3 organization.

UMA Institute for Tibetan Studies
7330 Harris Mountain Lane
Dyke, VA 22935-1008
USA

Version: January, 2016

ISBN

Library of Congress Control Number:
I. Napper, Elizabeth, 1949-.
II. Traversing the spiritual path: kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s presentation of grounds and paths: beautiful ornament of the three vehicles with dan-ma-lo-chö’s oral commentary.
Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN
I. Lo-sang-gyal-tshan, 1966- II. Title.
## Contents

- **Introduction** 13
- **Technical Notes** 27

**Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s Presentation of the Grounds and Paths** 29

1. Beings of the Three Capacities 31
2. General Indication of Grounds and Paths 51
3. Hearer Paths 111
4. Solitary Victor Paths 163
5. Great Vehicle Paths 181
6. Bodhisattva Grounds 245

**Appendix 1: Eight Forbearances and Eight Knowledges** 297

**Appendix 2: Lo-sel-ling College on the Modes of Progress on the Hearer Path of Meditation** 303

**Abbreviations** 311

**Bibliography of Works Cited** 313
Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po's *Presentation of the Grounds and Paths* 29

1. Beings of the Three Capacities 31

2. General Indication of Grounds and Paths 51
   I. General indication of a presentation of grounds and paths 51
      [A. Grounds] 51
         1. Definition 51
         2. Usages of the term “grounds” 53
            a. Three grounds of Hearers, Solitary Victors, and Bodhisattvas 54
            [b. Three yogic grounds] 55
            c. Six grounds of concentration 57
            d. Nine uncontaminated grounds 60
            e. Three realms and nine levels 63
            g. Eight lesser grounds 65
      [3. Grounds within the set of “grounds and paths”] 65
         [a. Definition] 65
         [b. Divisions of grounds within the set of grounds and paths 67
            1) Hearer, Solitary Victor, and Bodhisattva grounds] 67
            2) Grounds of the Lesser Vehicle and the Great Vehicle 68
               A) Grounds of the Lesser Vehicle: eight lesser grounds 69
                  1' Ground of seeing the wholesome 71
                  2' Ground of lineage 73
                  3' Ground of the eighth 76
                  4' Ground of seeing 80
                  5' Ground of diminishment 83
                  6' Ground of separation from desire 85
                  7' Ground of realizing completion 88
                  8' Ground of a Solitary Victor 89
               [Uncommon assertions of the Yogic Middle Way Autonomists] 91
               B) Grounds of the Great Vehicle 94
                  1' Ground of seeing certain qualities 96
                  2’ Ground of lineage 97
                  3' Ground of the eighth 99
                  4' Ground of seeing 102
                  5' Ground of diminishing 105
                  6' Ground of separation from desire 109
                  7' Ground of realizing completion 112
                  8' Ground of a Solitary Victor 114
      [Uncommon assertions of the Yogic Middle Way Autonomists] 91
   B) Grounds of the Great Vehicle 94
      1. Definition 94
      2. Synonymous equivalents 95
3. Divisions
   a. Paths of accumulation
   b. Paths of preparation
   c. Paths of seeing
   d. Paths of meditation
   e. Paths of no-more-learning

3. Hearer Paths

II. Explaining in detail a presentation of the grounds and paths of the three vehicles

   A. Explanation of Hearer paths
   1. Hearer paths of accumulation
      a. Definition
      b. Divisions
      c. Synonyms
      d. Explaining the mode of generation
   2. Hearer paths of preparation
      a. Definition
      b. Divisions
      c. Synonyms
      d. Mode of generation
   3. Hearer paths of seeing
      a. Definition
      b. Divisions
      [1). Hearer paths of seeing that are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise]
      [A) Hearer paths of seeing that are uninterrupted paths]
      [B) Hearer paths of seeing that are paths of release]
      [C) Hearer paths of seeing that are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise that are neither uninterrupted paths nor paths of release]
      d. Explaining the mode of generation
   4. Hearer paths of meditation
      a. Definition
      b. Divisions
      c. Synonyms
4. Solitary Victor Paths 163
   B. Explanation of Solitary Victor paths 163
      1. Definition 163
      2. Divisions 164
      3. Synonyms 164
      4. Meanings of the individual divisions 165
         a. Explaining Solitary Victor paths of accumulation 165
            1) Definition 165
            2) Divisions 166
            3) Synonyms 166
            4) Mode of generation 166
         b. Explaining Solitary Victor paths of preparation 167
            1) Definition 167
            2) Divisions 167
            3) Synonyms 168
            4) Mode of generation 168
         c. Explaining Solitary Victor paths of seeing 169
            1) Definition 169
            2) Divisions 171
            3) Synonyms 172
            4) Mode of generation 172
         d. Explaining Solitary Victor paths of meditation 175
            1) Definition 175
            2) Divisions 176
            3) Synonyms 177
         e. Explaining Solitary Victor paths of no-more-learning 177

5. Great Vehicle Paths 181
   C. Explanation of Great Vehicle paths 181
      1. General indication of the five paths 181
         a. Definition 181
         b. Divisions 183
         c. Synonyms 184
         d. Etymologies 184
         e. Explaining the meanings of the individual divisions 188
            1) Explaining the paths of common beings 189
A) Bodhisattva paths of accumulation 189
   1' Definition 190
   2' Divisions 190
   3' Synonyms 190
   4' Mode of generation 191
B) Great Vehicle paths of preparation 192
   1' Definition 192
   2' Divisions 192
   3' Synonyms 193
   4' Mode of generation 193
C) Great Vehicle paths of seeing 205
   1' Definition 205
   2' Divisions 206
   3' Synonyms 218
   4' Explaining the mode of generation 219
D) Great Vehicle paths of meditation 222
   1' Definition 222
   2' Divisions 222
   3' Synonyms 227
   4' Explaining the mode of generation 228
E) Great Vehicle paths of no-more-learning 233
   1' Definition 234
   2' Divisions 234
   3' Synonyms 236
   4' Explaining the mode of generation 236

[Objects of meditation and abandonment] 239

6. Bodhisattva Grounds 245
   2. Explaining in detail a presentation of the ten grounds 245
      a. Definition [of a ground of a Bodhisattva Superior] 246
      b. Divisions of grounds of Bodhisattva Superiors 249
      c. The meaning of the individual divisions 251
         1) Contextual etymologies 251
            A) Contextual etymology of ground in general 251
            B) Contextual etymologies of the individual grounds 252
         2) Mode of abandoning the objects of abandonment 267
         3) Features of surpassing qualities 276
            A) The feature of a surpassing perfection 277
            B) The feature of an increase in the number of qualities 278
            C) The feature of the mode of taking fruitional rebirth 281
            D) The feature of an enhancement of the three trainings
together with their fruits 282
E) The feature of the mode of inducing an ascertaining consciousness in states of subsequent attainment 283
F) The feature of thorough purifiers 287
G) Signs of attaining the grounds 288

Appendix 1: Eight Forbearances and Eight Knowledges 297
Appendix 2: Lo-sel-ling College on the Modes of Progress on the Hearer Path of Meditation 303
Abbreviations 311
Bibliography of Works Cited 313
1. Sūtras 313
2. Other Sanskrit and Tibetan Works 314
3. Other Works 319
Introduction

This book offers a translation and explanation of a Tibetan text that lays out the basic structure of the types and levels of Buddhist practice, the Presentation of the Grounds and Paths, Beautiful Ornament of the Three Vehicles, written by Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po, a 1728-1791. Hence, was recognized as the Second Jam-yang-shay-pa, or to put it another way, as the first reincarnation of Jam-yang-shay-pa, b the great Ge-lug polymath whose texts came to form the basis of the textbook literature of the Go-mang Monastic College of Dre-pung Monastic University.

Jam-yang-shay-pa had, in the latter part of his life, returned from central Tibet to his birthplace, Am-do Province, and founded there a new institution called Tra-shi-khyil (bkra shis ‘khyil), generally referred to as Labrang Tra-shi-khyil (bla brang bkra shis ’khyil) and often called just “Labrang.” Kön-chog-jig-may-wang po, born in Am-do and recognized as Jam-yang-shay-pa’s reincarnation, became the abbot of that institution and significantly expanded it. c He was a student of the great Mongolian scholar Jang-kya Röl-pay-dor-je (lcang rkya rol pa’i rdo rje); he travelled twice to China and also twice to central Tibet, where on his first visit, from 1752-1759, he studied for seven years at Go-mang College. He too was a prolific author, and his collected writings of seventy-eight works fill eleven volumes.

Jam-yang-shay-pa is renowned for the detailed complexity of the works he authored. His writings form the core of the textbooks (yig cha) at Go-mang and, among the sets of such textbooks in use at the different monastic colleges, are renowned as the most difficult. Kön-chog-jig-may-wang po, in contrast, is particularly known for his shorter summaries of core topics, which draw out the key material in a concise form that makes them ideal introductory texts, often studied before undertaking study of Jam-yang-shay-pa’s tomes.

The curriculum. The curriculum for Ge-lug philosophical studies is based on the Five Great Books (po ti linga), which shape the syllabus still followed in the main Ge-lug monastic universities as well as the nunneries that have taken up that same course of study. Lasting for up to twenty-five

---

a dkon mchog ’jigs med dbang po.
b ’jam dbyangs bzhad pa, 1648-1721.
c See Geshe Lhundup Sopa and Jeffrey Hopkins, Cutting through Appearances: Practice and Theory of Tibetan Buddhism (Ithaca, N.Y.: Snow Lion Publications, 1989), 130-134, for a more detailed biography. See also http://www.treasuryoflives.org for a short biography that gives a sense of his vast activities.
years, nowadays seventeen years are required before a candidate is al-
lowed to take the examinations to receive the highest degree, that of Ge-
she (dge bshes). The five texts are:

1) Dharmakīrti’s Commentary on (Dignāga’s) “Compilation of Prime
Cognition” (thad ma rnam ’grel, pramāṇavarttika)
2) Maitreya’s Ornament for the Clear Realizations (mngon rtogs rgyan,
abhisamayālamkāra)
3) Chandrakīrti’s Supplement to (Nāgārjuna’s) “Treatise on the Middle”
(dbu ma la ’jug pa, madhyamakāvatāra)
4) Vasubandhu’s Treasury of Manifest Knowledge (chos mngon pa’i
mdzod, abhidharmakośa)
5) Guṇaprabha’s Aphorisms on Discipline (’dul ba’i mdo, vinayasūtra)
along with its Autocommentary.

The exact number of years of study of each text, and some details of the
order of study can vary between monasteries; however, in all of them,
Dharmakīrti’s treatise on logic and epistemology provides the foun-
dation for the mode of study, which is based on logical reasoning and formal phil-
osophical debate.

The first topic studied is “Collected Topics” (bsdus grva), in which
students learn the layout of the Buddhist philosophical world—the major
ways that phenomena are categorized—while they are learning how to de-
bate. This is followed at Go-mang by study of “Signs and Reasonings”
(rtags rigs), the formal study of the vocabulary, principles, and details of
debate, and then by “Awareness and Knowledge” (blo rig), a presentation
of the different types of consciousnesses. At some monasteries, “Aware-
ness and Knowledge” is studied first, followed by “Signs and Reasoning.”
In all monasteries, study of Dharmakīrti’s actual text begins during these
early years; how those studies continue over the entire course of studies
varies somewhat among them. However, in all, the basic syllabus of “Col-
lected Topics,” “Awareness and Knowledge,” and “Signs and Reasoning”
is taken as the preliminary stage of study, in which students are introduced
to the core principles and vocabulary of their tradition. It is the preparation
that gives students the intellectual tools to undertake the profound topics
that are studied next and generally takes three to four years (at Go-mang
it is now three).

a For a fuller discussion of the course of study in Ge-lug monastic universities see Jeffrey
Hopkins’ introduction in Jeffrey Hopkins and Jongbok Yi, The Hidden Teaching of the
Perfection of Wisdom Sūtras: Jam-yang-shay-pa’s Seventy Topics and Kön-chog-jig-may-
The next major topic of study is called “Perfection of Wisdom” (phar phyin) and takes six to seven years to complete. The Great Book on which these studies are based is Maitreya’s *Ornament for the Clear Realizations*, a long, complex, and difficult verse text which students must memorize in its entirety (274 stanzas) during the time they are studying *Signs and Reasoning* (and that memorization is retested during each of the following years of Perfection of Wisdom study). It is considered to set forth the hidden meaning of the *Perfection of Wisdom Sūtras*, which is the structure of the Buddhist paths of spiritual practice.

After that come three years of study of “Madhyamaka” (dbu ma), based on Chandrakīrti’s *Supplement to (Nāgārjuna’s) “Treatise on the Middle.”* This is followed by two years study of “Abhidharma” (mdzod), based on Vasubandhu’s *Treasury of Manifest Knowledge*, and then the final two years focus on the study of monastic disciple, Vinaya (’dul ba), based on Gunaprabha’s *Aphorisms on Discipline*.

The study of these texts in the Ge-lug tradition is founded on commentaries by the founder of that tradition, Tsong-kha-pa (tsong kha pa blo bzang grags pa, 1357-1419), and by his two chief disciples, Gyal-tshab (rgyal tshab dar ma rin chen, 1364-1432) and Khay-drub (mkhas grub dge legs dpal bzang, 1385-1438). What serve as the basis for day-to-day studies are textbooks written by key figures within the various monastic colleges.

The text translated here, written by the reincarnation of the primary textbook author of the Go-mang College of Dre-pung Monastic University, is included within the “Perfection of Wisdom” studies centered around Maitreya’s *Ornament for the Clear Realizations*. Because “Perfection of Wisdom” is a huge and complicated topic and because Maitreya’s text is often cryptic, students at Go-mang are introduced to it in the first year of “Perfection of Wisdom” studies by way of three summary texts, opening a doorway to the topic and being referenced throughout the remaining years of its study. The first is a text by Jam-yang-shay-pa called *Eloquent Presentation of the Eight Categories and Seventy Topics: Sacred Word of Guru Ajita*; specifically linked to Maitreya’s text, it provides def-
initions, divisions, and boundaries for the eight categories and seventy topics that are the outline and focus of that work.

The other two summary texts are by Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po. His Presentation of the Grounds and Paths, which is translated here along with explanation by the late Dan-ma-lo-chŏ of Lo-sel-ling Monastic College of Dre-pung and further explication by Ge-she Lo-sang-gyal-tshan of Go-mang College, lays out key elements of the actual structure of the paths of practice, giving definitions of the paths of the different types of practitioners, etymologies of core vocabulary, and so forth. It provides access to knowledge of the progression of the paths—what has and what has not been attained at various levels—and thus is crucial at all levels of Perfection of Wisdom studies.

The third text studied is Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s Precious Garland of Tenets, a which gives a clear and succinct presentation of the basic tenets of the major schools of Buddhist philosophy. The Five Great Books are written from the viewpoint of different schools of Buddhist tenets, with consequent variations in principles of philosophy, practice, and expected results. Hence, understanding of the various tenet systems is essential to understanding the viewpoints of those texts as well as the different types of practitioners and the main focus of their practice. Thus the topic of philosophical tenets too is a necessary prerequisite for a full comprehension of Maitreya’s text.

The core texts at Go-mang for the study of tenets are two books by Jam-yang-shay-pa, his Root Verses on Tenets and his Great Presentation of Tenets. b The former is a long verse presentation and the latter an even longer text mostly in expository format. Before study of those texts is undertaken, students are introduced to the topic through study of Kön-chog-jig-may-wang po’s concise text on tenets. The fame and value of this text is such that it is well known and often consulted throughout the Ge-lug tradition, its range extending far beyond the Go-mang monastic College where it is a textbook.

Two other short texts by Kön-chog-jig-may-wang po are also often relied on during the study of the Perfection of Wisdom. One is the Thorough Expression of the Natures of the One Hundred Seventy-Three Aspects

---


b grub mtha’ rtsa ba and grub mtha’ chen mo. Jeffrey Hopkins’ English translation of the former and portions of the latter can be found in Maps of the Profound: Jam-yang-shay-ba’s Great Exposition of Buddhist and Non-Buddhist Views on the Nature of Reality (Ithaca, N.Y.: Snow Lion Publications, 2003).
of the Three Exalted Knowers: White Lotus Vine of Eloquence.\(^a\) It elaborates on an important topic in Maitreya’s text that Jam-yang-shay-pa had not explicated in as much detail. The other text by Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po used during the Perfection of Wisdom studies is a short explication of the concentrations and formless absorptions called the \textit{Excellent Vase of Good Explanation, A Presentation of the Concentrations and Absorptions set forth as a Condensation From the Great [Explication of] the Concentrations and Absorptions}.\(^b\) As the title indicates, this is a condensed form of a long textbook on the topic by Jam-yang-shay-pa. In earlier times, when the “Concentrations and Absorptions” (\textit{bsam gzugs}) were studied in the same year as other topics, Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s short text was the main textbook used for the study of this topic. However, in recent years, an entire year has been allotted to the study of this topic, and now Jam-yang-shay-pa’s \textit{Great Exposition of the Concentrations and Formless Absorptions}\(^c\) is the main textbook used.

\textit{This book.} The text by Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po translated and elaborated upon in this book, his \textit{Presentation of the Grounds and Paths, Beautiful Ornament of the Three Vehicles}, is part of a recognized “Grounds and Paths” genre; each monastic college has its own such text, and similar material is found in other traditions as well.\(^d\) These texts extrapolate material from Maitreya’s text and other sources, which is presented in the classic textbook style of setting out definitions, divisions, etymological explanations, and so forth. The material is organized into a clear conceptual structure that breaks it into pieces that can be readily memorized and used in debate (serving as mental anchors for dealing with abstract and often confusing discussions). Students are provided with a clear overview

\(^a\) \textit{mkhyen gsum gyi rnam pa brya dang don gsum gyi rang bzhin yang dag par brjod pa legs bshad padma dkar po'i khri shing}. An English translation of it can be found in Jeffrey Hopkins and Jongbok Yi, \textit{The Hidden Teaching of the Perfection of Wisdom Sūtras: Jam-yang-shay-pa’s Seventy Topics and Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s 173 Topics}, Dyke, VA: UMA Institute for Tibetan Studies, 2014: downloadable at uma-tibet.org.

\(^b\) \textit{bsam gzugs chen mo las ndor bs dus te b kod pa bsam gzugs kyi rnam bz ha legs b shad bum bz ang}, short form: \textit{bsam gzugs legs bshad bum bzang}. An English translation by Leah Zahler can be found in \textit{Study and Practice of Meditation: Tibetan Interpretations of the Concentrations and Formless Absorptions} (Ithaca, N.Y.: Snow Lion Publications, 2009), 351-446.

\(^c\) \textit{bsam gzugs chen mo}.

\(^d\) See, for instance, Jamgön Kongtrul Lodrö Tayé’s \textit{Treasury of Knowledge}. English translation by Richard Barron (Chökyi Nyima) in \textit{The Treasury of Knowledge: Journey and Goal} (Ithaca, N.Y.: Snow Lion Publications, 2011). Book Nine is titled “An Analysis of the Spiritual Paths and Levels to Be Traversed,” and contains much of the same core material found in Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s text.
of the stages and levels of spiritual progress.

Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s Presentation of the Grounds and Paths is somewhat longer and more complicated than comparable texts of other Ge-lug-pa monastic colleges. Nonetheless, what has turned rise the present work into a nearly 300-page book is the rich explanation and commentary supplied by Dan-ma-lo-chö Rin-po-che, a Lha-ram-pa Ge-she from Losel-ling College of Dre-pung Monastic University. He came to the University of Virginia in 1978 to teach for one year, during which time he taught courses on “Grounds and Paths” and the “Seventy Topics.” He was also working in individual sessions with students doing work on related topics such as the “Concentrations and Formless Absorptions,” “Mind-Only,” “Śvātantrika,” “Prāsaṅgika,” and Vasubandhu’s Treasury of Manifest Knowledge. While he was teaching the course on “Grounds and Paths,” he not only gave rich commentary on Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s text, but also wove in materials from topics of other contexts, showing how they fit together and thus greatly enriched the presentation of the “Grounds and Paths.” Also, aware that he was working with students without the grounding in the Tibetan Buddhist tradition that young monks at a comparable level of study would already have, he often took the time to give detailed explanations on foundational concepts, such as the presentation of the beings of the three capacities that opens the text. There are similarly rich explanations of the selflessness of persons realized by Hearers, of the meanings of “contaminated” and “uncontaminated,” the four noble truths, the eight enterers and abiders according to the Vasubandhu’s Treasury of Manifest Knowledge, and details of overcoming afflictions related to the desire realm by means of mundane and supramundane paths.

**Beings of the three capacities.** The title of the text is A Presentation of Grounds and Paths, Beautiful Ornament of the Three Vehicles; however, Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po, begins with a brief presentation of the paths of beings of the three capacities. This is an interesting shift from three vehicles to beings of the three capacities in that Maitreya’s text is based upon the three vehicles (of Hearers, Solitary Victors, and Bodhisattvas) as is reflected in Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s title, Beautiful Ornament of the Three Vehicles. That Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po nevertheless begins by identifying and giving definitions for the “paths of beings of the three capacities” is in reference to Atisha’s Lamp for the Path to Enlightenment and to Tsong-kha-pa’s Great Exposition of the Stages of the Path, which

---


*b* lam rim chen mo. English translation by the Lamrim Chenmo Translation Committee,
serve as the basis for the practice tradition within Gélug. Although not formally studied within the curriculum of “Perfection of Wisdom” studies, the genre of “Stages of the Path” texts is widely taught within the tradition as core practice texts, and has in recent years been taught extensively by the Fourteenth Dalai Lama, who has made it a focus of his annual public teachings to the monastic and lay communities. Although not formally studied within the curriculum of “Perfection of Wisdom” studies, the genre of “Stages of the Path” texts is widely taught within the tradition as core practice texts, and has in recent years been taught extensively by the Fourteenth Dalai Lama, who has made it a focus of his annual public teachings to the monastic and lay communities. The “beings of the three capacities” form the organizational rubric of this genre and Thus of these teachings.

That Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po starts his text with an exposition of “beings of the three capacities” ties the presentation of “grounds and paths” to practice, and further, by giving his first definitions of “paths” as consciousnesses that can be caused to arise in the mental continuum after sustained periods of study and contemplation, he begins with a clear statement that the course of study is about the mental transformation of students—practitioners—who are shown that “paths” begin from the earliest stages of practice and, those, steadily built upon, continue up to the highest state of complete enlightenment. Explicitly stated in these first definitions is the fact that the higher levels of practice are built upon, and contain, the lower. This same concept is found in Maitreya’s text and in Jamyang-shay-pa’s condensation in the Seventy Topics, but the presentation is more abstract. Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s beginning serves to both link the study of “grounds and paths” to a familiar practice tradition and to show clearly the link between Atisha and Tsong-kha-pa on the one hand and Maitreya’s Ornament on the other.

The topics of the text. Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po then begins the actual “presentation of grounds and paths” by identifying the basic etymology of the term “ground” and explaining that just as the physical earth, or ground, serves as the basis for all that moves upon it, so the spiritual “grounds” serve as the basis for all the good qualities resulting from spiritual practice that are developed through practice along the way. He gives a short summary of different usages within the Buddhist tradition of the term “grounds” (often translated as “levels” or “stages,”) merely referencing topics that are explained in detail elsewhere, but amplified here by

---

*a* The more technical section dealing with emptiness, the “Great Exposition of Special Insight” is studied during the next topic, “Middle Way.”

Dan-ma-lo-chö with rich explanation. Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po focuses his explanation on the “eight lesser grounds,” the usage of “grounds” from the non-Great Vehicle tradition most relevant to the “ten Bodhisattva grounds” of the Great Vehicle.

Maitreya’s text presents three types of Buddhist practitioners—Hearers, Solitary Victors, and Bodhisattvas—each having different chief objects of meditation. The description of the differences accords with the tenets of the Middle Way Autonomy School, and so this school is the viewpoint of the “Grounds and Paths” texts as studied in the monastic curriculum. Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po mentions explicitly that the Indian texts relied on for study of the Perfection of Wisdom are written from the viewpoint of the Yogic Middle Way Autonomy School (yogācāra-svātantrika-mādhyami) when he says (91), “In this Yogic Middle Way Autonomy system…” and throughout the text he pauses at critical points to explain the specific assertions of that system and to point out differences from other tenet systems.a

Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po begins by specifying the differing objects of negation, misconceptions to be overcome, asserted by the Yogic Middle Way Autonomists: for Hearers, it is the afflictions, for Solitary Victors, the coarse obstructions to omniscience, and for followers of the Great Vehicle, the subtle obstructions to omniscience. Parallel to this are the three different aspects of emptiness that must be realized: for Hearers, it is the person’s emptiness of being a self-sufficient substantially established entity; for Solitary Victors, the emptiness, or lack, of apprehending-subject and apprehended-object being different substantial entities; and for followers of the Great Vehicle, the emptiness of true existence. Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po contrasts this with the Middle Way Consequentialist (dbu ma thal ’gyur pa) assertion that all three types of practitioners have the same primary object of abandonment and meditate on the same emptiness. Although Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po did not delineate these references to the Consequence School within the overall outline of his text, I have demarcated them as such in square brackets in the translation for greater clarity.

After concluding his discussion of grounds in the context of the Lesser Vehicle, Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po says that he will defer discussion of

---

a There is a presentation of “ground and paths” from the viewpoint of the tenets of the Consequence School written in the early twentieth century by the Mongolian scholar Lo-sang-ta-yang (blo bzang rta dbyangs, 1867-1937), a follower of Pan-chen Sö-nam-drup, textbook author of the Lo-sel-ling College of Dre-pung Monastic University. This was translated by Jules Levinson as part of his dissertation at the University of Virginia in 1994, The Metaphors of Liberation: A Study of Grounds and Paths According to the Middle Way Schools, but has not been published. It is not widely studied at Go-mang.
grounds of the Great Vehicle until later (where it forms the final portion of his text, Chapter Six of this book) and he moves to a general discussion of “paths.” He defines a path as **an exalted knower of one who has entered a path that serves as a passageway opening the opportunity for progressing to the enlightenment that is its effect**, and then lays out the five paths—of accumulation, preparation, seeing, meditation, and no-more-learning—giving definitions, divisions, and synonyms for each. He describes a progression that delineates development in level and quality of realization.

He then discusses in detail the paths of the three types of practitioners—Hearers, Solitary Victors, and followers of the Great Vehicle. The repetition found within the descriptions of the five paths of the three vehicles serves to highlight that the basic mode of procedure is the same for each type of practitioner. For all three:

The **path of accumulation** is the first of the paths accumulating the collections of merit wisdom for the sake of attaining the enlightenment that is the goal of practice of the practitioner’s vehicle, and arises at the point when non-artificial experience of a determination to achieve the respective goal of practice arises in a practitioner’s mind-stream.

The **path of preparation** begins with the attainment of a state of conjoined calm abiding and special insight realizing the emptiness of the practitioner’s vehicle.

The **path of seeing** begins with the first direct perception of emptiness, which overcomes the artificial form of the misconception that needs to be removed.

The **path of meditation** begins with the initial attainment of capacity to overcome the innate forms of ignorance.

The **path of no-more-learning** is attained when one has completely overcome what needs to be removed by one’s path and has reached the goal of one’s practice.

The process is the same for all three vehicles; what differs is what the different practitioners are seeking to overcome, which determines the emptiness that they strive to realize.

Included in the discussion of the paths of the three types of practitioners are descriptions and careful delineations of a great deal of core path structure vocabulary, particularly for the process of direct perception of emptiness that occurs on the paths of seeing and meditation. Paths of see-
Grounds and Paths

...ing, for instance, are divided into those that are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise (mnyam bzhag ye shes), those that are pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment (rjes thob ye shes), and those that are neither pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise nor pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment. Pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise in the Hearer Vehicle, for instance, are one-pointed realization of the subtle selflessness of the person. Pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment are the state upon arising from the pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise.

Pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise themselves are divided into uninterrupted paths (bar chad med lam) and paths of release (rnam grol lam), as well as pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise that are neither of those two. An uninterrupted path is the consciousness that actually overcomes the misconception of that respective level; the path of release immediately following it in the same session of meditation is the state of having been abandoned that level of obstacle. The text describes it as being like throwing out a robber and then locking the door. A meditator rises from the path of release into a pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment.

This is a basic process for all three types of practitioners, thus reinforcing the similarity of the “mechanics” of the process of realization for the three vehicles. However, since this is description of profound meditative states, interesting questions arise as to what other types of consciousnesses can be present at such moments—for instance, how continuity of motivation is maintained in the face of nonconceptual direct realization—and the monastic colleges take different positions on these topics. Gomang and Lo-sel-ling differ considerably on some points, and so the varying explanations of Dan-ma-lo-chô and Lo-sang-gyal-tshan add richness to the presentation.

The final portion of the text is the discussion of Great Vehicle grounds. In the explanation of the paths of the Three Vehicles, Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po spoke largely within the framework of Maitreya’s text, but having completed the explanation of Great Vehicle paths, in the final topic, an explanation of the grounds of Bodhisattvas, he for the most part departs from the explicit subject matter of Maitreya’s text to the text that is the third of the Great Books studied, Chandrakīrti’s Supplement to (Nāgārjuna’s) “Treatise on the Middle.” Parallel to the presentation of paths, Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po presents materials concerning grounds that are mainly definitions of the various grounds, their divisions, explanations of their poetic names, and a listing of the different types of powers and qualities achieved with each of them here based in Chandrakīrti’s text even though he does not cite scriptural sources other than a basic one from Nāgārjuna’s Precious Garland (stanza 440), “Just as eight grounds of
Hearers are described in the Hearers’ Vehicle, so are ten grounds of Bodhisattvas [described] in the Great Vehicle,” showing that just as the term “grounds” is used for the eight grounds within the Hearer Vehicle, so there are ten grounds within the Great Vehicle. Some of the information given can be found in the Sūtra on the Ten Grounds, and even though Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s explanations of the names of the grounds do not directly reference Chandrakīrti, Dan-ma-lo-chǒ when teaching the text, frequently cited related verses from Chandrakīrti’s Supplement to (Nāgārjuna’s) “Treatise on the Middle and Tsong-kha-pa’s Illumination of the Thought, which serve as the core source within the Ge-lug curriculum for the study of the topic of the Bodhisattva grounds. Also, Tsong-kha-pa in his Illumination of the Thought specifically indicates that the tenets of the Middle Way Consequence School, the subject matter of the third Great Book studied, Chandrakīrti’s Supplement, considered by the Ge-lug tradition to present the most profound and subtle understanding of emptiness, are not mutually exclusive with Maitreya’s Ornament.

Moreover, in both Āryavimuktisena’s Illumination of the Twenty-Five Thousand Stanza Perfection of Wisdom Sūtra* and Haribhadra’s Great Commentary on the “Eight Thousand Perfection of Wisdom Sūtra”: Illumination of (Maitreya’s) “Ornament for the Clear Realizations,” as a source for positing the element of attributes as the lineage of all three vehicles, they cite the statement that all persons who are Superiors are distinguished by the uncompounded [element of attributes, emptiness]. This is saying that the meaning of the statement in the Diamond Cutter, “Persons who are Superiors are distinguished by the uncompounded [element of attributes, emptiness]”—stated as a means of establishing that “The qualities of an enlightened one and all the doctrines taught by him do not exist”—is that all Superiors of the greater and lesser vehicles are posited by way of their having actualized the uncompounded ultimate which is the non-establishment of phenomena in reality. Therefore, this [Prāsaṅgika] system and

\[\text{ji ltar nyan thos thig pa la/ nyan thos sa ni brgyud bshad pa/ de bzhin thig pa chen po la/ hyang chub sems dpa'i sa bcu'ao/}.\] This stanza is cited by Tsong-kha-pa in his Illumination of the Thought as he begins discussion of Chandrakīrti’s explanation of the Bodhisattva grounds. See Tsong-kha-pa, Ken-sur Nga-wang-lek-den, and Jeffrey Hopkins, Compassion in Tibetan Buddhism (London: Rider, 1980; reprint, Ithaca, N.Y.: Snow Lion, 1980), 131.

\[\text{dbu ma la 'jug pa'i rgya cher bshad pa dgongs pa rab gsal. English translation (chaps. 1-5): Hopkins, Compassion in Tibetan Buddhism, 93-230; the portion of the book that is Tsong-kha-pa’s Illumination of the Thought (chapters 1-5) is downloadable at:}
\[\text{http://uma-tibet.org/edu/gomang/dbu_ma/middle.php.}\]

\[\text{Tsong-kha-pa (Hopkins, Compassion in Tibetan Buddhism, 181) makes the case that Maitreya’s Ornament for the Clear Realizations as well as both Āryavimuktisena’s and Haribhadra’s commentaries contain two modes, the systems of the Yogic Middle Way Autonomy School (yogācāra-svātantrika-mādhyamika) and of the Consequence School (prāsaṅgika):}

Moreover, in both Āryavimuktisena’s Illumination of the Twenty-Five Thousand Stanza Perfection of Wisdom Sūtra* and Haribhadra’s Great Commentary on the “Eight Thousand Perfection of Wisdom Sūtra”: Illumination of (Maitreya’s) “Ornament for the Clear Realizations,” as a source for positing the element of attributes as the lineage of all three vehicles, they cite the statement that all persons who are Superiors are distinguished by the uncompounded [element of attributes, emptiness]. This is saying that the meaning of the statement in the Diamond Cutter, “Persons who are Superiors are distinguished by the uncompounded [element of attributes, emptiness]”—stated as a means of establishing that “The qualities of an enlightened one and all the doctrines taught by him do not exist”—is that all Superiors of the greater and lesser vehicles are posited by way of their having actualized the uncompounded ultimate which is the non-establishment of phenomena in reality. Therefore, this [Prāsaṅgika] system and
THE COMMENTATORS

The late Dan-ma-lo-chö was a Ge-she of the Lo-sel-ling College of Dre-pung Monastic University, Abbot Emeritus of Nam-gyal Monastery in Dharamsala, India, and a Great Assembly Hall Tulku. His autobiography is available online at: http://uma-tibet.org/haa/archive.php. His oral commentary forms the main body of this book and appears at the margin, and the translation of Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s text is indented.

Since Dan-ma-lo-chö was a Ge-she from Lo-sel-ling College and Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po is a textbook author for Go-mang College, and these are the two main colleges of philosophical study at Dre-pung Monastic University, they offer distinct streams of explanation that differ so much that additional input was required to explain Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s presentation, and for this the assistance of Ge-she Lo-sang-gyal-tshan from Go-mang was invaluable. Lo-sang-gyal-tshan is Abbot and a Ge-she at Go-mang College of Dre-pung Monastic University, Mundgod, Karnataka State, India, who also served as Disciplinarian at the Tantric College of Lower Lhasa in Hunsur, India. His oral commentary is

Maitreya’s Ornament for the Clear Realizations are not mutually exclusive. Hence, you should understand that the systems of those commentators [Āryavimuktisena and Haribhadra] on Maitreya’s Ornament for the Clear Realizations also contain two modes.

* Also called Commentary on (Maitreya’s) “Treatise of Quintessential Instructions on the ‘Superior Twenty-Five Thousand Stanza Perfection of Wisdom Sūtra’: Ornament for the Clear Realizations.”

* tshogs chen sprul sku.
marked with his name and is slightly indented. His very clear mode of explication was of much help in understanding differences of opinion between the monastic colleges.

EDITIONS CONSULTED

Three editions of Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s Presentation of the Grounds and Paths were used. Although they all appear to be based on the same core text, slight variations between them were found.


This edition was originally printed in La-brang-tra-shi-khyil monastery founded by Jam-yang-shay-pa and is likely the mother edition of the two other editions utilized:


The digital Tibetan text of Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s Presentation of the Grounds and Paths provided in this book is based on the “1999 TBRC bla brang” edition, with variant readings in the other two texts noted.
Technical Notes

It is important to recognize that:

• translations and editions of texts are given in the Bibliography;
• the names of Indian Buddhist schools of thought are translated into English in a wish to increase accessibility for non-specialists;
• for the names of Indian scholars and systems used in the body of the text, \( ch, sh, \) and \( sh \) are used instead of the more usual \( c, ś, \) and \( ś \) for the sake of easy pronunciation by non-specialists; however, \( cch \) is used for \( cch, \) not \( chchh \). Within parentheses the usual transliteration system for Sanskrit is used;
• transliteration of Tibetan is done in accordance with a system devised by Turrell Wylie; see “A Standard System of Tibetan Transcription,” *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies*, 22 (1959): 261-267;
• the names of Tibetan authors and orders are given in “essay phonetics” for the sake of easy pronunciation; the system is aimed at internet searchability;
• definitions are in bold type;
• titles of added subsections are given in square brackets; particularly in Chapter Two, Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po gave only a short list that Den-ma-lo-chö elaborated on extensively, and thus outline headings have been added to make the text easier to follow.
KÖN-CHOG-JIG-MAY-WANG-PO’S
PRESENTATION OF THE
GROUND AND PATHS

Dan-ma-lo-chö’s oral commentary is at the margin, and the translation of Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s text is indented.
1. Beings of the Three Capacities

This text is a *Presentation of the Grounds and Paths*, and its title is *Beautiful Ornament of the Three Vehicles*. As will be explained in detail later, the three vehicles are those of Hearers (*nyan thos, śrāvaka*), Solitary Victors (*rang rgyal, pratyekabuddha*), and the Great Vehicle (*theg pa chen po, mahāyāna*). The word “ornament” (rgyan) has many usages; here, it is the same as in Maitreya’s *Ornament for the Clear Realizations* in that among the many different types of ornaments, this one is an ornament that illuminates, or makes clear, that, like a mirror, shows what is there.

*Presentation of the Grounds and Paths: Beautiful Ornament of the Three Vehicles*

Homage to the gurus.

This obeisance is in Sanskrit. “Namo” means homage, bowing down; “guru” means lama, and has a plural ending: Homage to the lamas, the teachers.

Then, by way of making an expression of worship to Buddha, the author sets forth a promise of composition:

I bow down with respect to the King of the Shākyas who completed the progress of the grounds and paths and gave instructions about that way. I will write a brief presentation of the grounds and paths in order to care for those of equal lot.
Buddha, due to progressing successively through the five paths and ten grounds, brought them to completion and attained the state of perfect Buddhahood in which all defects have been abandoned and all good qualities attained. In this way he accomplished his own purposes. He then gave instructions about this so that future disciples as well might attain Buddhahood through completing in just the same way the progress of the grounds and paths. This indicates that Buddha brought to fulfillment the purposes, or welfare, of others.

Buddha here is called the “King of the Shākyas,” a name referring to the clan in which he was born, the Shākyas. There are also other names for Buddha referring to his lineage such as the “Sugarcane One” and “Sun-Friend.” Buddha is the object of the expression of worship.

The author pays homage with respectful body, speech and mind. Paying respect physically would involve some sort of bowing down, touching one’s limbs to the ground, and so forth; with speech, it would be to speak the qualities of a Buddha; with mind, being mindful of and reflecting on the qualities of a Buddha and generating faith. The stanza up to this point is a praise or expression of worship of a special object.

The purpose of making an expression of worship is to accumulate merit. Through the increase of merit, one can accomplish the activity one is beginning, in this case, a composition, without interruption. In the Extensive Sport Sūtra (rgya cher rol pa, lalitavistara), which Buddha taught shortly after he became enlightened, he said that the fruition of merit bestows happiness and eliminates all suffering, and that a person who has great merit can achieve whatever is sought. In accordance with this, an expression of worship is made at the beginning of composing a work.

Having paid homage, the author then states a promise to compose the text. Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po says that he is composing this work in order to care for those of equal lot—or intelligence—or those of lower lot than himself. In order to benefit such persons, he will write a brief presentation of the ten grounds and five paths, identifying what they are without using many words.

Saying such at the beginning of a text constitutes the promise to make the composition. The purpose for doing so is that when excellent persons make a promise to do something, they will never give it up. Nāgārjuna said in his Tree of Wisdom that wise people do not make many promises. Only

---

*a Treatise on the Way: The Tree of Wisdom (lugs kyi bstan bcos shes rab sdong bu, prajñādānā), stanza 11:*
after having analyzed and ascertained that they can accomplish something will they promise to do so. Thus they are slow to make promises, but once they have made a commitment to do something, they will make great effort until they bring it to completion. Just as letters carved into stone will remain there even if the stone is broken, so they will not give up their commitment even at the risk of their life. Thus, the purpose of making a promise of composition is to bring the activity eventually to a conclusion.

With regard to explaining here a presentation of the grounds and the paths that are the bases of the many worldly and supramundane qualities, initially I will express merely a brief presentation of the paths of the beings of the three capacities.

“Worldly qualities” means in one sense the happiness and marvels of this life, and in a broader sense, refers to all the happiness that is included within cyclic existence. “Supramundane qualities” refers to the qualities of those who have passed beyond the state of ordinary, worldly beings (so so’i skye bo, prthagjana), that is, to the qualities of Superiors (’phags pa, ārya). The term “base” is used in the sense that just as a table serves as a base for all the things one sets upon it, so the grounds and paths serve as a base for all worldly and supramundane good qualities.

The beings of the three capacities (skyes bu gsun) are beings of small capacity (skyes bu chung ngu), beings of medium capacity (skyes bu bu chung ngu), beings of large capacity (skyes bu chung dngu). The excellent do not make many promises, But if they do rarely make a commitment, Like a picture carved in rock, they do not Do otherwise though they might die.

'bring), and beings of great capacity (skyes bu chen po).

An attitude posited from the viewpoint of seeking mainly mere high status within cyclic existence in future lives for one’s own sake alone is the definition of a path of a special being of small capacity.\textsuperscript{a} Illustrations of this are, for instance, an awareness in the continuum of a being of small capacity that realizes the impermanence of death ...

All of us have the thought that we will sometime die, but the mind that thinks we won’t die for a while is a case of a mind that is conceiving permanence. In order to overcome this conception of permanence, one must come to understand that one will definitely die, that there is no definiteness with regard to the time of death, and that at the time of death nothing will help except religious practice. Having made this decision, realizing that there is no certainty that one will not die even right now, even tonight, that in each moment one is going closer to death, is a mind realizing the impermanence of death. Thus, here the impermanence of death (’chi ba mi

\textsuperscript{a} The reason that the definition is specified as being of a “special being of small capacity” is due to the fact that there is a three-fold categorization of “beings of small capacity.” Könchog-jig-may-wang-po is following the delineation by the Go-mang scholar Jam-yang-shay-pa (’jam dbyangs bzhad pa, 1648-1721), who defines these in the following way: A being of small capacity at the lowest level is “a person who seeks the mere happiness of this lifetime through non-religious means.” A being of small capacity at the medium level is “a person who achieves [the mere happiness of] this lifetime through religious and non-religious means.” And a being of small capacity at the highest level is “a person who seeks the mere happiness of a future cyclic existence [that is, a future lifetime] by only religious means, not emphasizing this lifetime.” Because beings of small capacity at the first two levels are seeking happiness by non-religious means, they are not included within the category of “religious” persons, and hence this presentation of the spiritual paths of religious persons begins only with the highest of the three, “special beings of small capacity.” For a thorough discussion of this, see Jeffrey Hopkins, Reflections on Reality: The Three Natures and Non-Natures in the Mind-Only School (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2002), 162-178.
rtag pa) means the indefiniteness of the time of death.

Another illustration of a path of a special being of small capacity is:

... and [a mind of] ethics [in the continuum of a being of small capacity] that is abandoning the ten non-virtues.\(^a\)

Here an abandonment of all ten is necessary. The abandonment of a lesser number of the non-virtues would be virtuous but would not be such a path.

Why are these called paths of a being of small capacity?

In dependence on those [awarenesses realizing the impermanence of death and (minds of) ethics abandoning the ten non-virtues in the continuums of beings of small capacity, persons who possess [these awarenesses] in their continuums are caused to proceed to a state of high status [that is, as a human or god]; hence they are called paths of beings of small capacity.

Based on practicing such paths, a being of small capacity comes to consider future lives to be more important than this life.

\(\text{An attitude posited from the viewpoint of mainly seeking liberation for one’s own sake alone, by way of having turned one’s awareness away from the marvels of cyclic existence is the definition of a path of a being of medium capacity.}\)

---

\(^a\) The ten non-virtues are killing, stealing, sexual misconduct, lying, divisive talk, harsh speech, foolish talk, covetousness, harmful thoughts, and wrong ideas.
“Cyclic existence” refers to mental and physical aggregates appropriated through actions and afflictions. No matter what marvels arise in the world, in cyclic existence—no matter how good one’s body, no matter what marvelous resources one might have—these can give only temporary happiness. They cannot give final happiness. For, like drinking salt water, no matter how much one enjoys contaminated happiness, there is no satisfaction. There is also no definiteness that this happiness will remain, nor is there definiteness with regard to status—one must always go from high to low and low to high. A being of medium capacity, observing these many defects of the marvels of cyclic existence, eradicates any admiration for them and turns the mind away from them.

These persons see that these contaminated aggregates are appropriated through the force of actions and afflictions, and seek, for their own sake alone, to eradicate the causes of suffering, the afflictions. “Liberation” is a state of not needing to assume again contaminated mind and body through having completely abandoned the afflictions. One need not take rebirth again in cyclic existence. This is what persons of medium capacity are primarily seeking, and thus they are posited from the viewpoint of being those whose intention is mainly seeking such liberation.

Illustrations [of paths of a being of medium capacity] are, for instance, awarenesses in the continuum of a being of medium capacity that realize the sixteen [attributes of the four noble truths], impermanence and so forth.

These are the sixteen attributes that exist in relation to the four noble truths, four each for the four truths of suffering, sources, cessation, and path.\(^a\)

\(^a\) The attributes of suffering are impermanence, misery, emptiness, and selflessness. The attributes of sources are cause, origin, strong production, and condition. The attributes of cessation are cessation, pacification, auspiciousness, and definite emergence. The attributes of path are path, reasonableness, achieving, and deliverance. See Jeffrey Hopkins and Jongbok Yi, The Hidden Teaching of the Perfection of Wisdom Sūtras: Jam-yang-shay-pa’s Seventy Topics and Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s 173 Topics, Appendix One, “Meditations on the Sixteen Attributes of the Four Noble Truths.” (short form: Hopkins and Yi, Jam-yang-shay-pa’s Seventy Topics) See also The Dalai Lama and Thubten Chodron, Buddhism: One Teacher, Many Traditions (Boston, Ma: Wisdom Publications, 2014) 39-59
These are called paths of a being of medium capacity because in dependence on [awarenesses realizing the sixteen attributes of the four noble truths], impermanence and so forth in the continuums of beings of medium capacity, persons who possess them in their continuums are caused to progress to the state of liberation.

After this comes the path of a being of great capacity.

An attitude posited, by way of having come under the influence of great compassion, from the viewpoint of seeking [to attain] an exalted-knower-of-all-aspects for the sake of other sentient beings' attaining Buddhahood is the definition of a path of a being of great capacity.

Bodhisattvas see other sentient beings tormented by suffering, be it the suffering of pain, the suffering of change, or the suffering of pervasive conditioning, and, from the depths of their hearts unable to bear this suffering of those beings, come under the influence of great compassion. Great compassion is the root of the Great Vehicle path. Thus, Chandrakīrti, at the beginning of his *Supplement to (Nāgārjuna’s) “Treatise on the Middle”* a did not make an expression of worship to his own personal deity, lama, and so forth, but instead paid homage to great compassion. He said for a presentation of these sixteen from the viewpoint of the Sanskrit tradition followed in Tibet and the Pali tradition followed in Theravāda countries.

---

a See stanzas 1 and 2.
that in order to attain Buddhahood, compassion is important in the begin-
ning, middle, and end. In the beginning it is like a seed, in the middle like
water and fertilizer, and in the end, like ripened fruit.

All the deeds of a Bodhisattva are engaged in depending on this great
compassion which, seeing the suffering of sentient beings, is unable to
bear it without doing something about it. No one can bear their own suf-
fering, but only those who have compassion cannot bear the suffering of
others. In this way compassion is very important, and it is important not
only for practicing the path but also in terms of worldly activities. If per-
sons have concern for others’ suffering similar to what they would have
for their own, they will make effort to relieve that suffering and thus come
to benefit the welfare of all people.

Illustrations [of paths of a being of great capacity] are, for
instance, the great compassion and the pure high resolve
in the continuum of a being of great capacity.

Pure high resolve is a not just the thought, “How nice it would be if sen-
tient beings were freed from suffering and the causes of suffering,” but
rather the thought, “I myself will free sentient beings from suffering and
the causes of suffering.”

These are called paths of a being of great capacity because
in dependence on those, [that is, the great compassion and
the pure high resolve in the continuum of beings of great
capacity], persons who possess them in their continuums
are caused to progress to unsurpassed enlightenment.

They progress to the state of Buddhahood.

Thus, the paths of the beings of small, medium, and great capacities
have been explained, and from these explanations one can understand the
differences of vastness in thought among them. The Sanskrit word for “be-
ing” (Tib. skyes bu) is purusha, one meaning of which is “one who pos-
sesses capacity” (nus pa dang ldan pa). You can see from the above defi-
nitions that these three types of beings differ greatly in terms of capacity.

Beings of small capacity have only the limited thought, “May I in fu-
ture lifetimes not have to suffer the misery of rebirth in the unfortunate
states.” Beings of medium capacity know that it will not help at all merely
not to undergo the suffering of bad transmigrations in future lifetimes.
Even if one abides in the peak of cyclic existence, it is no different from
being in a hell of molten copper, for the two are the same with regard to
the suffering of pervasive conditioning. Even though there is no suffering
of mental or physical pain or suffering of change for one abiding in the
peak of cyclic existence, when the actual meditative absorption of a person
in that state finally degenerates, the person will fall from that state and be
reborn in a lower state in which the sufferings of suffering and change will
manifest. Even in the best rebirths within cyclic existence one has not
passed beyond a state having the nature of the three sufferings. Hence, in
order to attain a liberation in which none of these three sufferings will have
to be experienced, persons of medium capacity cultivate paths such as re-
alization of the sixteen aspects of the four noble truths and so forth. Their
thought is more vast than that of beings of small capacity, but it is still
small, for they are thinking only of themselves.

One needs to think about all other beings. Sentient beings’ births are
limitless, without beginning. There is, hence, not a single being who has
not at some time been born as one’s mother. At the time they were our
mother, they protected us with kindness just as did our mothers of this
lifetime. It would be very bad if one had no thought to help these beings
who have been one’s mother and been very kind to one since beginningless
time, but rather discarded them, thinking only of oneself.

For instance, take the case of a mother who was blind and mentally
disturbed and who went walking along the edge of an abyss into which she
could easily fall. If her only child, seeing this, remained playing and en-
joying him or herself, this would be considered unseemly even in the
world. Yet, in just that way, sentient beings, our aged mothers, are as if
blind, not knowing the discarding of non-virtues and the adoption of vir-
tues, or how to practice the path. Although they want happiness, they do
not know how to achieve the causes of happiness; although they do not
want suffering, they powerlessly achieve its causes. They are as if crazed.
Moreover, because they have already accumulated many non-virtues and
continue to do so, they are wandering along the edge of the frightful abyss
of bad transmigrations. Just as a child should try to stop its blind, crazed
mother from wondering along the edge of an abyss, so we should develop
the compassion that seeks to free all these sentient beings from this state
in which though wanting happiness, they do not know how to achieve its
causes and hence are bereft of happiness, and though not wanting suffer-
ing, powerlessly achieve its causes again and again. It is not sufficient
merely to think, “How nice it would be if all these beings were free from
suffering;” rather, one must assume the burden of doing this oneself.

If one considers whether one has the capacity to free all sentient beings
from suffering, one understands that at present one does not. Who has such
capacity? When one investigates, one sees that it is a Buddha, a Supra-
mundane Victor, who has removed all defects and perfected all good qual-
ities. Thus, beings of great capacity are those who generate the altruistic
mind of enlightenment, thinking, “I will attain perfected Buddhahood in
order to establish all sentient beings in the great liberation of the non-abid-
ing nirvana.” They are those who have generated a mind intent on supreme
enlightenment.

What is a path (lam, mārga)? In the world we call the tracks (shul) of
someone who went before and which serve as a way to be followed by
those who come afterwards a path. We know many kinds of paths—a road
such as is used by cars, the tracks followed by a train, a footpath one might
follow when walking in the mountains. The term “path” is used here in a
similar manner. We call paths that way of proceeding of the Buddhas, Bo-
dhisattvas, and Superiors of the past—the kinds of attitudes they gener-
ated—which are how those who wish to generate such realizations in the
present and the future must proceed.

Among paths, there are those of beings of small, medium and great
capacities. There are individual paths for each of those types of beings,
and there are paths common to all of them. For instance, in order to gen-
erate the paths of a being of great capacity, one must first generate those
paths that are in common with beings of medium capacity. And in order to
generate the paths in common with beings of medium capacity in one’s
continuum, one must first generate the paths in common with beings of
small capacity. So initially one must think about what is to be practiced by
all three capacities of beings.

That which (1) is an object of practice by beings of all
three capacities and (2) is an attitude in which one’s
awareness must initially be trained in order to gener-
ate the paths of a being of medium capacity in one’s
continuum is the definition of a path common to beings
of small and medium capacity. Illustrations are, for in-
stance, wisdom realizing the impermanence of death and
wisdom realizing the suffering of bad transmigrations.

That which (1) is an object of practice by beings of both great and medium capacities and (2) is an attitude in which one’s awareness must initially be trained in order to generate in one’s continuum the paths of a being of great capacity is the definition of a path common to beings of great and medium capacities. Illustrations are, for instance, awarenesses realizing the sixteen attributes of the four noble truths, impermanence and so forth.

To realize the sixteen attributes, impermanence and so forth, would be, for instance, to contemplate true sufferings, true sources, true cessations, and true paths. When you contemplate true sources, the stages of the arising of cyclic existence, you need to reflect on the arising of afflictions, the arising of actions, the cycle of the twelve links of dependent arising, and so forth. You need to contemplate the faults of true sufferings, the first noble truth, and to contemplate the benefits of liberation, the third noble truth. And, in order to attain liberation, you have to generate a pure thought wishing to
train properly in the three precious trainings of ethics, meditative stabilization, and wisdom, the fourth noble truth. All of these paths have to be practiced by beings of medium capacity and they have to be practiced by beings of great capacity. Hence they are paths common to beings of medium and of great capacity.

We use the term “paths of a being of great capacity” but do not use the term “paths common with a being of great capacity” [because paths of a being of great capacity are not shared with beings of the other capacities. Being the highest paths, they are practiced only by beings of great capacity].

Further, there is a way of generating in one’s continuum this series of paths of the beings of the three capacities. When, upon having contemplated the way in which leisure and fortune are difficult to gain, their importance [when found] and the way they are lost without remaining for a long time, when there emerges non-artificial experience with regard to an attitude that—the emphasis on this lifetime having been undermined—seeks [high status in] the next lifetime, then one has generated in one’s continuum a path of a special being of small capacity.

Leisure (dal ba) is the absence of non-leisure (mi khom pa); it is endowment with the conditions for practicing the doctrine. There are eight conditions of non-leisure, and one who is free from those is said to have leisure. Fortune (byor ba) means to be free from incompleteness of the concordant circumstances for achieving the excellent doctrine. There are ten

\[\text{Further, there is a way of generating in one's continuum this series of paths of the beings of the three capacities. When, upon having contemplated the way in which leisure and fortune are difficult to gain, their importance [when found] and the way they are lost without remaining for a long time, when there emerges non-artificial experience with regard to an attitude that—the emphasis on this lifetime having been undermined—seeks [high status in] the next lifetime, then one has generated in one's continuum a path of a special being of small capacity.}

Leisure (dal ba) is the absence of non-leisure (mi khom pa); it is endowment with the conditions for practicing the doctrine. There are eight conditions of non-leisure, and one who is free from those is said to have leisure. Fortune (byor ba) means to be free from incompleteness of the concordant circumstances for achieving the excellent doctrine. There are ten
fortunes. Most of us have all of these; even if we don’t actually have them, we have substitutes for them.

It is very difficult to attain a physical basis in which one has all of these conditions of leisure and fortune, for each of them requires the prior achievement of many causes that are difficult to achieve. One has to take as one’s basis pure ethics. In addition, one needs as companions, or assistants, the six perfections, giving and so forth. For instance, if in one’s previous lifetime one had kept pure ethics but had not engaged in giving, one would in this lifetime be born as a human, but a very poor one. In this case one would have to spend all one’s time merely seeking food, clothing, and the like and would have no opportunity to study or engage in practice. Therefore, as a fruit of our own giving in former lifetimes, we have a sufficient of such concordant circumstances now.

Similarly, if in the previous lifetime one had not at all cultivated patience even though one had maintained pure ethics, one would be born as a person so ugly that people couldn’t bear to see us. That we have not been so born is an effect of having cultivated patience in our previous lifetime. If in the previous lifetime one, while still keeping ethics, had not at all made effort, one would be born as a person with an extremely small body, such as a dwarf. The fact that we have the normal measure of human size is an effect of having cultivated effort in past lives.

If, in the previous life, one had not cultivated concentration, or meditative stabilization, then when one tried now to study or think about an important topic, one’s mind would not be able to stay on the topic but would be excited and distracted. The fact that this is not the case is the effect of our having cultivated concentration in the previous lifetime. Likewise, we all have some sort of ability to keep words in mind, to think about things, to understand the difference between defects and good qualities—this is a type of wisdom and is an effect of having cultivated wisdom in the past.

Thus, in order to achieve a basis of leisure and fortune, one needs as a

---

(7) birth as a god of long life, (8) birth in a world system where a Buddha did not come.

a There are five inner fortunes: (1) being a human, (2) being born in a center of Buddhist teaching, (3) having sound sense faculties, (4) not having done the five actions of immediate retribution in a hell after death: killing one’s father, killing one’s mother, killing a Foe Destroyer, with bad intention causing blood to flow from the body of a Buddha, and causing dissension in the Spiritual Community, (5) having faith in Buddha’s scriptures. There are also five outer fortunes: (1) a visitation from a Buddha, (2) his teaching the excellent doctrine, (3) his teaching remaining to the present, (4) his followers still existing, (5) the people of the area having mercy and love for others and thus teaching others. See Sopa and Hopkins, *Cutting Through Appearances*, 23-26.

b The six are giving, ethics, patience, effort, concentration, and wisdom.
cause a basis of pure ethics and as accompaniers the practice of the six
perfections. Also, one has to have connection by way of pure prayer
wishes. This means that, in order to achieve a body of a good transmigra-
tion, at the time when one’s mind and body are about to separate, that is,
neat the time of death, one needs a virtuous thought such as of helping
others.

If any among those three are incomplete, one cannot attain a life sup-
port that has the complete eight leisures and ten fortunes. For instance, if
one did not keep good ethics but engaged in great giving, then in the next
lifetime one might be reborn as an ocean-dwelling dragon (nāga, klui) hav-
ing great resources or as an animal with great resources or even as a hungry
ghost with great resources. Because one engaged in giving, one attains
great resources, but because one was unable to keep ethics, one cannot
gain a human body. For instance, we have all seen dogs, birds, and so forth
that people keep and feed and care for extremely well; they have great
resources. The reason why they were born as animals is that they did not
keep good ethics, but due to the fact that they engaged in giving in the
previous life, they are in this lifetime well cared for by humans, cherished,
and given excellent food.

There is also an explanation of the difficulty of attaining leisure and
fortune by way of an example given by Buddha himself. He stuck his fin-
ger into the ground, and some particles of earth stuck to it when he took it
out. He said that those who are born in happy transmigrations are similar
to the number of particles sticking to his fingernail, whereas those who are
born in the bad transmigrations—of hell-beings, hungry ghosts, and ani-
imals—are like the number of particles of earth in the whole world.

When a lifetime of leisure and fortune is gained, it is very meaningful.
In the first place it is not even necessary to explain that if one has the eight
leisures and ten fortunes, one can achieve the purposes of this life. With
such a physical basis one can achieve the causes that will bring about at-
tainment of another lifetime in which one does not have to undergo the
sufferings of bad transmigrations but will have a life support of a happy
transmigration. Not only that, but with this physical support, one can attain
the state of liberation in which one has completely abandoned all afflic-
tions and is free from all suffering. Moreover, one can attain the state of a
Buddha in which one has fulfilled not only one’s own welfare but also that
of others.

For instance, in India, there were eighty great adepts (grub pa, siddha),
and in Tibet there were people such as Milarepa and the great adept, En-
sa-pa Lo-sang-dön-drub (dben sa pa, blo bzang don sgrub, 1505-1566, the
third Paṇchen Lama). These are people who in that very life attained the
Beings of the Three Capacities

state of union (*bzung ’jug*). Their physical bodies were the same as ours; they were born from the womb and had the six constituents. If we can develop modes of thought and practice similar to theirs, we too can attain such qualities of verbalization and realization. Hence, this physical support of leisure and fortune is very meaningful.

Understanding this, one will value it and want to extract its essence, that is, to take full advantage of it. If one does not realize how meaningful it is, one will not generate the wish to extract its essence. For instance, persons who do not know what a dollar is will not be particularly happy even if they get a lot of dollars nor will they feel regret if they throw them away. Whether you put sand or gold dust in a donkey’s ear makes no difference to the donkey. It will still shake it out, for the donkey does not know that gold is valuable. Similarly, it is the same to a donkey whether it is carrying two gold bricks or two clay bricks to build a house.

The reason why one contemplates the difficulty of gaining leisure and fortune and its meaningfulness when found is to generate an attitude wishing to practice doctrine. However, even if one has a thought wishing to achieve the doctrine correctly without wasting one’s leisure and fortune since such a life is difficult to find and meaningful when found, still, if one thinks that one is going to live for a long time, one will be very loose about practice. Thus, one must also contemplate the fact that one cannot stay for a long time: this life of leisure and fortune will not last a long time, but will be lost.

How is this? In general all compounded phenomena are impermanent. From their mere production, they are established as having a nature of disintegration. If you take time as an example, once the first moment of a new year has passed, the year is no longer complete; it has diminished. The same is also true with regard to months, weeks, hours, and so forth. For instance, if we assume that we are to live for eighty years, then with the passage of one moment after birth, one is that much closer to death. Not only that, but also there is no way of adding on to a lifetime. Hence, its diminishment occurs uninterruptedly, like water flowing downwards.

In general, momentary disintegration is the nature of all produced phenomena. For all beings, except for differences of time—earlier or later—it is definite that having taken birth, in the end one dies. For some sentient beings, their lifespan is definite. However, within our own world-system of Jambudvīpa, the lifespan is not definite. In the first period of this world system after its formation, sentient beings here had an “immeasurable”

---

*a* This represents a “union” of pure body, the illusory body, and pure mind, the objective clear light (*sku dag pa sgyu ma’i lus dang thugs dag pa don gyi ’od gsal*) and thus Budhahood itself.
lifespan. The lifespan has diminished gradually until at this point the lifespan is around eighty or ninety years. It will continue to diminish in the future to the point where the average lifespan is around ten years. Thus, there is no definiteness with regard to the lifespan of beings in Jambudvīpa. Also, there is, in particular, no definiteness with regard to the lifespan during this degenerate era, for, at this time there are many diseases that were not known before, and there are many new things being produced in dependence upon which people are adventitiously dying. Thus there are many causes of death and very few causes of life.

At the time of death, nothing will help except religious practice. Why is this? Even if, at the time of death, one could gather around oneself all of one’s friends, still one must go to death alone like a hair being drawn out of butter. The significance of this example is that when you take a hair out of butter, the butter does not stick to it. In the same way we go to death completely alone, unable to take anything with us. We cannot take even one dear friend. Even if we have enough clothing to last for a hundred years, we cannot take even one piece. Even if we have enough food to last for a hundred years, we cannot take even one spoonful. Therefore, at the time of death, resources do not help and friends do not help.

What will help at the time of death? If one has practiced the doctrine, that will help. Nothing other will. Having contemplated this, one should give up the thought that the affairs of this lifetime are terribly important or that this life is the only one—one should reverse the emphasis on the affairs of this life. Giving up one’s attachment to this life, one should develop an attitude seeking high status in the next. It is necessary to meditate on, to cultivate, this attitude over and over again until finally non-artificial experience of it arises. To have non-artificial experience means that this attitude arises of its own accord without having to cultivate it, or fabricate it. When such non-artificial experience of an attitude that has turned away from emphasis on this life and is intent on the next arises, then one has generated in one’s continuum a path of a special being of small capacity.

This concludes the description of how to generate a path of a special being of small capacity. Next comes the path of a being of medium capacity.

After that, [that is, after there has emerged non-artificial experience with regard to an attitude that—the emphasis on this lifetime having been undermined—seeks (high status in) the next lifetime,] when one has seen the marvels of cyclic existence as like a pit of burning fire and

---

\[a\] This has a certain measure difficult to count.
there emerges non-artificial experience with regard to an awareness wanting liberation from those [marvels of cyclic existence], then one has generated in the continuum a path of a being of medium capacity.

A person of cyclic existence (’khor ba pa) is one who has contaminated aggregates impelled by actions and afflictions. Those contaminated mental and physical aggregates themselves are cyclic existence. The reason why it is called “cyclic” is that once having taken rebirth within any of the six transmigrations through the power of actions and afflictions, one can only cycle within those six and cannot get free from the tight bonds of actions and afflictions.

“Marvels of cyclic existence” (’khor ba’i phun tshogs) refers to, for example, a marvelous body or marvelous resources. No matter how good those are, one should not generate attachment to them, but should view them as like a pit of burning fire. When there arises a wish for liberation from this cyclic existence impelled by actions and afflictions—a non-artificial wish that comes forth spontaneously without having to rely any longer on meditation—then one has generated in one’s continuum a path of a being of medium capacity.

Then, with regard to generating the paths of a being of great capacity in one’s continuum, one’s thought is as follows:

After that, [that is, after having generated in the continuum the path of a being of medium capacity,] one [needs to] come to understand that even though one attains a liberation that is one’s own release from cyclic existence, since one has extinguished only a portion of defects and has attained only a portion of good qualities, not only has one not completed one’s own welfare but also others’ welfare [can be accomplished] only triflingly and aiming at
only one’s own welfare is common with animals. Then, when non-artificial experience emerges with regard to an attitude mainly seeking the state of an exalted-knower-of-all-aspects for the sake of establishing other sentient beings in final happiness, one has generated in one’s continuum a path of a being of great capacity.

After generating the path of a being of medium capacity in one’s continuum, one must come to understand that even though, in dependence on one’s practice of the path, one comes to attain a state of liberation that is freedom from cyclic existence, one has not gotten rid of all defects, but only a portion of defects. Also, one has not attained all good qualities, but only a portion of good qualities. Since this is so, one has not completed one’s own welfare, or aims. Further, one sees that one is able to accomplish only triflingly, in a very small way, the welfare of others.

Moreover, one considers that practice engaged in for one’s own sake alone is an activity shared even with animals. For instance, birds and so forth first make a nest and then lay eggs in it; then the eggs crack and the chicks hatch; the parents sustain their young with worms, insects, and so forth, and within a few months they come to be equal to their parents. For humans, however, it takes a very long time for children to equal their parents.

To give another example, mice and other animals know how to take
care of themselves not just in terms of food. I will tell a short story to illustrate this. In the past, in Tibet, there was a Ka-dam-pa (bka’ gdam pa) Geshe named Lang-ri-thang-pa (glang ri thang pa) who had engaged in much practice, but was gloomy-faced—he never smiled or laughed at all. He had a mandala in which there was a large piece of turquoise, and one day he saw several mice carrying the turquoise away. It was far too large for just one mouse to carry, so one mouse had it on his back and three or four others were gathered around him to hold it in place. Seeing this, the Geshe laughed. This story shows that even animals know how to accumulate things—because they liked the turquoise they banded together to carry it away. Even mice are attached to things that they cannot eat. They know what can and cannot be eaten or used and they bother to accumulate both.

Also animals know how to tame their enemies. For instance, crows and owls are natural enemies. During the day a crow will come into an owl’s nest, remove a baby owl, and kill it by dropping it onto the stones below. At night, owls will come into a crow’s nest, remove a baby crow, and take it over to a stone and kill it. We are able to establish with our own direct perception that animals know how to search for water and food when they are hungry or thirsty—that deer and so forth seek out grass to eat, whereas carnivorous animals seek out meat.

Therefore, the achievement of the purposes of this life, one’s own food, drink, and so forth, is something shared with animals. Having realized that, this person is seeking to set other sentient beings in a state of final happiness, happiness that won’t change. And to be able to do this, he or she seeks to attain the state of omniscient Buddhahood—an-exalted-knowner-of-all-aspects that knows both the mode and the varieties. At the time such a thought arises through its own force, without having to depend upon effort or meditation, one is said to have non-artificial experience. When such non-artificial experience arises with regard to this wish to attain unsurpassed complete and perfect enlightenment for the sake of all sentient beings, a path of a being of great capacity has been generated in one’s mental continuum.
2. General Indication of Grounds and Paths

What is a presentation of grounds and paths like? With regard to explaining this there are two parts: a general indication of a presentation of grounds and paths and explaining in detail a presentation of the grounds and paths of the three vehicles.

The three vehicles are the Hearer, Solitary Victor, and Great Vehicles. “Explaining in detail a presentation” of them means that they are separated out individually for specific treatment.

I. GENERAL INDICATION OF A PRESENTATION OF GROUNDS AND PATHS

[A. GROUNDS]

1. Definition

The definition of ground [or earth] (sa, bhūmi) is that which is hard and obstructive.

This is the definition of the earth element from among the four elements—earth, water, fire, and wind. “Hard” (sra ba) means firm, or strong (drag
po), and “obstructive” (’thas pa) means packed together, that there is nothing between. Such is called earth, or ground. What is the function, or “work” of earth, or ground?

And, the function of ground [earth] is to serve as the basis of the production and abiding of all the world of the mobile and immobile.

“Mobile” refers to that which goes about. “Immobile” means that which does not move about. The mobile refers to sentient beings, the animate, and the immobile to the inanimate world. Sentient beings are also called “essence,” (bcud) and the environment is called “vessel” (snod), with the sense that the environment is like a vessel and living beings are like the things that are in the vessel—like a cup and what is in it. Thus the terms more commonly used for the mobile and the immobile are the world of the environment or world of the vessel (snod kyi ‘jig rten) and the sentient beings who are the essence in that vessel (bcud kyi sems can).

The place of production of these two—the mobile and immobile—is on the ground, and they dwell there also. Thus, the function of the ground is to serve as the basis of the production and abiding of the entire world, the vessel and the essence.

That [which is hard and obstructive and serves as the basis of the production and abiding of the entire world of the mobile and the immobile] is the fully-qualified ground [or earth] within the four elements.

That which in entity is hard and obstructive and has the function of serving as the basis of the production and abiding of the entire world of the mobile and the immobile is the real, actual, or fully qualified ground, or earth, from within the four elements.

However, calling the paths of the three vehicles “grounds” is a case of an imputed ground. The reason for designating
them thus is by way of a qualitative similarity of function.

Using the term “grounds” for the paths of the three vehicles, that is to say, for the clear realizations within the continuums of the beings of the Hearer, Solitary Victor, and Great Vehicles, is a case of an imputed ground. The name “ground” has been designated to them.

In general, names are designated in many different ways. There are cases of the name of a cause being designated to the effect. For example, when sunlight shines through the window, we say the sun is shining through the window. The sun is the cause of the rays of the light; we are using the name of the cause for the effect. There are also cases of giving the name of the effect to the cause. For instance, a correct proof statement (sgrub ngag yang dag) is called an inference for another (gzhan don rjes dpag). This is because in dependence on stating a correct proof statement, an inference can be produced, [and thus that proof statement, which is actually speech, and merely a cause of inference is called an inference, its effect, which is actually a consciousness]. There are also cases of giving the name of the whole to the parts. For instance, if the fringe hanging off a piece of cloth burned, you would say the cloth burned. There are also names given due to likeness, or similarity. A person of great courage is called a lion.

Here the paths of the three vehicles are called grounds because they serve as the basis of one’s generating in one’s own mental continuum those clear realizations that are the special qualities of the higher grounds. If in the designation of a name, one uses something that is known and familiar, it is easily understood and remembered. There is no one who doesn’t understand the word “ground,” for whatever we are doing, be it going, coming, lying down, getting up, or whatever, is involved with the ground. Thus, because we understand it well, the term ground is used in the presentation of grounds and paths in order to cause it appear easily to our minds. It is a case of designating a name by way of skill in means.

2. Usages of the term “grounds”

There are many usages of the verbal designation “grounds.” For, there are the three grounds—of Hearers,
Solitary Victors, and Bodhisattvas.

a. Three grounds of Hearers, Solitary Victors, and Bodhisattvas

The Tibetan and Sanskrit for “Hearer” are nyan thos and śrāvaka, respectively. Hearers are so called because they hear (nyan) the Great Vehicle scriptural collections from a Superior Emanation Body (a Buddha) or from Great Vehicle beings, that is to say, Bodhisattvas, and then they cause others who have interest in the Great Vehicle teachings to hear (thos) them—they proclaim (sgrogs pa) these doctrines. Thus, they are called nyan thos and also thos sgrogs. They are intent upon hearing and proclaiming the Great Vehicle teachings, but not practicing them.

Why are Solitary Victors so called? They are called rang rgyal, or Solitary-Conquerors (svajina) because Buddha said that they become conquerors by themselves at a time when Buddhas do not appear. Initially, they are of the Hearer lineage. However, without depending upon the guidance of other teachers in their last lifetime, they are able to actualize enlightenment themselves and thus are called Solitary-Conquerors. This means in that last lifetime when they are going to attain the state of a Foe Destroyer, they do not depend on the guidance of another teacher and are able to actualize the state of a Foe Destroyer themselves. They are also called Medium Realizers of Suchness (de kho na nyid rtogs pa’i ‘bring po); this is because their realization of suchness is better than that of Hearers and lower than that of followers of the Great Vehicle. They are also called Medium Buddhas (sangs rgyas ‘bring).

Then there is the ground of Bodhisattvas (byang chub semantics dpa’). With regard to the word “enlightenment” (byang chub, bodhi), byang means one has been purified of all the obstructions, that is to say, the afflictive obstructions and the obstructions to omniscience. Chub means to realize, penetrate, understand; one has realized all objects of knowledge. Thus the great enlightenment (byang chub chen po) is the same as Buddha (sangs rgyas). Hence, a Bodhisattva is one who, for the sake of achieving such a state of Buddhahood, in which all defects have been extinguished

---

The following explanation is according to the White Lotus of Excellent Doctrine Sūtra (dam pa’i chos pad ma dkar po’i mdo, saddharmapuṇḍarīka), in an etymology done from the viewpoint of the Great Vehicle.
and all good qualities attained, has generated a mind intent upon great enlightenment and is engaged in training in the deeds of a Bodhisattva.

In this way, three types of grounds are explained, those of Hearers, Solitary Victors, and Bodhisattvas. The author then sets forth another form of divisions of grounds:

[b. Three yogic grounds]

There are also the three yogic grounds: the yogic ground realizing the selflessness of persons, the yogic ground realizing the emptiness of duality, and the yogic ground realizing the emptiness of true existence.

The yogic ground realizing the selflessness of the person is mainly posited as existing in the continuums of Hearers. The selflessness of persons is one of the four compendia of the Buddhist doctrine (chos kyi sdom bzhi); these are the four seals:

- All products are impermanent
- All contaminated things are miserable
- All phenomena are empty and selfless
- Nirvāṇa is peaceful and virtuous.

This is the third of these, that all phenomena are empty and selfless.

What is this person that is selfless? That being which is designated in dependence upon any of the five aggregates is the definition of a person. This means that without the identification of the basis of the designation, the aggregates, there is no identification of a person. Take, for instance, an action. When we say “I am going,” or “I am staying,” we are designating the person, “I,” in dependence on the body. When we say, “I am comfortable,” or “I am miserable,” this is a case of designating the

---

*a lta ba bkar btags kyi phyag rgya bzhi; 1. 'dus byas thams cad mi rtag pa; 2. zag bezthams cad sdog bsnag pa; 3. chos thams cad stong zheg btag med pa; 4. mya ngan las 'das pa zhi zheg dge ba. See Sopa and Hopkins, Cutting Through Appearances, 176-178, for discussion of these four within Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po's short presentation of comparative tenets, the Precious Garland of Tenets (grub mtha' rin chen phreng ba).
person in dependence on feeling. If we say, “This person is smart and this other person is stupid,” the persons are being designated in dependence on greater or lesser wisdom. Thus, all of the actions of the person are designated in dependence upon the functions of one or another of the aggregates.

In our mental continuums we have the thought “I.” This mind thinking “I” is generated in dependence upon any one of the five aggregates. No matter how much one looks, there is no identification of a person without identifying aggregates. If the identification of something must depend upon the identification of another phenomenon, that thing is said to be imputedly existent. The opposite of imputedly existent (btags yod) is substantially existent (rdzas yod). The non-establishment of the person as substantially existent in the sense of being self-sufficient is called the selflessness of the person. If something were able to stand by itself, it would then eliminate that its identification would have to depend upon the identification of another phenomenon. When one understands the non-establishment of the person as substantially existent in the sense of being self-sufficient, one understands the selflessness of the person. When one has eliminated superimpositions with regard to this, one has eliminated superimpositions with regard to the selflessness of the person.

How can the selflessness of persons be realized with respect to all phenomena? All phenomena are objects of use of the person. “Objects of use” here means objects (yul). For example, forms are objects of use by the eye consciousness, sounds are objects of use by the ear consciousness, odors are objects of use by the nose consciousness, tastes are objects of use by the tongue consciousness, tangible objects are objects of use by the body consciousness, and all other phenomena are objects of use by the mental consciousness. Therefore, the six—forms, sounds, odors, tastes, tangible objects, and other phenomena—are, respectively, the objects of use by the six consciousnesses. Because these phenomena are objects of use by the six consciousnesses, they come to be objects of use by the persons [who possess these six consciousnesses in their mental continuums]. When one realizes that although these phenomena are objects of use of the person, they are not objects of use by a person who is substantially existent in the sense of being self-sufficient, then one has realized the selflessness of the person in terms of all phenomena.

---

*a rang nyid ngos gzung ba la chos gzhан ngos gzung ba la bya ba de la btags yod zer.  
*b gang zag rang khyab thub pa’i rdzas yod du ma grub pa.  
*c gang zag gi longs sphyod bya.
Hearers take this selflessness of the person as their main object of cultivation in meditation. Therefore, this first yogic ground is posited mainly with regard to Hearers.

The second yogic ground is that realizing the emptiness of duality. Duality refers to the two, object (yul) and subject (yul can), or apprehended (gzung ba) and apprehender (’dzin pa). The emptiness of duality is the emptiness of object and subject as being different substantial entities (rdzas tha dad) and is also called an emptiness of external objects (phyi rol don gyis stong pa). The realization of the emptiness of external objects is the realization of the emptiness of duality. Because Solitary Victor take this emptiness as their main object of cultivation in meditation, the second yogic ground is called the yogic ground realizing the emptiness of duality.

The third yogic ground is that realizing the emptiness of true existence. Emptiness of true existence means that all phenomena are empty of being objects established from the side of their own uncommon objective mode of subsistence without being posited through the force of appearing to a non-defective awareness. The yogic ground realizing this is called the third yogic ground, that realizing the emptiness of true existence. It is posited as the third yogic ground because Bodhisattvas take the realization of this emptiness of true existence of all phenomena, or this emptiness of ultimate existence, as their main object of cultivation in meditation.

With regard to the etymology of yoga (rnal ’byor), rnal means a pair, or two (zung), and ’byor is taken to mean join (’brel ba), hence “joining the two.” Thus this refers to the yoga of the union of calm abiding and special insight (zhi lhag zung ’brel gyi rnal ’byor). Hearers, Solitary Victors, and Bodhisattvas all cultivate a meditative stabilization that is a yoga of the union of calm abiding and special insight, but there is a difference with regard to the objects realized, which have just been explained.

This completes the explanation of the three yogic grounds. The next division of grounds to be identified is the six grounds of concentration.

c. Six grounds of concentration

And there are the six grounds of concentration: the preparation for the first concentration, the “not unable;” the two, the mere actual first concentration and special actual first concentration; and the last three concentrations[—the actual second, third, and fourth concentrations].

---

*a chos thams cad blo gnod med la snang ba’i dbang gis bzhag pa ma yin par yul rang gi thun mong ma yin pa’i sdod lugs kyi ngos nas grub pas stong pa.*
The first of these is the preparation for the first concentration, called the “not-unable” (mi lcog med, anāgamaṇya). The attainment of a preparation for the first concentration and the attainment of calm abiding are simultaneous. The preparations (nyer bsdogs, sāmantaka) are:

1. mental contemplation of a mere beginner (las dang po pa tsam gyi yid byed)
2. mental contemplation of individual knowledge of the character (mtshan nyid so sor rig pa’i yid byed, laksānapraṇātārāmanaskāra; also known as thorough knowledge of the character [mtshan nyid rab tu rig pa])
3. mental contemplation arisen from belief (mos pa las byung ba’i yid byed, adhimokṣikamanaskāra)
4. mental contemplation of thorough isolation (rab tu dben pa’i yid byed, prāśīvātanaskāra)
5. mental contemplation of joy-withdrawal (dga’ ba sdud pa’i yid byed, ratisāṃgrāhakamanaskāra)
6. mental contemplation of analysis (dpyod pa yid byed, mīmāṁsāmanaskāra)
7. mental contemplation of final training (sbyor mtha’i yid byed, pray-gaṇisthamanaskāra).

Of these seven preparations, not all are “not-unable”—only the first. For, none of the last six can be uncontaminated. The first, the contemplation of a beginner, has both contaminated and uncontaminated forms, the contaminated forms being those which consider the upper realm as peaceful and the lower realm as gross. The uncontaminated form is called the preparation that is “not unable.” Just as, if a person is “not unable” to do a task, they can do it, are capable of it, so the uncontaminated form of the contemplation of a beginner is called the preparation that is “not unable” because it has the capacity of abandoning, of acting as an antidote to, the

---

a See Leah Zahler, *Study and Practice of Meditation* (Snow Lion: Ithaca, NY, 2009), 189-229, for a thorough discussion of the preparations. Pages 189-191 give a very clear exposition of preparations, and 195-200 particularly address the topic of the “contemplation of a beginner.”
afflictions of all three realms. This is the first of the six grounds of concentration.

The next two grounds of concentration are the mere actual first concentration and the special actual first concentration. Regarding the difference between a preparation for a concentration and an actual concentration, a preparation is a method for separating from the desire for the afflictions of the lower realm, which in this case, since we are considering the first concentration, is the Desire Realm. Then, when one attains the actual first concentration, one has separated from desire for the afflictions of the Desire Realm.

With regard to the actual first concentration, there are two types—a mere actual first concentration and a special actual first concentration. Such a division into mere and special is made only for the first concentration and not for the second, third, or fourth concentrations because among the branches (yan lag, aṅga) of the first concentration, it is possible for some to be separated from desire for the lower realm and for some not to be so separated. However, with regard to the second, third, and fourth concentrations, it is not possible for there to be a difference among the branches with regard to being separated or not from desire for the lower level. Therefore, for the second, third, and fourth concentrations, a distinction of mere and special is not made.

A mere actual first concentration is 1) an absorption of an actual concentration and 2) abides in a type of a level of neutral feeling. The difference between the mere and the special is whether the feeling is neutral or blissful—a mere actual first concentration abides in a type of a level of neutral feeling and a special actual first concentration abides in a type of a level of blissful feeling.

The next three grounds of concentration are the last three concentrations, these being the second, third, and fourth concentrations. If one analyzes, there are different numbers of branches with regard to the individual concentrations and so forth, which we need not go into here. Later on if you want to study these in detail, there are books that lay these out. The six grounds of concentration are six types of concentration that can possibly be uncontaminated.

The next mode of division of grounds is into nine.

---

d. Nine uncontaminated grounds

Also, by adding to the six grounds of uncontaminated concentration[—the preparation for the first concentration, the “not unable;” the two, the mere actual first concentration and special actual first concentration; and the actual second, third, and fourth concentrations—]the first three of the uncontaminated formless absorptions—[actual limitless space, limitless consciousness, and nothingness], there are the nine uncontaminated grounds.

The four formless absorptions are:

1 limitless space (nam mkha’ mtha’ yas, ākāśāntya)
2 limitless consciousness (rnam shes mtha’ yas, vijñānāntya)
3 nothingness (ci yang med, ākīṃcaya)
4 peak of cyclic existence (srid rtse, bhavāgra).a

It is possible for the first three of the four formless absorptions to be uncontaminated, but it is not possible for the peak of cyclic existence to be uncontaminated.b There are nine uncontaminated grounds because it is possible for that which is of their entity to be uncontaminated.

To explain about the meaning of “uncontaminated,” the opposite of the uncontaminated (zag med, anāsrava) are the contaminated (zag pa dang bcas pa, sāsrava), and with regard to the meaning of “contaminated,” there are two systems: that of the lower Manifest Knowledge system of

---

a See Zahler, *Practice and Study of Meditation*, 260-263.
b See Zahler, *Practice and Study of Meditation*, 245, where Pan-chen Sö-nam-drug-pa is cited giving as a reason the fact that it is unclear in its object of observation and subjective aspect.
Vasubandhu’s *Treasury of Manifest Knowledge*\(^a\) and that of the higher
Manifest Knowledge system of Asaṅga’s *Summary of Manifest Knowledge*,\(^b\) which is followed by Āryavimuktisena and Haribhadra and is the basis for the Middle Way Autonomy (*dbu ma rang rgyud pa, svātan-
trika-mādhyamika*) system being set forth here.

Within the system of Vasubandhu’s *Treasury of Manifest Knowledge*,
there are two explanations of “contaminated,” one by way of object of ob-
servation (*dmigs pa*) and one by way of association (*mtshungs ldan*).\(^c\) To
be contaminated by way of being an object of observation means that the
phenomena of our impure environment, such as our own bodies or external
phenomena, can serve as objects of observation in dependence on which
desire, hatred, and so forth are produced. These objects serve as bases for
the generation of attachment, aversion, and so forth. Because in depend-
ence upon observing them, afflictions can be produced, these phenomena
are said to be contaminated by way of being an object of observation.\(^d\)

The other type of contamination is to be contaminated by way of as-
sociation.\(^e\) For instance, there are the five omnipresent (*kun 'gro, sar-
vatraga*) mental factors: feeling, discrimination, intention, mental engage-
ment, and contact.\(^f\) These are called “omnipresent” because they accom-
pany, or are associated with, all main minds. Whether a main mind is vir-
tuous, non-virtuous, or neutral, these five omnipresent mental factors ac-
company it; once something is a main mind, it is necessarily accompanied
by these five. Take for example a path. Whether a path is contaminated or
uncontaminated, since there necessarily is a mind that is the entity of that
path, these five omnipresent mental factors necessarily accompany it. Simi-
larly, an afflicted mind would also be accompanied by the five omnipres-
ent mental factors. Because in that case these five mental factors would be
accompanying an afflicted, or contaminated, mind, they themselves would
be cases of phenomena contaminated by way of association.

In the system of the Middle Way Autonomists, the meaning of con-
taminated and uncontaminated is posited by way of four approaches:

1. The first is called a contaminated phenomenon that is a cyclic exist-

\(^a\) *Abhidharmakośa, chos mngon pa'i mdo*, Peking 5590, vol. 115.
\(^b\) *Abhidharmasamuccaya, mngon pa kun btsus*, Peking 5550, vol. 112.
\(^c\) See Sopa and Hopkins, *Cutting Through Appearances*, 187-192, for more detail on the
explanation of contamination and noncontamination according to this system.
\(^d\) *dmigs pa'i sgo nas zag pa dang bcas pa*.
\(^e\) *mtshungs ldan gyi sgo nas zag pa dang bcas pa*.
\(^f\) *tshor ba, vedanā; 'du shes, samjñā; sens pa, cetanā; yid la byed pa, manasikāra; reg pa, sparśa.*
is included with cyclic existence and has as its causes actions and afflictions that are sources of suffering. Illustrations of this are the impure environment and the impure beings in the environment.

2. The next are contaminated phenomena that are conceptual consciousnesses (rtog pa'i zag pa dang bcas pa). A conceptual, or thought, consciousness is a one that apprehends a sound-generality and meaning-generality as suitable to be associated. Within this type of consciousness, there are no sense consciousnesses, but only mental consciousnesses. A sound-generality (sgra spyi) is the appearance of a pot, for instance, to a conceptual consciousness just in dependence upon hearing or thinking the term “pot” [without knowing its meaning]. A meaning-generality (don spyi) is the appearance of a pot, for instance, to a conceptual consciousness apprehending a pot, not like the eye’s seeing it, but in a rough general manner. These consciousness that engage their objects by way of the appearance of sound- or meaning-generalities and are unable to engage their objects directly in the way that the eye consciousness comprehends forms are said to be determinative knowers in which sound- and meaning-generalities are suitable to be associated and are said to be contaminated phenomena which are conceptual consciousnesses. Although this does not appear in the books, I will make up an example: For instance, if you were looking at an object through a nylon curtain, you would not see the object clearly, but only vaguely. It is that sort of an appearance. Thus this mixture of the sound-generality and the meaning-generality acts as an interference between the mind and the object, preventing the object from being known just as it is, and this is “conceptual contamination” or contaminated phenomenon of a conceptual consciousness.

3. The next is contaminated phenomena of the afflictions (nyon mongs pa'i zag pa dang bcas pa). Afflictions are those mental factors that cause the mind to be unserviceable in the sense of being unable to direct it toward virtues; they cause the mind to be unpeaceful. If we divide them, there are the six basic, or root, afflictions and the twenty secondary afflictions.a Contaminated phenomena of the afflictions are either the afflictions themselves or are mental phenomena associated with the afflictions—that is, that come to be afflicted through being associated with the afflictions.

4. We use the term, “afflictive obstructions” (nyon mongs pa'i sgrih pa). What do they obstruct? These mainly obstruct, or prevent liberation from cyclic existence. There are also obstructions to objects of

---

a For a list of these, see Lati Rinpocheday and Elizabeth Napper, Mind in Tibetan Buddhism (Ithaca, NY: Snow Lion 1986), 37-38.
knowledge, or to omniscience (*shes bya'i sgrib pa*). From between liberation and omniscience, those which mainly prevent the attainment of omniscience are called obstructions to objects of knowledge because they mainly obstruct attainment of an exalted knower of everything, an omniscient consciousness. An omniscient consciousness understands without remainder all objects of knowledge in all their divisions, these being the modes and the varieties. The conception that phenomena, which are not truly established, are so established, along with the predispositions established by it, acts as an obstacle to realizing all of the phenomena of the modes and the varieties. Because such conceptions are obstacles to realizing the noumenon just as it is, they are called obstructions to objects of knowledge, “phenomena” and “objects of knowledge” being equivalent.

Thus, the fourth division of contaminated phenomena is called contaminated phenomena of the obstructions to omniscience (*shes bya'i sgrib pa'i zag pa dang bcas pa*). This refers to a consciousness that either is an obstruction to omniscience or is polluted with the appearance of true existence (*bden par grub pa'i snang ba*). Hence, even if a consciousness is not itself an obstruction to omniscience, if it is an awareness having the appearance of true existence, then it is said to be together with the obstructions to omniscience (*shes bya'i sgrib pa dang bcas pa*). Once something is together with the obstructions to omniscience, it is a contaminated phenomenon of the obstructions to omniscience. Such awarenesses come to have the appearance of true existence through the force of predispositions established by the conception of true existence, that is, through pollution by the obstructions to omniscience, and thus these consciousnesses also are called contaminated phenomena of the obstructions to omniscience.

Hence, in the system of Haribhadra and Āryavimuktisena, whatever has any of these four types of contamination is a case of a contaminated phenomenon (*zag pa dang bcas pa*). A consciousness that does not have any of these four is called an uncontaminated consciousness; a path free of these is called an uncontaminated path. Since this is how in this system contaminated and uncontaminated are delineated, except for a meditative equipoise directly realizing emptiness most consciousnesses are contaminated.

### e. Three realms and nine levels

And, by adding the eight concentrations and absorptions[—the four concentrations: first, second, third, and
fourth; and the four formless absorptions: limitless space, limitless consciousness, nothingness, and the peak of cyclic existence—]to the desire mind, there are the three realms and nine levels.\(^a\)

The first of the nine levels is the mind of the Desire Realm (\textit{\'dod pa \textasciitilde i sems}) or the Desire Realm (\textit{\'dod kham}). In non-contaminated form, one can say of the higher ones that it makes no difference whether one says “mind” (\textit{sems}) or “realm” (\textit{kham}). But the desire mind must be uncontaminated. In addition, there are the four concentrations—first, second, third, and fourth—and the four formless absorptions—limitless space, limitless consciousness, nothingness, and peak of cyclic existence. The three realms are the Desire Realm (\textit{\'dod kham}), Form Realm (\textit{gzugs kham}), and Formless Realm (\textit{gzugs med kham}).

\textbf{The three realms and nine levels of cyclic existence}\(^b\)

(from the highest levels to the lowest)

III. Formless Realm (\textit{gzugs med kham}, \textit{\=ar\=apyadh\=atu})
1. Peak of Cyclic Existence (\textit{srid rtsa}, \textit{bhavagra})
2. Nothingness (\textit{ci yang med}, \textit{\=akimcaya})
3. Limitless Consciousness (\textit{rnam shes mtha\textasciitilde yas}, \textit{vij\=anan\=antya})
4. Limitless Space (\textit{nam mkha\textasciitilde mtha\textasciitilde yas}, \textit{\=aka\=san\=antya})

II. Form Realm (\textit{gzugs kham}, \textit{\=rapadh\=atu})
1. Fourth Concentration (\textit{bsam gtan bzhi pa}, \textit{caturthadhy\=an})
2. Third Concentration (\textit{bsam gtan gsum pa}, \textit{trit\=iyadh\=an})
3. Second Concentration (\textit{bsam gtan gnyis pa}, \textit{dvit\=iyadh\=an})
4. First Concentration (\textit{bsam gtan dang po}, \textit{prathamadh\=an})

I. and 1. Desire Realm (\textit{\=dod kham}, \textit{\=k\=amadh\=atu})
Gods of the Desire Realm (\textit{\=dod kham kyi lha}, \textit{\=k\=amadh\=atu\=deva})

\(^a\) Here the translation of the Tibetan \textit{sa} has shifted from “ground” to “level” as it fits better in this context.

\(^b\) Chart adapted from Leah Zahler, \textit{Study and Practice of Meditation: Tibetan Interpretations of the Concentrations and Formless Absorptions} (Ithaca, N.Y.: Snow Lion Publications, 2009), 192.
Those Who Make Use of Others’ Emanations (gzhan 'phrul dbang byed, paranirmitavasavartin)
Those Who Enjoy Emanation ( 'phrul dga’, nirmāṇarati)
Joyous Land (dga’ ldan, tuṣīta)
Land Without Combat ( ’thab bral, yāma)
Heaven of Thirty-Three (sum cu rtsa gsum, trayastriṃśa)
Four Great Royal Lineages (rgyal chen rigs bzhi, cāturmahārājakāyika)
Demigods (lha ma yin, asura)
Humans (mi, manusya)
Animals (dud ’gro, tiryañač)
Hungry ghosts (yi dvags, preta)
Hell-beings (dmyal ba, nāraka)

g. Eight lesser grounds

Also there are the eight lesser grounds.a

This is the last division of grounds mentioned.
The main type of ground that is being delineated here is that ground which is within the set “grounds and paths.”

[3. Grounds within the set of “grounds and paths”]

[a. Definition]

A clear realization of one who has entered the path that serves as a basis of the many good qualities that are its fruit is the definition of a ground within the set of the two, grounds and paths.

a See later in this chapter, 69 to 91, where these eight are enumerated and discussed in detail.
A ground is a clear realization in the continuum of a person who has entered the path. An effect, or fruit, is that which is produced, and a cause is the producer of it. Good qualities (yon tan, guna) are those that help oneself in a temporary or in a deep way, whereas those that harm one superficially or deeply are defects (skyon, doṣa). The two are opposites. Basis (gzhi rten) means root; a ground acts as the root of these many good qualities that help oneself. “Entered the path” (lam zhugs) means that, at minimum, the person has entered the path of accumulation (tshogs lam, sambhāramārga) of any of the vehicles—Hearer, Solitary Victor, or Great Vehicle—that is, has generated such a path in their continuum. A clear realization (mngon rtogs, abhisamaya) is a consciousness and is equivalent with a pristine wisdom (ye shes, jñāna) and exalted knowledge (mkhyen pa).

Regarding the etymology of clear realization, it must be noted that etymologies do not always apply to the thing under discussion. For example, lotuses are called lake-born (mtsho skyes, saraja) but a lotus that grows on dry land is also called lake-born, even though the etymology does not apply to it. Hence, an etymology does not necessarily apply to all instances; it can be narrower, as in the above example of a dry land lotus. Or it can be wider than the actual thing; for instance, there are things that grow in a lake that are not lotuses, such as grass. These are not called lake-born, although they are born from a lake.

Hence, whatever is a clear realization does not necessarily fulfill the etymology of clear realization. That being understood, the etymology of clear realization is that which directly realizes its own object of meditation (rang gi bsgom bya’i don mngon sum du rtogs pa). However, there are four possibilities (mu bzhi) between clear realization and its etymology. Great compassion (snying rje chen po) and the altruistic aspiration to enlightenment (byang chub kyi sems, bodhicitta) are clear realizations but are not consciousnesses directly realizing their own object of meditation [because they are not consciousnesses that “realize” any object]. A clairvoyant consciousness knowing another’s mind that is possessed by a person who has not entered the path directly realizes its own object of meditation but is not a clear realization. A pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise on the path of seeing is both a clear realization and that which directly realizes its own object of meditation. Thus, whatever exists in the manner of this etymology is not necessarily a clear realization and whatever is a clear realization does not necessarily exist in the manner of this etymology.
General Indication of Grounds and Paths

[b. Divisions of grounds within the set of grounds and paths]

1) Hearer, Solitary Victor, and Bodhisattva Grounds]

When grounds within the set of grounds and paths are divided, there are three: Hearer grounds, Solitary Victor grounds, and Bodhisattva grounds.

These three are called grounds because, just as the earth serves as a basis of orchards, forests, and so forth, so since these serve as the basis of the many good qualities of those [three—Hearer, Solitary Victors, and Bodhisattvas—] who have entered the path, they are called thus.

These three are called grounds from the viewpoint of a similarity of function with actual ground, or earth. “Orchards” refers to domesticated trees, particularly those bearing fruit, whereas “forests” has the sense of bodies of trees too numerous to count, as in a jungle. “And so forth” would include everything else—houses, roads, fields—anything you can think of. What acts as the basis for all of these? Earth, or ground. Just so, these clear realizations serve as the basis of the many higher qualities of those who have entered the path, and from this viewpoint are called grounds.

For instance, the Hearer path of accumulation has three parts: lesser, medium, and greater. The path of preparation (sbyor lam, prayogamārga) has four sections: heat (drod, ūṣma), peak (rtse mo, mūrdham), forbearance (bzod pa, kṣānti), and supreme mundane qualities (chos mchog, agradharmatā). Above it is the path of seeing (mthong lam, darśanamārga), and above it the path of meditation (sgom lam, bhāvanāmārga) with its
nine cycles. The lesser path of the Hearer path of accumulation serves as a basis for the generation of all the paths that are higher than it—all those from the medium path of accumulation on up. Similarly, the medium path of accumulation serves as a basis for the generation of all the paths from the greater path of accumulation on up. The greater path of accumulation serves as a basis, or a cause, for the generation of all the paths from the heat level of the path of preparation on up. The heat level of the path of preparation serves as a basis for the generation of the other higher levels of the path of preparation, the paths of seeing, meditation, and so forth. And the same is true for the remaining levels of the paths, each serving as basis for the generation of the levels above it. Of what does the path of no-more-learning (mi slob lam, aśaikṣamārga) serve as a basis since there are no paths higher than it? The path of no-more-learning does not necessarily have to serve as a basis for the attainment of something not yet attained, but, from among the nirvāṇas with and without remainder, one can say that it serves as the basis for the attainment of the nirvāṇa without remainder (lhag med myang 'das), which has not been attained.

Hence, these are called “grounds” because of serving as the basis of many good qualities, and they do so not only in the sense of producing that which has not been produced but also serve as causes for the maintenance and the non-degeneration of what has been produced.

The meaning of “path” (lam, mārga) in the phrase “one who has entered the path” is that the Superiors (’phags pa, ārya) of the past proceeded with these types of contemplations and thoughts and those Superiors of the future will also proceed with these same contemplations. From this point of view, these are called paths.

2) GROUNDS OF THE LESSER VEHICLE AND THE GREAT VEHICLE

When those [grounds within the two-fold division into grounds and paths] are divided by way of inferiority and superiority, there are two: grounds of the Lesser Vehicle and grounds of the Great Vehicle.

Paths are called “vehicles” because one must proceed successively, up
through the paths of accumulation, preparation, seeing, meditation, and no-more-learning; from this point of view, the paths are called vehicles, [in the sense that they carry one progressively upwards]. The paths of Hearers and Solitary Victors are called lesser paths. They are called “lesser” because Hearers and Solitary Victors have abandoned seeking the welfare of sentient beings, one’s aged mothers, who from beginningless cyclic existence have sustained one with very great kindness, and are making effort at the path for their own welfare, seeking mainly their own liberation from cyclic existence. Therefore, the grounds of Hearers and the Solitary Victors are called lesser grounds, or grounds of the Lesser Vehicle.

Bodhisattvas, from within one’s own welfare and others’ welfare, take others’ welfare as chief, and for the sake of freeing others from suffering are willing to take upon themselves the burden of others’ suffering. Between self and others, they cherish others more than themselves, and due to this vastness of thought, their grounds are called the grounds of the Great Vehicle.

**A) GROUNDS OF THE LESSER VEHICLE: EIGHT LESSER GROUNDS**

When grounds of the Lesser Vehicle are divided, there are the eight lesser grounds.

Within the Lesser Vehicle, we speak of the four Approachers to the Fruit and the four Abiders in the Fruit:

Approacher to Stream Enterer and Abider in the Fruit of Stream Enterer
Approacher to Once Returner and Abider in the Fruit of Once Returner
Approacher to Never Returner and Abider in the Fruit of Never Returner
Approacher to Foe Destroyer and Abider in the Fruit of Foe Destroyer.{a}

There are thus four pairs making eight. Haribhadra, in his *Clear Meaning Short Commentary (grel chung don gsal)*, a commentary that gets its name

---

{a} *rgyan zhugs zhugs pa dang rgyan zhugs 'bras gnas; phyir 'ong zhugs pa dang phyir 'ong 'bras gnas; phyir mi 'ong zhugs pa dang phyir mi 'ong 'bras gnas; dgra bcom zhugs pa dang dgra bcom 'bras gnas.* See below, 76 to 91, for an extended discussion of these eight. See also Sopa and Hopkins, *Cutting Through Appearances*, 212-214.
because it is short and has clear meaning, \(^{a}\) gave a somewhat unusual version of the eight lesser grounds, in that he omitted the first Approacher [Approacher to Stream Enterer] and took the clear realizations, or the paths, of the latter three Approachers—the Approchers to Once Returner, Never Returner, and Foe Destroyer—and treated them as one among the eight lesser grounds, calling them the “ground of Hearers.”

In Haribhadra’s *Clear Meaning Short Commentary* [or *Clear Meaning Commentary*], his calling the clear realizations of the latter three Approchers [Approacher to Once Returner, Approacher to Never Returner and Approacher to Foe Destroyer] the “ground of Hearers” within the enumeration of the eight [lesser] grounds is for the sake of presenting the mode of the three vehicles.

He did this so that one could clearly understand the presentation of the paths of the three vehicles—the Hearer Vehicle is such and such, the Solitary Victor Vehicle is such and such, and the Great Vehicle is such and such.

However, according to the general procedure of the scriptures, the eight lesser grounds are: (1) the ground of seeing the wholesome, (2) the ground of lineage, (3) the ground of the eighth, (4) the ground of seeing, (5) the ground of diminishment, (6) the ground of separation from desire, (7) the ground of realizing completion, (8) the ground of Solitary Victors.

\(^{a}\) The full title is: *Commentary on (Maitreya’s) “Ornament for the Clear Realizations, Treatise of Quintessential Instructions on the Perfection of Wisdom”* (abhisaṃyākāraṇāmaprajñāpāramitopadesāśāstraśvāttī; shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa’i man ngag gi bstan bcos mngon par rtogs pa’i rgyan ces bya ba’i ’grel pa). The more common short form of the title is *Clear Meaning Commentary* (spuṭhārtha, ’grel pa don gsaf), Peking 5191, vol. 90.
What Haribhadra did in his *Clear Meaning Commentary* was to eliminate the first, the ground of seeing the wholesome, and begin with the second, the ground of lineage. Then, between the ground of realizing completion and that of Solitary Victors, the seventh and eighth in the general list, he added in a new category, called the ground, or level, of Hearers. [Thus, his list makes explicit mention of both Hearers and Solitary Victors, unlike the more widely used list which explicitly mentions only Solitary Victors.]

1' Ground of seeing the wholesome

Illustrations of these are, respectively, as follows: The path of accumulation of Hearers is called the ground of seeing the wholesome because it is the path of initially seeing the wholesome phenomena of purification.

These are not just illustrations but are explanations of their meanings, rather like etymologies. There would not be any grounds of seeing the wholesome *within this eightfold division* that were not Hearer paths of accumulation, but, in general, not just Hearers but also Solitary Victors and Bodhisattvas have paths of initially seeing the wholesome phenomena of purification.

---

* a Hence, the list according to Haribhadra is: (1) the ground of lineage, (2) the ground of the eighth, (3) the ground of seeing, (4) the ground of diminishment, (5) the ground of separation from desire, (6) the ground of realizing completion, (7) the ground of Hearers, and (8) the ground of Solitary Victors.
To locate this in terms of the previous discussion of the beings of the three capacities, when one turns one’s mind towards the doctrine, first one turns away from the affairs of this life, seeing them as not having much import, and so one’s attachment to this life diminishes. Subsequent to this, when one thinks about the happiness of cyclic existence within a future cyclic existence, one contemplates the general and specific defects of cyclic existence, as well as the sixteen aspects of the four noble truths, and so on, and an attitude intent upon attaining high status within a future cyclic existence becomes weaker.

Then one understands that the root of cyclic existence is the conception of self, ignorance, that cyclic existence is an effect of actions and afflictions, which themselves have the conception of self as their root. When there arises a thought wishing to attain, for one’s own sake alone, the liberation in which, having abandoned the root of cyclic existence, one need never take rebirth again in it, and when this thought arises strongly all the time, day and night, then one has developed a non-artificial awareness seeking the Hearer liberation and has attained the Hearer path of accumulation. This arises in dependence on contemplating again and again for a long time the defects of true sufferings and true sources and the advantages of true cessations and true paths.

In the text, “phenomena of purification” (rnam byang gi chos) refers to liberation from cyclic existence, along with its causes, to a true cessation. Because this person has a strong, unusual awareness seeking liberation, he or she generates strong faith observing the phenomena of purification, that is, observing liberation, a wish to attain liberation. Because it is a path on the occasion of initially attaining—in a strong and non-artificial form—an awareness wishing to attain liberation, and because that awareness is observing the wholesome phenomena of purification, it is called the path of initially seeing the wholesome phenomena of purification.

The reversal of attachment to all forms of cyclic existence is called a thought of definite emergence, or a thought definitely to leave cyclic existence. When, by way of generating such a mind of definite emergence from cyclic existence, one develops a strong non-artificial consciousness seeking liberation, then whatever virtue one engages in becomes a cause of liberation, and the clear realizations in the continuum of such a person are called paths of accumulation. At that point the person attains the path of accumulation of a Hearer.

Here, the text says, “seeing” (mthong) the wholesome phenomenon of purification, but this does not refer to seeing in the way an eye sees a form; the terms “see” and “realize” (rtogs pa) are also used to mean “actualize”
(mgon du byed pa) or “attain” (thob pa), and these are the meaning here. We can understand that this is so from the way the term is used in a passage from Haribhadra that provides the transition to the second chapter of Maitreya’s *Clear Ornament for Realization*. Haribhadra uses the term “realize” (rtogs pa) for the term “to attain” (thob pa). What he says literally is that in order to realize an exalted-knower-of-all-aspects, it is necessary to know a knower of paths—and what this means is that in order to “attain” an exalted-knower-of-all-aspects, it is necessary to “attain” a knower of paths.

In general, when one says “seeing the wholesome phenomenon of purification,” it would be suitable to take the word *mthong* as referring to “seeing,” meaning taking the wholesome phenomenon as an object; however, in this case, the “phenomenon of purification” is liberation. This ground is that of initially seeing in a non-fabricated manner the wholesome phenomenon of purification, of initially generating this path in one’s mental continuum, that is to say, of initially attaining the uncommon cause for the attainment of liberation. Thus it is better to take “seeing” as meaning “to attain.” It would be possible to explain it in the general sense of taking the wholesome phenomena of purification as an object, for even prior to the path of accumulation it is possible to generate an inferring consciousness that has liberation as its object. However, when the meaning is taken in this general way, the path of accumulation would not be the occasion of “initial” seeing; hence it is preferable to posit the meaning of “seeing” from the viewpoint of the path of accumulation being the point of initially beginning the accumulation of the uncommon causes for the attainment of liberation—of its being a path when having initially attained the complete factors of method for the attainment of liberation.

In this way, the Hearer path of accumulation is called the ground of seeing the wholesome because it is the path of initially seeing, or attaining, the wholesome phenomena of purification. Hearer paths of accumulation are of three types: greater, medium, and lesser.

2' Ground of lineage

The Hearer path of preparation is called the ground of lineage because from that [path of preparation] one attains non-mistakenness with regard to one’s [Hearer] lineage.

---

*a Explanation of the “Eight Thousand Perfection of Wisdom Sūtra”: Illumination of (Maitreya’s) “Ornament for the Clear Realizations,” sde dge 3791, shes phyin vol. 85, 73a.2-73a.3: rnam pa thams cad mkhyen pa nyid rtogs pa ni [73a.3] lam shes pa nyid yongs su shes pa med na ma yin pas lam shes pa ni de’i tshe yang zhes bya ba la sogs pa gsungs pa yin te…*
How many Hearer paths of preparation are there that are called grounds of lineage? The path of preparation is divided into four: heat, peak, forbearance, and supreme mundane qualities [and all of them are called grounds of lineage].

The reason for calling the Hearer path of preparation that is initially generated the “heat” path of preparation is because one has initially attained the capacity to overcome the manifest form of the artificial conception of self. The conception of self (bdag 'dzin) is of two varieties: artificial (kun btags) and innate (lhan skyes). The artificial is abandoned at the time of the path of seeing, and the innate over the course of the path of meditation. There are two varieties of each of these: one is the manifest form (mngon gyur ba), the other is the seed form (sa bon), or predispositions.\(^a\) At the time of attaining the heat level of the path of preparation, one initially attains the capacity for overcoming specifically the manifest form of the artificial conception of self; therefore, it is called “heat.” In order to burn fuel it is necessary for the fuel to become warm or hot; once the fuel is hot—and not before—the fire will quickly ignite; just so, at this point one is attaining an initial capacity to overcome the artificial form of the conception of self along with its seeds, like heating the fuel. It is not the case that at this point the meditator actually undergoes a physical sensation of heat; rather, this is an example: to burn fuel you initially need heat.

The next level of the path of preparation is called “peak” because it is the peak of worldly virtues, and because the virtue of the heat path of preparation has increased higher and higher. The virtue of the heat level of the path of preparation [of Hearers] is identified mainly as the meditative stabilization that is a union of calm abiding and special insight realizing the selflessness of the person, and here that has increased higher and higher.

The forbearance path of preparation is so-called because on this level of the path of preparation, one initially attains a non-analytical cessation

\(^a\) Only the manifest forms of the artificial and innate conceptions are “conceptions of self,” since such must be consciousnesses. The seeds of these are non-associated compositional factors that will eventually ripen as consciousnesses; because the consciousness is just ready to arise, they are called “seeds” (sa bon). A previous consciousness ceases; a new one could be generated, and the potency that can give rise to it is called a “seed.”
that is a cessation of birth in a bad transmigration.\(^a\) From the forbearance level on up, one is no longer born in any of the bad transmigrations. Also, at this level, the five faculties, faith and so forth,\(^b\) are given the name “powers” (stobs). They exist prior to this level, but are not called “powers.”

Why is it called “forbearance” \((bzod\ pa)\)? There are three types of forbearance, or patience. The first is the usual type that we talk about when we are patient with those who harm us. It is called the forbearance that does not care about, or think about, harmers.\(^c\) This is not to engage in any thought about harm, even when someone strikes you or says something bad about you. You don’t think anything of it; you just let it go, throw it away.

The next is the forbearance that is a voluntary assumption of suffering.\(^d\) This is a case of assuming whatever hardship is necessary, for instance, for the achievement of doctrine. Being focused on future attainment of liberation for oneself or on attaining Buddhahood for the sake of all sentient beings, one is willing to undergo anything temporarily for the sake of this. Whether one has to undergo the suffering of heat or cold or physical deprivation or whatever, one does not think about that, but keeps one’s mind to the deeper purpose or aim.

The third is the forbearance of definite realization of the doctrine.\(^e\) At this level, one has attained a special forbearance with regard to the doctrine. Because one has realized well the doctrine, which here is the doctrine of selflessness, one cannot be overcome by the conception of self. One has attained realization of truth—selflessness, which in the Hearer Vehicle is the selflessness of persons—that cannot be overcome by the discordant class, the conception of self.

The fourth level of the path of preparation is called “supreme mundane quality” because, from among the paths of ordinary beings, it is the supreme of qualities. With peak we said that it was a peak of worldly virtues, but it is a peak in relation to heat, not in general. You might take the word “peak” as meaning like the point on the top of a victory banner, of which there is none higher, but it does not mean this; it means the sharp point of

\(^a\) \text{ngan 'gro'i skye ba 'gog pa'i so sor btags min gyi 'gog pa.}

\(^b\) These five are: faith, effort, mindfulness, meditative stabilization, and wisdom. For discussion on when they are called five “faculties” and when they are called five “powers,” see the footnote in Hopkins and Yi, \text{Jam-yang-shay-pa’s Seventy Topics}, 329-331, in the section on “Boundaries [of concordances with a portion of liberation].”

\(^c\) \text{gnod byed la ci mi snyam pa'i bzod pa.}

\(^d\) \text{sdug bsngal dwang len gyi bzod pa.}

\(^e\) \text{chos la nges rtogs kyi bzod pa.}
something—like the point, the tip of a knife, and so on the peak level of the path of preparation, the capacity for overcoming the manifest form of the artificial afflictions attained with the heat level has become sharper; it has improved. However, here with this fourth level of the path of preparation, because it is the best of the paths of an ordinary being, beyond which there is no better, it is called the “supreme mundane quality.” So here “quality” refers to a path.

A Hearer path of preparation is called the ground of lineage because this is when unmistakenness, that is, certainty, is attained with regard to one’s lineage. This means that one is definite within one’s own lineage and will not switch over to another; one who reaches this point within the Hearer path will definitely remain within the Hearer path and not switch over to the Solitary Victor or Bodhisattva paths.

3' Ground of the eighth

A clear realization of an Approacher to Stream Enterer is called the ground of the eighth because it is at this [ground of the eighth] that the first of the eight Approachers and Abiders—the four Approachers: Approacher to Stream Enterer, Once Returner, Never Returner, and Foe Destroyer; and the four Abiders in the Fruits—this being Approacher to Stream Enterer] is attained.

As was previously explained, there are four Approachers and four Abiders, making eight. The level of Approacher to Stream Enterer is the first if one counts by order of attainment of these, but if one counts from the highest level of attainment, then Abider in the Fruit of Foe Destroyer is the first, and Approacher to Stream Enterer is the eighth. Numbered thus, the list of eight is as follows:

8 Approacher to Stream Enterer
7 Abider in the Fruit of Stream Enterer
6 Approacher to Once Returner
5 Abider in the Fruit of Once Returner
4 Approacher to Never Returner
3 Abider in the Fruit of Never Returner
2 Approacher to Foe Destroyer
1 Abider in the Fruit of Foe Destroyer.

To explain a bit about the meaning, or entities, of these, an Approacher to Stream Enterer is a person who is engaged in exertion for the sake of attaining the Fruit of Stream Enterer. In order to understand what an Approacher to Stream Enterer is, it is necessary first to understand what an Abider in the Fruit of Stream Enterer is. A person who abides in the fruit of the way of virtuous endeavor that is included in the type that is distinguished by having abandoned the three thorough entanglements to be abandoned by the path of seeing is called an Abider in the Fruit of Stream Enterer.\(^a\)

The three thorough entanglements to be abandoned by the path of seeing are:

1. the artificial view of the transitory collection as a substantially existent \(I\);\(^b\)
2. conceiving bad systems of ethics and modes of conduct as supreme;\(^c\)
3. afflictive doubt.\(^d\)

The reason for saying that there are three thorough entanglements to be abandoned by the path of seeing can be explained through an example. If you want to go somewhere, there are three obstacles to arriving at a place:

1. not wishing to go there: one cannot arrive at a place if one does not want to go there.
2. mistaking the path: one will arrive in the wrong place if one goes by the wrong path.
3. having doubts regarding the path: one will not be able to proceed along a path if one is constantly having doubts about it.

The first of the three thorough entanglements, the artificial view of the transitory collection as a substantially existent \(I\), is a case of awareness which, observing the \(I\) within one’s continuum, conceives it to be established as substantially existent, that is, self-sufficient. Because this view is the opposite of the view of selflessness, when it is in one’s continuum one

---
\(a\) Tib: mthong spang kun byor gsum spongs pa’i rab tu phye pa’i rigs su gnas pa’i dge sbyong tshul gyi ’bras hu la gnas pa’i gang zag de.
\(b\) ’jig lia kun htags (’jig lia is a contraction for ’jig tshogs la lia ba, satkāyadrṣṭi).
\(c\) tshul khrims dang brtul zhugs mchog ’dzin.
\(d\) the tshom nyon mong s can.
Grounds and Paths

does not wish to achieve the liberation that is the abandonment of the con-
ception of self, the fruit of having abandoned what is to be abandoned by
the path of seeing. Thus it is like not wishing to go there.

Regarding the term “view of the transitory collection,” there are two
types, artificial and innate. What is being abandoned by the path of seeing
is the artificial view of the transitory collection. To give an etymology of
this term, it is a case of conceiving the I which is designated to the collec-
tion of the aggregates that are transitory, that is, that disintegrate moment-
arily, and which is not established as substantially existent in the sense of
being self-sufficient, as if it were so established.

The second of the three thorough entanglements is the conception of
bad systems of ethics and modes of conduct, which are not supreme, as
being supreme. It is like proceeding on a wrong path. The third thorough
entanglement, afflictive doubt, is like having doubts while going on the
path. There are many objects of abandonment by the path of seeing, but
this similarity with the main obstacles to arriving at one’s destination is
why these three are emphasized in this explanation.

The Hearer path of seeing is composed of an uninterrupted path and a
path of release. The uninterrupted path of a Hearer path of seeing is the
path of approaching Stream Enterer. Thus, a person abiding in the uninter-
rupted path of a Hearer path of seeing is called an Approacher to Stream
Enterer. (Here we are talking about Hearers who proceed gradually, in
steps. There are others who proceed in a different manner, as will be dis-

cussed later.) The path of release of a path of seeing is the state of having
abandoned, through the force of the uninterrupted path, the three thorough
entanglements, those which are to be abandoned by the path of seeing, in
a manner such that they will not be generated again. The initial attainment
of this path of release marks the attainment of the Fruit of Stream Enterer.
The path of release is called the Fruit of Stream Enterer, and a person who
abides in the path of release of the Hearer path of seeing is called an Abider
in the Fruit of Stream Enterer.

With regard to the Fruit of Stream Enterer there are two types:

1. the Fruit of Stream Enterer which is a product: This is the path of re-
lease of the path of seeing; it is the actual “fruit of stream enterer,” an
effect.

---

a See below, Chapter Three, 124-129, for a detailed description of uninterrupted paths (bar chad med lam) and paths of release (nam grol lam).
b There is a tradition that, following Asaṅga’s Summary of Manifest Knowledge, calls the
supreme mundane qualities level of the path of preparation (shyor lam chos mchog) “Ap-
proacher to Stream Enterer.” This is not the position of the Autonomists, which is being
set forth here.
2. the Fruit of Stream Enterer which is not a product and thus is “uncompounded” (`dus ma byas): This is the true cessation attained simultaneously with the path of release that is the state of having abandoned what is to be abandoned by the path of seeing, the three thorough entanglements.

The uncompounded fruit of Stream Enterer is not an actual effect (ˈbras bu) because an effect must be impermanent, whereas it is an effect of separation (bral ˈbras), which means an effect that is a state of having separated—here it is a state of having separated from the objects to be abandoned by the path of seeing. Because an effect that is a state of separation is attained through the power of having cultivated the uninterrupted path of the path of seeing, it is called an effect although it is not an actual effect. The name is given due to the similarity that just as an effect is produced through the force of its cause, so this separative effect is attained through the force of having attained the uninterrupted path.

Returning to the meaning of Abider in the fruit of Stream Enterer, such a person “abides in the fruit of the way of virtuous endeavor\(^a\) included in the type that is distinguished by having abandoned the three thorough entanglements to be abandoned by the path of seeing.” The term “the way of virtuous endeavor” indicates the uninterrupted path of the path of seeing. The ultimate virtuous endeavor is the Fruit of a Foe Destroyer. Although enlightenment is the state of Foe Destroyer, because the path of seeing is a temporary enlightenment (gnas skabs kyi byang chub), it is designated with the name “enlightenment.” Hence, the path of release of the path of seeing is also called “virtuous endeavor.” “way” (tshul) indicates a technique, or method, for attaining it; the method for achieving that path of release is the uninterrupted path of the path of seeing, and thus it is called the way of virtuous endeavor.

The “fruit” of the way of virtuous endeavor that this person has attained is the path of release of this path of seeing and also the true cessation attained simultaneously with the path of release.

To summarize, a person who abides in the fruit of such a way of virtuous endeavor is called an Abider in the Fruit of Stream Enterer. The path of release of the Hearer path of seeing is the abiding in the fruit of Stream Enterer and a person who abides in the path of release of the Hearer path of seeing is an Abider in the Fruit of Stream Enterer. Prior to this, a person who abides in the uninterrupted path of the Hearer path of seeing, this being effort for the sake of attaining the fruit of Stream Enterer, is an Approacher to Stream Enterer. The uninterrupted path of a Hearer path of

\(^a\) dge shyong tshul.
Grounds and Paths

seeing is the path of approaching Stream Enterer, and the person who abides in that path is an Approacher to Stream Enterer. Therefore, the clear realization of one who is approaching to Stream Enterer is called the eighth ground because the first from among the eight enterers and abiders is attained from this point.

4th Ground of seeing

A clear realization of an Abider in the Fruit of Stream Enterer is called a ground of seeing because one has for the first time by means of a supramundane path directly seen the selflessness of the person.

Here at this point one has initially seen the selflessness of the person directly, meaning that it was not seen by means of a generic image. “Supramundane” means “passed beyond the world,” passed beyond the state of an ordinary being. This is an uncontaminated path, uncontaminated and supramundane having the same meaning. “Mundane” refers to ordinary beings, and hence “supramundane” means passed beyond the levels of ordinary means. Thus, a supramundane path is a Superior’s (’phags pa, ārya) path.

Up to this point we have been discussing Enterers and Abiders in the Fruit of Stream Enterer. The next level of the eight has to do with an Abider in the Fruit of Once Returner. A person “abiding in the fruit of the way of virtuous endeavor that is included in the type distinguished by having mostly abandoned the five partial concordances with the lower” is called an Abider in the Fruit of Once Returner.a

To the three thorough entanglements described earlier we add two more:

1. aspiration to the Desire Realm (’dod pa la ’dun pa)\(^b\) and

\(^a\) tha ma’i cha mthun inga phel cher spongs pa’i rab tu phye’i rigs su gnas pa’i dge sbyong tshul gyi ’bras bu la gnas pa’i gang zag de phyir ’ong ’bras gnas zer gyi red.

\(^b\) When asked, Dan-ma-lo-chö agreed that this is the same as ’dod pa’i yon tan la ’dod pa, but preferred to leave it just as ’dod pa la ’dun pa.
2. harmful intent (gnod sems).

These are the five partial concordances with the lower (tha ma'i cha mthun lnga). Here, the “lower” is the Desire Realm, it being the lowest of the three realms, and these five are chief within the Desire Realm. They are included within the class of the Desire Realm.\(^a\)

The afflictions of the Desire Realm are discussed in a number of ways that mostly overlap but also are distinct, by two important sets of vocabulary: “aspiration to the Desire Realm” (\textit{dod pa la ‘dun pa}) and afflictions of the Desire Realm that are objects to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation (\textit{jig rten pa’i sgom spangs su gyur pa’i ‘dod pa’i nyon mongs}).\(^b\) The critical distinction between these two sets of terminology is that “aspiration to the Desire Realm” can only be abandoned by attaining the path of seeing, whereas “afflictions of the Desire Realm that are abandoned by way of a worldly path of meditation” can be gotten rid of by attaining an actual concentration. Hence, in general, there is a very large difference in terms of having attained or not attained the Hearer path of seeing. However, in terms of Once Returners and Never Returners, since both have attained the Hearer path of seeing, for them there is only a small difference.\(^c\)

The objects of abandonment in both cases are divided into three cycles of afflictions—great, medium, and small—each of which are again divided into three, making nine objects of abandonment,\(^d\) which are numbered here from the most coarse to the most subtle, for they are abandoned in that order. (The chart reads from bottom to top.)

\(^a\) ‘dod pa’i cha gtogs pa, or ‘dod pa’i cha dang mthun pa.
\(^b\) ‘jig rten pa’i sgom spangs su gyur pa’i ‘dod pa’i nyon mongs. It is important for debate that it be delineated so specifically. If one were to say merely “afflictions of the Desire Realm” (‘dod pa’i nyon mongs) one would be open to fault.
\(^c\) The basic explanation of the progression of eight Hearer Enterers and Abiders that comes forth through this discussion of the “Eight Lesser Grounds” is correlating those to progress over the five supramundane paths. However, it is also necessary to correlate those to the presentation of the afflictions that are abandoned by a worldly path of meditation, the abandonment of which leads to advanced levels of meditative concentration that can be attained by both Buddhists and non-Buddhists. Clarifying fine points of this correlation forms the subject matter of the next several pages. Although somewhat of a detour from the main subject matter of the text, it offers a fascinating view into the minute attention to technical detail of the Ge-lug scholastic debate tradition. For more on the distinctions between these two, see Zahler, \textit{Study and Practice of Meditation}, 190-195.
\(^d\) These are discussed very briefly in Sopa and Hopkins, \textit{Cutting Through Appearances}, 211-214, in the section on Paths in the Great Exposition School.
“Mostly” abandoned is said regarding Abiders in Once Returner because from among the nine varieties of aspiration to the Desire Realm, they have abandoned only the first two sets of three—the three great and three medium cycles of afflictions. Thus they are said to have mostly abandoned the partial concordances with the lower, that is, most of the afflictions pertaining to the Desire Realm. (There are also people who have abandoned even seven or eight, but none have abandoned all nine levels, or cycles, of aspiration to the attributes of the Desire Realm.) Those who have mostly abandoned the partial concordances with the lower are called Abiders in the Fruit of Once Returner.

There are Stream Enterers who have abandoned as many of these as the three great—great, medium, and small—as well as the great of the medium and the medium of the medium. They will not have abandoned more than two of the medium set. They can have done this, but there is no necessity that they must have done so; in fact, most will not have.

An Abider in the Fruit of Stream Enterer is said to be “a person who abides in the fruit of the way of virtuous endeavor that is included in the type that is distinguished by having abandoned the three thorough entanglements to be abandoned by the path of seeing.” “Abides in the type” is said because there are Stream Enterers who have abandoned the three great afflictions of the Desire Realm—the great, medium, and small of the great—that are to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation. Such Stream Enterers are not “distinguished by” having abandoned the three thorough entanglements to be abandoned by a path of seeing, for the statement “which is distinguished by” by itself indicates that the person has abandoned the three thorough entanglements that are to be abandoned by a path of seeing, but has not abandoned any objects of abandonment more subtle

---

a This usage of this verbal distinction becomes even more important later when discussing Once Returners and Never Returners. However, even here it serves a function.
than those, which this person has done. However, such a person can be said to “abide in the type that is distinguished by” that.\(^a\)

The point behind this is that there are some persons who, before generating the path of seeing, generate a worldly path of meditation. Through that worldly path of meditation they abandon the first three (the great, medium, and small of the great objects of abandonment by a worldly path of meditation), and then later attain the path of seeing. At that point, on the uninterrupted path of the path of seeing, they become Approachers to Stream Enterers, but they have done more than the general one has done.

We have been using as our example the abandoning of the first three (great, medium, and small of the great) afflictions of the Desire Realm that are objects of abandonment of a worldly path of meditation. There are also cases of abandoning the fourth and fifth as well, but not the sixth because if they reach the sixth, they become Once Returners.

Most persons attain the path of seeing first and then abandon these serially, but there are people who abandon as many as five without having attained the path of seeing, that is, prior to attaining it.

In summary, to relate this to the above chart of the nine afflictions of the Desire Realm that are objects to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation: an Abider in the Fruit of Once Returner is a person who has at least abandoned the first six of the nine. There are Abiders in the Fruit of Once Returner who have abandoned the seventh and the eighth, but there are also those who have not abandoned those. There are none who have abandoned the ninth (the small of the small). Stream Enterers can have abandoned as many as four or five, but not six; Once Returners must have abandoned the first six, and could (but need not) have abandoned seven or eight, but not all nine.

\section*{5' Ground of diminishment}

A person abiding in the fruit of the way of virtuous endeavor that is in-

\(^a\) In other words, there are Stream Enterers who have abandoned more than the three thorough entanglements to be abandoned by a path of seeing—for instance those who have abandoned the three great afflictions to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation. They do not fulfill the qualification “distinguished by” \textit{(rab tu phye ba)} since they have abandoned more objects of abandonment than just the three entanglements to be abandoned by a path of seeing, but they are those who “abide in the type” \textit{(rigs su gnas pa)} that is distinguished by…” From the viewpoint of type they can be \textit{said} to be “distinguished by” even though they are not “distinguished by” in that “distinguished by” means one has not abandoned more subtle objects of abandonment than the three thorough entanglements to be abandoned by a path of seeing and they have abandoned more than that.
cluded in the type distinguished by having mostly abandoned the five concordances with the lower is called an Abider in the Fruit of Once Returner. And:

A clear realization of an Abider in the Fruit of Once Returner is called a ground of diminishment because, having abandoned two of the three [sets of] the afflictions of the Desire Realm [that is, the three great and three medium of the nine afflictions], those have diminished.

The term “diminishment” in colloquial language means “thinning.” Here, afflictions of the Desire Realm that are to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation do still exist, but they are not “thick,” not potent, since at least six of the nine have been abandoned, and thus it is called a ground of diminishment.

Those at this level are called “Once Returners” because they will take rebirth once more in the Desire Realm by the power of actions and afflictions. If the person who attains the state of Abider in the Fruit of Once Returner does not in that life go higher than this and attain the state of Never Returner or Foe Destroyer, then the person is necessarily born one more time in the Desire Realm by the power of actions and afflictions. They could however attain in that lifetime the state of a Never Returner [to the Desire Realm] or a Foe Destroyer, and then they would not be reborn again in the Desire Realm.

A person “abiding in the fruit of the way of virtuous endeavor that is included in the type distinguished by having abandoned the five partial concordances with the lower” is called an Abider in the Fruit of Never Returner. The only difference between this and the definition of Abider in the Fruit of Once Returner is that the word “mostly” (phal cher) has been left out.

Because this person will never again take rebirth in the Desire Realm by the power of actions and afflictions, this person is called a Never Returner. This person can take rebirth in the Form and Formless Realms by the power of actions and afflictions but will never again do so in the Desire Realm. Why? Because this person has abandoned all nine of the afflictions
pertaining to the Desire Realm that are to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation. In general, afflictions pertaining to the Desire Realm that are abandoned by a worldly path of meditation are easier to abandon than aspiration to the desirable. So a Never Returner has abandoned all nine of the afflictions to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation but has not abandoned all aspiration to the desirable, because when one has done this, one has attained the fruit of Foe Destroyer.

Query: Might such a person take rebirth again in the Desire Realm by the power of aspirational prayers (smon lam)?

Response: Such would not occur since this is a description of Hearer grounds. Only Bodhisattvas would take rebirth in the Desire Realm when they did not have to, doing so by the power of aspiration.

6' Ground of separation from desire

A clear realization of an Abider in the Fruit of Never Returner is called a ground of separation from desire because [the person] has separated from desire for all the afflictions of the Desire Realm.

When the text says “clear realization” of one abiding in the Fruit of Never Returner, it is referring to the path, specifically the path of release, in the continuum of a person who is abiding in the fruit of the way of virtuous endeavor that is included in the type distinguished by having abandoned the five concordances with the lower. This is what is called a “ground” of separation from desire. “Separation from desire” is said because the person has separated from attachment (chags pa), or desire (‘dod chags)\(^a\) for all of the afflictions pertaining to the Desire Realm that are to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation.

To lay out in detail some of the terminology used to describe this, they

\(^a\) Dan-ma-lo-chö specified that the two are essentially the same. It is possible to make a difference in the sense that attachment (chags pa) can occur in the higher realms, whereas ‘dod chags, literally attachment to the Desire Realm, in the context of the three realms, is only found in the Desire Realm. So you can make a difference, but it depends on what you are talking about and what your purpose is. Some people do debate based on this distinction, but basically there is not a problem if you say that they are the same, and there is less error in saying this than in saying they are different.
have separated from desire (ʼdod chags) for all of the afflictions pertaining to the Desire Realm to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation (ʼjig rten paʾi sgom spangs su gyur paʾi ʼdod paʾi nyon mongs mtha dag la chags pa dang bral ba). They have abandoned aspiration for the Desire [Realm] (ʼdod pa la ʼdun pa), abandoned desire observing the desirable qualities of the Desire Realm (ʼdod paʾi ʼdod yon la dmigs paʾi ʼdod chags). Specifying the terminology in this way rules out any discussion of abandoning attachment observing the self.

There would be a verbal fault if one said that “all the afflictions pertaining to the Desire Realm” (ʼdod paʾi nyon mongs mthaʾdag) have been abandoned. For instance, it would be difficult for them to have abandoned desire observing the self. Attachment to the self of the desire, form, and formless realms are all equally hard to abandon. Hence, not until attaining the fruit of a Foe Destroyer will one abandon all afflictions pertaining to the Desire Realm. So all that is being specified here as abandoned is desire observing the five desirable aspects [of the Desire Realm] (ʼdod yon lnga la dmigs paʾi ʼdod chags), that is, that observing forms, sounds, odors, tastes, and tangible objects, or, attachment to the desirable qualities of the Desire [Realm] (ʼdod paʾi ʼdod yon la chags pa). Phrasing it this way rules out any discussion of abandoning attachment observing the self, which is important. What has been abandoned is a coarse attachment.a

Query: What is the difference between an affliction pertaining to the Desire Realm to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation and an affliction pertaining to the Desire Realm in general? Why do we say “worldly path of meditation?”

Response: An affliction, the desire for which one can separate from merely by attaining an actual concentration, is called an affliction of the Desire Realm to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation.b

Query: Have Abiders in the Fruit of Stream Enterer attained an actual concentration?

Response: Abiders in the Fruit of Stream Enterer have not attained an actual concentration—none of them. And they do not at all cultivate a worldly path of meditation. A worldly path of meditation is a path having an aspect of contaminated wisdom (zag bcas shes rab kyi rnam pa can gyi

---

a Dan-ma-lo-chö ended this discussion by concluding that he preferred limiting the description by specifying what the attachment was observing, namely the five desirable aspects (ʼdod paʾi ʼdod yon lnga la dmigs paʾi ʼdod chags) rather than using the long verbal phrase “to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation (ʼjig rten paʾi sgom spangs su gyur paʾi ʼdod paʾi nyon mongs) since the former qualification alone was enough to specify it as a coarse attachment.

b bsam gtan gyi dngos gzhi thob tsam gyis chags bral byed nus paʾi nyon mongs de la ʼjig rten paʾi sgom spangs su gyur paʾi ʼdod nyan.
Query: Why, after attaining Stream Enterer, would a Hearer then cultivate a worldly path?

Response: In the usual sense, a worldly path is a case of viewing the Desire Realm as coarse and the higher realms as peaceful—this sort of path does not occur in the continuum of a Superior. When we say that the fruits of Once Returner and Never Returner are attained in dependence upon worldly paths, those worldly paths are not those having an aspect of contaminated wisdom (zag bcas shes rab kyi rnam pa can) but rather are paths of the occasion of subsequent attainment having the contamination of conceptuality (rtog pa’i zag pa dang bcas pa’i rjes thob kyi gnas skabs kyi lam). These are paths, for instance, observing the four noble truths, taking true sufferings and sources as objects of abandonment and true cessations and paths as objects to be taken up. So, in this sense there is a viewing of grossness and subtleness and thus the designation of viewing grossness and subtlety is used, but it is not a case of viewing the lower level as gross and the upper level as subtle—all three realms are viewed in the same way [as cyclic existence]. That is the meaning here of worldly path and should not be mistaken by taking it to be a worldly path of meditation like that of non-Buddhists.

There are two types of afflictions, coarse (rags pa) and subtle (phra ba). Here we are talking about coarse afflictions—attachment to forms, sounds, odors, and so forth. Hence, the afflictions being abandoned in order to attain the fruit of Once Returner or Never Returner, are coarse afflictions. Why? When a person who has had the prior realization of a Stream Enterer abandons six of the afflictions pertaining to the Desire Realm that are abandoned by a worldly path of meditation, they attain the fruit of a Once Returner. When one abandons all nine with respect to the Desire Realm, one attains the actual first concentration and attains the state of an Abider in the Fruit of Never Returner; one is free from desire for the afflictions that are abandoned by a worldly path of meditation.

Query: How does one distinguish between coarse and subtle afflictions?

Response: For instance, the desire that observes any of the five attributes of the Desire Realm—a—pleasant forms, sounds, odors, tastes, touches—is a case of a coarse affliction. Such are illustrations of coarse afflictions, in the sense of being the main of those, but there are others included within it such as hatred and so forth. Desire or attachment to a self is a case of a subtle affliction—those afflictions that are of the entity

---

\(^{a}\)sd pa’i yon tan lnga la dmigs pa’i chags pa.

\(^{b}\)bdag la chags pa.
of a conception of a self of persons. Hence, the attainment of Once Returner and Never Returner is done in terms of the abandonment of these coarse afflictions, not in terms of the subtle afflictions.

Query: When are the subtle afflictions abandoned?

Response: A Once Returner is continuously abandoning the subtle afflictions; a Never Returner is also abandoning them. This is easily explained in terms of those who proceed in a serial manner, first attaining Stream Enterer, then Once Returner, then Never Returner, and then Foe Destroyer. However, there are also those who without attaining Stream Enterer, initially attain the fruit of a Once Returner—there is a Once Returner who has had preceding freedom from attachment. There are also those who without attaining the fruit of a Once Returner from the very beginning attain the fruit of a Never Returner—those who have had preceding freedom from attachment.

Query: If one just considers it in terms of gradualists, when do they abandon the subtle?

Response: The subtle are being abandoned along with the others—but not exactly the same ones. It is not that the subtle afflictions are not being abandoned as the person advances, but it is also not necessarily that the person is abandoning these same levels of the subtle afflictions as he or she proceeds. In any case, the presentation of Once Returner and Never Returner is done in terms of the abandonment of the coarse afflictions.

Query: How far can a non-Buddhist go in this list?

Response: Since non-Buddhists do attain actual concentrations, when they are able to abandon the afflictions pertaining to the Desire Realm and so forth that are abandoned by a worldly path of meditation in dependence upon seeing the lower realm as gross and the higher realms as peaceful, and thus when they attain that freedom from attachment, they attain actual concentrations. However, in general, such a person has not abandoned anything that is to be abandoned by a path of meditation. For, they have not attained a path of seeing, or a path of preparation, or even a path of accumulation. They have not entered into the path at all.

7' Ground of realizing completion

A clear realization of a Hearer Foe Destroyer is called a ground of realizing completion because of having realized that one has completed the activities of one’s path.

---

[a] gang zag gi bdag ’dzin gyi ngo bor gyur pa’i nyan mongs de tsho.
[b] spang gyis spang gyis.
[c] chags bral sgon song gyi phyir ’ong dang chags bral sgon song gi phyir mi ’ong.
One realizes that one has brought to completion, that is, fully accomplished, the activities of one’s own path, which in this case is the Hearer path. These are the activities of realization and the activities of abandonment as one progresses along the paths of accumulation, preparation, seeing, meditation, and no-more-learning. Foe Destroyers know that they have completely done all of these.

8' Ground of a Solitary Victor

The clear realizations of a Solitary Victor are called grounds of a Solitary Victor because of being exalted knowers of one who possesses the quality of not needing to depend on another teacher in his or her last lifetime in mundane existence. The clear realizations of learner Solitary Victors are also included within this [ground of a Solitary Victor].

Mundane existence (srid pa) means cyclic existence (’khor ba). The “last” lifetime in cyclic existence means that lifetime following which the Solitary Victor need not again take rebirth in cyclic existence, the lifetime in which this person will attain the fruit of a Foe Destroyer. In that lifetime, the Solitary Victor who will actualize the fruit of a Foe Destroyer does not need to depend on another teacher to teach the doctrine, be this teacher a Supreme Emanation Body, or a Hearer, and so forth. Thus, even though Solitary Victors, literally in the Tibetan, Self-Buddhas (rang sngs rgyas) are not Buddhas (sngs rgyas), their paths, or clear realizations are called
grounds of “Self-Buddhas,” or “Self-Enlightened Ones” because they, in their last lifetime, actualize their enlightenment, the fruit of Foe Destroyer, through their own power without depending on another teacher to teach them how to train.

The illustration given here of a ground of a Solitary Victor is a clear realization in the continuum of a Solitary Victor Foe Destroyer; however, it is not the case that whatever is a ground of a Solitary Victor must be a clear realization of a Solitary Victor Foe Destroyer. The clear realizations of Solitary Victors on the paths of accumulation, preparation, seeing, and meditation are also all included with the category of grounds of Solitary Victors.

Approachers to Stream Enterer were included within the third of the eight lesser grounds, the ground of the eighth, but what about the paths of Approachers to Once Returner, Approachers to Never Returner, and Approachers to Foe Destroyer? Is it that they are not included anywhere in the eight?

Also, there is no fallacy that the clear realizations of the latter three Approachers [Approacher to Once Returner, Approacher to Never Returner, and Approacher to Foe Destroyer] are not included in these [eight lesser grounds] because they are included in the clear realizations of the three Abiders in the Fruit [the three, Abiders in the Fruit of Stream Enterer, Once Returner, and Never Returner].

In other words, Approachers to Once Returner, Never Returner, and Foe Destroyer are included in the three categories that cover Abiders in the fruit of Stream Enterer, Once Returner, and Never Returner.

This explanation is being given in terms of those who proceed gradually, step by step. From this viewpoint, there are two types of Abiders in the Fruit of Stream Enterer; one is called a mere (tsam po ba) Abider and the other is called a special (khyad par can) Abider. A mere Abider is a person who merely abides in the fruit and does not strive toward the next
higher step. Because they are not striving toward the next higher fruit, they are not Approachers to that higher fruit. Special abiders are striving to attain the higher fruit and thus are Approachers to that fruit. Therefore, a special Abider in the Fruit of Stream Enterer who proceeds gradually and an Approacher to Once Returner who proceeds in a gradual manner are the same [and thus there is no need to specify Approacher to Once Returner separately in the list, since it is the same as a special abider in the Fruit of Stream Enterer].

In essence, one becomes an Approacher to the next higher fruit at the point at which one begins effort towards attaining that fruit—one need not yet actually have gotten rid of any of the afflictions that must be overcome in order to attain that fruit. When one who is a mere Abider in the fruit of Stream Enterer and is not striving to become a Once Returner, begins striving to become a Once Returner, that person then becomes a special Abider

Thus, the three latter Approachers are included within Abiders in the fruits. An Approacher to Once Returner is included within Abider in the Fruit of Stream Enterer in the sense that a special Abider in the Fruit of Stream Enterer is an Approacher to Once Returner. And the same goes for Approacher to Never Returner and Approacher to Foe Destroyer. They are included within the lower Abider in the Fruit. This is how it is within the gradual mode of proceeding on the path. Because we are explaining the mode of progressing on the grounds and paths, it is sufficient to explain it in this way, and it is not necessary to explain those who proceed in a simultaneous manner or those who proceed in a leap-over manner as is explained in the lengthier books on the Perfection of Wisdom (phar phyin).

[UNCOMMON ASSERTIONS OF THE YOGIC MIDDLE WAY AUTONOMISTS]

The text now goes on to talk about the uncommon assertions of the Yogic Middle Way Autonomy School (yogacāra-svātantrika-mādhyamika). They are so called because they are Middle Way Autonomists (svātantrika-mādhyamika) who are like the proponents of Mind-Only (cittamātra, or yogacāra) in that they assert no external objects.

In this Yogic Middle Way Autonomy system, Hearers take the afflictions as their main objects of abandonment.
They seek as their main object of attainment the state of having abandoned the afflictions.

And Solitary Victors take the coarse obstructions to omniscience as their main objects of abandonment.

What are the obstructions to omniscience? From among liberation and omniscience, the obstructions that mainly hinder the attainment of omniscience, or an exalted-knower-of-all-aspects, are the subtle obstructions to omniscience. Here, in the context of the main object of abandonment of Solitary Victors, we are talking about the coarse obstructions to omniscience, which are conceptions of apprehending-subject and apprehended-object as different substantial entities. These are called the coarse obstructions to omniscience because of being harder to abandon and more subtle than the afflictive obstructions and of being coarser than the obstructions to omniscience. It would not be suitable to call them afflictive obstructions, for even Hearer Foe Destroyers have completely abandoned the afflictive obstructions. Thus, since they are more subtle than the afflictive obstructions and also more coarse than the [subtle] obstructions to omniscience, they are called coarse obstructions to omniscience. These conceptions of object and subject, or apprehended-object and apprehending-subject, as different substantial entities are the main object of abandonment of Solitary Victors.

Due to this fact [that Solitary Victors take the coarse obstructions to omniscience as their main object of abandonment], the eight Approachers and Abiders are not posited for Solitary Victors. And [for this same reason] the master [Haribhadra] also posits the first seven [from ground of seeing the wholesome up to ground of realizing completion] of the lesser grounds in terms of the clear realizations of Hearers and posits the ground of a Solitary Victor as an eighth lesser ground that is not included in any of the eight Approachers and Abiders.

a Correcting the 1999 TBRC *bla brang* (4a.6) and the 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (4a.5) from the past tense form of the verb, *spangs*, to the future form, *spang*, in accordance with the 2012 Mundgod digital edition (4.6).
Proponents of Mind-Only assert that there are no external objects and that all phenomena are of the entity of the mind, whereas Sūtra Middle Way Autonomists (sautrāntika-svātantrika-mādhyamika) are Middle Way Autonomists who assert that there are external objects. The masters of the Mind-Only system are Asaṅga, Vasubandhu, Dignāga, Dharmakīrti, and so forth. The masters of the Sūtra Middle Way Autonomy School are Bhāvaviveka, Jñānagarbha, and so forth.

Middle Way Consequentialists (prāśaṅgika-mādhyamika) assert that there is not even a particle of any phenomenon that exists from its own side, that is, is inherently established, and assert that the generation of an inferential consciousness does not need to depend on the statement of a syllogism but can occur depending on only the statement of a consequence. The actual inner thought of the masters Nāgārjuna, Āryadeva, and so forth is indeed that of the Middle Way Consequentialist system, but they did not clearly set forth the incorrectness of autonomous syllogisms and the need for consequences. Therefore, they are also taken by the Middle Way Autonomists to be their teachers, and thus they are called Proponents of the Middle Way of the model texts, that is, masters shared by both systems. The Middle Way Consequentialist masters are Buddhapālita, Chandrakīrti, Shāntideva, and so forth.

In the Mind-Only, Sūtra Middle Way Autonomy, and Consequentialist systems, all eight Approachers and Abiders are posited for Solitary Victors because both Hearers and
Solitary Victors have the same main object of abandonment.

In those systems, the eight Approachers and Abiders—Approacher to and Abider in Stream Enterer, Once Returner, Never Returner, and Foe Destroyer—are posited for Solitary Victors just as they are posited for Hearers because in those systems the main objects of abandonment of both Hearers and Solitary Victors are the same. What they are seeking to abandon and what they are seeking to attain are the same. Both seek mainly to attain a true cessation that is the state of having completely abandoned the afflictions.

[This concludes the discussion of the grounds of the Lesser Vehicle.]

\textbf{B) GROUNDS OF THE GREAT VEHICLE}

Second, when Great Vehicle grounds are divided, there are ten grounds. These will be explained later.\textsuperscript{a}

\textbf{[B. PATHS]}

1. Definition

An exalted knower of one who has entered a path that serves as a passageway opening the opportunity for progressing to the enlightenment that is its effect is the definition of a path.

\textsuperscript{a} Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po postpones the discussion of Great Vehicle grounds until later (see Chapter 6) and then, to conclude his general indication of the presentation of grounds and paths, begins a discussion of “paths.”
We will go through the definition of “path” in parts. Byang chub means enlightenment, and if we consider here the enlightenment of a Hearer, then the syllable byang refers to an enlightenment that is a state of having abandoned all of the afflictive obstructions. In the phrase “Hearer’s enlightenment” (nyan thos byang chub), the term chub means “realize,” and when the meaning is spelled out, it means a complete realization of the selflessness of the person that is qualified by having abandoned the afflictive obstructions.\textsuperscript{a} “Qualified by” (khyad par du byas pa) means “which has the quality of knowing that the afflictive obstructions have been thoroughly abandoned in a manner such that they will not occur again.” “Progressing” (bgrod pa) indicates the force, or capacity, for progressing to the state of having attained the abandonment of all of the afflictive obstructions and fully realizing the selflessness of the person qualified by the abandonment of the afflictive obstructions. “Opportunity” (go skabs) indicates having the chance, or ability, to do this. In “serve as a passageway” (phye shul) the word phye means opening, as for instance, a door; opening a door reveals, or allows, a passageway. If you are driving a car and there is a large boulder in the road, you would have to break it up into pieces and get it aside, thus opening up a passageway.

Thus, within this division of grounds and paths, the definition of a path is an exalted knower of one who has entered into the path that serves as an opening of a passageway allowing the opportunity of progressing to that enlightenment that is its own fruit. This is a spiritual path going to liberation and omniscience.

2. Synonymous equivalents

“Path of liberation,” “exalted knower,” “pristine wisdom,” “clear realization,” “mother,” and “vehicle” are synonymous equivalents. These [exalted knowers of one who has entered a path] are called “paths” because they cause one to progress to the state of liberation.

\textsuperscript{a} nyon sgrib spangs pa’i khyad par du byas pa’i gang zag gi bdag med rdzogs par riogs pa.
A “path of liberation,” or “liberating path” (thar lam) is so called because it is a path that allows progress to, opens up the pathway to, liberation. An “exalted knower” (mkhyen pa) is so called because it is unmistaken knowledge of a method for attaining that enlightenment that is one’s own object of attainment. “Pristine wisdom” (ye shes, jñāna) is the same. “Clear, or thorough, realization” (mngon rtogs, abhisamaya) is the same. A path is called a “mother” (yum) because it produces or gives birth in the future to that superior person (’phags pa, ārya) which is its own effect. It is called a “vehicle” (theg pa, yāna) or platform because it is like a ladder or set of stairs, with the lower leading to the higher.

These terms are all equivalent, or mutually inclusive, but they are used in various ways. The term “pristine wisdom” mainly refers to the wisdoms of meditative equipoise and of subsequent attainment, and in that sense the term is used primarily with reference to the paths of seeing and meditation—Superior paths. However, the actual meaning of the term is broader, including all paths. Similarly with the term “clear realization;” it is mostly seen in reference to Bodhisattva paths, that is, in Great Vehicle texts, but although you will see it mostly in that regard, you cannot say that it is necessarily or even mainly so. It is just that since we usually talk about the Bodhisattva paths, we see it in that context.

Many of these terms are primarily used in reference to the path of seeing and above. For instance, with regard to the term “mother,” some raise qualms about using this term for the paths of accumulation and preparation of Hearers. Perfection of Wisdom texts speak of the three mothers, or three exalted knowers—exalted-knowers-of-all-aspects, knowers of paths, and knowers of bases. A The only one of those that Hearers and Solitary Victors could have is a knower of bases, and it occurs in the continuums of Hearer and Solitary Victor Superiors but not in the continuums of Hearers or Solitary Victors on the paths of accumulation or preparation.

Nonetheless, the position of Go-mang is that all these terms are equivalent because they fulfill the basic meanings of the terms, even if they are

\[\text{rnam mkhyen/ rnam pa thams cad mkhyen pa, lam shes, gzhi shes. See Hopkins and Yi, Jam-yang-shay-pa’s Seventy Topics, where this presentation is extensively laid out.}\]
not the most common referent. For Go-mang, the “mother” included in this list is not that included in discussion of the three exalted knowers—knowers of bases, knowers of paths, and exalted knowers-of-all-aspects. That is the main context where the term “mother” is used, but is not the only context. Here in this context it means that in dependence upon which one progresses higher and higher. Hence in spite of the above qualm, “mother” is a valid synonym for liberating path and the other items in the list. There is a similar problem regarding the term “path” (lam). Many take it to mean “true paths” (lam bden). However, true paths occur with the path of seeing upon direct realization of the truth (bden pa mngon sum du rtags pa). Hence some non-Ge-lug traditions say that the paths of accumulation and preparation are not actual paths, which begin only with the path of seeing. For Ge-lug, however, not all paths are true paths and all five paths are actual paths.a

One etymology of the term “vehicle” is what holds something up, preventing something from falling down, a platform, rising up step by step. “Vehicle” is also etymologized as a mount, on which one ascends and rides. Of course, these are not meant in a literal sense, but as examples in this context of the grounds and paths where we are talking about consciousnesses.

All of these terms are called paths because they cause progress to the state, or rank, of liberation. The word “liberation” here refers both to the liberation that a Foe Destroyer attains, the state of having abandoned all of the afflictive emotions, the abandonment of true sufferings and true sources, and to the great liberation, the enlightenment of a Buddha.

3. Divisions

Again, when those [paths] are divided by way of their entities, there are five: the paths of accumulation, preparation, seeing, meditation, and no-more-learning.

The first of these are the paths of accumulation.

---
a This paragraph of clarification comes from Lo-sang-gyal-tshan in response to the above qualm raised by Dan-ma-lo-chö.
a. Paths of accumulation

A clear realization of doctrine is the definition of a path of accumulation.

In many other texts the definition of path of accumulation is given as “that which is concordant with a portion of liberation.”

When [paths of accumulation are] divided, there are three: the paths of accumulation of the three vehicles [Hearers, Solitary Victors, and the Great Vehicle].

There are Hearer paths of accumulation, Solitary Victor paths of accumulation, and Great Vehicle paths of accumulation.

“Path of accumulation,” “ground of faith,” “concordance with a portion of liberation,” and “clear realization of doctrine” are synonymous equivalents.

There is a reason for calling a [clear realization of the doctrine] a “path of accumulation” because it is the first of

---

a thar pa cha mthun. This is often translated as “aid to liberation.” As Jam-yang-shay-pa (Seventy Topics, in commentary on the 36th Topic) says:

“Liberation” (thar pa) is so called because of having abandoned the afflictions. “Portion of liberation” (thar pa’i cha) is so called because of being one faction of it. A “concordance with a portion of liberation” is so called because of being that which aids liberation.

Thus, “concordance with a portion of liberation” is a word-translation, and “aid to liberation” is a “meaning-translation.” The former has been chosen because otherwise the final sentence of Jam-yang-shay-pa’s above statement would have to redundantly read:

An “aid to liberation” is so called because of being that which aids liberation.
the paths accumulating the collections [of merit and wisdom] for the sake of attaining the enlightenment of the vehicle of its path, due to which it is called such.

If one is a follower of the Hearer vehicle, this is the first of the paths accumulating the collections of merit and wisdom for the sake of attaining the enlightenment of the Hearer vehicle. If one is a follower of the Solitary Victor vehicle, this is the first of the paths accumulating the collections for the sake of attaining the enlightenment of the Solitary Victor vehicle, and so forth.

There is a reason for calling a [clear realization of doctrine] a “ground of faith” because it is a path that is a state of skillfulness mainly in the five objects, faith and so forth [faith, effort, mindfulness, meditative stabilization, and wisdom], due to which it is called such.

The five are faith (dad pa, śraddhā), effort (brtson ’grus, vīrya), mindfulness (dran pa, smṛti), meditative stabilization (ting nge ’dzin, samādhi), and wisdom (shes rab, prajñā).\(^a\) One has become skilled mainly in the

---

\(^a\) See Hopkins and Yi, *Jam-yang-shay-pa’s Seventy Topics*, in the section on Topic 36, Concordances with a Portion of Liberation. The stanzas from Maitreya’s *Ornament* that list these five (IV.33-34) are given with the meaning fleshed out by Ngag-wang-pal-dan’s word commentary, *Explanation of the Treatise “Ornament for the Clear Realizations” from the Approach of the Meaning of the Words: The Sacred Word of Maitreyanātha*, in the Backnotes in the section on topic 36, Concordances with a Portion of Liberation; and in the footnotes to *Jam-yang-shay-pa’s Seventy Topics* there is discussion of when they are given different names such as the five powers and five faculties in the section titled “Boundaries [of concordances with a portion of liberation].”
objects of those five. The object of faith is mainly here the enlightenment that is one’s object of attainment. Since faith is the first of these five, the path of accumulation is called the “ground of faith,” but in fact the person is skilled in all five.

With regard to why the path of accumulation is called a “concordance with a portion of liberation,” the analytical cessation that has abandoned all of the afflictive obstructions is liberation. Afflictive obstructions can be divided into the two, artificial and innate, and hence the true cessation that is the state of having abandoned one portion of the afflictive obstructions, the artificial afflictive obstructions, is a part of liberation (thar pa’i cha). Since the path of accumulation is the first of the paths of an occasion that accords with the attainment of a part of liberation, it is called a concordance with a portion of liberation.

There is a reason for calling a [clear realization of the doctrine] a “concordance with a portion of liberation” because a true cessation that is to have abandoned the afflic-
tive obstructions is liberation, and a true cessation that is to have abandoned the artificial afflictive obstructions that is one part of that [true cessation that is the state of having abandoned the afflictive obstructions] is a part of liberation, and this is a path of an occasion that accords with attaining this [true cessation that is to have abandoned the artificial afflictive obstructions], due to which it is called such.

There is a reason for calling [an exalted knower of the path of accumulation] a “clear realization of doctrine” because “doctrine” in the term “clear realization of doctrine”
is the twelve branches of the scriptures, and it is a state in
which, having observed those [twelve branches of the
scriptures] following sound-generalities, one reaches a
definitive conclusion about a Hearer’s clear realization of
the meaning [of the doctrine] mainly through hearing and
thinking, due to which it is called such.

This is an occasion on which one forms an understanding based on the
words of the twelve branches of scripture relying upon sound-generalities
and settles the main of the objects of meditation of one’s vehicle for the
sake of attaining the chief of the objects of attainment of one’s vehicle,
this being done mainly by way of hearing and thinking. In other words,
while observing the twelve branches of scripture, one proceeds by way of
sound-generalities in order to ascertain a clear realization of the meaning,
this being done through hearing and thinking. The clear realization of the
meaning is the path of preparation. What one is doing on the path of accu-
mulation is trying to settle, or ascertain, that meaning by way of sound-
generalities that are contacted by looking at the scriptures. Therefore, the
path of accumulation is called clear realization of doctrine, that is, scrip-
ture.

b. Paths of preparation

A clear realization of the meaning is the definition of
the path of preparation. When [paths of preparation] are
divided, there are three: Hearer paths of preparation, and
so forth [that is, Hearer, Solitary Victor, and Great Vehicle
paths of preparation].
“Path of preparation,” “concordance with a portion of definite discrimination,” “limb of definite discrimination,” and “clear realization of the meaning” are equivalent.

There is a reason for calling an [exalted knower in the continuum of one on the path of preparation] a “path of preparation” [or “path of connection”] because it connects to the path of seeing of the vehicle of its path, due to which it is called such.¹

One meaning of the Tibetan term “sbyor” is “to connect.” What does this path connect to? This path connects one to the path of seeing of one’s respective vehicle—the Hearer, Solitary Victor, or Great Vehicle. The path of preparation, or connection, is a clear realization of the meaning. A person who possesses this in his or her mental continuum is a person of the path of preparation/connection (sbyor lam pa). When that path of preparation, that consciousness, “connects” to the path of seeing, the consciousness becomes a path of seeing, and the person in whose mental continuum it is becomes a “person of the path of seeing” (mthong lam pa). In relation to the path of preparation, the path of seeing is in the future, and a person

¹ Hopkins and Yi, Jam-yang-shay-pa’s Seventy Topics, in a footnote on p.63, offer an explanation for the usage of the translation “path of preparation:"

The translation of sbyor lam (prayogamarga) as “path of preparation” is based on the oral explanation of it as analogous to preparing food for a meal—the meal being the path of seeing. Whether it is called preparation, training, connection, joining, or application, it has to do with preparing one for the path of seeing, the initial direct realization of emptiness.
of the path of seeing is in the future in relation to a person of the path of preparation.

There is a reason for calling an [exalted knower in the continuum of one on the path of preparation] a “concordance with a portion of definite discrimination” because “definite discrimination” is the path of seeing, and it assists a portion of that [path of seeing], due to which it is called such.

There is a reason for calling an [exalted knower in the continuum of one on the path of preparation] a “limb of definite discrimination” because it is a limb causing attainment of the path of seeing, its effect, due to which it is called such.

There is reason for calling an [exalted knower in the continuum of one on the path of preparation] a “clear realization of the meaning” because experience that is arisen from meditation has emerged with regard to any of the coarse or subtle selflessnesses that are the meanings of the scriptures, due to which it is called such.
The word “scriptures” (gsung rab) refers to the word of Buddha and the correct treatises that comment on that word. “Any coarse or subtle selflessness” means any one of the three: the subtle selflessness of phenomena, the coarse selflessness of phenomena, or the selflessness of persons. There are first states arisen from hearing, then states arisen from thinking, and then states arisen from meditation, which is the level reached at this point.

c. Paths of seeing

A clear realization of the truth is the definition of the path of seeing.

This “clear realization” (mngon rtogs, abhisamaya) is not just one of the usual clear realizations, but is the initial attainment of direct cognition—cognition not relying on a meaning-generality. The truth whose meaning is realized (bden pa'i don) is any of the selflessnesses, be it the selflessness of persons, the coarse selflessness of phenomena, or the subtle selflessness of phenomena.

When [paths of seeing] are divided, there are three: Hearer paths of seeing, and so forth [that is, Hearer, Solitary Victor, and Great Vehicle paths of seeing].

“Path of seeing,” “clear realization of the truth,” and “exalted knower in the continuum of one on the path of seeing” are equivalent.

There is a reason for calling an [exalted knower of one on the path of seeing] a “path of seeing” because it is a path
of newly realizing directly any of the coarse or subtle selflessnesses, due to which it is called such.

The path of seeing is attained through the power of having cultivated the path of preparation, and it is the path of newly, meaning initially, directly realizing the selflessness that is the respective object of realization of the meditator’s vehicle, either the subtle selflessness of phenomena, the coarse selflessness of phenomena, or the selflessness of persons.

There is a reason for calling an [exalted knower of one on the path of seeing] a “clear realization of the truth” because it is a path newly directly realizing the truth, due to which it is called such.

That finishes the path of seeing.

**d. Paths of meditation**

A subsequent clear realization is the definition of the path of meditation. When paths of meditation are divided, there are three: Hearer, [Solitary Victor, and Great Vehicle] paths of meditation. “Path of meditation,” “subsequent clear realization,” and “exalted knower of one on the path of meditation” are equivalent.
These are equivalent, or mutually inclusive.\(^a\)

There is a reason for calling an [exalted knower of one on the path of meditation] a “path of meditation” because one is meditating uninterruptedly\(^b\) on a selflessness that has already been realized directly, due to which it is called such.

\[ \text{These are equivalent, or mutually inclusive.} \]

This path arises after the path of seeing and is called the “path of meditation” because one is meditating again and again, continuously, without interruption, on a selflessness that was newly realized directly at the time of the path of seeing.

There is a reason for calling an [exalted knower of one on the path of meditation] a “subsequent clear realization” because it is a path of directly realizing the truth subsequent to the path of seeing, due to which it is called such.

\[ \text{This path arises after the path of seeing and is called the “path of meditation” because one is meditating again and again, continuously, without interruption, on a selflessness that was newly realized directly at the time of the path of seeing.} \]

It is produced after the path of seeing and is a path again and again directly

\(^a\) See the next chapter, p.114, in the section on the synonyms of the Hearer path of accumulation for a discussion of fine distinctions regarding the terms “equivalent” and “synonymous.”

\(^b\) Dan-ma-lo-chö specified *rgyun ldan du*, which is used on this occasion, as meaning “without interruption,” whereas *rgyun du* means always, or continuously.
realizing the “mode of subsistence of the truth” or “the true mode of subsistence” (bden pa’i gnas lugs).

That finishes the path of meditation.

e. Paths of no-more-learning

An exalted knower posited from the viewpoint of having abandoned the afflictive obstructions is the definition of a path of no-more-learning.

The words “posited from the viewpoint” (cha nas bzhag pa) are used here to indicate the specific feature defining paths-of-no-more-learning allowing it to function as a general definition that applies to all three vehicles. Other textbook authors define it simply as “an exalted knower that is a state of having abandoned the afflictive obstructions” and still others as “an exalted knower posited from the viewpoint of being a state of having abandoned the main of the obstacles to attaining the enlightenment of any of the three vehicles.” And still others posit it is “an exalted knower that has abandoned either of the two obstructions.” This last is the most comfortable definition to uphold.

Lo-sang-gyal-tshan: The qualification “posited from the viewpoint” can be seen as emphasizing that not all objects of abandonment have been abandoned, but only the afflictive obstructions; if it were necessary to abandon all objects of abandonment in order to attain a path of no-more-learning, then Hearer and Solitary Victor paths of no-more-learning would not be paths of no-more-learning since they have not abandoned the obstructions to omniscience. Only upon reaching the ground of Buddhahood has one attained a state of complete no-more-learning.

At this point, Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po is within a “general presentation” of grounds and paths, and so he has given a general definition to cover all three vehicles. However, this does leave room for

---

a tshug pa’i byang chub pa’i ’gongs kyi gtso bo spangs pa’i gzhag nas mkhyen pa.
b sgrīṅ gnyis gung spangs pa’i mkhyen pa.
c The explanation in this and the next three indented paragraphs is by Lo-sang-gyal-tshan, ge-shi of Go-mang Monastic College, who has given the explanation followed by Go-mang.
various debates. A qualm that is raised is whether this might mean that regarding someone on the Bodhisattva path of accumulation who has had the previous realization of a Hearer Foe Destroyer and thus has abandoned the afflicting obstructions, one might ask about that path, “Is this Bodhisattva path a Hearer path of no-more-learning?” To this, the answer would be given that it is not, because Hearer and Bodhisattva paths are contradictory because of the difference in motivation. Once a Hearer enters the Great Vehicle, there are no more Hearer paths generated in that person’s continuum.

When paths of no-more-learning are divided terminologically, there are three: Hearer, [Solitary Victor, and Great Vehicle] paths of no-more-learning.

Saying “terminologically” introduces some possibility for debate. Some say that the division is “terminological” because in this general presentation no-more-learners are defined by having abandoned the afflicting obstructions, and therefore all three are alike in this regard, due to which it is merely a “terminological” division [and not an actual division]. Others say that what Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po must have in mind is the etymology of the path of no-more-learning—that it is a path of one who has utterly nothing more to learn. Then only the Great Vehicle path of no-more-learning would be etymologically correct as a path of no-more-learning since Hearer and Solitary Victor Foe Destroyers still have more to learn.

For instance, if one cited as a subject, “a Bodhisattva on the path of accumulation who had previously attained the realization of a Hearer Foe Destroyer” (and thus had reached the Hearer path of no-more-learning yet still has to train in the Great Vehicle path) one might ask, “Does this path fulfill the etymology of no-more-learning?” It does not. Is this a path of someone who does not have to learn for the sake of attaining higher paths? It is not.

“Path of no-more-learning,” “pristine wisdom of one who has abandoned the afflicting obstructions,” and “exalted knower of a Foe Destroyer” are equivalent.
A Buddha’s exalted knower is indeed a pristine wisdom of one who has abandoned the afflicting obstructions, even though a Buddha has abandoned more. And it is an exalted knower of a Foe Destroyer because a Buddha is a Great Vehicle Foe Destroyer. According to the Lo-sel-ling College’s explanation, it is not posited from the viewpoint of the afflicting obstructions having been abandoned even though they have been abandoned.

There is a reason for calling it an [exalted knower of a Foe Destroyer] a “path of no-more-learning” because one has completed the activities of the vehicle of its path, due to which it is called such.

The pristine wisdoms that are the knowledge of extinguishment and the knowledge of non-production that is generated after the path of meditation are called paths of no-more-learning because one has completed the activities of one’s vehicle. The “activities” are the abandons, the meditations, and so forth, and they have been brought to a “completion” such that one does not have to newly train anymore in that vehicle or make any further effort at them. Thus this path is called a path of no-more-learning. For instance, there are places in sūtra where Foe Destroyers say, “I have become a Foe Destroyer. I have done what has to be done. I have cast aside the burden.” This is the same.
II. EXPLAINING IN DETAIL A PRESENTATION OF THE GROUNDS AND PATHS OF THE THREE VEHICLES

This has three parts: explanations of Hearer [paths], Solitary Victor [paths], and Great Vehicle paths.

A. EXPLANATION OF HEARER PATHS

This has five parts: Hearer paths of accumulation, preparation, seeing, meditation, and no-more-learning.

1. Hearer paths of accumulation

This has four parts: definition, divisions, synonyms, and explaining the mode of generation.
a. Definition

A Hearer’s clear realization of doctrine generated prior to the path of preparation that is its effect is the definition of a Hearer path of accumulation.

b. Divisions

When those [Hearer paths of accumulation] are divided, there are the three: great, medium, and small Hearer paths of accumulation.

The first Hearer path of accumulation generated is the small, after that comes the medium one, and then the one generated just prior to passing over to the Hearer path of preparation is called the great Hearer path of accumulation.

Also when those [Hearer paths of accumulation] are divided, there are the three: direct perceptions, inferential cognitions and subsequent cognitions [that are Hearers paths of accumulation].

What are direct perceptions that are Hearer paths of accumulation?

The first [that is, direct perceptions] are, for instance, the first five clairvoyances [the clairvoyances of magical emanation, divine ear, memory of former lives, knowing others’ minds, and divine eye] in the continuum of one [on the Hearer path of accumulation].
There are six clairvoyances, and from among those, the first five can exist prior to the path, and they can exist in the continuum of a non-Buddhist.\(^a\)

The second [an inferential cognition] is, for instance, an awareness in the continuum of one [on the Hearer path of accumulation] newly realizing the selflessness of the person in dependence on a sign.

The third [a subsequent cognition] is, for instance, an ascertaining consciousness in the continuum of one [on the Hearer on the path of accumulation] that ascertains the selflessness of the person.

c. Synonyms

“Hearer path of accumulation,” “Hearer ground of faith,” “Hearer concordance with a portion of liberation,” and “Hearer clear realization of the doctrine” are synonymous equivalents.

---

\(^a\) The six clairvoyances are the clairvoyance of magical emanation, divine ear, memory of former lives, knowing others’ minds, divine eye, and extinction of contamination. The sixth exists only in the continuum of a Foe Destroyer. See Hopkins and Yi, Jam-yang-shay-pa’s Seventy Topics, in the section titled “Divisions [of guidance]” for descriptions of these.
There is a little difference between “equivalent” (don gcig) and “synonymous equivalents” (don gcig ming gi rnam grangs). For instance, “product” (byas pa) and “impermanent thing” (mi rtag pa) are equivalent but are not synonymous equivalents. This is because what one understands from “product” and what one understands from “impermanent thing” are different even if they are equivalent, or mutually inclusive, meaning that whatever is the one is the other. “Product” means something that is produced in dependence on causes and conditions, whereas “impermanent thing” means that which momentarily disintegrates, momentarily changes. They are mutually inclusive, but they appear to the mind in a different way.

Whatever are equivalent and also have the same meaning-sense are called synonymous (ming gi rnam grangs). For two things to be synonymous, there would have to be no difference in difficulty or ease in their being ascertained. Hence, if one puts “clear realization of doctrine” (chos mngon rtogs) as the definition of “path of accumulation” (tshogs lam), then it is difficult for them to be truly synonymous because a definition must be easier to ascertain than a definiendum, and therefore “clear realization of the doctrine” should be easier to ascertain than “path of accumulation.” Hence, within the four terms listed, two that are clearly synonymous are “path of accumulation” and “ground of faith.”

For etymologies of these, apply the same pattern as previously.

In other words, previously the text gave etymologies of these terms in regards to the path of accumulation in general; now to understand the etymologies as applied to Hearers, just add “Hearer.”

d. Explaining the mode of generation

First of all one must generate in one’s mindstream a thought definitely to

\[\text{See Chapter Two, 98-101.}\]
leave cyclic existence. How is this done? One must consider all of the marvels of cyclic existence to be like food given to a person afflicted with nausea; to such a person, any food is just disgusting. Be this the glories of the gods, or of humans, one has to have reversed attachment to all of these and not even for a moment admire any type of the prosperities of cyclic existence. In order for this to be generated in the one’s mindstream, it is necessary to lessen the force of the mind seeking high status in a future lifetime. To do this, it is first necessary to generate a mind more strongly seeking the welfare of future lives than the welfare of this lifetime. And for this, it is necessary to lessen attachment to the appearances of this lifetime. This is why, as explained earlier, it is necessary first to train the mind in the paths that are common with beings of small capacity and then in the paths that are common with beings of medium capacity.a

Through training in the stages of the path that are in common with, or shared with, beings of small capacity, the strength of attachment to the appearances of this lifetime lessens. Having overcome the emphasis on the appearances of this lifetime, one seeks the welfare of future lifetimes of high status. Then a person realizes that even if high status is attained within cyclic existence for a lifetime or two, it is of no final benefit. This is like, for instance, a prisoner who is definite to be executed in a month and is being beaten every day. If the warden comes and relieves him of being beaten every day of that month, it will still not create a situation of mental ease for that person. On the one hand, it is good that he is not being beaten every day, but still, at the end of the month he will be killed. So it is merely temporary relief with no mental ease.

Similarly, no matter how many times one is reborn within high status in cyclic existence—whether once, twice, ten times, or one hundred times—as long as one has not abandoned contaminated actions and afflictions, at some point a strong non-virtuous karma will be activated by those afflictions, and one will be reborn in a low state within cyclic existence. As long as one has not abandoned the afflictions and the karmas that are accumulated by way of them, no matter what kind of a body one assumes, whether it be good or bad, the nature of cyclic existence is such that eventually one will end up in a bad state.

When one understands this from the depths of the heart and reverses attachment to all forms of cyclic existence, one is said to have a mind seeking definitely to get out of cyclic existence.

When, by way of having generated in one’s continuum an

---

a See Chapter One, 33ff. See also Sopa and Hopkins, *Cutting Through Appearances*, 71-79.
attitude to definitely leave cyclic existence, non-artificial experience emerges with regard to an attitude seeking a Hearer’s liberation, one has generated a Hearer path of accumulation in one’s continuum.

One is thinking “If only I could attain the liberation of a Hearer,” (nyan thos kyi thar pa thob na) that is, “How good it would be if I could attain the liberation of a Hearer.” When this attitude arises in a non-artificial manner, that is, by its own force without any further striving or exertion, then one has generated in one’s continuum the Hearer path of accumulation.

The boundaries are from the Hearer path of accumulation until just before attaining the Hearer path of preparation.

2. Hearer paths of preparation

This has four parts: definition, divisions, synonyms, and mode of generation.

a. Definition

A Hearer’s clear realization of the meaning generated prior to the Hearer path of seeing that is its effect is the definition of a Hearer path of preparation.
It could also be called “a Hearer’s clear realization of the meaning generated from a Hearer’s partial concordance with liberation and which generates as its own effect a Hearer’s path of seeing.”

b. Divisions

When those [Hearer paths of preparation] are divided by way of their entities, there are four: Hearer heat, peak, forbearance, and supreme mundane quality paths of preparation.

A division “by way of entity” is a division by way of nature, not by way of capacity.

And, when divided by way of their capacity, there are three: great, medium, and small. For, in terms of a single [person’s] continuum, the Hearer path of preparation that is initially generated is posited as the small, the [Hearer] path of preparation that is generated in the middle as the medium, and the Hearer path of preparation that is generated at the end as the great. And, in terms of different [persons’] continuums, a path of preparation of a person of sharp faculties is posited as the great, that of a person of medium faculties as the medium [path of preparation], and that of a person of dull faculties as the small [path of preparation].
When we talk about small, medium, and great, we are talking about their generation within one person’s continuum. The last division in terms of faculties is not frequently used.

c. Synonyms

“Hearer path of preparation,” “Hearer concordance with a portion of definite discrimination,” and “Hearer clear realization of the meaning” are synonymous equivalents. For etymologies, apply the same pattern as previously. a

A path of preparation of a Hearer definite in that lineage is a conceptual subsequent cognition with regard to the subtle selflessness of the person because that [path of preparation of one definite in the Hearer lineage] is non-prime conceptual knowledge realizing the subtle selflessness of the person.

a See 102-104 above.
“Definite in the lineage” means a person who is definite in the Hearer lineage and will not switch over to the Great Vehicle or to the path of a Solitary Victor. This consciousness is a conceptual subsequent cognition realizing that the person is empty of being substantially established in the sense of being self-sufficient.\(^a\) “Realize” indicates that it is not a consciousness to which an object appears but is not noticed nor is it a doubting consciousness. “Non-prime” indicates that it is neither direct prime cognition nor inferential prime cognition. Conceptual knowledge (zhen rig) further eliminates that it is an awareness to which an object appears but is not ascertained.

Lo-sang-gyal-tshan: In the continuum, or mindstream, of one definite in the Hearer lineage who is on the path of preparation, there are many different consciousnesses, not just those realizing the subtle selflessness of persons. As well as consciousnesses of the factor of wisdom, there are also those of the factor of method. For instance, such a person would have the thought definitely to leave cyclic existence through turning away from all its marvels. However, here the author is identifying specifically the consciousnesses of one definite in the Hearer lineage with regard to the chief object of meditation of the path of preparation, the selflessness of the person.

The reason why Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po specified the person as being “definite in the Hearer lineage” is that from the heat level of the Hearer path of preparation, there are those who shift to the Solitary Victor path and those who shift to the Great Vehicle path, and from the peak level, there are those who shift to the Solitary Victor path, though none who shift to the Great Vehicle path. There are not many, but this is possible. They would be realizing more subtle emptinesses; for instance, one who was going to shift to a Solitary Victor path would be cultivating realization of the emptiness that is the absence of subject and object being different substantial entities. To exclude them, the text specifies “those who are definite in the Hearer lineage” as being those who are realizing the subtle selflessness of the person.

Someone’s propounding that there are wrong consciousnesses on Hearer paths of accumulation and preparation is not logically feasible because whatever is [either of]
those [two—Hearer paths of accumulation or preparation] must be factually concordant awarenesses.

Some person is propounding that the Hearer path of accumulation and the Hearer path of preparation do have instances of wrong consciousnesses. This “someone” (kha cig) must be a scholar, somebody who has some basis for that position, and his basis is probably the following: During the Hearer path of accumulation there are cases of cultivating a meditative stabilization on ugliness in order to overcome desire. For instance, there is a meditative stabilization in which one imagines the whole area being filled with skeletons; one meditates on the whole area as being full of skeletons, but the area is in fact not full of skeletons. Therefore, this scholar is thinking that that type of meditative stabilization is a wrong consciousness.

Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po is saying that these are not wrong consciousnesses because whatever is a Hearer path of accumulation or a Hearer path of preparation must necessarily be a factually concordant awareness (blo don mthun), and thus whatever is a Hearer path of accumulation or a Hearer path of preparation cannot be an awareness that is not factually concordant. Even though the area is not filled with skeletons in the manner of one’s meditation, this meditative stabilization is not a factually discordant mind because this is not a case of being mistaken due to a cause of error and thereby falling into total error, such as perceiving a snake to be a rope or a snow mountain to be blue; rather, here one is intentionally meditating on the area as being full of skeletons for the sake of overcoming desire. A wrong consciousness, on the other hand, is one that through the force of either superficial or deep error is engaged in wrong apprehension. Also, regarding this meditative stabilization in which one is imagining the whole area to be full of skeletons, in fact, there is a skeleton underneath the flesh of every person who is of a different mental continuum from oneself; hence this meditative stabilization is not without an object of operation (jug yul)—it does have one.

d. Mode of generation

When one on the Hearer path of accumulation, from within a continuous meditative equipoise of calm abiding
realizing the subtle selflessness of persons, attains a wisdom arisen from meditation having induced through the power of analyzing this subtle selflessness a special bliss of mental and physical pliancy, this is called attaining the Hearer path of preparation.

Let us discuss this in parts. One on the Hearer path of accumulation is in meditative equipoise within a calm abiding that realizes the subtle selflessness of the person. So this is within a one-pointed calm abiding that is realizing the non-existence of a person that is substantially established in the sense of being self-sufficient as well as realizing the non-existence of objects of use of a person that is substantially established in the sense of being self-sufficient. Such a person continues to analyze this subtle selflessness of the person, and when, through the force of that analysis itself, a special bliss of physical and mental pliancy is induced, that person is said to have attained a wisdom arisen from meditation, called special insight. At that time the Hearer path of preparation is said to have been attained.

Whenever one attains special insight, one attains a union of calm abiding and special insight. Initially, when one attains calm abiding, one has a physical and mental pliancy that is induced by stabilizing meditation, but if prior to this point one engaged in analysis, that analysis would not be capable of inducing the bliss of physical and mental pliancy. However, [now through alternating stabilizing meditation with analytical meditation, gradually] one attains a meditative stabilization that is a union of calm abiding and special insight, at which point not only does one have physical and mental pliancy that is induced by one-pointed meditative equipoise, one also has physical and mental pliancy that is induced by the power of reasoned analysis from within this meditative equipoise.

The boundaries [of the Hearer path of preparation] are from the completion of the Hearer path of accumulation.
until just before attaining the Hearer path of seeing.

When the path of accumulation has been completed, the path of preparation begins, and whenever one attains the path of seeing, then all the activities of the path of preparation have been completed.

3. Hearer paths of seeing

This has four parts: definition, divisions, synonyms, and explaining the mode of generation.

a. Definition

A Hearer’s clear realization of the truth that is generated prior to the Hearer path of meditation which is its effect is the definition of a Hearer path of seeing.

b. Divisions

When those [Hearer paths of seeing] are divided by way of their entities, there are three: Hearer paths of seeing that are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise, Hearer paths of seeing that are pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment, and Hearer paths of seeing that are neither of those two [that is, are Hearer paths of seeing that are neither pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise nor pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment].
A Hearer’s path of seeing that is a pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise is a one-pointed realization of the subtle selflessness of the person. A Hearer’s path of seeing that is a pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment is the state that one is in upon arising from the pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise.

[1]. HEARER PATHS OF SEEING THAT ARE PRISTINE WISDOMS OF MEDITATIVE EQUIPOISE]

A Hearer’s clear realization of the truth that is in one-pointed meditative equipoise on the selflessness of the person which is its object is the definition of a Hearer path of seeing that is a pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise.

That it is “one-pointed” means that it is not fluctuating. “Which is its object” means its object of operation or its main object.

When [Hearer paths of seeing that are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise] are divided, there are three: the two, Hearer paths of seeing that are uninterrupted paths (bar chad med lam), and that are paths of release (rnam grol lam), as well as Hearer paths of seeing that are pristine
wisdoms of meditative equipoise that are neither of those two [that is, that are neither Hearer paths of seeing that are uninterrupted paths or paths of release].

[A) HEARER PATHS OF SEEING THAT ARE UNINTERRUPTED PATHS]

A Hearer’s clear realization of the truth that is the actual antidote to the artificial afflictive obstructions is the definition of a Hearer path of seeing that is an uninterrupted path.

Within the afflictive obstructions (nyon sgrib) there are two types, artificial and innate. Here, the artificial afflictions are being abandoned. That this is an “actual antidote” (dngos gnyen) to these means that it directly, or actually, induces the state of having abandoned the artificial afflictive obstructions.

When [Hearer paths of seeing that are uninterrupted paths] are divided, there are the eight forbearances of a Hearer path of seeing—[the two: doctrinal forbearance and subsequent forbearance with regard to suffering; the two doctrinal forbearance and subsequent forbearance with regard to sources; the two, doctrinal forbearance and subsequent forbearance with regard to cessations; and the two,
doctrinal forbearance and subsequent forbearance with regard to paths]. These [eight forbearances] are mutually inclusive because an uninterrupted path of a Hearer path of seeing is all eight of these [forbearances], because it is the four doctrinal forbearances—[doctrinal forbearance with regard to suffering, doctrinal forbearance with regard to sources, doctrinal forbearance with regard to cessations, and doctrinal forbearance with regard to paths] and also the four subsequent forbearances—[subsequent forbearance with regard to sufferings, subsequent forbearance with regard to sources, subsequent forbearance with regard to cessations, and subsequent forbearance with regard to paths].

This division is by way of their conceptually isolatable factors, and that the eight are mutually inclusive means that whatever is one of them is any and all of the others. Why? The four doctrinal forbearances proceed in terms of the four noble truths and are: doctrinal forbearance with regard to true sufferings, doctrinal forbearance with regard to true sources, doctrinal forbearance with regard to true cessations, and doctrinal forbearance with regard to true paths. The four subsequent forbearances are: subsequent

---

Footnote: \(^a\) chos bzod bzhi: sdug bsgal chos bzod, kun 'byung chos bzod, 'gog pa chos bzod, lam
forbearance with regard to true sufferings, subsequent forbearance with regard to true sources, subsequent forbearance with regard to true cessations, and subsequent forbearance with regard to true paths.\(^a\)

This introduces a very complicated topic. The reason for setting forth this procedure in which these eight are the uninterrupted path and a second set of eight, the eight knowledges, are the path of release is because the Great Exposition School, which follows Vasubandhu’s *Treasury of Manifest Knowledge*, sets forth a system in which a Hearer proceeds through these gradually in sixteen steps. Thus there is a need for this presentation here to include those verbal designations.\(^b\)

Lo-sang-gyal-tshan: The explanation of the eight forbearances and eight knowledges followed within the presentation of grounds and paths is from the viewpoint of the Yogic Autonomists, which, for this topic, is based upon Asaṅga’s *Summary of Manifest Knowledge*.\(^c\)

Explanations based upon the *Treasury of Manifest Knowledge* speak of sixteen steps which, according to the lower tenet systems, are sequential and hence mutually exclusive; they also make the differentiation regarding the eight forbearances that the first four forbearances, the doctrinal forbearances, are observing the Desire Realm and the latter four, the subsequent forbearances, the higher realms.

In this system based upon the *Summary of Manifest Knowledge*, the eight forbearances are mutually inclusive, differentiable only for thought, and the doctrinal forbearance with regard to true sufferings acts as the antidote to the true sufferings to be abandoned by the path of seeing of all three realms. According to the *Summary of Manifest Knowledge*, from the viewpoint of realizing selflessness within observing the objects, the four noble truths, they are called doctrinal forbearances. And from the viewpoint of realizing selflessness within observing subjects, those doctrinal forbearances, the other four are called *chos bzod*.

\(^a\) *rjes bzod bzhi*: *sdug bsgal rjes bzod, kun 'byung rjes bzod, 'gog pa rjes bzod, lam rjes bzod*.

\(^b\) See Appendix One where Dan-ma-lo-chö lays out the Great Exposition School presentation based on Vasubandhu’s *Treasury of Manifest Knowledge* in fascinating detail. See also Sopa and Hopkins, *Cutting Through Appearances*, 207-209 for a short description of the Great Exposition School presentation, and also See Hopkins and Yi, *Jam-yang-shay-pa’s Seventy Topics*, Appendix 2.

\(^c\) Lo-sang-gyal-tshan specified that the nuanced explanation in this and the following four paragraphs might be specific to Go-mang College. He noted that Asaṅga’s *Summary of Manifest Knowledge* has only a very brief reference that is not elaborated upon and hence the most commonly used mode of explanation is the longer one found in Vasubandhu’s *Treasury of Manifest Knowledge*. 
Jam-yang-shay-pa and his followers make their assertions here in accordance with the *Summary of Manifest Knowledge*. However, the explanation in the *Summary of Manifest Knowledge* is not exactly as König-chog-jig-may-wang-po has given it here. In the *Summary of Manifest Knowledge*, the four doctrinal forbearances are one moment and the four subsequent forbearances are a second moment, and hence the eight forbearances are produced in two moments of production. (They are then followed by the eight knowledges, also in two moments of production, making four moments in all.) Hence, according to the literal teaching of the *Summary of Manifest Knowledge*, “subsequent” (rjes) does have the meaning of subsequent, since those four subsequent forbearances come in the next moment. The position of Jamyang-shay-pa and his followers is that this is not to be asserted as literal. They use these same verbal conventions but do not assert two moments of production of the forbearances and the knowledges. Instead, they say that each group of eight is differentiated only by way of their conceptually isolatable factors. Thus the assertion regarding the meaning of “subsequent” (rjes) is that the objects and then the subjects are realized as selfless, but it is not a differentiation of time.

Hence, there are three different modes of assertion: 1) Vasubandhu’s *Treasury of Manifest Knowledge*, with sixteen sequential moments for the eight forbearances and eight knowledges; 2) the literal assertion of the Asaṅga’s *Summary of Manifest Knowledge*, with four sets of four each; and 3) the assertion of the higher tenet systems that the eight forbearances are simultaneous and then the eight knowledges are simultaneous in a second moment. The third of these is what is set forth here.

How\(^a\) does one arrive at the point of attaining these? Over the four levels of the path of preparation—heat, peak, forbearance, and supreme mundane quality—one is observing all phenomena as being selfless by way of a generic image. At the end of the supreme mundane quality path of preparation, when one realizes this selflessness directly by means of a yoga of conjoined calm abiding and special insight, in the next moment one has attained an uninterrupted path of a path of seeing, or, in other words, the four doctrinal forbearances and the four subsequent forbearances.

An uninterrupted path of a Hearer’s path of seeing itself directly realizes the selflessness of all phenomena, but when it is divided up into various parts, [that is, descriptively,] then you get these eight. It itself acts as

\(^a\) From this point, the explanation returns to that given by Dan-ma-lo-chô.
the actual antidote of all those objects of abandonment to be abandoned by the path of seeing. These eight are a division by way of conceptually isolatable factors.

[A Hearer path of seeing that is an uninterrupted path] is the first four [the doctrinal forbearances] because of being an uninterrupted path of a Hearer path of seeing that directly realizes the objects—the four noble truths [that is, the four—true sufferings, true sources, true cessations, and true paths]—as without a self of persons. [A Hearer path of seeing that is an uninterrupted path] is the second four, [the subsequent forbearances] because of being an uninterrupted path of a Hearer path of seeing that directly realizes the subjects—the four doctrinal forbearances [subsequent forbearance with regard to suffering, subsequent forbearance with regard to sources, subsequent forbearance with regard to cessations, and subsequent forbearance with regard to paths]—as without a self of persons.

The uninterrupted path of a Hearer path of seeing consists of the doctrinal forbearances regarding the four noble truths. The objects here are the four noble truths. One is viewing them and realizing them to be empty of a
subtle self of persons. Thus, the uninterrupted path of a Hearer’s path of seeing is all four of these. And it is also the four subsequent forbearances. When it says “subject,” the subjects are the doctrinal forbearances (chos bzod) themselves. This uninterrupted path of a Hearer path of seeing that is the four doctrinal forbearances is a consciousness realizing the four truths to be empty of a self of persons, and this very same consciousness realizes the consciousness itself to be empty of a self of persons. That is the “subject” referred to here. This knowledge of the doctrinal forbearances as empty of a self of persons is called a subsequent forbearance (rijes bzod), even though it occurs at the same time. This one uninterrupted path of a Hearer path of seeing is all four of the doctrinal forbearances and all four of the subsequent forbearances. That is why it is said that they are “divided by way of their conceptually isolatable factors.” They are equivalent, and there is nothing separate that one can point to as a first one or as a subsequent one.

[B) HEARER PATHS OF SEEING THAT ARE PATHS OF RELEASE]

A Hearer’s clear realization of the truth that is a path of release having abandoned the artificial afflictive obstructions is the definition of a Hearer path of seeing that is a path of release.

At the time of a Hearer path of seeing that is a path of release, the Hearer attains a state of having abandoned all of the objects to be abandoned by a path of seeing and is directly realizing the selflessness of the person within the qualification that all of the objects of abandonment by the path of seeing have been abandoned. They have been abandoned in the manner of their not being produced again.

When [Hearer paths of seeing that are paths of release] are divided, there are the eight knowledges of a Hearer—[the two: doctrinal and subsequent knowledge of suffering; the two, doctrinal and subsequent knowledge of sources; the two, doctrinal and subsequent knowledge of cessation;
and the two, doctrinal and subsequent knowledge of paths.

Again, there are eight. Just as the uninterrupted path has been given the name “eight forbearances,” so the path of release is given the name “eight knowledges.” The names are very similar; you just substitute “knowledge” for “forbearance:” doctrinal knowledge of suffering, doctrinal knowledge of sources, doctrinal knowledge of cessation, and doctrinal knowledge of paths; subsequent knowledge of suffering, subsequent knowledge of sources, subsequent knowledge of cessation, and subsequent knowledge of paths.\(^a\)

It is called doctrinal “knowledge” because one is knowing the selflessness of the person directly and completely, but here it is with the qualification that the objects of abandonment by the path of seeing have been abandoned. The object of observation of the path of release is the same as that of the uninterrupted path. They are one session of meditative equipoise.

It is called “doctrinal knowledge regarding suffering” because it directly knows the meaning of selflessness within having abandoned the objects of abandonment by the path of seeing—such as the artificial conception of a self that has as its object of observation the sufferings of the Desire Realm—by way of making them so that they will never return again. This pattern is to be extended similarly to the other three doctrinal knowledges.

Again, these eight are all the one path of release. Just as the other eight were all one uninterrupted path, so these eight are all one path of release. Whatever is one is all the others.

These [eight knowledges of a Hearer] are mutually inclusive because a Hearer path of seeing that is a path of release is all eight [knowledges], because of being the four doctrinal knowledges [doctrinal knowledge of suffering, doctrinal knowledge of sources, doctrinal knowledge of

\(^a\) sduc bsngal chos shes, kun ‘byung chos shes, ‘gog pa chos shes, lam chos shes; sduc bsngal rjes shes, kun ‘byung rjes shes, ‘gog pa rjes shes, lam rjes shes.
cessation, and doctrinal knowledge of paths] and of also being the four subsequent knowledges [subsequent knowledge of suffering, subsequent knowledge of sources, subsequent knowledge of cessation, and subsequent knowledge of paths].

It is the first four [doctrinal knowledge of suffering, doctrinal knowledge of sources, doctrinal knowledge of cessation, and doctrinal knowledge of paths] because of being a Hearer path of seeing that is a path of release directly realizing the objects—that is, the four truths—as without a self of persons. It is the second four [subsequent knowledge of suffering, subsequent knowledge of sources, subsequent knowledge of cessation, and subsequent knowledge of paths] because of being a Hearer path of seeing that is a path of release directly realizing the subjects—that is, the four doctrinal knowledges—as without a self of persons.
That concludes the discussion of the first two divisions of Hearer paths of seeing that are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise—uninterrupted paths and paths of release. The third division of Hearer paths of seeing that are pristine wisdoms is those that are neither uninterrupted paths nor paths of release.

[C] HEARER PATHS OF SEEING THAT ARE PRISTINE WISDOMS OF MEDITATIVE EQUIPOISE THAT ARE NEITHER UNINTERRUPTED PATHS NOR PATHS OF RELEASE

[Hearer] paths of seeing that are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise that are neither of the [above] two, are, for instance: (1) Hearer paths of seeing that are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise set in one-pointed meditative equipoise on emptiness; (2) Hearer paths of seeing that are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise set in one-pointed meditative equipoise on the emptiness of duality; and (3) Hearer paths of seeing that are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise set in one-pointed meditative equipoise on the selflessness of the person.
Lo-sang-gyal-tshan: According to the explanation of Go-mang College, there is the uninterrupted path and then the path of release, and each of them is a single moment. After that comes the pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment. But after that, Hearers again enter into one-pointed meditative equipoise on the selflessness of the person, and since that is neither an uninterrupted path nor a path of release, it has to be a meditative equipoise that is neither of those two. It is not yet a path of meditation, and so it has to be a meditative equipoise of the path of seeing. According to the Great Exposition School, the path of seeing takes only the moments of the uninterrupted path and the path of release, and then one moves immediately to the path of meditation; however, the presentation of path structure here is derived from the Perfection of Wisdom Sūtras by way of Maitreya’s Ornament for Clear Realizations, and the commentaries primarily relied on by the Tibetan tradition are written from the viewpoint of the Yogic Autonomy School, and they do not assert such immediate passage to the path of meditation.

This and the following two paragraphs of explanation were provided by Lo-sang-gyal-tshan, ge-she of Go-mang Monastic College. This does not accord with Lo-sel-ling College, which asserts that whatever is a meditative equipoise of a Hearer path of seeing must be either an uninterrupted path or a path of release, and hence Dan-ma-lo-chö did not offer an explanation. Given that Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po has given as examples of this third category of pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise: 1) pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise realizing emptiness and 2) pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise realizing non-duality, Lo-sang-gyal-tshan suggested that most Go-mang scholars do not use the definition Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po gave for a pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise which was “A Hearer’s clear realization of the truth that is in one-pointed meditative equipoise on the selflessness of the person that is its object” but rather posit “A Hearer’s clear realization of the truth that is in one-pointed meditative equipoise on whichever of the three selflessnesses is its object” (rang yul du gyur pa’i bzhag pa’i nyan thos kyi bden pa mngon rtags de). This parallels the definition given for Hearer pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise of the Hearer path of meditation, see below, 147. Lo-sang-gyal-tshan added, however, that others say that the definition as given is fine because the selflessness of the person is the chief object of meditation of Hearers and hence here on the occasion of explaining Hearer paths it should be set forth that way. And then when you get to the three examples given later, they explain that it is merely that those other two can occur, but they would not occur for those who are definite in the Hearer lineage.
The different levels of the path of meditation have to do with building up the capacity to serve as an antidote to the various levels of afflictions to be abandoned by the path of meditation. One has to keep making effort to build up that capacity, and until reaching the point of being able to generate the uninterrupted path of the path of meditation, one remains on the path of seeing. In the system of the Yogic Autonomists, there can be a long time between a Hearer attaining the path of seeing and attaining the path of meditation, many years, even as long as an eon.

The main object of meditation by Hearers is the subtle selflessness of the person, and most Hearers only realize the selflessness of the person. However, there are some who enter the Great Vehicle, who realize emptiness, but who then conclude that they cannot undertake the long and arduous path of the Great Vehicle for the sake of others; deciding that they will practice the path for themselves alone, they fall back down to the Hearer path. They are still able to realize emptiness; their Great Vehicle mind-generation has deteriorated, but there is no reason that their realization of emptiness need deteriorate, and so they would occasionally continue to meditate on emptiness and would enter into meditative equipoise on emptiness. Similarly, they might also enter into meditation on the emptiness of duality. There is some debate about this, but this is the assertion of Go-mang College.

There are those who say that Hearers have necessarily NOT realized emptiness, but there are others who say that they could have realized emptiness, but not directly. The reason for this is that if they had realized it directly, they would have attained the path of seeing, and from this there is no falling back to the Hearer path.a

The sixteen periods of forbearance and knowledge of the path of seeing occur in two sections of generation because the eight forbearances are generated simultaneously and

---

a This was Dan-ma-lo-chö’s response to the query. When Lo-sang-gyal-tshan was asked about the Go-mang position regarding this, he said that they give the same response. To the further query as to whether or not it was the case the Hearers have necessarily not realized emptiness directly, he said that for those following Jam-yang-shay-pa’s textbook on the Perfection of Wisdom (phar phyin yig cha), there are those who say that there are Hearers who have realized emptiness directly and those who say that Hearers have necessarily not realized emptiness directly. However, the general run position (dus rgyun gyi lab ya la) is to say that there is realization of emptiness, but not direct realization of emptiness. That is general Go-mang assertion within Perfection of Wisdom studies (phar phyin rang lugs) when one is speaking in terms of Yogic Practice Autonomists. However, if one is speaking in terms of the Consequence School, then Hearers could realize emptiness directly.
the eight knowledges—[the two: doctrinal and subsequent knowledge of suffering; the two, doctrinal and subsequent knowledge of sources; the two, doctrinal and subsequent knowledge of cessation; and the two, doctrinal and subsequent knowledge of paths]—are generated simultaneously.

There is a first period and then a second one. All eight of the forbearances occur at one time in the first; they are simultaneous because they are just one consciousness. All of the other eight also occur at the same time in a second.

There is a length of the period of time of the uninterrupted path and the path of release of a Hearer path of seeing because [these paths] have the length of time of the shortest moment in which an action can be completed.

Query: Other texts say that the length of time is not the shortest moment in which an action can be completed, but is the session of meditation. What is your view?

Response: Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po has specified it as the shortest moment in which an action can be completed, here two snaps of the fingers. There are other ways of determining how long that is, and it would
be difficult to do it that quickly. My own opinion is that it doesn’t necessarily occur in the smallest unit of time for the accomplishment of an action, but it could. The meditative stabilization at that point has power such that it could only be done in the length of time it takes for two finger snaps, one for the uninterrupted path and one for the path of release. It is not that it necessarily has to be so, but the person is trained in meditative stabilization at this point and has such dexterity (rtsal) or capacity.

This [duration of the uninterrupted paths and paths of release] should be known also with regard to the later occasions.

The initial division of Hearer paths of seeing was by way of their entities into pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise of a Hearer path of seeing, pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment of a Hearer path of seeing, and Hearer paths of seeing that are neither of those two. We have now concluded the discussion of pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise of a Hearer path of seeing and begin that of pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment of a Hearer path of seeing.

[2) HEARER PATHS OF SEEING THAT ARE PRISTINE WISDOMS OF SUBSEQUENT ATTAINMENT]

A Hearer’s clear realization of the truth that is posited from the viewpoint of (1) being a Hearer path of seeing that is neither an uninterrupted path nor a path of release of a Hearer path of seeing and (2) arising after the completion of the path of release that induces it is the definition of a Hearer path of seeing that is a pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment.

Lo-sang-gyal-tshan explained that this could be taken as referring to later sections of this book describing the path of meditation, and also to the uninterrupted paths and paths of release of Solitary Victors and Bodhisattvas.
Although Jam-yang-chog-lha-ö-ser says that a pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment must only be a conceptual consciousness, in our own system there are both conceptual and non-conceptual [pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment].

There is a very extensive Collected Topics on Valid Cognition called The Collected Topics of Tag-tshang-ra-wa-tö-pa. Tag-tshang-ra-wa-tö-pa (stag tshang rwa ba stod pa) is the name of a monastery, and within that name, Tag-tshang is a place name. The author of this book is Jam-yang-chog-lha-ö-ser (’jam dbyangs mchog lha ’od zer, 1429-1500). The assertion being referenced here is his view that whatever is a pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment is necessarily a conceptual consciousness.

Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po disagrees with him, saying that pristine wisdoms subsequent to meditative equipoise are not necessarily conceptual. I too think this is true, because in states of subsequent attainment there would be consciousnesses of clairvoyance and so forth that are non-conceptual. There would also be cases of directly realizing something other than selflessness such as subtle impermanence.

---

\[\text{\textit{a}}\] In the 2012 Mundgod digital version there is a \textit{shad} perpendicular stroke after \textit{yang yin} and before \textit{rang} to indicate the end of a phrase. It is not found in either the 1999 TBRC \textit{bla brang} (8a.6) or the 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (7b.1) editions, which have been followed.

\[\text{\textit{b}}\] The 2012 Mundgod digital version reads \textit{gsungs kyang}, whereas both the 1999 TBRC \textit{bla brang} (8b.1) and the 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (7b.3) editions read \textit{gsung yang}. The printed editions have been followed.

\[\text{\textit{c}}\] This well-known text is generally referred to as Ra-tö-di-grwa (rwa stod bs dus grwa). See TBRC W26445, W1KG16726, W2CZ8044, W1KG1623.
[3] **HEARER PATHS OF SEEING THAT ARE NEITHER PRISTINE WISDOMS OF MEDITATIVE EQUIPOISE NOR PRISTINE WISDOMS OF SUBSEQUENT ATTAINMENT**

The third division of Hearer paths of seeing given above was into those that are neither pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise nor pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment. These are the illustrations:

[Hearer paths of seeing] that are neither of those two are the four immeasurables—[immeasurable love, immeasurable compassion, immeasurable joy, and immeasurable equanimity]—and awarenesses intent on liberation in the continuums of those on an uninterrupted path or a path of release of a Hearer path of seeing.

Lo-sang-gyal-tshan. Go-mang College asserts that the four immeasurables—immeasurable love, immeasurable compassion, immeasurable joy, and immeasurable equanimity—in the continuum of one on either the uninterrupted path or the path of release of the Hearer

---

a The 2012 Mundgod digital version (8.22) reads *lam pa ba*, whereas both the 1999 TBRC *bla brang* (8b.1-2) and the 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (7b.3) editions read *lam pa pa*. The printed editions have been followed.
b This paragraph is from oral communication, 18 January, 2014.
path of seeing are neither wisdoms of meditative equipoise nor wisdoms of subsequent attainment. They similarly assert as examples of this third category attitudes of renunciation and compassion. For Go-mang, the pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise is the manifest mind, but at that same time there exist in hidden (lkog gyur, parokṣa), or subliminal, form many minds, such as the above examples. Those minds exist, but they are not pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise, which must be manifest minds; nor are they pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment, because that is yet to come. However, they are paths of seeing, and hence they are Hearer paths of seeing that are neither of the other two.

Lo-sel-ling College does not posit these, for their assertion is that even though the four immeasurables in the continuum of someone on an uninterrupted path or a path of release are said to exist, they do not exist in a manifest manner—they exist only in a manner of non-degeneration. Lo-sel-ling asserts that a person would have to rise from the uninterrupted path or the path of release, that is, stray from direct realization of selflessness, to have in their continuum, for instance, a mind of compassion viewing the suffering of sentient beings and wishing that they be separated from it.

Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po continues with other examples of paths of seeing that are neither paths of meditative equipoise nor paths of subsequent attainment:

Also there are exalted knowers realizing emptiness and exalted knowers realizing emptiness of duality that occur in the continuum of one who has attained a state of subsequent attainment of a Hearer path of seeing.

Lo-sang-gyal-tshan: To understand these two examples, one needs to understand that there are two modes of presenting the meaning of “subsequent” with regard to pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment. When explained etymologically, “subsequent” indicates that it comes “after” the uninterrupted path and the path of release. Some say

\[\text{The Go-mang assertion that Lo-sang-gyal-tshan gives in this and the next paragraph differs from that of Lo-sel-ling which follows from Dan-ma-lo-chö afterward.}\]
that all paths of seeing that come after those two are pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment. Asserting such fulfills the etymological explanation of “subsequent;” however, here in the presentation of grounds and paths, the assertion is that even though that is the etymology of “subsequent,” still not all subsequent paths are pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment. Rather, the explanation is the following: On the occasion of the pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise, one is realizing selflessness; then, subsequent to this realization, through its force, one realizes, for instance, that even though all things are selfless, they are not totally non-existent, but are like a magician's illusions, are dependent-arisings, are products, can perform functions, and so forth. The mind realizing this is the meaning of “pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment,” not just all subsequent paths. Only such realizations, which are drawn forth through the force of the prior realization of selflessness, are pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment, not just any path consciousness that follows.

Hence, included within the category of minds subsequent to meditative equipoise but not pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment are the attitude of renunciation, and the four immeasurables, as well as, for Hearers, minds realizing emptiness and non-duality. These are not states of meditative equipoise but they are paths of seeing.\(^a\)

For Lo-sel-ling College, these would be called pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment.\(^b\) I think it is fine to call all of the pristine wisdoms of one on the path of seeing that occur subsequent to the path of release pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment. I would begin a debate to the author, “In that case, it follows that the pristine wisdom realizing emptiness in the continuum of one who has attained a state of subsequent attainment of a Hearer’s path of seeing is not a pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment.” To my view, the pristine wisdom realizing emptiness does fulfill the definition of a pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment [that he himself posited]. The definition specifies that it is “posited from the viewpoint of arising after the completion of the path of release that induces it,” and I see no problem with fitting this illustration into that.

\(^a\) Lo-sang-gyal-tshan, oral communication, 3 Jan, 2015, added that there are Go-mang scholars who are prepared to assert that just as “exalted knower in the continuum of one on the path of seeing” and “path of seeing” are equivalent, so “exalted knower in the continuum of one of subsequent attainment” and “pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment” are equivalent, and hence those scholars would assert manifest minds such as that intent on liberation as being pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment.

\(^b\) The explanation returns to that given by Dan-ma-lo-chô.
c. Synonyms

“Hearer path of seeing,” “Hearer clear realization of the truth,” and “exalted knower of one on the Hearer path of seeing” are equivalent. For etymologies, apply the same pattern as previously.

To spell these out, it is called a “Hearer path of seeing” because of being a path of seeing in the continuum of a Hearer newly seeing directly a truth that was not realized before. Because of being a new realization of the truth, the meaning of selflessness, which one did not realize before, it is called a “Hearer clear realization of the truth.” Because of being an exalted knower in the continuum of someone abiding on the Hearer path of seeing, it is called an “exalted knower of a Hearer path of seeing.”

d. Explaining the mode of generation

A Hearer path of seeing that is an uninterrupted path and a [Hearer path of seeing] that is its path of release are generated in one session of meditative equipoise. Rising from that [meditative equipoise], a [Hearer path of seeing] that is a pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment is generated. After that [path of seeing that is a pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment], a third category of meditative equipoise–[a Hearer path of seeing that is neither a pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise nor a pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment]–is generated.
Lo-sang-gyal-tshan: The uninterrupted path is the first moment and the path of release is the second moment. Those two occur sequentially in one session of meditation. After that, one rises from that meditative equipoise into a Hearer path of seeing that is a pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment. Then after that, one can again enter into meditative equipoise. For Go-mang, this third category of meditative equipoise is synonymous with Hearer path of seeing that is a meditative equipoise that is neither an uninterrupted path nor a path of release of a Hearer path of seeing.

Lo-sel-ling asserts that there is a mere general meditative equipoise. This is a meditative equipoise that is neither a pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise nor a pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment, but is a third variety (mnyam bzhag phung sum pa), which is a mere meditative equipoise that occurs subsequent to those two. Although it is set in meditative stabilization, it is not a path of seeing; rather, it is a path of meditation.

In the upper systems of tenets the eight forbearances and the eight knowledges are each posited as a single consciousness—the uninterrupted path and then the path of release—that performs the functions of all eight. However, in the Hearer systems, they are set out in a series of steps over time.

According to the Hearer schools of tenets, the sixteen periods of forbearance and knowledge are performed serially, not simultaneously, and they proceed in the order of the four noble truths, not realm by realm. (See the chart on the next page.)

---

\[^a\] mnyam par bzhag pa yin, mnyam bzhag ye shes ma yin, rjes thob ye shes ma yin, mnyam bzhag tsam po ba yin, mnyam bzhag phung sum pa yin.
Chart 1: Sixteen periods of forbearance and knowledge
(read from bottom to top)

- Path of meditation (Abider in the fruit of Stream Enterer)
  - 16 subsequent knowledge
  - 15 subsequent forbearance
  - 14 knowledge
  - 13 forbearance
  - 12 subsequent knowledge
  - 11 subsequent forbearance
  - 10 knowledge
  - 9 forbearance
  - 8 subsequent knowledge
  - 7 subsequent forbearance
  - 6 knowledge
  - 5 forbearance
  - 4 subsequent knowledge
  - 3 subsequent forbearance
  - 2 knowledge
  - 1 forbearance
  - Higher realms
  - True paths
  - Desire Realm

- Path of seeing (Approacher to the fruit of Stream Enterer)
  - 16 subsequent knowledge
  - 15 subsequent forbearance
  - 14 knowledge
  - 13 forbearance
  - 12 subsequent knowledge
  - 11 subsequent forbearance
  - 10 knowledge
  - 9 forbearance
  - 8 subsequent knowledge
  - 7 subsequent forbearance
  - 6 knowledge
  - 5 forbearance
  - 4 subsequent knowledge
  - 3 subsequent forbearance
  - 2 knowledge
  - 1 forbearance
  - True cessations
  - True origins
  - True sufferings
  - Desire Realm
Because they are being generated serially, the “doctrinal forbearance” with regard to the sufferings of the Desire Realm acts as the actual antidote to, for instance, the artificial view of the transitory as real I and mine that observes sufferings within the Desire Realm. The “doctrinal knowledge” is a path that is a state of having abandoned such an artificial affliction that is to be abandoned by the path of seeing. The former only acts as an antidote to that particular object of abandonment, and the latter only is a state of having abandoned that particular affliction such that it won’t arise again.

The uninterrupted path that acts as the actual antidote to, for example, the view of the transitory collections as real I and mine, which takes as its object of observation sufferings of the upper realms is called “subsequent forbearance” with regard to the suffering of the upper realms. When one attains the path of release that is attained along with attainment of the abandonment of those objects that are to be abandoned by the path of seeing, with regard to the upper realms (for instance, the artificial view of the transitory collections as real I and mine), then one has the “subsequent knowledge” with regard to the suffering of the upper realms.

The next four are doctrinal forbearance, doctrinal knowledge, subsequent forbearance, and subsequent knowledge, each with respect to the second of the four noble truths, true sources. The reason that this system arose is that, after the Buddha attained enlightenment, the first wheel of teaching that he turned was the wheel of teaching the four noble truths. The mode of the generation of the paths accords with his setting forth the four noble truths.

Buddha repeated the four truths first from the point of view of entity (ngo bo), then from the point of view of function (byed pa), and finally from the point of view of activity together with the fruit (bya ba ‘bras bu dang bcas pa). For the entity Buddha said “These are true sufferings.” “These” refers to his disciples’ aggregates. He was telling them that their contaminated aggregates were sufferings and were to be identified as sufferings. So first, from the viewpoint of entity, he said, “These are noble truths of suffering. These are the noble truths of origin. These are the noble truths of cessation. These are the noble truths of path.”

Then, from the viewpoint of function, he said, “Suffering is to be known. Sources are to be abandoned. Cessations are to be actualized. Paths are to be cultivated.” In other words, suffering is to be recognized, or identified. The causes of suffering, sources, are to be abandoned with effort. The cessations that are the pacification of suffering are to be accomplished through effort. The paths that are the techniques or methods for attaining the cessations are to be cultivated.

Then from the viewpoint of activity together with the fruit, Buddha
said, “Sufferings are to be known; there is nothing to be known.”a In general, sufferings are to be known, but they are not to be known in the manner of a self of persons. This means that sufferings are not to be known as the objects of use—objects experienced—by a substantially existent person. Similarly, “Sources are to be abandoned, but there is nothing to abandon.” The sources are contaminated actions and the afflictions. Because contaminated actions and the afflictions are the roots of sufferings, if one does not want suffering, then one must abandon the causes of suffering. So they are to be abandoned, but not to be abandoned by a substantially existent or self-sufficient self. Then he said, “Cessations are to be actualized, but there is nothing to actualize.” True cessations, which are states of having abandoned the sources, that is to say, contaminated actions and afflictions which are the causes of suffering, are indeed to be actualized, but they are not to be actualized in the manner of an existent self of persons, that is to say, they are not to be actualized by a self-sufficient or substantially existent self. Then he said, “The paths are to be cultivated, but there is nothing to cultivate.” In order to attain the state of liberation, one must cultivate true paths, that is, the superior paths are to be cultivated in order to attain those cessations that are states of having abandoned the true sufferings and true sources. But they are not to be, and cannot be, cultivated by a self-sufficient or substantially existent self.

So, in brief, sufferings are to be known, sources are to be abandoned, cessations are to be actualized, and paths are to be cultivated, but they are not to be known, abandoned, actualized, and cultivated in the manner of a self-sufficient person. And thus Buddha taught the four truths as selfless.

The first (doctrinal forbearance of suffering) through the fifteenth (subsequent forbearance of the path) are all paths of seeing. The sixteenth, the last path of release, (subsequent knowledge of the path) is the beginning of the path of meditation.

There is a lot of debate around this, but one can line these up with the presentation of the eight Enterers and Abiders that was discussed earlier.b If one is proceeding in the general manner, during the first fifteen periods of the sixteen, one is an Approacher to Stream Enterer. When one attains the sixteenth, subsequent knowledge of the path, one attains the path of meditation, and one also becomes an Abider in the Fruit of Stream Enterer.c

---

a sdug bsngal shes par bya te shes par byar med. bdag tu grub pa’i tshul gyis shes par bya ba ma red.
b Chapter Two, 76-91.
c This presentation is represented by a chart that appeared above, 143. Alternative presentations are discussed in the next section on the path of meditation and in Appendix One.
Regarding the abandonment of the artificial and innate afflictions, the forbearances abandon the artificial afflictions and take place on the path of seeing. The innate afflictions are abandoned over the course of the path of meditation.

4. Hearer paths of meditation

This has four parts: definition, divisions, synonyms, and mode of generation.

a. Definition

A Hearer’s subsequent clear realization is the definition of a Hearer path of meditation.

It is called subsequent because it is generated after, or subsequent to, a Hearer’s clear realization of the truth, in other words, after the path of seeing.

b. Divisions

When [Hearer paths of meditation] are divided, there are the two, [Hearer paths of meditation] that are meditative [equipoise] and that are subsequent [attainment] and also a third, Hearer paths of meditation that are neither of those two—[that is, neither pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise nor pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment].
A Hearer’s subsequent clear realization that is set in one-pointed meditative equipoise on the selflessness that is its object is the definition of a Hearer path of meditation that is a pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise.

The fact that the text says “the selflessness that is its object” suggests that the object of the meditative equipoise of a Hearer’s path of seeing is not necessarily the selflessness of the person. This is because of the assertion by Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po that although the main object of meditation of Hearers is the selflessness of persons, there are also Hearers who realize the selflessness of non-duality and who realize emptiness. Specifying “the selflessness that is its object” leaves room for Hearer pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise realizing those on the path of meditation just as they were possible on the Hearer path of seeing.

When [Hearer paths of meditation that are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise] are divided, there are three: Hearer paths of meditation that are uninterrupted paths, that are paths of release, and Hearer paths of meditation that are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise that are neither of those—[that is, neither uninterrupted paths nor paths of release].
A Hearer’s subsequent clear realization that serves as the actual antidote to the afflictive obstructions that are to be abandoned by a path of meditation that are its own corresponding objects of abandonment is the definition of a Hearer path of meditation that is an uninterrupted path.

When [Hearer paths of meditation that are uninterrupted paths are] divided, there are nine, ranging from the small of the small Hearer paths of meditation to the big of the big Hearer paths of meditation. (See the chart on the next page.)
Chart 2: Objects abandoned by the path of meditation
(read chart from bottom to top for temporal order)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Path of Meditation</th>
<th>Object Abandoned</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Big</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Path of Release</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Uninterrupted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Path</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Small 9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Path of Release</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Uninterrupted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Path</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Medium 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Path of Release</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Uninterrupted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Path</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Big 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Path of Release</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Uninterrupted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Path</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Small 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Path of Release</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Uninterrupted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Path</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Medium 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Path of Release</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Uninterrupted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Path</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Big 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Path of Release</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Uninterrupted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Path</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Small 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Path of Release</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Uninterrupted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Path</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Medium 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Path of Release</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Uninterrupted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Path</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Big 4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A Hearer’s subsequent clear realization that is a path of release having abandoned the afflicting obstructions to be abandoned by a path of meditation that are the corresponding objects of abandonment of the uninterrupted path inducing it is the definition of a Hearer’s path of meditation that is a path of release.

It is called a path of meditation (or familiarization) because it is generated after a clear realization of the truth. It is called a path of release because it is a state of having newly been liberated, or released, from the corresponding objects of abandonment by the uninterrupted path. The liberator, or abonder, is the uninterrupted path, and this is a state of having been liberated, or released.

The words “inducing it” refer to the uninterrupted path that precedes a path of release and induces or leads to it. Each uninterrupted path “induces” its own respective path of release. The word correspond (ngos skal) indicates that objects of abandonment correspond to a particular level of the path of meditation. What is able to abandon the big of the big objects of abandonment? It is the small of the small uninterrupted paths of the path of meditation that is its direct “opponent,” that can eradicate it, that is its actual antidote. The path of release induced by that direct antidote is a state of those objects of abandonment having been abandoned forever, that is, in the manner of their not arising again.

Every path of release, no matter which it is, has an uninterrupted path that “induces” it. Each uninterrupted path has a “corresponding” object of abandonment, which it is to extinguish, to which it acts as the actual antidote. Having done so, it then induces the path of release, the state of that particular object of abandonment having been removed.

In sūtra, the way in which an uninterrupted path acts as an antidote is exemplified with sunlight and darkness. The approaching of the shining of sunlight and the approaching to cessation of darkness are simultaneous. Similarly, the appearance of sunlight and the cessation of darkness are also simultaneous. As in that example, the approaching to production of the
uninterrupted path and the approaching to cessation of the respective objects of abandonment of that uninterrupted path are simultaneous.

The generation of an uninterrupted path and the cessation of its corresponding objects of abandonment are also simultaneous. That is in general. For instance, the generation of an interrupted path of a Hearer path of seeing and the cessation of the objects of abandonment that are to be abandoned by a Hearer path of seeing are simultaneous. Similarly, the generation of the uninterrupted path of a Great Vehicle path of seeing and the cessation of the objects of abandonment that are to be abandoned by a Great Vehicle path of seeing are simultaneous.

If this is debated, one can ask: Does it follow with regard to whatever is an object of abandonment by a Great Vehicle path of seeing, that its cessation and the generation of the uninterrupted path of a Great Vehicle path of seeing are necessarily simultaneous? They are not necessarily simultaneous (despite what was just said). For instance, take as an example the conception of thoroughly afflicted objects. This conception ceased on the heat level of the path of preparation, but its seeds did not cease. Those are not abandoned until such time in the future when the path of seeing is attained. Hence, those seeds are the corresponding object of abandonment by the path of seeing, but its cessation occurred before the path of seeing. Thus, the cessation of the manifest form of it is not necessarily simultaneous with the path of seeing, but the cessation of the seed form of it is necessarily simultaneous with the generation of the path of seeing.

Here we are talking about Hearers, and in the case of Hearers, the generation of an uninterrupted path of a Hearer path of seeing and the cessation of the objects of abandonment by a Hearer path of seeing are simultaneous. Similarly, the generation of the small of the small uninterrupted paths of a Hearer path of meditation and the cessation of the great of the great objects of abandonment by a Hearer path of meditation are simultaneous. The attainment of the small of the small Hearer paths of release and the attainment of the abandonment that is the state of having abandoned the great of the great objects of abandonment to be abandoned by a Hearer path of meditation are simultaneous.

At the time of the small of the small uninterrupted paths of a Hearer path of meditation, by way of its acting as the actual antidote, the great of the great objects of abandonment to be abandoned by a Hearer path of meditation are made non-existent. However, at that time one has not attained a stability that is the making of these objects of abandonment into

---

a See Chapter Two, 74ff, for the previous explanation of the four levels of the path of preparation and the four types of conceptions, the manifest form of which is ceased respectively on those four levels.
possessing the quality of never again being generated. The uninterrupted path acts as the actual antidote that removes the object of abandonment, and then in the next moment, there arises the factor of stability, the factor of its not arising again. The factor with regard to that which is a product is called the path of release, and the factor with that path of release which is the object of abandonment’s not-arising again and is a non-product is called a true cessation.

There is a path of release of the small of the small Hearer path of meditation. Is it a path of release that involves a state of having abandoned the afflictive obstructions to be abandoned by a path of meditation? It is not, and the reason is that one has not finished abandoning the afflictive obstructions that are to be abandoned by the path of meditation. It is a path of release that involves a state of having abandoned that to be abandoned by the path of meditation which is the corresponding object of abandonment by the uninterrupted path that induces it.\(^a\)

The reason for this is that the uninterrupted path that induces it is the small of the small uninterrupted paths of the path of meditation. Its corresponding objects of abandonment are the great of the great objects of abandonment by the path of meditation. Thus, together with it is attained a state of having abandoned that particular afflictive obstruction, and it is a path having the quality that that particular afflictive obstruction will never again be generated.

When those [Hearer paths of meditation that are paths of release] are divided, there are two: those done in terms of gradual objects of abandonment and those done in terms of simultaneous objects of abandonment.

\[^a\] The 2012 Mundgod digital edition (9.15) reads gcig char ‘i, the 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (8a.5) edition, reads gcig char ‘i, and the 1999 TBRC bla brang (9a.4) seems to read gcig char ba ‘i, but is not clear. Ba has been followed.

The Tibetan terms rim gyis pa and gcig char ba refer to persons, indicating those who proceed by way of abandoning objects of abandonment gradu-
ally, or sequentially, and those who proceed by abandoning them simultaneously.\(^a\)

Regarding the first, [those done in terms of gradual objects of abandonment], there are eighty-one afflictions to be abandoned by the path of meditation: there are nine cycles of afflictions to be abandoned by a path of meditation that are included within the level of the Desire Realm: [the three—big, medium, and small of the big; the three—big, medium, and small of the medium; and the three—big, medium, and small of the small of the afflictions to be abandoned by the path of meditation that are included within the desire realm, making nine]. Similarly [to the desire realm], there are nine cycles of afflictions to be abandoned by a path of meditation for each of the other [eight] levels ranging from the first concentration to the peak of cyclic existence.

Thus, there are nine for the Desire Realm: the big of the big, medium of the big, small of the big, big of the medium, medium of the medium, small of the medium, big of the small, medium of the small, and small of the small. And similarly, there are nine each for the first, second, third, and fourth concentrations, and nine each for infinite space, infinite consciousness, nothingness, and peak of cyclic existence. (See chart next page.)

\(^a\) Go-mang and Lo-sel-ling have very different ways of explaining the meaning of these two terms. Here in the body of the text, the Go-mang explanation has been followed. Danma-lo-chö's presentation of the Lo-sel-ling position has been given in Appendix Two.

\(^b\) The 1987 Lhasa Go-mang edition (8a.6) mistakenly reads gyis re re.
Chart 3: Afflictive emotions to be abandoned in terms of the three realms and nine levels
(Read from bottom to top)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>afflictive emotions pertaining to the Formless Realm</th>
<th>Peak of Cyclic Existence (ninth level)</th>
<th>73-81</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nothingness (eighth level)</td>
<td>64-72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Infinite Consciousness (seventh level)</td>
<td>55-63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Infinite Space (sixth level)</td>
<td>46-54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>afflictive emotions pertaining to the Form Realm</td>
<td>Fourth Concentration (fifth level)</td>
<td>37-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Third Concentration (fourth level)</td>
<td>28-36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Second Concentration (third level)</td>
<td>19-27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>First Concentration (second level)</td>
<td>10-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>afflictive emotions pertaining to the Desire Realm (first level)</td>
<td>small</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>small of the small</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>medium of the small</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>medium</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>small of the medium</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>medium of the medium</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>big</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>small of the big</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>medium of the big</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There are eighty-one uninterrupted paths of the path of meditation which are the actual antidotes that successively abandon those [eighty-one afflictions to be abandoned by the path of meditation].
These are the eighty-one objects of abandonment by a supramundane path of meditation.\(^a\)

And, there are eighty-one paths of release: eighty paths of release of paths of meditation which are states of those [eighty-one afflictions to be abandoned by the path of meditation] having been abandoned sequentially, and in addition [to those eighty paths of release of the path of meditation], one path of release that is included within the path of no-more-learning of the vehicle which is its path.

Uninterrupted paths and paths of release go together—each uninterrupted path induces its respective path of release.

For [Hearer paths of meditation] done in terms of simultaneous objects of abandonment, there are nine cycles of uninterrupted paths of the path of meditation. These nine range from the small of the small uninterrupted paths of the path of meditation that abandons simultaneously the nine big of the big afflictions to be abandoned by the path

\(^a\) The above chart was copied from Hopkins and Yi, *Jam-yang-shay-pa’s Seventy Topics* 192. It in turn was adapted from Zahler, ibid., 193. As Zahler says:

Each of the nine levels has cycles of afflictive emotions pertaining to it. There are three main divisions for each level—big \((\text{chen po, adhimātra})\), middling \((\text{\textquoteleft\textquoteleft bring, madhyā})\), and small \((\text{chung ngu, mṛdu})\)—each of which is subdivided into three by degrees. Thus, each of the nine levels has nine degrees of afflictive emotions pertaining to it—(1) the big of the big \((\text{chen po’i chen po, adhimātrādhimātra})\), (2) the middling of the big \((\text{chen po’i \textquoteleft\textquoteleft bring, adhimātra-madhyā})\), and (3) the small of the big \((\text{chen po’i chung ngu, adhimātramṛdu})\); (4) the big of the middling \((\text{\textquoteleft\textquoteleft bring gi chen po, madhyādhimātra})\), (5) the middling of the middling \((\text{\textquoteleft\textquoteleft bring gi \textquoteleft\textquoteleft bring, madhyāmadhyā})\), and (6) the small of the middling \((\text{\textquoteleft\textquoteleft bring gi chung ngu, madhyāmṛdu})\); (7) the big of the small \((\text{chung ngu’i chen po, mṛdva-dhimātra})\), (8) the middling of the small \((\text{chung ngu’i \textquoteleft\textquoteleft bring, mṛdva-madhyā})\), and (9) the small of the small \((\text{chung ngu’i chung ngu, mṛdva-mṛdu})\)—making eighty-one in all.
of meditation, these being of the nine levels of the three realms—[that is the desire realm, four concentrations, and four formless absorptions, making nine], up through the big of the big uninterrupted paths of the path of meditation that abandons simultaneously the nine small of the small afflictions to be abandoned by the path of meditation of those nine levels—[the desire realm, four concentrations, and four formless absorptions].

The mode of procedure of the simultanists is to abandon the afflictions pertaining to all three realms that are to be abandoned by a path of meditation at one time, in nine cycles of abandonment is. [In this case, they necessarily proceed just in nine steps, doing all the big-big at one time, not doing eighty-one steps.] The small of the small uninterrupted paths of the path of meditation acts as the antidote that abandons all of the big of the big afflictions with regard to all three realms. When the big of the big path of release is induced by that uninterrupted path, then one has attained a path of release in which all of the small of the small objects of abandonment with regard to all three realms have been abandoned.

Also, there are nine cycles of paths of release that are [states of] having abandoned those [nine from the great of the great afflictions up to the small of the small] objects of abandonment by a path of meditation.
c. Synonyms

“Hearer path of meditation,” “Hearer subsequent clear realization,” and “exalted knower in the continuum of a Hearer on the path of meditation” are synonymous equivalents.

There are translations into Tibetan [of the Sanskrit term bhāvanāmārga] as “path of familiarization” (khoms pa’i lam), rather than “path of meditation” (sgom pa’i lam). The reason for this is that it is a case of frequent, or repeated, contemplation. One is again and again conditioning to, or familiarizing with, that direct realization of the truth that one attained at the time of the path of seeing. It is called the path of meditation because one is meditating on the meaning of the mode of subsistence in order to attain that higher path which is the path of no-more-learning. As Maitreya said in his Ornament for the Clear Realizations, IV:53, “Again and again contemplating and comprehending and definitely realizing is the path of meditation.” Either translation is suitable; most of the Tibetan translations say “path of meditation.”

It is a subsequent clear realization because it is a clear realization generated after, or subsequent to, the path of seeing. And it is an exalted knower in the continuum of a Hearer on the path of meditation or a pristine wisdom in the continuum of a Hearer on the path of meditation. All of these are synonymous.

d. Mode of generation

When, in dependence on meditating on what has already

\[\text{yang nas yang du sems pa dang/ mjal dang rgyes rtags sgom pa’i lam.}\]
been realized—the selflessness of the person—a Hearer on the path of seeing attains the actual antidote to the big of the big afflictive obstructions, a Hearer path of meditation is generated in that [person’s] continuum.

One who reached the point of subsequent attainment of the Hearer path of seeing repeatedly familiarizes with the selflessness of the person that has already been realized; when that person attains an uninterrupted path that is able to act as the actual antidote to the big of the big afflictive obstructions, then he or she has generated a Hearer path of meditation in their continuum.

5. Hearer paths of no-more-learning

This has four parts: definition, divisions, synonyms, and mode of attainment.

Because there is no higher path within one’s vehicle, so that one does not need any longer to strive to achieve a higher path, it is called a path of no-more-learning.

a. Definition

A clear realization of one who has completed the progress of a Hearer’s path is the definition of a Hearer path of no-more-learning.
“Progress” (bgrod pa) means to advance higher. “That one has completed it” (mthar phyin pa) means that one has finished it. There are no remaining higher levels to be achieved in that path. As a Hearer, there is no higher state to be attained.

**b. Divisions**

When those [Hearer paths of no-more-learning] are divided, there are two: exalted knowers of Foe Destroyers who have simultaneously [abandoned] the objects of abandonment and exalted knowers of Foe Destroyers who have gradually [abandoned] the objects of abandonment.

A Foe Destroyer who, prior to attaining that state, actualizes the fruit of a Never Returner is a Foe Destroyer of simultaneous abandonment, whereas a Foe Destroyer who, prior to attaining that state, does not actualize the fruit of a Never Returner is a Foe Destroyer of gradual abandonment.

When [Hearer paths of no-more-learning are] divided by way of faculty, there are two types: [exalted knowers of] Hearer Foe Destroyers of sharp faculties and exalted knowers of those of dull faculties.

According to the Great Exposition School, those Foe Destroyers who have dull faculties can fall from the fruit of Foe Destroyer. However, according
to the higher systems, there is no such thing as falling from the fruit of Foe Destroyer, although there are cases of the mere temporary degeneration of their meditative stabilization of bliss in this lifetime. Still, for both the higher and lower systems, there are no cases of degeneration that are not “repaired” within that life. Hence, even in the system that asserts a Foe Destroyer who falls from that fruit, it is re-attained in this lifetime. Similarly, in the upper systems, where there are cases of Foe Destroyers who fall from the meditative stabilization of bliss, it is necessarily the case that that meditative stabilization is restored and they do attain it again in that very lifetime.

c. Synonyms

“Hearer path of no-more-learning,” “Hearer path of completion,” and “exalted knower in the continuum of a Hearer Foe Destroyer” are synonymous equivalents.

A Hearer path of no-more-learning is a path in the continuum of a Hearer Superior, and since it is such that one does not need to make effort to train to attain a higher path, it is called a “Hearer path of no-more-learning.” Since it is a path of one who has completed progress on the Hearer path, it is called a “Hearer path of completion.”

d. Mode of attainment

A diamond-like meditative stabilization within the Hearer path of meditation causes the afflictive obstructions to have the quality of not being suitable to be produced; when, in the second moment one attains a path of release [that is a state] of having abandoned the afflictive obstructions, one actualizes a Hearer path of no-more-learning.
Within a Hearer path of meditation, there is what is called the “diamond-like meditative stabilization.” Just as a diamond can cut any object that has form, so this final uninterrupted path at the very end of the path of meditation is capable of abandoning all of those very small remaining afflictions that the earlier paths were not able to abandon. It causes those afflictive obstructions to have the quality of not being suitable to be produced again, and then in the very next moment, with the path of release, one attains the state in which all of them have been abandoned forever. With this one actualizes the Hearer path of no-more-learning.
4. Solitary Victor Paths

**B. EXPLANATION OF SOLITARY VICTOR PATHS**

This has five parts: definition, divisions, synonyms, and the meanings of the individual divisions.\(^a\)

**1. Definition**

A Solitary Victor’s clear realization that serves as a passageway opening the opportunity for progressing to a Solitary Victor’s liberation is the definition of a Solitary Victor path.

They are called “Solitary Victors,” or “Self-Conquerors” because they “become victorious alone” (rang rgyal bar gyur ro) at a time when there are no Buddhas. They are also called “Self-Enlightened” (rang byang chub) for the same reason. They are called “Medium Realizers of Suchness” (de kho na nyid rtogs pa ’bring po) because their realization of suchness is superior to that of Hearers but inferior to that of followers of the Great Vehicle.

To spell this out in more detail, they are called “Solitary Victors” or “Self-Enlightened” because in their last lifetime in cyclic existence they

\(^a\) The Tibetan texts of all three editions used: the 1999 TBRC bla brang (10a.3), the 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (9a.2-3) and the Mundgod digital (10.16), all say that there are five parts to this section, but list only four, and in the following text only four parts are explained. A section on etymological explanations frequently given in this context (see the next chapter on Great Vehicle Paths) is lacking.
actualize a pristine wisdom that is the knowledge of extinction and of non-production that is “self-arisen,” not relying upon another, a teacher, who sets forth guidance.a

There is not much difference between wisdom that knows extinction and wisdom that knows non-production. The first, wisdom knowing extinction, is a pristine wisdom knowing that all of the afflictions have been abandoned. The second is a pristine wisdom knowing that those extinguished afflictions will not be generated again. One could also call this a pristine wisdom of non-regeneration.

Here, in this system of the Yogic Middle Way Autonomists, the liberation of a Solitary Victor, or Self-Conqueror, is a state of having abandoned the coarse obstructions to omniscience, b specifically, of having abandoned the conception of apprehended-object and apprehending-subject as different substantial entities. Their clear realizations open the opportunity, or way, for progress to such liberation. When such a way is opened, a path is revealed.

2. Divisions

When those [paths of Solitary Victors] are divided, there are five: Solitary Victor paths of accumulation, preparation, seeing, meditation, and no-more-learning.

3. Synonyms

“Solitary Victor ground,” “Solitary Victor path,” “Solitary Victor vehicle,” and “Solitary Victor exalted knower” are synonymous equivalents.

---

a srid pa mtha’ ma’i tshe slob dpon gzhon gyis gdamgs ngag bstan pa la mi ltos par rang byung gi zad pa dang mi skye ba shes pa yi ye shes mngon du byas pas na rang rgyal ba ’am rang byang chub.

b Other schools would say that they have abandoned the afflictive obstructions.
4. Meanings of the individual divisions

This has five parts: explaining Solitary Victor paths of accumulation, preparation, seeing, meditation, and no-more-learning.

**a. Explaining Solitary Victor paths of accumulation**

This has four parts: definition, divisions, synonyms, and mode of generation.

---

1) **DEFINITION**

A Solitary Victor’s clear realization of doctrine that is generated prior to the Solitary Victor path of preparation which is its effect is the definition of a Solitary Victor path of accumulation.

This clear realization is in the continuum of a Solitary Victor, and it is prior to the generation a Solitary Victor’s path of preparation. “Which is its effect” means that the path of preparation arises subsequent to it.

---

\(^a\) The 2012 Mundgod digital (10.21) mistakenly reads *rnams*. 
2) DIVISIONS

When those [Solitary Victor paths of accumulation] are divided, there are three: Solitary Victors’ great, medium, and small paths of accumulation.

3) SYNONYMS

“Solitary Victor path of accumulation,” “Solitary Victor concordance with a portion of liberation,” and “Solitary Victor clear realization of doctrine” are synonymous equivalents.

4) MODE OF GENERATION

When non-artificial experience emerges with regard to an awareness that mainly seeks a Solitary Victor’s enlightenment, one has generated in one’s continuum a Solitary Victor path of accumulation.

Though prior to the path one could have a mind that seeks a Solitary Victor’s enlightenment, it is only when one has such a mind without any exertion, such that it is non-fabricated and spontaneous, that one has generated in the continuum a Solitary Victor path of accumulation.
b. Explaining Solitary Victor paths of preparation

This has four parts: definition, divisions, synonyms, and mode of generation.

1) DEFINITION

A Solitary Victor’s clear realization of the meaning which arises after the completion of the path of accumulation that is its substantial cause and is generated prior to the Solitary Victor path of seeing that is its effect is the definition of a Solitary Victor path of preparation.

That the path of accumulation is its substantial cause means that the path of accumulation is suitable to become an entity of the path of preparation.

2) DIVISIONS

When those [Solitary Victor paths of preparation] are divided, there are four: heat, peak, forbearance, and supreme mundane quality paths of preparation.

Each of the first three—[heat, peak, and forbearance] has three divisions: small, medium and great. However, the supreme mundane quality [path of preparation] of both
Hearers and Solitary Victors, has no division into the three—small, medium and great—because it has the duration of the briefest moment of time in which an action can be completed.

This is why a Great Vehicle path of preparation is posited as being superior to a Lesser Vehicle path of preparation by way of divisions.

3) SYNONYMS

“Solitary Victor path of preparation,” “Solitary Victor concordance with a portion of definite discrimination,” “Solitary Victor branch of definite discrimination,” and “Solitary Victor clear realization of the meaning” are synonymous equivalents.

4) MODE OF GENERATION

Although on the level of the Solitary Victor path of accumulation one has attained calm abiding observing the emptiness of external objects, one has not attained special insight [observing that]. When special insight observing this [emptiness of external objects] is attained, one has attained the heat path of preparation of a Solitary Victor.
On the path of accumulation, one has attained calm abiding observing the emptiness of external objects, that is to say, the emptiness of apprehended-objects and apprehending-subjects as different substantial entities, those two having the same meaning. The mind is abiding one-pointedly on that object; however, one has not yet attained a meditative stabilization that is a union of calm abiding and special insight and is observing the emptiness of external objects. When, from within calm abiding, one attains a wisdom conjoined with pliancy—the pliancy being induced by the power of analysis—one has attained the heat level of the Solitary Victor path of preparation.

c. Explaining Solitary Victor paths of seeing

This has four parts: definition, divisions, synonyms, and mode of generation.a

1) DEFINITION

A Solitary Victor’s clear realization of truth that arises after completion of the Solitary Victor path of preparation, its substantial cause, and that precedes the generation of the Solitary Victor path of meditation, its effect, is the definition of a Solitary Victor path of seeing.

---

a The fourth part of this outline, mode of generation, is not explicitly mentioned in the text that follows. There is a small amount of text that might be taken as addressing this point, and a header has been inserted in brackets to indicate it.
“Substantial cause” means the prior substantial continuum of something (rang gi rdzas rgyun snga ma), namely, what is suitable to become the entity of the particular object, that particular effect. It is the prior moment of that. The path of seeing of a Solitary Victor, a Middling Realizer of Suchness, arises after the completion of the Solitary Victor path of preparation that serves as its substantial cause.

The path of meditation is the effect of the path of seeing. The definition of “effect” is that which is helped, or that which is produced, or that which is a subsequent arising. So a path of seeing is a clear realization of the truth that has the path of preparation as its cause and the path of meditation as its effect.

The path of seeing of a Solitary Victor is a clear realization of the truth included within the occasion of the path that newly directly realizes the emptiness of apprehended-object and apprehending-subject as different substantial entities. However, whatever is a Solitary Victor’s path of seeing is not necessarily a direct realization of such non-duality. An example is the mind wishing to attain the enlightenment of a Self-Enlightened One (rang sang rgyas kyi byang chub), that is, this wish in the continuum of a Solitary Victor on the path of seeing subsequent to meditative equipoise (rang rgyal gyi mthong lam rjes thob pa’i rgyud). This is a “clear realization of truth” (bden pa mngon rtogs) [the definition of a path of seeing], but it is not directly realizing the truth (bden pa mngon sum du rtogs kyi ma red).

The same is true of Hearers and Bodhisattvas. For instance, the altruistic mind-generation in the continuum of one on the Great Vehicle path of seeing of subsequent attainment is a mind that is a Great Vehicle clear realization of the truth (theg chen gyi bden pa mngon rtogs). Why? Because it is included within the paths on the occasion of newly realizing a truth that was not realized previously, however, the Great Vehicle altruistic mind-generation does not itself directly realize emptiness.

\[\text{stong nyid la sngar ma rtogs pa’i gsar du rtogs pa’i gnas skabs kyi bsdas pa re}d.\]
Similarly, according to Lo-sel-ling, there would be a mind in the continuum of a Hearer on the path of seeing at the point of subsequent attainment (nyan thos mthong lam rjes thob pa’i rgyud kyi) wishing to attain a Hearer’s liberation, the Hearer path of no-more-learning. It is a Hearer’s clear realization of the truth because it is a path included within the occasion of having newly and directly realized the selflessness of the person that was never before directly realized. However, this mind in the continuum of a Hearer on the path of seeing at the point of subsequent attainment that is wishing for liberation is not itself directly realizing selflessness.

2) DIVISIONS

When [Solitary Victor paths of seeing] are divided, there are three: Solitary Victor paths of seeing that are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise, that are pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment, and Solitary Victor paths of seeing that are neither of those two [that is, neither pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise nor pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment]. If the first, [Solitary Victor paths of seeing that are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise], are divided, there are two: uninterrupted paths and paths of release.\(^a\)

\(^a\) Lo-sang-gyal-tshan offered the following reason for the Solitary Victor division of pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise of the path seeing being just two-fold, rather than three-fold as in the case of Hearers and Bodhisattvas: The main of Solitary Victors is the Rhinoceros-like Solitary Victor, and for them there is no third type of meditative equipoise of the path of seeing because they pass through the paths of preparation, seeing, and meditation in one session, without rising from it. They do not attain the uninterrupted path, the path of release, and then later re-enter meditation on that same emptiness. See below for more discussion of different types of Solitary Victors and their modes of progress.
3) SYNONYMS

“Solitary Victor path of seeing,” “Solitary Victor clear realization of the truth,” and “exalted knower in the continuum of a Solitary Victor on the path of seeing” are synonymous equivalents. For the other points, apply the same pattern as previously.a

[4) MODE OF GENERATION]

According to the Yogic Middle Way Autonomists, a Solitary Victor’s uninterrupted path and path of release both have the aspect of an emptiness of duality.

In the Yogic Middle Way Autonomy system, the emptiness of duality, that is to say, the emptiness of a difference of entity between apprehended-object and apprehending-subject, is the main object of meditation by a Solitary Victor. And this is the “aspect” of both the uninterrupted path and the path of release. The conception of apprehended-object and apprehending-subject as different substantial entities is more difficult to abandon than

a Lo-sang-gyal-tshan took this sentence as indicating that the mode of generation of the Solitary Victor path of seeing should be understood to be basically the same as that of Hearers described previously. See above, 141. Then the next sentence describes the one difference between the paths of seeing of Hearer and Solitary Victors, which is the object being realized. The following header was added since the basic outline given previously had four parts.
the afflictive obstructions—the conception of the person as substantially existent or self-sufficient—and is less difficult to abandon than the obstructions to omniscience—the conception of phenomena as truly existent. Therefore, the emptiness of apprehended-object and apprehending-subject as different entities is posited as a coarse obstruction to omniscience, and the abandonment that is the state of having abandoned the conception of apprehended-object and apprehending-subject as different substantial entities is the main object of attainment sought by Solitary Victors. Hence, in this system the main objects of meditation of Hearers and Solitary Victors are different.

In systems other than [the Yogic Middle Way Autonomists], it must be asserted that those [the uninterrupted paths and paths of release of Solitary Victors] have the aspect of the subtle selflessness of the person.

That is to say, in systems other than the Yogic Middle Way Autonomists, such as Mind-Only, Sūtra Middle Way Autonomy, or any others.

A Solitary Victor is distinguished from a Hearer by six features: lineage; abiding; manner of progress on the path; manner of actualizing the fruit; manner of amassing the collections; and movement.a

From the viewpoint of lineage, Solitary Victors have sharper faculties than Hearers; from the viewpoint of thought, their thought is less vast than that of Bodhisattvas. Thus, from the viewpoint of lineage, they are superior to Hearers and inferior to Bodhisattvas.

There are two types of Solitary Victor: rhinoceros-like Solitary Victors (bse ru lta bu'i rang rgyal) and congregating Solitary Victors (tshogs spyod kyi rang rgyal). The rhinoceros-like Solitary Victors do not abide with other companions but stay alone in isolated places. Congregating Solitary Victors, during their paths of learning, do abide with others—Hearers and other companions; however, when explaining paths of Solitary Victors, they are main explained in terms of the rhinoceros-like, who are taken as chief.

There are three modes of progress on the path for Solitary Victors.

---

a rigs, gnas pa, lam bsgod tshul, 'bras bu mgon du byed tshul, tshogs bsags tshul, rgyu ba.
The first is that of rhinoceros-like Solitary Victors, who, except for the small and medium paths of accumulation, do not accompany or depend upon a Supreme Emanation Body, or Hearers, or others. This means that from the great path of accumulation through the paths of preparation, seeing, meditation, and no-more-learning they stay alone, not depending upon others.

Within the congregating Solitary Victors, there are two types. The first represents the second mode of procedure; these persons do depend upon others—Hearers, Superior Emanation Bodies, and so forth, for generation of the path of preparation, but not for generating the path of seeing and beyond. The second type within congregating Solitary Victors represents the third mode of procedure; these persons do depend upon Hearers, Superior Emanation Bodies, and so forth, for the generation of the path of seeing, but not for the generation of the paths of meditation and no-more-learning.

All three are similar in that when, in their last lifetime, they actualize the fruit of Foe Destroyer, they do not depend upon the instructions of any other teacher. Their last lifetime in cyclic existence means the lifetime in which they will attain the state of Foe Destroyer. In the lifetime prior to that last lifetime just before dying, they plant three prayer petitions; they say, “May I be reborn in a land where there are no Buddhas or Hearers. May I be able to actualize the fruit of Foe Destroyer without depending upon the instructions of another teacher. May I be able to teach the doctrine to trainees without sounds but through physical gestures.” Through the force of those prayers, they are born in any of three continents as either a male or a female and not in the lowest class—in a good class. The three continents are Jambudvīpa (‘dzam bu’i gling), Videha (lus ’phags po), and Godanīya (ba lang spyod)—not in the northern continent, but in the southern, eastern, or western continents.

*Query:* In their last lifetime, would they depend upon, say, a servant?

*Response:* I think not. Even if they did have a servant, they would not talk to the servant. So most likely not. It is not like here, because they would go out begging and then would eat whatever they got and would not

---

a See the 70th Topic in Hopkins and Yi, *Jam-yang-shay-pa’s Seventy Topics*. Dan-ma-lo-chö explains there: A supreme emanation body is one that tames trainees by way of showing the twelve deeds: descent from the Joyous Pure Land, conception, birth, mastery of the arts, sporting with the retinue, renunciation, asceticism, meditation under the tree of enlightenment, conquest of the array of demons, becoming a Buddha, turning the wheel of doctrine, and nirvāṇa (passing away). Among the many activities, the supreme is that of speech, and thus because this type of emanation body turns the wheel of doctrine for each and every trainee who has the lot to receive it, it is called supreme.

b *sgra med lus kyi rnam ‘gyur gyi sgo nas.*
Next is the mode of amassing the collections. Solitary Victors accumulate the collections of merit and wisdom for up to a hundred eons.

There are six objects that Solitary Victors are said to meditate upon: the aggregates; constituents; sense-fields; truths; dependent-arising; and the factual and non-factual. They are skilled in these six.

Regarding the factual and the non-factual, that pleasurable effects arise from accumulating virtuous causes and suffering arises from accumulating non-virtuous causes are factual. The non-factual is the opposite of that; for instance, that from accumulating virtuous causes, unpleasant effects arise. Thus, Solitary Victors determine the factual and non-factual—what is true and what is not true—this being with regard to subtle details of cause and effect, dependent-arising, and so forth. Mainly they contemplate the operation and overcoming of cyclic existence by way of the twelve links of dependent-arising.

The final difference is in terms of movement. When Solitary Victors move about, such as going into a city for alms and so forth, they control their bodies, senses, and mindfulness very carefully, and when teaching those who make offerings to them, they do not use speech, but rather teach doctrine with their bodies, showing miraculous deeds and the like.

d. Explaining Solitary Victor paths of meditation

This has three parts: definition, divisions, and synonyms.

1) DEFINITION

A Solitary Victor’s subsequent clear realization which arises after the completion of the Solitary Victor path of seeing that serves as its substantial cause and occurs prior to the generation of the Solitary Victor path of no-more-learning that is its effect is the definition of a Solitary Victor path of meditation.

\[ \text{phung po, khams, skye mched, bden pa, rten 'brel, gnas dang gnas ma yin pa.} \]
With regard to the path of meditation, the path of seeing is its substantial cause; in other words, the path of seeing was its prior substantial continuum. “Solitary Victor path of seeing” means those paths included within the level of a Solitary Victor’s newly and directly seeing the emptiness of duality that was not realized previously. The path of meditation arises after the completion of such a path of seeing, and is a Solitary Victor’s subsequent clear realization that occurs prior to the path of no-more-learning that is its effect, that is produced by it, that occurs in its subsequent moments, this being the Solitary Victor’s wisdom of extinction and wisdom of non-production again.

2) DIVISIONS

When these [paths of meditation of Solitary Victors] are divided, there are Solitary Victor paths of meditation that are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise and those that are pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment.

The former are cases of being in meditative equipoise on the emptiness of a difference of entity between apprehended-object and apprehending-subject, with the pristine wisdom and that emptiness being like water poured into water. The latter are states of subsequent attainment attained when they rise from that meditative equipoise.

Within the first, [Solitary Victor paths of meditation that are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise] there are nine cycles of the path of meditation—for there are the three small cycles, the three medium cycles, and the three big cycles.
The small of the small, medium of the small, and big of the small are the three small cycles of a Solitary Victor path of meditation. The small of the medium, medium of the medium, and big of the medium are the three medium cycles of a Solitary Victor path of meditation. The small of the big, medium of the big, and big of the big are the three big cycles.

3) SYNONYMS

“Solitary Victor path of meditation,” “Solitary Victor subsequent clear realization,” and “exalted knower in the continuum of one on the Solitary Victor path of meditation” are synonymous equivalents.

Next is the path of no-more-learning which is so called because, in terms of the paths of that vehicle, there are no higher paths; hence, one does not need to strive to attain higher paths of that vehicle.

e. Explaining Solitary Victor paths of no-more-learning

A Solitary Victor’s exalted knower that has abandoned all conceptual consciousnesses conceiving the apprehended to be external objects is the definition of a Solitary Victor path of no-more-learning.
“Apprehended” (gzung ba) refers to objects apprehended. “Conceiving external objects” means conceiving external objects not to be established through the power of the activation of latencies that are with an inner consciousness, but to be established as a different entity from the valid cognition that apprehends it. This is not saying that in general there are no objects that are different substantial entities; rather, it is saying that there is no object that is a different substantial entity from the valid cognition that apprehends it. Former and later moments are different substantial entities; the consciousnesses of different people are different substantial entities, but there is no object that is a different substantial entity from the valid cognition that apprehends it. Thus, in the Mind Only system, all phenomena are of the entity (bdag nyid) (or nature, or selfhood) of the mind.

The attainment of the Solitary Victor path of no-more-learning means that, over the nine cycles of the path of meditation, the person has completely gotten rid of all forms of that conception. From among the two, artificial and innate, not just the artificial but also the innate have been utterly removed leaving no remainder whatsoever. Such an exalted knower is called a Solitary Victor path of no-more-learning.

When [Solitary Victor paths of no-more-learning are] divided, there are two: Solitary Victor paths of no-more-learning of those who previously had the realizations of rhinoceros-like Solitary Victors…

This means that while on the paths of learning the person had previously actualized the paths of a rhinoceros-like Solitary Victor, so that they have now actualized such a path of no-more-learning.

and Solitary Victor paths of no-more-learning of those who previously had the realizations of a congregating Solitary Victor.

For other points, apply the same pattern [as previously].
The second refers to those Solitary Victors who depended on others for the generation of the path of preparation and those who also depended on others for the generation of the path of seeing.

“For other points, apply the same pattern,” indicates that one can carry over what was explained before about Hearers.
5. Great Vehicle Paths

C. EXPLANATION OF GREAT VEHICLE PATHS

This has two parts: a general indication of the five paths and explaining in detail a presentation of the ten grounds.

1. General indication of the five paths

[This has five parts:] definition, divisions, synonyms, etymologies, and explaining the meanings of the individual divisions.

a. Definition

A Great Vehicle exalted knower included either within that which causes progress to the Great Vehicle enlightenment or within having progressed to the [Great Vehicle enlightenment] is the definition of a Great Vehicle path.
"That which causes progress to the Great Vehicle enlightenment" refers to the Bodhisattva paths, and that which has already "progressed to the Great Vehicle enlightenment" refers to the paths in the continuum of a Buddha Superior.

Query: How can the exalted knowers in the continuum of a Buddha be called paths?

Response: Even though Buddhas do not engage in attaining qualities not already attained and do not strive to fulfill qualities that have not been fulfilled, once Buddhas have actualized the fruit, they engage in many activities to bring about others' welfare, enter into meditative equipoise, and so forth. Just as we have to walk to come to this building and still have to walk once we come inside, so the exalted knowers in the continuum of a Buddha are also called paths.

To explain a bit about the terminology of "Great" and "Lesser" Vehicles, Hearers and Solitary Victors have a "Lesser Vehicle" because they cherish themselves and, not being able to help others much, neglect the welfare of others. For instance, if an official in the government does not look after the welfare of the people (mi mang) but only after his own welfare, that is not considered to be good; it is considered to be low, or lesser. "Lesser" means that it is not superior.

Bodhisattvas are said to be of the Great Vehicle, to be Mahāyānists, not because of external qualities such as size, but because of the vastness of their thought—because a Bodhisattva is thinking that he or she must attain the state of Buddhahood in order to free all sentient beings throughout space from suffering and establish them all in happiness. Prior to freeing all sentient beings from suffering and establishing them in happiness, it is necessary to free oneself from all suffering and establish oneself in the greatest happiness; thus, when the Bodhisattva examines to determine who has such capacity, in what state one has the capacity to free all sentient beings from suffering and to establish them all in happiness, he or she determines that only a Buddha has this capacity and hence decides definitely to attain Buddhahood for the sake of all sentient beings.

Thinking of this, Maitreya says in the Ornament for the Clear Realizations (I.18ab), "Mind-generation is the wish for complete, perfect enlightenment for the sake of others."

\[a\] See Hopkins and Yi, Jam-yang-shay-pa’s Seventy Topics, I.18ab, where this line is discussed in detail.
aspirations: it arises from its cause, which is an aspiration seeking the welfare of others, and it is associated with an aspiration for one’s own enlightenment. Due to this, the vehicle of the Bodhisattva is called the “Great Vehicle” because both the object of intent, which is the welfare of limitless sentient beings, and the thought, which is a Bodhisattva’s seeking to establish all sentient beings in the state of Buddhahood in order to benefit them all, are vast.

A Bodhisattva’s clear realization that serves as a passageway opening the opportunity for progressing to the Great Vehicle liberation is the definition of a Bodhisattva path.

“Bodhisattva training,” “complete training in all aspects,” “Great Vehicle achieving,” “achieving through armor,” “Bodhisattva’s exalted knower,” and “Bodhisattva’s clear realization” are synonymous equivalents.

b. Divisions

When those [Great Vehicle paths] are divided, there are five: Great Vehicle paths of accumulation, paths of preparation, paths of seeing, paths of meditation, and paths of no-more-learning.

---

a The 1999 TBRC bla brang (11b.6), and 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (10b.4) both read pa’i. The Mundgod digital (12.13) reads ba’i.
b The 1999 TBRC bla brang (10a.1) and 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (10b.5) have no shad here. It has been added in accordance with the 2012 Mundgod digital (12.15).
c. Synonyms

“Great Vehicle path,” “Great Vehicle clear realization,” and “Great Vehicle exalted knower” are synonymous equivalents.

d. Etymologies

These can be known through inferring them from the former ones.\(^a\)

Great Vehicle paths have seven greatnesses. As Maitreya’s Ornament for the Great Vehicle Sūtras (mdo sde rgyan, mahāyānasūtrasālaṃkāra) says:\(^b\) “Greatness of object of observation,

---

\(^a\) This is a reference back to the general explanation of “paths” given in Chapter Two, these etymologies can readily be adapted to be made specific for the Great Vehicle. See 95ff.

\(^b\) sde dge: TBRC W23703.123: 3-80, which is a PDF of: Delhi: Karmapae choedhey, Gyalwae sungrab partun khang, 1982-1985, 62.3-4.
passion, it observes all sentient beings and seeks to free them from all suffering, be it the frights of cyclic existence or the frights of a state of solitary peace.

“And similarly the two achievings,

This is the achieving that is the fulfillment of one’s own welfare, which is the final abandonment, and the achieving that is the fulfillment of others’ welfare, which is the final realization.

“Pristine wisdom and the initiation of effort,

Here “pristine wisdom” refers to the wisdom realizing the meaning of the mode of subsistence (gnas lugs kyi don), emptiness. By way of understanding—just as it is—with such wisdom that phenomena are primordially pure, one initiates vast effort for the sequential cultivation of the paths.

In general, the term “pristine wisdom” is used for all paths, but here it is preferable to take it as referring to the wisdom realizing emptiness. In dependence on this wisdom realizing that phenomena are primordially pure of true existence, one initiates effort to accumulate the vast collections of merit and wisdom for the sake of achieving Buddhahood, the completion of one’s own and other’s purposes. The main means for progressing to Buddhahood is the wisdom realizing emptiness because the main path is the pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise. Each of the uninterrupted paths acts as the antidote to its respective object of abandonment, and after each of these one attains a path of release that is a state of having abandoned its respective object of abandonment.

“Skill in method,

The previous items had to do with the collection of pristine wisdom and the wisdom realizing emptiness whereas this one indicates all paths included within the factor of method, that is to say, great compassion, the altruistic mind of enlightenment, great love, and so forth. They are very skilled in all those paths that are included within the collection of merit and, being skilled in method, are able to bring about the welfare of sentient beings, knowing just what is appropriate to help each sentient being.

“The great achievement of the true [welfare of others],
Because they are greatly skilled in means, they know how to teach other sentient beings in accordance with their dispositions, thoughts, latent predispositions, and so forth and thus are able to greatly achieve the true welfare of others. They teach thinking only of what will most greatly benefit those they are teaching, not of themselves. For instance, when Bodhisattvas explain doctrine to sentient beings, to those who need explanations by way of many examples, many reasons, and many different divisions, they explain it that way. If the person does not need very vast teaching or very brief teaching but needs a medium variety, they set forth a medium mode. There are also those who don’t like extensive explanations but need a brief one; Bodhisattvas are also able to explain the doctrine in such a brief manner. Thus, Bodhisattvas are able to achieve well the welfare of trainees of great, medium, and small intellect.

There are two ways of determining who are of sharper or duller faculties. There are those for whom just to begin to explain a topic is sufficient. Because they can understand it all from just a little explanation, they are very sharp. This is from the point of view of the practitioner. The medium need more explanation, and the dull need vast explanations. This is one system. The system I have been explaining above, however, is that the sharpest can still understand what is being presented no matter how much is explained. Such a person does not consider it to be difficult to learn more and more, to learn a very extensive presentation. To those who become confused when a lot is explained, a medium amount needs to be explained. The person who becomes confused at even that amount is taught even less. In this way, the One Hundred Thousand Stanza Perfection of Wisdom Sūtra, which is the most extensive version, is taught to the sharpest; the Twenty-five Thousand Stanza Sūtra is for the medium; the Eight Thousand Stanza is for those of lesser intellect.

“The great activities of a Buddha,

When one attains the state of Buddhahood in which all defects have been removed and all auspicious attributes are possessed, one is a Buddha who issues forth physical creations (sku’i bchod pa) in accordance with the needs of sentient beings, be these in pure lands or in impure lands. One then ceaselessly engages in activities of body, speech, and mind for the sake of sentient beings until cyclic existence itself is emptied of sentient beings.
"Because it possesses these greatesses, it is definitely called the 'Great Vehicle'."

One attains the name “Mahāyānist,” or “One of the Great Vehicle,” at the point at which one develops the altruistic mind of enlightenment. There is a statement in some texts that in order to generate the altruistic mind of enlightenment in the mental continuum, one must have developed experience on the level of a state arisen from meditation. The reason for the usage of this designation—that one must have experience that is “arisen from meditation”—is that one must meditate repeatedly and for a long time in order to generate the altruistic mind of enlightenment. This is called the development of non-artificial experience.

However, there is also an explanation that in order to attain any state that has “arisen from meditation,” it is necessary to have attained calm abiding. What Tsong-kha-pa says in the Great Exposition of the Stages of the Path (lam rim chen mo) to resolve this is that even though an altruistic mind of enlightenment is not a state arisen from meditation in the technical sense, since it is meditation, what contradiction is there in its being arisen from meditation? If it were contradictory, then until a person had attained a preparation (nyer bsdogs) for the first concentration, which is simultaneous with achieving calm abiding, there would not be any possibility of this person’s having “meditation” [this being absurd].

\[\text{Lam rim chen mo / skyes bu gsum gyi nyams su blang ba’i rim pa thams cad tshang bar sion pa’i byang chub lam gyi rim pa (Dharamsala, India: Tibetan Cultural Printing Press, 1964) 70.20-71.2. English translation: Great Treatise on the Stages of the Path to Enlightenment, vol. 1 (Snow Lion: Ithaca, N.Y., 2000), 111:}\]

While mere familiarization with knowledge acquired through the wisdom of study and reflection is indeed not a good quality that results from meditation, how could this contradict familiarization as simply being equivalent to meditation? If it did, then meditation would never be possible for an ordinary being who had not attained access to the first meditative stabilization. For, the texts on knowledge often explain that the process of entering a higher level from the level of the desire realm creates a good quality that results from meditation, but there is no such result of meditation [creation of a good quality] associated with the desire realm itself.

Tsong-kha-pa’s point becomes more clear when commentary from the Four Interwoven Annotations (The Lam rim chen mo of the incomparable Tsong-kha-pa, with the interlinear notes of Ba-so Chos-kyi-rgyal-mtshan, Sde-drug Mkhon-chen Ngag-dbang-rab-ritan, ’Jam-dbyangs-bsad-pa’i-rdo-rje, and Bra-sti Dge-bshes Rin-chon-don-grub, lam rim mchan
Hence, although there are two apparent explanations—one in which one does need to have a state arisen from meditation and the other in which one does not—in order to generate an altruistic mind of enlightenment in the mental continuum, there is no contradiction, because the former is not a technical use of the term “arisen from meditation.” This is because scriptures speak of hell beings, animals, and so forth who generate the altruistic mind of enlightenment without cultivating the nine states leading to calm abiding and gaining calm abiding itself [which they cannot do]. Hence, the statement that experience on the level of a state arisen from meditation is needed to have developed an altruistic mind of enlightenment means that “non-artificial experience” is needed rather than an actual state arisen from meditation, because whoever has a state arisen from meditation [in its technical sense] must also have generated calm abiding. Hence the term “arisen from meditation” is here a case of using this term to indicate that non-artificial experience has arisen.

The utterly essential (yod na med na gcig) root of the Great Vehicle path is the altruistic mind of enlightenment. It is the door of entry to the Great Vehicle.

e. Explaining the meanings of the individual divisions

The word dbye ba is present tense; phye ba is past tense and refers to divisions already made. The divisions here are the five paths. Kön-chog-jig-bzhi shrags ma/ mnyam med rje btsun tsong kha pa chen pos mdzad pa ’i byang chub lam rim chen no ’i dka’ ba ’i gnad rnams mchan bu bzhi’i sgo nas legs par bshad pa theg chen lam gyi gsal gspron [New Delhi: Chos’-phel-legs-ldan, 1972], vol.1., 68b.4-68b.6/146.4-146.6) is added (annotations in brackets):

[Third, meditation and arisen from meditation differ:] Therefore, mere familiarization with that very ascertainment by way of the wisdoms of hearing and of thinking is indeed not arisen from meditation, but what contradiction is there in its being meditation! If it were contradictory, then meditation would utterly not occur in a common person who had not attained a preparation (nyer bsdogs) for the first concentration because it is explained many times in the texts of manifest knowledge (chos mngon pa, abhidharma) that states arisen from meditation do not exist in those [levels of the Desire Realm] except for the case of generating a state arisen from meditation when one enters into a high level in the level of the Desire Realm [such as a one-pointed mind of the Desire Realm (’dod sens rtse gcig pa)] among the nine mental abidings, when pliancy is generated] in dependence upon it.
may-wang-po has already made a division into the five paths; now he gives an explanation of those divisions.

This has two parts: explaining the paths of common beings and the paths of Superiors.

Asaṅga’s *Summary of Manifest Knowledge* says, “What is a common being? One who has not attained the attributes of a Superior.” This is a person who has not attained a Superior path. A common being is also called “one who looks nearby” (tshur mthong).

A Superior (*’phags pa, ārya*) is so called because one is elevated above, or superior to (*khyad par du ’phags pa*) the levels of a common being.

1) EXPLAINING THE PATHS OF COMMON BEINGS

A Bodhisattva’s exalted knower included within the levels of engagement through belief is the definition of a path of a Bodhisattva common being. When those [paths of Bodhisattvas common beings] are divided, there are two, Bodhisattva paths of accumulation and of preparation.

A) BODHISATTVA PATHS OF ACCUMULATION

This has four parts: definition, divisions, synonyms, and mode of generation.

---

*a so so’i skyes bu gang zhes na ’phags pa’i chos ma thob pa’o. sde dge: TBRC W23703. 134: 89 – 241, which is a PDF of: Delhi: Karmapae choedhey, Gyalwae sungrab partun khang, 1982-1985, 218.4. The full passage is: ’dod pa na spyod pa’i so so’i skye bo gang zhe na/ gang ’dod pa’i khams su skyes par gyur la ’phags pa’i chos rnams ma thob pa’i gang zag go//
I' Definition

A Great Vehicle clear realization of doctrine is the definition of a Great Vehicle path of accumulation.¹

2' Divisions

When those [Great Vehicle paths of accumulation] are divided, there are three: great, medium and small.

Remember the explanation that was given at the time of the presentation of the Hearer path of accumulation, of these three done in terms of one person and done in terms of different types of consciousness. [The same applies here.]²

3' Synonyms

“Great Vehicle concordance with a portion of liberation,” “Great Vehicle path of accumulation,” and “Great Vehicle clear realization of doctrine” are synonymous equivalents.

¹ Notice that Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po has made a shift from speaking about Bodhisattva path of accumulation to using the wording Great Vehicle path of accumulation. The two are equivalent. From this point on he uses only “Great Vehicle.”

² See Chapter Three, 117.
Here, one can give a different etymology for the Great Vehicle path of accumulation than that which was given for the Hearer path of accumulation because in the Great Vehicle one must accumulate the collections of merit and wisdom for three periods of countless eons in order to attain Buddhahood. Thus, at this point one is beginning the accumulation of the collections for the first period of countless eons. The accumulation of the collections for the first period of countless eons is done over the path of accumulation, the path of preparation, and the first ground. The rest of the impure grounds, the second through the seventh grounds, are the time of accumulation for the second set of countless eons. The third is done over the three pure grounds, the eighth, ninth, and tenth.

For the etymologies of these, apply the same pattern as previously.

4’ Mode of generation

Initial generation of a Great Vehicle mind-generation and entry to the Great Vehicle path of accumulation are simultaneous. For, when non-artificial experience arises with regard to an awareness seeking unsurpassed enlightenment for others’ welfare, one must be posited as having entered the Great Vehicle path of accumulation.

“For others’ welfare” means for the sake of establishing all other sentient beings in the state of a non-abiding nirvāṇa. “Unsurpassed enlightenment” is so called because there is no enlightenment higher. This is the state of Buddhahood that is the final object of attainment, in which one has the ultimate of abandonments and of realizations.
What is unsurpassed enlightenment? It is the wisdom body of attributes (ye shes chos sku) that realizes all the different types of objects of knowledge. And it is the complete enjoyment body (long spyod rdzogs pa’i sku) and emanation body (sprul sku) that possess this wisdom in their continuums. These are what is called “enlightenment.”

One cultivates slowly over time the intention, “If I could only attain the two form bodies,” and whenever non-artificial experience arises with regard to it, at that time one enters the Great Vehicle path of accumulation. In brief, whenever one generates the precious altruistic mind of enlightenment in one’s continuum, then one has entered among Mahāyānists, those of the Great Vehicle.

**B) GREAT VEHICLE PATHS OF PREPARATION**

This has four parts: definition, divisions, synonyms, and mode of generation.

1' Definition

A Great Vehicle clear realization of the meaning is the definition of a Great Vehicle path of preparation.

2' Divisions

When those [Great Vehicle paths of preparation] are divided, there are four: heat, peak, forbearance, and supreme mundane quality. Each of those—[heat, peak, forbearance, and supreme mundane quality—is divided into] three—small, medium and great—making twelve.

---

*a Kön-chok-jig-may-wang-po has deviated here from his original outline, according to which this section should have been “Explaining the Bodhisattva path of preparation.” The meaning is unchanged, but he has shifted his wording to Great Vehicle and uses the revised wording throughout the following section.*
3' Synonyms

“Great Vehicle path of preparation,” “Great Vehicle concordance with a portion of definite discrimination,” “Great Vehicle limb of definite discrimination,” and “Great Vehicle clear realization of the meaning” are synonymous equivalents.\(^a\)

4' Mode of generation

If this is treated in terms of those whose lineage is definite in the Great Vehicle from the very beginning, who have not previously gone on a lower path, the initial attainment of special insight observing emptiness and entry into the

\(^a\) In commentary on the 3rd Topic in Hopkins and Yi, Jam-yang-shay-pa’s Seventy Topics, Dan-ma-lo-chö explains the meaning of the latter three of these terms:

The path of preparation is also called a “clear realization of the meaning” because one is realizing emptiness mainly by way of a meditative stabilization that is a union of calm abiding and special insight. A path of seeing is called “definite discrimination” (nges ’byed) because one is seeing emptiness directly, and the path of preparation is called the “limb of definite discrimination” because the meditative stabilization that is a union of calm abiding and special insight is like a part of that. Also, because of being concordant with or partially similar to (cha mithun) this discrimination for the same reason, it is called concordance with a portion of definite discrimination (nges ’byed cha mithun), that is, partially concordant with the path of seeing.
Great Vehicle path of preparation are simultaneous.

Those who have previously gone on a lower path refers to those who enter the Hearer or Solitary Victor path, complete that path, and attain the fruit of Foe Destroyer; subsequent to this, exhorted by teachings from a Buddha, they enter into the Great Vehicle path. It does not refer to those who have generated, for instance, the path of accumulation or preparation of a Hearer or Solitary Victor, for they have not generated a union of calm abiding and special insight realizing emptiness. As for the path of seeing of a Hearer or Solitary Victor, there is no one who has attained either of those who does not go on to become a Foe Destroyer in that vehicle.

Hence the discussion here is not in terms of those who have completed the Lesser Vehicle path and then switch over to the Great Vehicle, but rather is about those whose lineage is definite in the Great Vehicle from the very beginning. “From the very beginning” means from even before entering the path. So this refers to someone who before entering the Great Vehicle path has proceeded in the usual manner of developing great compassion, then generating the altruistic aspiration to enlightenment, and then entering the Great Vehicle path of accumulation.

If this is treated in accordance with those who have previously been on a lesser path, (1) new attainment of the special capacity to overcome the manifest conception of afflicted objects and (2) entry into the Great Vehicle path of preparation are simultaneous.

A follower of the Lesser Vehicle who has special insight observing emptiness would not have this special capacity. The reason for this is that the
manifest conception of afflicted objects (*kun nas nyon mongs gzung rtog mgon gyar pa*) refers to the conception of the true existence of objects, and this is an obstruction to omniscience.\(^a\) A follower of the Lesser Vehicle is not striving mainly to overcome the obstructions to omniscience, but is mainly striving to overcome the afflictive obstructions. Because the obstructions to omniscience are more difficult to abandon, a follower of the Lesser Vehicle is not capable of overcoming the manifest artificial conception of true existence of afflicted objects [and has to develop this capacity in order to reach the level of the Great Vehicle path of preparation].

Lo-sang-gyal-tshan:\(^b\) Those who have previously been on a lesser path have extensive experience with one-pointed meditation on the selflessness of the person and have already attained a pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise and a union of calm abiding and special insight observing this. Having entered into the Great Vehicle, they have to shift their object of meditation to emptiness, the subtle selflessness of phenomena, but the mode of meditation is the same as what they have already practiced, and hence this is easier for them than if they were just beginning to meditate on selflessness. It is like the way it is easier to learn to drive a big truck if you already know how to drive a car, than if you are starting to learn on a big truck from the very beginning. Hence, those who have completed the Hearer path meditating on the selflessness of the person quickly achieve a union of calm abiding and special insight observing emptiness. Nonetheless, this alone is not sufficient for them to progress to the path of preparation. They still need to meditate again and again with great force on emptiness until, from among the four artificial conceptions, they are able to overcome the manifest conception of afflicted objects.

\(^a\) Dan-ma-lo-chó explains these in detail in commentary on “Features such as object of observation, aspect, and so forth [of paths of preparation]” in Hopkins and Yi, *Jam-yang-shay-pa’s Seventy Topics*:

The conception of true existence is of two varieties—artificial (*kun btags*) and innate (*lhan skyes*). The artificial conception of true existence, as well as its seeds, is entirely and forever abandoned by the path of seeing. The artificial conception of true existence has four divisions, and even though artificial conceptions are actually abandoned by the path of seeing, one attains the capacity to suppress their manifest form on the path of preparation.

Capacity to suppress the manifest forms of these four “conceptions” also serves as a way of delineating the divisions of the path of preparation in the Great Vehicle. See below, 198-203.

\(^b\) Oral communication, 23 January, 2013.
When a Bodhisattva who has not previously been on the lesser path attains the path of release of the path of seeing, he or she has abandoned the artificial obstructions to omniscience, the artificial conception of true existence. Along with that, he or she has automatically abandoned the artificial afflictive obstructions, the artificial conception of self. No special effort is required. When the more difficult are abandoned, the less difficult are abandoned along with them.

There are differences in the four levels of the path of preparation, heat and so forth. The non-conceptual pristine wisdom of the path of seeing is a path like fire, and the initial generation of a path that is similar to heat in that it is a prior sign of the generation of that [fire] is called the "heat path of preparation."

The path of seeing is so called because one is directly seeing the status of the truth. It is non-conceptual because (1) it is free from apprehending signs (mtshan 'dzin dang bral ba), that is, free from the conception of true existence and (2) it is free from being a conceptual knower apprehending in a manner suitable for the association of a sound-genericity and a meaning-genericity. Such a non-conceptual pristine wisdom is a yogic direct perceiver, and when it is a non-conceptual pristine wisdom of the path of seeing, it is a path that is like a fire. Prior to the generation of such a non-conceptual pristine wisdom that is like fire, there has to be a prior sign (snga ltas) that it is coming.

There are cases of the severance of any of the roots of virtue through the force of anger and so forth on the heat path of preparation and below, but, from the point of having attained the peak path of preparation, there is no severance of any roots of virtue due to the force of those [that is, due to anger and so forth]. Because of having reached the peak of fluctuation of roots of virtue, it is called the peak path of preparation.

---

a From this point, the explanation returns to that given by Dan-ma-lo-chö.
Through the force of anger, wrong views, and so forth, virtuous roots are overcome (bcom), not a permanent annihilation but a severance of virtuous roots such that they lose their capacity to produce effects. This can occur on the path of accumulation and on the heat path of preparation, but from the peak path of preparation, one has reached a “peak” beyond which such severance can no longer occur.\(^a\) At this point strong anger and so forth cannot be generated. Anger can still be generated, but not in a form strong enough to overcome roots of virtue. The peak of fluctuation is the peak beyond the fluctuation of the roots of virtue.

Also [this is called the peak path of preparation] because it is said that at this point one has attained a nirvāṇa that is a passing beyond the sorrow of the severance of virtuous roots.\(^b\)

One has attained a non-analytical cessation (so sor brtags min gyi 'gog pa)

---

\(^a\) Lo-sang-gyal-tshan added that discussion of the meaning of “severance” (chad pa) in general and in this context of the Bodhisattva grounds can be found in Tsong-kha-pa’s Extensive Explanation of (Chandrakirti’s) “Supplement to (Nāgārjuna’s) ‘Treatise on the Middle’”: Illumination of the Thought (dgongs pa rab gsal) in the discussion of the perfection of patience beginning under the heading of “Meaning of the text on the unsuitability of anger due to its destroying virtue accumulated over a long time.” For an English translation, see Compassion in Tibetan Buddhism (Ithaca, N.Y.: Snow Lion Publications, 1980), 208-216.

\(^b\) Note that here and in the following passage the term “passing beyond sorrow,” (myang ‘das, nirvāṇa) is used much earlier than the actual nirvāṇa. Lo-sang-gyal-tshan explained that of the two explanations given for the meaning of peak, the first shows what one has left behind when reaching a “peak” that is beyond the severance of virtuous roots, while the second indicates what has gained when reaching the “peak,”—a nirvāṇa, a passing beyond the sorrow, of such a severance. (Oral communication, 23 January, 2014.)
in which there is no more severance of the roots of virtue.

Because of having newly attained a forbearance that is non-fear with regard to the profound doctrine, emptiness, it is called the forbearance path of preparation. From the point of attaining this [forbearance path of preparation], one will not be born in bad migrations through the power of actions and afflictions, due to which one is said to have attained a nirvana that is a passing beyond the sorrow of the bad migrations.

From the forbearance path of preparation on, there is utterly no rebirth in the bad migrations due to actions and afflictions: one has attained a non-analytical cessation that is a cessation of rebirth in bad migrations. “Nirvana” here refers to a non-analytical cessation [whereas the actual nirvana is an analytical cessation of all afflictions].

Because of being the supreme, [or the very best] of worldly virtues, it is called the supreme mundane quality path of preparation.

There is another way of positing the heat, peak, forbearance, and supreme mundane quality levels of the path of preparation:¹

¹ This alternative identification of the significance of the four levels of the path of preparation is based on the four artificial conceptions of true existence. On the four levels of the path of preparation one attains the capacity to overcome the manifest form of these conceptions respectively. See Hopkins and Yi, Jam-yang-shay-pa’s Seventy Topics, for a detailed explanation under the heading of “Ways of having conceptions as objects of abandonment” within the broader topic of “Features such as object of observation, aspect, and so forth [of paths of preparation].” In brief form these four are called: 1) attainment of perception of suchness (de kho na nyid la snang ba thob pa); 2) increase of perception of
In another way, because the meditative stabilization of clear appearance of a meaning-generality with regard to the noumenon has been initially attained, it is called “the Great Vehicle heat path of preparation;”

The term “noumenon” (chos nyid, dharmatā) refers to the emptiness, or mode of being, or thusness (de bzhin nyid, tathātā) of phenomena. The term “meaning-generality” (don spyi, arthaśāmānya) refers here not to the generality in the pair “generality and particularity” but to the generally characterized phenomenon that appears to thought. This is the appearance of an object to a conceptual consciousness apprehending that object, whether it be the appearance of pot to a conceptual consciousness apprehending pot or the appearance of form to a conceptual consciousness apprehending form. There is a meaning-generality relative to each and every phenomenon. The meaning-generality of emptiness being referred to in this line is the appearance of emptiness to a conceptual consciousness apprehending emptiness. “Clear appearance of a meaning-generality” refers to a much clearer appearance of the meaning-generality of emptiness than that which appeared during the times of hearing and thinking.

suchness (de kho na nyid la snang ba mched pa); 3) abiding in one part of suchness (that means there is no longer a sense of the object, but there is a sense of the subject, de kho na nyid la phyogs gcig la zhung pa); 4) the non-interrupted meditative stabilization (de ma thag pa'i ting nge 'dzin). They are the same as heat, peak, forbearance, and supreme mundane quality; however, they describe, in terms of what is appearing to the consciousness, an ability to overcome increasingly more subtle levels of the artificial conception of true existence: two of objects (gzung rtog) and two of subjects ('dzin rtog). At the heat level, one overcomes conceptions of afflicted phenomena being truly existent objects of use (kun nas nyon mongs gzung rtog). At the peak level one overcomes conceptions of pure phenomena as being truly existent objects of use (rnam byang gzung rtog). At the forbearance level one overcomes conceptions that a consciousness conceiving that a substantially existent self truly exists (rdzas 'dzin rtog pa). At the supreme mundane quality level, one overcomes the conceptions that a consciousness conceiving that an imputedly existent self truly exists (btags 'dzin rtog pa).

See Sopa and Hopkins, *Cutting Through Appearances*, 225-30, for a detailed presentation of generic images as well as an explanation of specifically and generally characterized phenomena.
With the attainment of the Great Vehicle path of preparation, one attains a meditative stabilization that is a union of calm abiding and special insight observing emptiness. Because this is the beginning of the states arisen from meditation observing emptiness, one has a clearer appearance of the meaning-generality of emptiness than during the times of hearing and thinking. Thus, at this point one initially attains a meditative stabilization that has clear appearance of a meaning-generality with regard to the status of phenomena, and hence this heat path of preparation is called “attainment of an appearance of suchness” (de kho na nyid la snang ba thob pa).

In order to attain the meditative stabilization that is a union of calm abiding and special insight observing emptiness, it is first necessary to attain calm abiding observing emptiness. To gain this, one must first attain a state arisen from thought observing emptiness. For that, one must think about the meaning of emptiness by way of reasoned analysis. To engage properly in such thought and analysis regarding the meaning of emptiness, one must have attained states arisen from hearing observing emptiness. To attain those states, one must hear about emptiness from someone who shows the path. Ideally this would be a person who has thoroughly understood, or internalized, the meaning of emptiness, but at least it should be someone who has heard instructions about emptiness from the texts and has internalized that guidance.

This is the reason why it is said that in the beginning hearing is very important. If one engages in meditation without having preceded it with hearing, it is difficult to generate realization in the mental continuum. In the past a Ka-dam-pa lama said, “A person who is seeking to be a great meditator without having done hearing is like someone trying to climb a stone cliff without any fingers.” Therefore, hearing is very important. First of all one engages in hearing, and then generates wisdom arisen from hearing.

What does hearing mean in this context? It means to hear with the ear those scriptures that teach emptiness. With regard to states arisen from hearing and states arisen from meditation, “states arisen from hearing” are those minds mainly induced by hearing that are approaching, or directed towards, suchness. Minds arisen from hearing, or wisdom arisen from hearing, are mainly cases of correct assumption (yid dpyod). Whether one hears it from a lama directly or reads it in a book, when one then “decides” on this basis that all phenomena are indeed without true existence, this is included within a state arisen from hearing.

After that, one engages in analysis by way of reasoning. At this point one is thinking on what faults there would be if phenomena did truly exist,
the reasons why phenomena do not truly exist, and so forth. This type of thought or contemplation is called thinking. One has to engage in this type of thought extensively. For example, one might take a specific phenomenon such as a sprout or self and think that it does not truly exist because of being a dependent-arising or because it is devoid of being either a truly existent one or a truly existent plurality. When, in dependence on such reasons, one comes to no longer have doubt wondering whether phenomena truly exist or not, then in dependence upon the statement of a sign—a logical reason having the three aspects—one can generate an inferential consciousness realizing just as it is that phenomena do not truly exist. This inferential cognition is a wisdom arisen from thought.

Having generated this state arisen from thought, one familiarizes with it again and again. This is meditation. At this point persons who have achieved calm abiding previously must generate in the mental continuum calm abiding observing emptiness. Persons who have not achieved calm abiding previously must at that time cultivate calm abiding in the manner that it is usually explained and practiced and thereby achieve calm abiding.

Thus there are two types of persons: those who search out meditation, that is to say, calm abiding, from within the view of emptiness, and those who search out the view from within meditation, that is to say, from within calm abiding. Whichever one is, when one attains a meditative stabilization that spontaneously and without striving understands emptiness, this being from the viewpoint of being conjoined with mental and physical pliancy, one has attained calm abiding observing emptiness.

If, having achieved calm abiding, one immediately engages in analysis, the mind will fluctuate. If one stays within stabilizing meditation, there is no fluctuation, but if one does reasoned analysis the mind will waver. However, in dependence on again and again cultivating this calm abiding that observes emptiness [by alternating analytical meditation and stabilizing meditation], then eventually even when one analyzes, the mind will not fluctuate but rather a stability even greater than before will be induced. When reasoned analysis acts as an assister to the development of even greater stability, one attains a meditative stabilization that is a union of calm abiding and special insight distinguishing phenomena that is induced by the power of analysis through reasoning and is conjoined with mental and physical pliancy. This is called a meditative stabilization that is a union of calm abiding and special insight observing emptiness. It is a “union” of calm abiding and special insight because the meditative stabilization observing emptiness and the wisdom realizing emptiness mutually assist each other. This point, which is the initial attainment of such a meditative stabilization of calm abiding and special insight observing emptiness, is
called the heat path of preparation. [The emptiness being meditated on is the emptiness of true existence, and the level of realization attained at this point overcomes conceptions of afflicted phenomena as truly existent objects of use.]

and because a meditative stabilization of the increase of appearance of a meaning-generality with regard to the noumenon has been initially attained, it is called the Great Vehicle peak path of preparation;

The word “increase” (mched pa) has the sense of getting stronger, as for instance a fire’s growing larger, greater, stronger. Here the appearance of a meaning-generality to the meditative stabilization that is a union of calm abiding observing emptiness is increasing in strength, is greater than it was when this meditative stabilization was initially attained; this marks the peak path of preparation. [The level of realization attained at this point overcomes conceptions of pure phenomena as truly existent objects of use.]

and because the paramount of clear appearance of a meaning-generality with regard to the noumenon has been attained and a meditative stabilization on a portion of apprehending-subjects has been initially attained, it is called the Great Vehicle forbearance path of preparation;

The path of preparation began with the initial attainment of clear appearance of a meaning-generality of emptiness. When one attains the paramount (rab) of such clear appearance, one has attained the forbearance level of the path of preparation. At this point one has attained the capacity to overcome the manifest form of artificial conceptualizations apprehending substantial existence. Hence, one is said to have engaged in a “portion” of suchness because one has overcome one of the two manifest forms of artificial conceptualizations of apprehending-subjects (‘dzin rtog) as truly
existent.\textsuperscript{a} and because an immediately preceding meditative stabilization that will quickly generate the uninterrupted meditative stabilization has been initially attained, it is called the Great Vehicle supreme mundane quality path of preparation.

At this level one has attained the capacity to suppress the manifest form of all those artificial conceptions to be abandoned by the path of seeing. Thus one has newly attained the capacity to overcome the manifest form of the conception of the true existence of apprehending-subjects that realize the person to be imputedly existent. The uninterrupted meditative stabilization that will be quickly, or immediately, generated is the path of seeing itself, and at this point of the supreme mundane quality path of preparation, one has an immediately preceding meditative stabilization because just after this the path of seeing will be generated.

Some propound that the initial attainment of clear appearance with regard to the noumenon is called heat, and the increase of this [clear appearance with regard to the noumenon] is called forbearance, and so forth. This is not logically feasible because the four levels of the path of preparation, heat and so forth, of those definite in the lineage of the Great Vehicle are conceptual consciousnesses, due to which their objects do not appear clearly to them, whereas an awareness having clear appearance is a non-conceptual consciousness.

\textsuperscript{a} The two are conceptualizations apprehending substantial existence (\textit{rdzas 'dzin rtog pa}) and conceptualizations apprehending imputed existence (\textit{btags 'dzin rtog pa}); as Ngag-wang-pal-dan says, the first are “conceptualizations of a substantially existent apprehender,” and the second are “conceptualizations of an imputedly existent apprehender.” For discussion of these, see Jeffrey Hopkins and Jongbok Yi, \textit{Ngag-wang-pal-dan’s Explanation of (Maitreya’s) Treatise “Ornament for the Clear Realizations” from the Approach of the Meaning of the Words: Sacred Word of Maitreyanātha} (UMA Institute for Tibetan Studies: \texttt{http://uma-tibet.org}), V.13-14 and V.15-16 respectively, and V.30-31 and V.32-34 respectively. For a slightly different way that Kôn-chog-jig-may-wang-po discusses this process, see Sopa and Hopkins, \textit{Cutting Through Appearances}, 292-4.
There are some scholars who say that the initial attainment of clear appearance with regard to the noumenon (chos nyid), that is, the emptiness that is the mode of subsistence of phenomena, is called “heat,” and that subsequent levels of its increase higher and higher are called forbearance, and so forth. This is incorrect because the four levels of the path of preparation, heat and so forth, in the continuums of Bodhisattvas who have not previously attained the level of Hearer or Solitary Victor Foe Destroyer, that is, those who are from the beginning definite in the Great Vehicle lineage, are conceptual consciousnesses, and being conceptual, they are determinative knowers for which sound and meaning-generalities are suitable to be associated, and so their objects do not clearly appear to them. This is because only non-conceptual consciousnesses have clear appearance of their object.

This is so because Dharmakīrti’s *Commentary on (Dignāga’s) “Compilation of Prime Cognition”* (tshad ma rnam ’grel, pramāṇavarttika) says:¹

Whatsoever consciousness has clear appearance
Is asserted to be non-conceptual.”

It would be wrong to just say “clear appearance,” and this is why Kön-

¹ *tshad ma rnam ’grel gyi tshig le’ur byas pa, sde dge 4210, sde dge TBRC W23703. 174: 189 - 304. Delhi: Delhi karmapae choedhey, Gyalwae sungrab partun khang, 1982-1985, 130.1 This is from the third chapter. The first line of passage is as cited here; the second line differs, reading de ni rtog med gnyi gar yang*. 
chog-jig-may-wang-po specified “clear appearance of a meaning-general-ity.” Hence, one has to make the distinction that the clear appearance of a meaning-generality is not a clear appearance.

C) GREAT VEHICLE PATHS OF SEEING

This has four parts: definition, divisions, synonyms, and explaining the mode of generation.

I' Definition

A Great Vehicle clear realization of the truth is the def-inition of a Great Vehicle path of seeing.

This is the same format as the other definitions of paths of seeing we have had previously except for the fact that the word “truth” does not have the same reference. Previously it meant the four noble truths, whereas here in the definition of a Great Vehicle path of seeing “truth” in “clear realization of the truth” is ultimate truth—the absence of true existence, emptiness.

Why are the four truths called truths? They are so called because in just the manner that Buddha said that the first two truths are to be aban-doned and the latter two truths are to be adopted, so it is in fact, and thus they are true. With regard to ultimate truths, or ultimate-object truths (don dam bden pa, paramārtha-satya), the word ultimate (dam pa) refers to a Superior’s pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise; the object (don) of a Superior’s pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise is called a truth (bden

a Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po has here deviated from his original topical outline set forth above on p.188, where he divided the explanation of the meanings of the individual divi-sions of Great Vehicle paths into explaining paths of ordinary beings and of Superiors. Upon completion of the section explaining paths of ordinary beings by means of a two-fold division into Great Vehicle paths of accumulation and of preparation, the next topic according to the outline would have been the second part of the two-fold division, an explanation of the paths of Superiors, of which “explaining the path of seeing” would be the first. Instead the text has just continued within a sequential listing of the five paths, calling the explanation of the path of seeing, “the third.”
pa) because it exists in fact in just the way that a Superior’s meditative equipoise sees it.

Thus, “truth” in “clear realization of the truth” in the definition of a Great Vehicle path of seeing must be ultimate truth [which in this system of tenets means “emptiness,” the absence of true existence.]

2’ Divisions

When [Great Vehicle paths of seeing] are divided, there are three—the two, paths of seeing that are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise and that are pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment, as well as paths of seeing that are neither of those two [that is, neither pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise nor pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment].

A Great Vehicle clear realization of the truth that serves as the actual antidote to the artificial conception of true existence that is its corresponding object of

---

*The 1999 TBRC bla brang (13b.4) has a shay after la which is absent in both the 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (12b.1) and the 2012 Mundgod digital (14.15).*
**abandonment** is the definition of a Great Vehicle path of seeing that is an uninterrupted path.

In the above definition the word “its” in the phrase “its corresponding object of abandonment” refers to whatever is the subject being discussed, in this case an interrupted path of a Great Vehicle path of seeing. In this type of context the Tibetan words *rang* and *khyod* are used interchangeably. The term *ngos skal* means “corresponding,” and indicates that for which something has responsibility. Thus in the term *ngos skal gyi spang bya* it means the objects of abandonment that correspond to it. Any particular uninterrupted path has a responsibility for abandoning a particular object of abandonment; that is its corresponding, or respective, object of abandonment.

As I mentioned above, there are truths, such as the four truths and the two truths; however, there is no true establishment—things are not established truly. There is truth, but no true establishment. For something to be truly established it would have to exist in the manner in which it appears to our innate consciousness that has been conceiving true existence since beginningless time, and there is nothing that does so. This innate conception of true existence is the final basic root of cyclic existence. For something to be truly existent, it would have to exist as it appears to a consciousness conceiving of true existence and it does not.

In the Mind-Only and Yogic Autonomy systems, there is a distinction made between the final basic root of cyclic existence (’khor ba’i gzhi rtsa mthar thug) and the root of cyclic existence (’khor ba’i rtsa ba). In both those systems, the conception of a self of phenomena (chos kyi bdag ’dzin, dharma-ātma-grāha) is the final basic root of cyclic existence but is not the root of cyclic existence. They both say that there is no contradiction in being liberated from cyclic existence but not having abandoned the final basic root of cyclic existence [as is the case with Lesser Vehicle Foe Destroyers]; nevertheless, these two systems differ with respect to how they identify the self of phenomena. In the system of the Autonomists, the conception of a self of phenomena, true existence, is the conception that forms

---

*a* In the Mind-Only School the conception of a self of phenomena is the conception that apprehended-object and apprehending-subject are established as different entities.
and so forth are not posited through the force of appearing to a non-defective consciousness, but are established by way of their own uncommon mode of subsistence. Why is this called the final, or ultimate, basic root of cyclic existence? We are all undergoing the sufferings of birth, aging, sickness, and death. The six types of transmigrators in cyclic existence are undergoing various types of the three types of suffering [of pain, change, and being so conditioned as to be always susceptible to suffering]. What causes them to wander in cyclic existence? Actions and afflictions. And the root of all those actions and afflictions is the conception that the “I” is substantially existent or self-sufficient. Thus, that is the root of cyclic existence (’khor ba’i rtsa ba). When this is abandoned, cyclic existence is abandoned; until this is abandoned, one cannot abandon cyclic existence.

Does this root of cyclic existence itself have a root? It does. Its root is the conception that phenomena are truly established, whereas they are not. Thus, this is the root of the root of cyclic existence, and this is why it is called the final, or basic, root of cyclic existence.

The definition of an uninterrupted Great Vehicle path of seeing specifies that it is an actual antidote to the artificial conception of true existence. This artificial conception is a conception, which is formed based upon systems of tenets and reasons, that the true existence of what does not truly exist is logically feasible. The uninterrupted path is called an actual antidote because it is that which actually removes the artificial conception of true existence.

When [paths of seeing that are uninterrupted paths] are divided, there are the eight forbearances. Those [eight forbearances] and Great Vehicle path of seeing that is an uninterrupted path are equivalent:

A Great Vehicle clear realization of the truth that is distinguished by having abandoned the artificial obstructions to omniscience is the definition of a Great Vehicle path of seeing that is a path of release.
Obstructions to omniscience, or obstructions to objects of knowledge, are so called because of being obstructions that mainly prevent the attainment of omniscience from within the two, liberation and omniscience. In other words, between liberation and omniscience, they mainly prevent omniscience; thus the reference to knowable objects.

When the definition says “distinguished by” (rab tu phye ba) this means the same as “being posited from the viewpoint of,” and is here added to make the meaning more clear. Why is it called a path of release? Because it is a state of having been released from the artificial conception of true existence.

When [Great Vehicle paths of seeing that are paths of release] are divided, there are the eight knowledges. These [eight knowledges] and path of release of a Great Vehicle path of seeing are equivalent.

Again, this is a division by way of their isolates.

There exist paths of seeing that are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise that are neither [uninterrupted paths nor paths of release] because those included within (1) Great Vehicle paths of seeing in one-pointed meditative equipoise on the selflessness of the person, (2) Great Vehicle paths of seeing in one-pointed meditative equipoise on the emptiness of duality, and (3) pristine wisdoms of the first ground included within the path of seeing that, after the pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment of a Great Vehicle path of seeing, are again in one-pointed meditative equipoise on emptiness are [paths of seeing that are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise that are neither uninterrupted paths nor paths of release].

a Correcting da dang thag in the 1999 TBRC bla brang (14a.1) to de dang theg in accordance with the 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (12b.4, 12b.5) and the 2012 Mundgod digital (14.22).
According to Lo-sel-ling, the first two would be pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment. The third would be a mere meditative equipoise (\textit{mnyam bzhag tsam po ba}) of the path of seeing.

Lo-sang-gyal-tshan: According to the Go-mang mode of explanation, there is no problem with there being, on the Great Vehicle path of seeing, pristine wisdoms of one-pointed meditative equipoise on the selflessness of the person, the coarse selflessness of phenomena, and so forth. Bodhisattvas have to train in these. In the continuum of a Bodhisattva on the path of seeing there are various knowers of paths (\textit{lam shes}) such as knowers of paths knowing Hearer paths (\textit{nyan thos kyi lam shes pa' i lam shes}) and knowers of paths knowing Solitary Victor paths (\textit{rang gyal gyi lam shes pa' i lam shes}). A knower of paths knowing Hearer paths would be realizing the selflessness of the person; it is a mind set in one-pointed meditative equipoise on the selfless of the person, and there is no need to call it a pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment.

The path of seeing, and the first ground that is a path of seeing, can go on for a very long time. From having attained the Great Vehicle

\footnote{These paragraphs, up to the point of resumption of translation of Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s text, are from oral communication, 23 January, 2014.}

\footnote{See Hopkins and Yi, \textit{Jam-yang-shay-pa’s Seventy Topics}, The Eight Categories, Chapters II, for a summary presentation and “Explaining the Seventy Topics, Chapter II. Explaining the eleven phenomena characterizing knowers of paths” for detailed presentations.}
path of seeing until attaining the Great Vehicle path of meditation can be a matter of eons depending upon the capacity of the Bodhisattva. The Great Vehicle is very different from the Lesser Vehicle, in which, having attained the path of seeing, it is possible to achieve the state of Foe Destroyer within a day, even within one hour.

It is said [in the sūtra system presentation] that in order to attain Buddhahood, one needs to accumulate the two collections of merit and wisdom for three periods of countless eons. There are many things that one needs to learn, to practice, to do. There are many things that need to be trained in while on the path of seeing, many things that need to be trained in while on the first ground. For instance, on the first ground, one needs to completely train in the ten aspects of thorough purifiers (yongs sbyong bcu).a Because there are all these things that need to be done for the purposes of sentient beings while on the first ground, one does not, having attained it, move immediately to the path of meditation. If you look at the amount of time spent on the path of seeing and that spent on the path of meditation, then, comparatively speaking, the path of seeing is quicker. But it is not the case that having attained the path of seeing, one immediately attains the path of meditation. It would take many years, and more likely, eons.

Since this is the case, if yesterday one had directly realized emptiness and attained the path of seeing, today one would once again enter into meditative equipoise directly realizing emptiness. That awareness would be a meditative equipoise realizing emptiness one-pointedly. It would be a path of seeing. It would not be an uninterrupted path, nor would it be a path of release. Hence it would be a meditative equipoise of a path of seeing that was neither an uninterrupted path nor a path of seeing; it would also be a first ground.

On the path of seeing, one has by means of the uninterrupted path overcome the artificial form of the obstructions to omniscience. Then one has to return to meditative equipoise on emptiness again and again to increase its strength and potency such that it can overcome the innate obstructions to omniscience. Hence, one is [frequently] within meditative equipoise on emptiness, and when it has sufficient strength to serve as an actual antidote to the innate afflictive obstructions to be abandoned by the path of meditation, then at that time one moves to the path of meditation.

---

a These are the ten purifiers of the first ground presented in Maitreya’s Ornament for Clear Realization, 1.48-50. See Hopkins and Yi, Ngag-wang-pal-dan’s Explanation of (Maitreya’s) Treatise “Ornament for the Clear Realizations” from the Approach of the Meaning of the Words: Sacred Word of Maitreyanātha, 1.48-50.
Consider the timing: On the path of seeing, one would be continuing to enter into one-pointed meditative equipoise directly realizing emptiness, and at the point of moving to the path of meditation, we can make division in terms of time:
1. Initially, one would be set in meditative equipoise on emptiness on the occasion of the path of seeing.
2. Then, in the middle of that session, within being set in this meditative equipoise, one would arrive at the path of meditation after which one would be on the path of meditation in one-pointed meditative equipoise directly realizing emptiness.

So, would you call the first phase a path of seeing or a path of meditation? One would have to call the meditative equipoise at the start of that session a meditative equipoise of the path of seeing, and since it is not an uninterrupted path nor a path of release, it is a path of seeing that is neither of those two. You could also call it a "mere meditative equipoise" since it is neither an uninterrupted path nor a path of seeing.

That which is (1) an exalted knower of those who have risen from the path of release of a Great Vehicle path of seeing and (2) is a Great Vehicle clear realization of the truth that manifestly arises in the continuum of persons who possess it in their continuums is the definition of a Great Vehicle path of seeing that is a pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment.

A person of the Great Vehicle is someone who has generated the altruistic mind of enlightenment and it has not degenerated. A Great Vehicle clear realization of the truth is called a Great Vehicle path of seeing. That path on the occasion of newly attaining the state of separation from the corresponding objects of abandonment by an uninterrupted path of a Great Vehicle path of seeing is called a Great Vehicle path of seeing that is a path of release. The uninterrupted path and the path of release of a Great Vehicle path of seeing are in the same meditative session.
Now we are considering a state of having arisen from such meditative equipoise in which emptiness and the wisdom consciousness realizing it are like water poured in water. The first part of the definition of a Great Vehicle path of seeing that is a pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment specifies that it is an exalted knower, or a pristine wisdom, of one who has risen from such a state. In the second part of the definition, “that manifestly arises in the continuum of persons who possess it (rang) in their continuums,” the Tibetan term rang sometimes refers to the person rather than the subject, but here it refers to the subject, which is a Great Vehicle pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment of the path of seeing. In the continuum of such a person, a clear realization of the truth is manifestly arisen in the continuum, that is, it does not abide in the entity of a predisposition, but is manifest. It abides as an entity that is clear and knowing.

When the definition says “a Great Vehicle clear realization of the truth,” it refers to a path that is included within the level of a path newly seeing the truth that was not seen before, that is, within the level of the path of seeing. A pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment is not a direct realization of emptiness, but it is a clear realization of the truth because it is included within the paths of the time, or level, of the first direct realization of emptiness, the path of seeing.

This is synonymous with Great Vehicle path of seeing that is a pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment.a

In general, meditative equipoise is twofold: mundane meditative equipoise—(1) the [four] concentrations, [four] formless absorptions and so forth—and (2) non-conceptual awarenesses that are supramundane meditative equipoise.

a An object defined (definiendum) and its definition are always mutually inclusive—that is, whatever is the one is the other; thus, Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s point here in saying this must be that he wants to emphasize that “mundane states of subsequent attainment, such as a mind of the Desire Realm of one who has risen from a concentration” which he is about to mention are not pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment of a Great Vehicle path of seeing.
Meditative equipoise refers to an ability to set one’s mind as one wishes on an object of observation, having abandoned laxity, excitement, and so forth. Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po is indicating that whatever is meditative equipoise is not necessarily a pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise because even before entering the path there are cases of meditative equipoise, and because non-Buddhists (phyi rol pa) can have meditative equipoise. However, the second type is the actual pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise.

Also, states of subsequent attainment are two types: (1) mundane states of subsequent attainment, such as a mind of the Desire Realm of one who has risen from a concentration, and (2) states of subsequent attainment conjoined with meditative equipoise, such as one that due to the force of a supramundane meditative equipoise, and according in object of observation and aspect with it, realizes the emptiness of true existence and illusoriness. From between these two, a Great Vehicle path of seeing that is a pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment is a state of subsequent attainment conjoined with meditative equipoise.

Just as there are two types of meditative equipoise—mundane and supramundane, so there are two types of states of subsequent attainment—the mundane, such as a mind of the Desire Realm of one who has risen from
a concentration, and another that is an actual pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment, a supramundane path of subsequent attainment of one who has passed beyond the state of an ordinary being. The latter is a path in the continuum of a Superior person, and arises by the power of the meditative equipoise of a supramundane path, specifically by the power of the meditative equipoise of the uninterrupted path and the path of release. The object of observation and aspect of the state of subsequent attainment are concordant with the object of observation and aspect of the meditative equipoise of the uninterrupted path and of the path of release.

“Emptiness of true existence and illusoriness” refers to a composite of emptiness of true existence and illusion. A magician can take a stick or a pebble and cause it to appear as a horse or an elephant. When such appears, he knows that it is not real although the horse or elephant undeniably appears to him to be real; he sees a horse or elephant but he knows that it is a stick or a pebble. Similarly, in the state of subsequent attainment, the person realizes that whereas phenomena are empty of true existence, they appear to be truly existent. It is similar to an illusion in that phenomena appear to be truly existent but in fact are empty of true existence. The person is continually putting in mind that they are empty of true existence even while they are appearing to be truly existent. Within being empty, they appear. Even though they appear so, they are not apprehended as being truly existent; rather, they are apprehended as being without true existence. This is the union of emptiness and appearance.

In order to realize conventional phenomena to be like illusions, it is first necessary to realize the emptiness of true existence. Between conventional truths and ultimate truths, conventional truths are more difficult to realize.

In that case, how can it be said that conventional truths are the method and ultimate truths are that which arise from the method? It is because prior to realizing emptiness, one must understand the subject that is the basis of realizing an emptiness, this being a conventional truth such as a person, sprout, pot, pillar, internal phenomenon, external phenomenon, product, non-product. For instance, in the One Hundred Thousand Stanza Perfection of Wisdom Sūtra, there are one hundred and eight bases of commentary that are the bases, or the subjects, for ascertaining emptiness. These are the flawless subjects about which one wants to know something (shes ’dod chos can skyon med).

There are also many reasons and concordant examples (mthun dpe) that are set forth to prove emptiness, all of which are conventional truths. Among the reasonings are that something does not truly exist because of being a dependent-arising, or because of not being found when sought in
the seven ways, or that something is not ultimately produced because of
not being produced from itself, not being produced from another, not being
produced from both, and not being produced causelessly, or that something
does not truly exist because of possessing parts (cha beas), or that some-
thing does not truly exist because of being an object of comprehension by
a valid cognizer (ishad mas gzhal bya). Thus there are many reasons as
well as many subjects set forth, and all of the reasons and subjects are
conventional truths. In order to realize the meaning of emptiness, one must
previously understand these. In this way conventional truths are the
method and ultimate truths are that which arises from the method.

Once emptiness is realized, the realization that conventionalities are
illusion-like comes automatically of its own power. It cannot occur prior
to the realization of emptiness, but comes automatically afterwards. For
example, in order to know the rules of [Tibetan] composition, writing let-
ters and so forth, one must first know well astrology, Sanskrit, and Tibetan
poetics. Once those are known well, the knowledge of composition fol-
lows automatically.

“Emptiness of true existence and illusoriness” does not mean that the
emptiness of true existence is illusion-like; it means that though phenom-
ena are empty of true existence, they nevertheless appear, and though they
appear to be truly existent, they are nevertheless empty of true existence.
Even though you have realized them to be empty, they nonetheless appear
to be truly existent, just as mirages and the floaters that appear to one with
cataracts appear to be real. This is what you are realizing. The example is
a magician. He knows that his basis of conjuring is just a stick or a stone,
but as he is showing a horse or elephant to others, he sees it himself al-
though he knows it is not real. Thus you are not just realizing that objects
are empty of true existence, you are also realizing that they are like illu-
sions in that the many varieties of objects that appear to be truly existent
but are not.

The state of subsequent attainment is conjoined with meditative equi-
poise, that is, the force of the meditative equipoise affects subsequent at-
tainment. The fusion of emptiness and appearance that appears to it is the
“imprint” (lag rjes) of the meditative equipoise that induced it. The pris-
tine wisdom of subsequent attainment of a Great Vehicle path of seeing is
not a mundane state of subsequent attainment, like a mind of the Desire
Realm of one who has arisen from a concentration, but rather is a state of
subsequent attainment that is conjoined with, or affected by, meditative
equipoise.

The likes of a dispersed mental consciousness at the time
of forgetting the objects of observation, aspect, and so
forth of meditative equipoise is a dispersed state of subsequent attainment.

“Dispersed mental consciousness” refers to, for example, a time when your mind has wandered. For instance you are watching someone playing ball, or watching television, or listening to the news. Instead of drawing the mind within, it has spread out to things outside.

Although on the paths of learning, the two, meditative equipoise and subsequent attainment, are contradictory, on the Buddha ground, meditative equipoise and subsequent attainment are asserted to be one entity.

On the paths of learning, whatever is a pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise is necessarily not a state of subsequent attainment. However, for a Buddha, they are of one entity but different conceptually isolatable factors. They are only different for thought. This is because there is no time when a Buddha is not directly seeing all phenomena. When Buddhas are within direct perception of emptiness, the various conventional appearances are also appearing, and they can teach what will tame individual sentient beings, and can engage in various deeds. While not stirring from directly seeing emptiness, Buddhas are capable of creating various physical creations in order to help others. Thus on the Buddha ground, the pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise and the pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment are not mutually exclusive, but are rather one entity.

There exist Great Vehicle paths of seeing that are neither meditative equipoise nor states of subsequent attainment because a conventional mind-generation or a mind realizing the sixteen attributes [of the four noble truths], impermanence and so forth, in the continuum of one on the uninterrupted path of a Great Vehicle path of seeing are such [that is, are Great Vehicle paths of seeing that are neither

---

a Correcting rgya yin pa in 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (13a.5) to rgya yan pa in accordance with 1999 TBRC bla brang (14a.1).
As before, different monastic colleges take different positions regarding this, and, for Lo-sel-ling, this is a source of qualm because it would be difficult to posit anything that actually is a conventional mind-generation at that time or a mind realizing the sixteen attributes of the four noble truths at that time. However, because it exists in a manner of non-degeneration at the time of Great Vehicle uninterrupted path of seeing, it can be said to exist. But, if you tried to specifically posit a subject (chos can) that was such, that would be difficult because then it would be manifest, and that is not possible during the uninterrupted path of the path of seeing.a

3’ Synonyms

“Exalted knower in the continuum of one on the Great Vehicle path of seeing,” “Great Vehicle clear realization of the truth,” and “Great Vehicle path of seeing” are synonymous equivalents.

a See the previous discussion of this point, 138-140. The basic difference is that Go-mang asserts that these do exist at that time, but in a hidden, or subliminal, manner, whereas for Lo-sel-ling, these are said to exist in a manner of non-degeneration, only latent, not manifest, which makes Lo-sel-ling unwilling to posit such an example.
4’ Explaining the mode of generation

The pristine wisdom of the greater supreme mundane quality Great Vehicle path of preparation that is in one-pointed meditative equipoise on the noumenon, the uninterrupted path of a Great Vehicle path of seeing, and the path of release of a Great Vehicle path of seeing are generated [serially] in one session of meditative stabilization. After that [path of release of a Great Vehicle path of seeing], the pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment of a Great Vehicle path of seeing is generated.

The first period (skad gcig dang po) is the pristine wisdom of the greater supreme mundane quality level of the Great Vehicle path of preparation which is in meditative equipoise on emptiness by way of a meaning-generality. Then, in the next moment, or period, (skad gcig gnyis pa de la) the uninterrupted path of the Great Vehicle path of seeing realizing emptiness directly is generated. Then, after that, the path of release of the Great Vehicle path of seeing is generated. These three happen in sequence in one session of meditative equipoise. After that, when one rises from this meditative equipoise, the pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment of a Great Vehicle path of seeing is generated.

With regard to the mode of abandonment of the objects abandoned by an uninterrupted path of a path of seeing, the approaching to production of the uninterrupted path of a Great Vehicle path of seeing in the continuum of one on the Great Vehicle path of preparation and the approaching to cessation of the artificial obstructions to omniscience
that are the corresponding objects of abandonment [of that uninterrupted path] are simultaneous.

In the continuum of a Bodhisattva at the greater supreme mundane quality level of the Great Vehicle path of preparation, the uninterrupted path of the Great Vehicle path of seeing is approaching generation; it is just about to be generated. And, at the same time, the seeds of the artificial obstructions to omniscience that are the corresponding objects of abandonment of the Great Vehicle path of seeing are approaching cessation. These two are simultaneous. “Artificial obstructions to omniscience” refers to the seeds of the artificial obstructions to omniscience.

The generation of the uninterrupted path of the path of seeing that is the entity of the eight forbearances in the continuum [of that person on the uninterrupted path], and the complete cessation of the corresponding objects of abandonment of that [uninterrupted path] are simultaneous, and at this time [of completely ceasing the respective object of abandonment of that uninterrupted path] the person of the path of preparation moves on to become a person of the path of seeing. This [cessation] is like throwing a robber out the door. Although at this point [of that uninterrupted path] one has attained a non-analytical cessation that is to have been separated from the objects abandoned by the path of seeing, one has not attained an analytical cessation.
This cessation is attained in dependence on having analyzed but is not an “analytical cessation” because “analysis” here refers not merely to analysis, but to a wisdom of non-contaminated individual analysis, which refers to that uninterrupted path. Because this cessation is simultaneous with the path of seeing, rather than arising in dependence upon it, it is a non-analytical cessation. The analytical cessation comes with the path of release.

For example, at the time of the forbearance level of the path of preparation, one attains a non-analytical cessation that is a cessation of birth in the bad migrations, whereas the analytical cessation of such is only attained at the time of the path of release of the path of seeing. In Asaṅga’s Summary of Manifest Knowledge it is said that the aggregates, sense fields, and so forth of the bad migrations are to be viewed as ceased through seeing, that is, they are objects of abandonment by the path of seeing; the meaning is that the analytical cessation that is a cessation of birth in the bad migrations is attained only with the path of release of the path of seeing, whereas the non-analytical version is attained at the time of the forbearance path of preparation. Similarly, the non-analytical cessation that is the cessation of the artificial conception of true existence is attained at the time of the supreme mundane quality level of the path of preparation and the uninterrupted path of the path of seeing [which occur in immediate sequence], whereas the analytical cessation of the artificial conception of true existence is attained only with the path of release of that path of seeing.

In the next period of [that is, after that uninterrupted path], when the path of release of the path of seeing that is the entity of the eight knowledges is generated, one attains an analytical cessation that is an abandonment of what is to
be abandoned by the path of seeing. This is like locking the door after throwing out the robber.

The uninterrupted path is like throwing the robber out, and the path of release is like locking the door, making it very firm such that the robber cannot return.

**D) GREAT VEHICLE PATHS OF MEDITATION**

This has four parts: definition, divisions, synonyms, and an explanation of the mode of generation.

1' **Definition**

A Great Vehicle subsequent clear realization is the definition of a Great Vehicle path of meditation.

2' **Divisions**

When these [Great Vehicle paths of meditation] are divided, there are the three, Great Vehicle paths of meditation that are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise and so forth [that is, Great Vehicle paths of meditation that are pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment, and Great Vehicle paths of meditation that are neither pristine wisdoms
of meditative equipoise nor pristine wisdoms of subsequent attainment].

That which is (1) a one-pointed meditative equipoise on any of the three selflessnesses [the selflessness of the person, emptiness of duality, or emptiness of true existence] that is its object and (2) is a Great Vehicle subsequent clear realization occurring manifestly in the continuum of the person who possesses it in the [mental] continuum is the definition of a Great Vehicle path of meditation that is a pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise.

When [Great Vehicle paths of meditation that are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise] are divided, there are three: Great Vehicle paths of meditation that are uninterrupted paths, and so forth [that is, that are paths of release, and that are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise that are neither uninterrupted paths nor paths of release].

\(^a\) 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (14a.2) mistakenly reads da.
A Great Vehicle subsequent clear realization that serves as the actual antidote to the innate conception of true existence that is its corresponding object of abandonment is the definition of a Great Vehicle path of meditation that is an uninterrupted path.

When [Great Vehicle paths of meditation that are uninterrupted paths] are divided, there are four small cycles, three medium cycles, and four great cycles, making eleven because the conceptions that are objects of abandonment to be abandoned by the path of meditation are abandoned by way of a division of them into the eleven cycles of the two, the innate afflictive obstructions and the innate obstructions to omniscience.

Lo-sang-gyal-tshan: a For the Lesser Vehicle, the path of meditation is described as being divided into nine cycles of objects of abandonment: three small, three medium, and three great. The reason that eleven cycles of uninterrupted paths of the path of meditation are needed in the Great Vehicle is to fit the description of progress over this path with

---

a Oral communication, Feb 2, 2014.
the presentation of the ten Bodhisattva grounds [which forms the subject matter of the next chapter]. Hence, there are ten uninterrupted paths corresponding to the ten grounds, and additionally, the tenth ground has two uninterrupted paths, an initial uninterrupted path and a final uninterrupted path of the tenth ground.

A Great Vehicle path of meditation that is an uninterrupted path serving as the actual antidote to the great of the great innate conceptions of true existence that is its corresponding object of abandonment is the definition of a small of the small uninterrupted path of a Great Vehicle path of meditation.

When [Great Vehicle paths of meditation that are the small of the small of the uninterrupted paths] are divided, there are two, a path of meditation of the first ground that is an uninterrupted path and [a path of meditation] of the second ground that is an uninterrupted path.

Lo-sang-gyal-tshan: For Jam-yang-shay-pa and the Go-mang tradition that relies on his textbooks, there is the uninterrupted path of the path of seeing, which is immediately followed by the path of release of the path of seeing. At this point, that which is to be abandoned by the path of seeing (the mthong spang) has been abandoned. This is then immediately followed by the pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment of the path of seeing. Following this, a Bodhisattva again enters into meditative equipoise on emptiness. That meditation is a

---

^ The material up to the next translation from Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po is oral communication, February 2, 2014.
pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise of the path of seeing that is
neither an uninterrupted path nor a path of release, and it is still the
first ground.

When on the first ground that is the path of seeing, everything to
be abandoned by the path of seeing is gone. Regarding objects **to be
abandoned**, only those to be abandoned by the path of meditation
(*sgom spang*) remain. They are not yet abandoned, and when they have
been abandoned, a Bodhisattva has moved to the path of meditation.
However, for Jam-yang-shay-pa, the Bodhisattva has not yet moved
to the second ground. Why? In order to move to the second ground, a
Bodhisattva must have first completed the activities of the first
ground, which are described as ten aspects of thorough purifiers
(*yongs sbyong bcu*).a When those have been completed, a Bodhisattva
moves to the second ground. The first ground can take many eons, and
that process takes place on the both the path of seeing and the path of
meditation.b

There are those who go directly on to the path of meditation, but
there are also those who reenter meditative equipoise on the path of
seeing. Such Bodhisattvas meditate on emptiness more and more, and
by doing so build up the capacity to overcome that to be abandoned
by the path of meditation, the innate conception of true existence. In
the session where this capacity is fully gained, at the point when the
big of the big objects to be abandoned by the path of meditation is
overcome, that is, by an uninterrupted path of a path of meditation,
and the Bodhisattva moves to the path of meditation. The path of re-
lease that immediately follows is the small of the small paths of release
of the path of meditation. It is still a first ground. Then when the Bo-
dhisattva meditates more and develops the capacity to overcome the
small of the big objects to be abandoned by the path of meditation, the
large of the small uninterrupted paths of the path of meditation is gen-
erated, and the path of release that follows it is a second ground.

---

a Each ground has its own set of thorough purifiers, different in number on the various
grounds, which must be completed before a Bodhisattva can move to the next ground. See
the next chapter on the Bodhisattva grounds where that enumeration is presented.

b Lo-sang-gyal-tshan said that the source relied on for this point is Gyal-tshab-dar-ma-
rin-chen’s *Explanation Illuminating the Meaning of the Commentaries on (Maitreya’s)
“Treatise of Quintessential Instructions on the Perfection of Wisdom, Ornament for the
Clear Realizations”: Ornament for the Essence rnam bshad snying po rgyan* (referred to
in Tibetan by the abbreviated title *phar phyin rnam bshad*) and also Asaṅga’s *Bodhi-
sattva Grounds (bodhisattvabhūmi)*, which he reported as saying that the first ground can
take many eons.
For Pan-chen Sö-nam-drags-pa,\(^a\) the textbook author followed by Lo-sel-ling, when one moves to the path of meditation, one also moves to the second ground. In his system, the initial uninterrupted path of the path of meditation is a second ground. For Jay-tsün Cho-kyi-gyal-tshan,\(^b\) the textbook author followed by Se-ra Jey,\(^c\) the uninterrupted path that overcomes the great of the great objects of abandonment by the path of meditation is not a path of meditation, but the path of release that is the state of having abandoned those is a path of meditation and is a second ground.

A Great Vehicle subsequent clear realization that involves having been liberated from the innate conception of true existence that is the corresponding object of abandonment by the uninterrupted path inducing it is the definition of a Great Vehicle path of meditation that is a path of release.

When [Great Vehicle paths of meditation that are paths of release] are divided, there are nine.\(^d\)

3’ Synonyms

“Great Vehicle path of meditation” and “Great Vehicle

\(^a\) paṇ chen bsod nams grags pa, 1478-1554.
\(^b\) rje btsun chos kyi rgyal mtshan, 1469-1546.
\(^c\) se ra/rgya/rgya byes.
\(^d\) When queried, as to why the text says that there nine paths of release rather than the eleven one would expect, given that there are eleven uninterrupted paths, Lo-sang-gyal-tshan offered the following explanation:

First, there are actually only ten paths of release of the path of meditation, since the path of release immediately following the final uninterrupted path of the Great Vehicle path is a Great Vehicle path of no-more-learning. Thus, one would have expected the author to posit ten paths of release; it is likely that he wrote nine simply because it is the usual way of dividing up the path of meditation.
subsequent clear realization” are synonymous equivalents.

4' Explaining the mode of generation

When an uninterrupted path that serves as the actual antidote to the innate conception of true existence that is its corresponding object of abandonment is newly generated in the continuum of a Bodhisattva on the path of seeing, this is posited as passing from the path of seeing to the path of meditation. (See chart next page.)

---

a Correcting den in 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (14b.1) to don in accordance with 1999 TBRC blab rang (15b.5).
## Correlation of Great Vehicle Paths and Bodhisattva Grounds

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PATH</th>
<th>BUDDHAHOOD</th>
<th>path of release</th>
<th>Grounds</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>great</td>
<td>great</td>
<td>uninterrupted path</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>medium</td>
<td>path of release</td>
<td>uninterrupted path</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>small</td>
<td>path of release</td>
<td>uninterrupted path</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>great</td>
<td>path of release</td>
<td>uninterrupted path</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>medium</td>
<td>path of release</td>
<td>uninterrupted path</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>small</td>
<td>path of release</td>
<td>uninterrupted path</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>great</td>
<td>path of release</td>
<td>uninterrupted path</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>medium</td>
<td>path of release</td>
<td>uninterrupted path</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>small</td>
<td>path of release</td>
<td>uninterrupted path</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>great</td>
<td>path of release</td>
<td>uninterrupted path</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>small</td>
<td>path of release</td>
<td>uninterrupted path</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1st of the 10 grounds</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes:
- The table lists the correlation between the Great Vehicle Paths and the Bodhisattva Grounds.
- Each row represents a path with its corresponding ground.
- The path is categorized into great, medium, and small.
- The path of release and uninterrupted path are listed for each category.
- The numbers indicate the order or rank of the grounds.
There is a mode of abandoning the objects of abandonment by an uninterrupted path of the Great Vehicle path of meditation. In terms of those whose lineage is definite as that of the Great Vehicle:

- the great of the great afflictions that are to be abandoned by the path of meditation and the great of the great obstructions to omniscience that are to be abandoned by the path of meditation are each divided into two groups, great and small, and
- the small of the small [objects of abandonment] are also similarly divided into two,

making eleven cycles of objects to be abandoned by the path of meditation; these are abandoned by eleven uninterrupted paths of the path of meditation.

When we speak of the great of the great and so on, we are referring to these on all nine levels. The great of the great is again divided into two, great and small; the small of the small is also divided into two, great and small, and that makes eleven cycles of objects to be abandoned rather than nine. When we speak about eleven cycles, we are considering this further division; when we talk about nine, we are not considering this further division.

The eleventh path of release is the path of no-more-learning. When you treat it as eleven cycles, the last is the ground of Buddhahood. When
you treat it as nine, all are paths of meditation, but when you do treat as eleven, the last is the ground of Buddhahood. The eleventh uninterrupted path is the “uninterrupted path at the end of the continuum” [as a sentient being] (rgyun mtha’ bar chad med lam).

For:

- the uninterrupted path of the path of meditation of the first ground simultaneously abandons the nine greats of the division of the great of the great afflictions to be abandoned by the path of meditation into two—these being of the three realms and the nine levels;
- the uninterrupted path of the path of meditation of second ground simultaneously abandons the nine small in the division of the great of the great objects to be abandoned by the path of meditation into two—these being of the three realms and the nine levels;
- similarly, the uninterrupted paths of the path of meditation ranging from the uninterrupted path of the path of meditation of the third ground up to the uninterrupted path of the path of meditation of the ninth ground respectively abandon simultaneously the nine that range from the medium of the big objects to be abandoned by the path of meditation—these being of the nine levels—through the medium of the small;

\(^a\) Correcting gyi in 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (15b.4) to gyis in accordance with 1999 TBRC bla brang (16a.2) and electronic edition.
Hence the uninterrupted path of the path of meditation of the third ground abandons the medium of the big objects to be abandoned by the path of meditation; that of the fourth ground abandons the small of the big; that of the fifth ground abandons the big of the medium; that of the sixth ground abandons the medium of the medium; that of the seventh ground abandons the small of the medium; that of the eighth ground abandons the big of the small; and that of the ninth ground abandons the medium of the small.

- the initial uninterrupted path of the path of meditation of a tenth grounder simultaneously abandons the nine greats in the division into two of the small of the small objects to be abandoned in relation to the nine levels. The final uninterrupted path of the path of meditation of a tenth grounder simultaneously abandons the nine smalls in the division into two of the small of the small objects to be abandoned by the path of meditation in relation to the nine levels.

In terms of one who has previously had the realization of a Foe Destroyer, then, since there are no afflictions to be abandoned, the obstructions to omniscience are abandoned upon their having been divided into eleven cycles.

---

a Correcting gyi in 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (14b.6) to gyis in accordance with 1999 TBRC bla brang (16a.4) and electronic edition.
Great Vehicle Paths

[the four-fold great: the very great of the great obstructions to omniscience, the great of the great, medium of the great, and small of the great; the three-fold medium: great of the medium, medium of the medium, and small of the medium; and the four-fold small: great of the small; medium of the small; small of the small; exceedingly small of the small; making eleven].

Therefore, it should be known that the great of the great Bodhisattva path of meditation, the uninterrupted path at the end of the continuum, and the diamond-like meditative stabilization of a Bodhisattva path of meditation are equivalent.

“Path of no-more-learning,” “pristine wisdom body of attributes,” “exalted-knower-of-all-aspects,” and “Buddha-pristine-wisdom” are all the same as will be indicated later at the point of the synonyms.

E) GREAT VEHICLE PATHS OF NO-MORE-LEARNING

This has four parts: definition, divisions, synonyms, and an explanation of the mode of generation.
1' Definition

A final exalted knower that has exhaustively abandoned the two obstructions is the definition of a Great Vehicle path of no-more-learning.

2' Divisions

When those [Great Vehicle paths of no-more-learning] are divided, there are two: exalted-knowers-of-all-aspects that know the mode and exalted-knowers-of-all-aspects that know the varieties. Or again, when [Great Vehicle paths of no-more-learning] are divided, there are the five pristine wisdoms: the mirror-like pristine wisdom, and so forth [the pristine wisdom of sameness, the pristine wisdom of individual realization, the pristine wisdom of achieving activities, and the pristine wisdom of the element of attributes].

The mirror-like pristine wisdom is so-called because one has actualized a state in which the form aggregate has been purified such that it is no longer
necessary to alternate between the pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise and the pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment. If you had a two-sided mirror, reflections would appear on both sides. Similarly, a Buddha’s exalted knower, a mirror-like pristine wisdom, can perceive simultaneously both ultimate and conventional phenomena, without needing to alternate between meditative equipoise and subsequent attainment to do so. Both the mode and the varieties, that is, both emptiness and conventional phenomena, can appear at the same time to a Buddha’s mirror-like pristine wisdom. This is unlike the situation on the paths of learning, where when ultimate truths are being realized, conventional phenomena cannot be taken as an object. Even though we speak verbally about an exalted-knower-of-all-aspects that knows a pot and an exalted-knower-of-all-aspects that knows a pillar, an exalted-knower-of-all-aspects realizing emptiness and an exalted-knower-of-all-aspects realizing the selflessness of the person, in fact are all just one exalted knower that sees all objects of knowledge.

The pristine wisdom of equality, or sameness, is so called because one has actualized the final pristine wisdom upon the transformation of the aggregate of feelings. At that point there is no feeling of suffering at all. In terms of the levels of learning, the actual fourth concentration has the nature of neutral feeling; the actual third concentration has the nature of bliss. Because at the stage of Buddhahood, there is no such division into types and hence there is equality, it is called the pristine wisdom of equality. At that point one has an “equality” (\textit{mnyam}) of uncontaminated bliss that does not have any of the defects of usual bliss and has all the good qualities of equanimity.

The pristine wisdom of individual realization is so called because one has actualized the final pristine wisdom upon the transformation of the aggregate of discrimination. This purified discrimination understands just as they are the dispositions, thoughts, and latent tendencies of trainees, and this serves as the motivator for teaching doctrine. From the point of view of knowing these without confusion, a Buddha teaches doctrine unimpededly and with full concordant conditions, knowing just what individual teachings should be given to which people—Great Vehicle or Lesser Vehicle, sūtra or tantra. Thus it is called the pristine wisdom of individual realization.

The pristine wisdom of achieving activities is so-called because it is an actualization of a final pristine wisdom upon the transformation of the aggregate of compositional factors. If a trainee has all the concordant circumstances for it, then a Buddha is able to engage in activities on this person’s behalf that are just the right length of time, not a minute too long.
nor too short, because a Buddha has no forgetfulness, no imprecision, and so forth. That which causes a Buddha to be able to do this is the final pristine wisdom of achieving activities.

The pristine wisdom that is actualized upon the transformation of the aggregate of consciousness is called the pristine wisdom of the element of attributes. In the continuum of a sentient being this “element of attributes” is the naturally abiding lineage; in the continuum of a Buddha it is the Nature Body, which is the factor of natural purity. The final, or ultimate, perceiver of that is called the pristine wisdom of the element of attributes.

3' Synonyms

“Exalted-knower-of-all-aspects,” “Great Vehicle path of no-more-learning,” and “pristine wisdom truth body” are synonymous equivalents.

4' Explaining the mode of generation

A Bodhisattva who is abiding in the uninterrupted path at the end of the continuum is one on the path of meditation. At the time of this uninterrupted path, the unimpeded capacity that is the cause generating the first moment of an exalted-knower-of-all-aspects exists as a full complement of the limitless types of potentials of the twenty-one sets of uncontaminated pristine wisdom.

---

*a* rang bzhin nram dag gi char gyur pa’i ngo bo nyid sku. ’di gzigs pa mthar thug pa de la chos dbyings ye shes.

*b* 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (15a.4) has no perpendicular stroke (shad) after lam, whereas 1999 TBRC bla brang (16b.2) and electronic edition do.

*c* These are set forth in Maitreya’s Ornament for Clear Realization, VIII.2-6. They are twenty-one sets of uncontaminated pristine wisdoms of the Buddha ground. See Hopkins and Yi, Jam-yang-shay-pa’s Seventy Topics, where they comprise the 68th topic and are listed in both English and Tibetan.
On the occasion of the uninterrupted path at end of the continuum, there exists an unimpeded capacity to act as a complete and perfect cause to generate the first moment of an exalted-knower-of-all-aspects [the omniscient consciousness of a Buddha], and this is a cause that completes the limitless types of capacity for generating the twenty-one sets of uncontaminated pristine wisdom of the Buddha ground.

For that uninterrupted path [that is the uninterrupted path at the end of the continuum], dualistic appearance with regard to the noumenon has vanished, and there is not even the slightest appearance of conventionalities to either the appearance factor or the ascertainment factor of that [uninterrupted path at the end of the continuum].

Dualistic appearance with regard to emptiness has disappeared. To the appearance factor of that uninterrupted path no conventional phenomena are appearing, and no conventional phenomena are objects of its mode of apprehension.

However, in the next moment of that [uninterrupted path at the end of the continuum], without stirring from that meditative equipoise, even though to the factor perceiving the mode [that is, realizing emptiness] conventionalities

---

\(^a\) Correcting des in 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (15a.6) to nges in accordance with 1999 TBRC bla brang (16b.4) and Mundgod electronic edition.
do not appear, to the appearance factor, all the diverse objects of knowledge are directly perceived, like moist olives in the palm of the hand, such that this one moment of pristine wisdom has become a common locus of an exalted knower knowing the mode and knowing the diversity.

To the appearance factor of that uninterrupted path, there is no appearance of conventionalities, but in the next moment of that consciousness, without moving from, or rising from, that meditative equipoise set in equipoise on emptiness—to the factor of that consciousness realizing the mode—conventionalities do not appear, but to its appearance factor, all the varieties of objects of knowledge appear like seeing an olive in the palm of the hand. It is a wet olive because it reflects the lines of the hand, but olive is just an example—if it were put into the palm of your hand, you could see it very clearly. This is how a Buddha sees all phenomena. The one moment of pristine wisdom that does all this has become a common locus of an exalted knower of the mode and an exalted knower of the varieties of phenomena.

And this attainment of the first moment of an exalted-knower-of-all-aspects, abandonment of all obstructions to omniscience, attainment of the state of a Buddha, and attainment of the path of release of having abandoned the two obstructions have occurred simultaneously.
At that time, one attains the first moment of an exalted-knower-of-all-aspects. At that same time, one has abandoned all the obstructions to omniscience, one has attained the state of a Buddha, and one has attained the path of release that is a state of having abandoned the two obstructions. There are no differences in time of these, some former and some later; they are simultaneous.

[OBJECTS OF MEDITATION AND ABANDONMENT]

When the differences in the chief objects of meditation of the three vehicles are set forth in brief, according to the system of Consequentialists, emptiness is the main object of meditation on the paths of the three vehicles [the Hearer Vehicle, Solitary Victor Vehicle, and Great Vehicle] because the uninterrupted paths and the paths of release of the paths of seeing of all three vehicles [Hearer, Solitary Victor or Great Vehicle] are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise set one-pointedly on both the subtle selflessness of persons and the subtle selflessness of phenomena. They assert that the negative [or absence] of true existence in terms of a person is asserted as the subtle selflessness of a person and the negative [or absence] of true existence in terms of [other] phenomena such as the aggregates and so forth is the subtle selflessness of phenomena.

---

a Correcting yin ni in 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (15b.1) to yin no in accordance with 1999 TBRC bla brang (17a.1) and Mundgod electronic edition.
The Middle Way School is one of the four types of Buddhist tenet systems, and its fundamental root tenets assert that whatever is an established base [that is, whatever exists] is necessarily not truly existent. The Middle Way school (dbu ma pa, madhyamaka) itself is divided into Autonomists (rang rgyud pa, svātantrika) and Consequentialists (thal 'gyur pa, prāsaṅgika). Those followers of the Middle Way who assert autonomous reasons (rang rgyud kyi sbyor ba, svatantra-prayoga) are called Autonomists. Those followers of the Middle Way who do not assert autonomous reasons but do assert the generation of an inferential consciousness based only on a consequence (thal 'gyur, prasaṅga) are Consequentialists.

According to the Consequence School, the subtle selflessness of persons is that persons, aside from just being imputed by terms and conceptuality, do not exist in their own right (yul rang gi ngos nas), and the subtle selflessness of phenomena is that other phenomena, aside from just being imputed by terms and conceptuality, do not exist in their own right. In the Consequentialist system there is no difference in the difficulty of realizing the selflessness of the person and the selflessness of phenomena because there is no difference of coarseness and subtlety in the objects of negation. As Chandrakīrti says in his Supplement to (Nāgārjuna's) "Treatise on the Middle Way," the difference in the two selflessnesses is made by way of the base that is empty (stong gzhi) rather than by way of that which is negated.

The negative or emptiness of true existence in terms of I or of mine is the selflessness of persons. Similarly, the emptiness of true existence of persons who are of different continuums than oneself is also a selflessness of persons. That factor that is the negative of true existence that is with
phenomena other than the I, mine, and persons—whether these phenomena be compounded or uncompounded—is a subtle selflessness of phenomena.

According to the Consequentialists, the Autonomists assert that all phenomena inherently exist. The Consequentialists say that since the Autonomists assert inherent existence, they are thus unable to present well how phenomena could be empty of true existence, which they do indeed assert. Therefore, one could ask whether this would lead to saying that the Middle Way Autonomists are not proponents of the Middle Way. It is answered that there is no fallacy that they are not proponents of the Middle Way because even though they are not able to explain how to posit the lack of true existence exactly as it is, they nonetheless do assert it, and hence there is no fault that they are not proponents of the Middle Way. For example, there is a renowned example of a monastic who is in contradiction of the formulated rules, but this does not make the person not a monastic. Indeed it is not suitable for a person who has pledged to be governed by formulated rules to contradict those rules, but the contradiction or breaking of this conduct is not itself sufficient to make the person a non-monastic, although this does not include the four basic defeats, for a monastic who commits any of these becomes a non-monastic. Similarly, it is not suitable to assert existence in its own right or inherent existence, but the mere assertion of that does not make a person not a proponent of the Middle Way. However, if one asserts true existence or ultimate existence, one becomes not a proponent of the Middle Way.

In the systems of the Autonomists and the proponents of Mind-Only, the chief objects of meditation of the three vehicles are dissimilar. According to the Middle Way Yogic Autonomists:

- the subtle selflessness of phenomena is the chief object of meditation for Bodhisattva paths
- the coarse selflessness of phenomena, which is the emptiness of apprehended-object and apprehending-subject as

---

a There are natural non-virtues and formulated or coded non-virtues. The natural non-virtues are the ten non-virtues: killing, stealing, sexual misconduct, lying, and so forth. The codified non-virtues are not natural non-virtues because they have to be laid down as rules prior to becoming non-virtues. During the time of Buddha, when the rules were made and given out to monastics one by one, there existed monks who did not possess the formulated laws, but now all monastics are committed to the formulated laws. Merely breaking a codified rule does not make one a non-monastic, and similarly merely asserting inherent existence does not make one not a proponent of the Middle Way, as long as one asserts the absence of true existence.
different substantial entities, is the chief object of meditation for Solitary Victor paths

- and the subtle selflessness of persons, which is a person’s emptiness of being substantially existent in the sense of being self-sufficient, is the chief object of meditation for Hearer paths.

Because the chief objects of meditation are different, the chief objects of abandonment are also different.

Also, the obstructions to omniscience are posited as the chief objects of abandonment for Bodhisattvas. The coarse conception of a self of phenomena is posited as the chief object of abandonment for Solitary Victors, and the subtle conception of a self of persons is posited as the chief object of abandonment for Hearers.

---

a 2012 Mundgod digital (18.17) has a shad at this point that is absent in both 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (15b.5) and 1999 TBRC bla brang (17a.5). The shad is stylistically consistent within the sentence.

b 2012 Mundgod digital (18.18) and 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (15b.6) both have a shad at this point that is absent in 1999 TBRC bla brang (17a.6). The shad is stylistically consistent.
In the systems of the [Middle Way] Sutric Autonomists and of Mind-Only, the types of wisdom realization and the chief objects of abandonment of Hearers and Solitary Victors are explained in mostly the same way.

The reason for this is that the Middle Way Sutric Autonomists assert external objects. Therefore, they do not posit the emptiness of apprehended-object and apprehending-subject as different substantial entities as the chief object of meditation of Solitary Victors.

The proponents of Mind-Only do not assert external objects and do assert an emptiness of external objects; still, they assert that the emptiness of apprehended-object and apprehending-subject as different substantial entities is the subtle selflessness of phenomena. Thus, they assert that whenever one realizes the emptiness of external objects or the emptiness of apprehended-object and apprehending-subject as different substantial entities, one has realized the subtle selflessness of phenomena. Therefore, for them, Solitary Victors cannot realize the emptiness of apprehended-object and apprehending-subject as different substantial entities [since they do not realize the subtle selflessness of phenomena]; rather they posit this as the main object of meditation of the Great Vehicle.

The differences between the great and small vehicles and so forth should be known from other texts.

---

\[ \text{Footnote: Correcting } \text{gtso bo phal 'jog in the 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (15b.6) to } \text{gtso bor 'jog in accordance with the 1999 TBRC bla brang (17b.1) and 2012 Mundgod electronic (18.20).} \]
6. Bodhisattva Grounds

2. Explaining in detail a presentation of the ten grounds

This has three parts, the definition of a ground of a Bodhisattva Superior, divisions, and the meaning of the individual divisions.

As was explained earlier, there are many different types of presentations of “ground” (sa, bhūmi).\(^a\) For instance, there is the ground that is renowned in the world; there is also the ground from within the division into grounds and paths. Within the division into grounds and paths, there are the eight grounds of the lesser vehicle that have already been explained. Nāgārjuna said in *The Precious Garland* (stanza 440), “Just as eight grounds of Hearers are described in the Hearers’ Vehicle, so are ten grounds of Bodhisattvas [described] in the Great Vehicle.”\(^b\) “Just as …” indicates that the eight grounds of Hearers are used as an example for the ten grounds of Bodhisattva Superiors in the Great Vehicle.

\(^a\) See Chapter 2. The specific discussion of the “eight lesser grounds” occurs from 69-91.

\(^b\) Ji ltar nyan thos theg pa la// nyan thos sa ni brgyad bshad pa// de bzhin theg pa chen po la// byang chub sems dpa’i sa bcu’o//. This verse is cited by Tsong-kha-pa in his *Illumination of the Thought* as he begins his discussion of Chandrakīrti’s explanation of the Bodhisattva grounds. See Tsong-kha-pa, Ken-sur Nga-wang-lek-den, and Jeffrey Hopkins, *Compassion in Tibetan Buddhism* (London: Rider, 1980; reprint, Ithaca, N.Y.: Snow Lion, 1980), 131.
a. Definition [of a ground of a Bodhisattva Superior]

A Bodhisattva Superior’s exalted knower that is conjoined with wisdom directly realizing emptiness and with great compassion is the definition of a ground of a Bodhisattva Superior.

Here, emptiness refers to the subtle selflessness of phenomena. The fact that this is a direct cognition means that there is no appearance of true existence and no appearance of a sound-generality or a meaning-generality. The object it realizes is as clear to it as is a form to the eye perceiving a form. Wisdom, here, is the wisdom discriminating phenomena. That is wisdom, and there is also method, in the form of great compassion. Great compassion is an empathetic consciousness that observes all sentient beings and wishes to free them from suffering.

Although there are times when a Bodhisattva is not explicitly thinking about emptiness, there are no times when a Bodhisattva Superior’s consciousness is not conjoined with the realization of emptiness. This is because it does not have to be explicitly conjoined; it can be conjoined in the sense of non-degeneration. A Bodhisattva is not subject to our type of forgetting. If a Bodhisattva wants to think about emptiness, he or she always can.

Query: Would there then be any consciousness of a Bodhisattva Superior that would not be a ground?

Response: His or her exalted knowers would all be grounds, but not other consciousnesses, such as a Bodhisattva’s sense consciousnesses. Also, within mental consciousnesses there are also those that would not be grounds, such as for instance, a mental consciousness mindful of blue or a mental consciousness mindful of a sound that is induced by an ear consciousness apprehending a sound. On the seventh ground and below, there are cases of the conception of true existence being manifest, and those consciousnesses are not grounds either.

Even though they, unlike ordinary persons like ourselves, do not get
completely out of their own control and come under the control of the afflic-
tions, there are cases of manifest afflictions. The example given is of a
Bodhisattva’s manifesting desire in order to help others, as in the case of
having children, and so forth. These activities are branches of achieving
the welfare of others and hence causes of enlightenment. They are con-
joined with the wisdom directly realizing emptiness and with compassion,
but they are not exalted knowers.

There is a well-known story about a captain called the Compassionate
Captain (*ded dpon snying rje can*) who was a Bodhisattva Superior. He
killed a man called Wicked Spearman who was about to kill many people.
The captain took it upon himself to kill that man, thinking, “Whatever hap-
pens to me is all right.” Not only would he save the people that the other
was going to kill, but he also felt to relieve that person of the sin of killing
so many others, even if he then had to have the sin of killing someone.

This story is used as an example of a Bodhisattva Superior still having
afflictions, specifically those of anger or hatred. However, whether or not
there would have to be anger in the continuum of the Bodhisattva is de-
bated. One point of view is that, even if the basic causal motivation is vir-
tuous, in order to actually bring the deed of killing to conclusion, there is
the thought “I have to stop this person’s life,” and this requires a moment
of hatred or anger. I think that it is likely this way because you would need
this thought. With it you would think, “If this person dies, that is fine.” To
be willing to bring this about is the sign that there is a moment of anger. If
you were doing this only with a thought of compassion, you would not be
able to carry out the act of killing.

Query: Would this not make the person a non-Bodhisattva since you
cannot give up your compassion towards people, not even towards one
person.

Response: It would not because the person is functioning within a very
strong thought to help others.

However, there are also people who argue the other side. They say that
there is no hatred; that in the beginning, middle, and end, the action of the
Bodhisattva is only virtuous. The captain realizes that if he does not kill
that man and many people are killed, there will be tremendous fault to the
person who kills them. He also knows that if all those persons are killed,
they not only lose their lives, they do so from within a situation of great
fear. So there is great fault if this is allowed to happen. The Bodhisattva
also knows that the man will die soon in any case. If the Bodhisattva could
stop that person from committing these deeds of ill-will which is both su-
perficial and deep, it would help that person himself as well as help all the
others that he would have harmed. All those people would not have to die
or experience that terrible fear while being killed and this man would not have to accumulated all that non-virtue. If he could stop this, it would help all those persons and help Wicked Spearman himself. If one says that the preparation, the actual carrying out, and the completion of the deed are conjoined with these thoughts, then there is no anger.

I feel that on the first and second grounds there would be cases of generating anger, but on the third ground and above the stain of such anger has been removed completely, such that there is no capacity to generate manifest anger. It is said, as will come later, that on the first ground one abandons the stains of miserliness. If one carries this logic over, it indicates that the abandonment of the stains of anger takes place on the third ground.

Whatever the case may be, there are Bodhisattva Superiors who do have afflictions. According to the Middle Way Autonomy School, those Bodhisattvas who have not proceeded previously on the Lesser Vehicle path simultaneously abandon the afflictive obstructions and the obstructions to omniscience.

However, afflictions do not cause fault in a Bodhisattva. They are like poisons that have been counteracted by mantra or medicine. Either someone else or oneself could recite the appropriate mantra after poison has been eaten, and there is also medicine that can be taken after one has ingested poison. By employing one or the other of these countermeasures, one can overcome the capacity of the poison. But it is not the case that the poison hasn’t gone to the stomach; it has, but it cannot harm the person. Similarly, although Bodhisattva Superiors might have afflictions in their continuum, these do not cause fault or harm. The Bodhisattva does not fall under their power; rather the Bodhisattva has power over those afflictions. Nevertheless, those afflictive consciousnesses are not grounds.

Also, in systems that assert self-cognizing consciousnesses, although those are knowers, they are not exalted knowers and thus not grounds. Self-cognizing consciousnesses are necessarily neutral; thus even a self-cognizing consciousness that experiences a yogic direct perception is not an exalted knower. Therefore, whatever is a consciousness of a Bodhisattva Superior is not necessarily an exalted knower of a Bodhisattva Superior and thus not necessarily a ground.

---

[a] See below, 252-253.
b. Divisions of grounds of Bodhisattva Superiors

When those [grounds of Bodhisattva Superiors] are divided, there are ten. The first ground is the very joyful; the second the stainless; the third the luminous; the fourth the radiant; the fifth the difficult to overcome; the sixth the manifest; the seventh the gone afar; the eighth the immovable; the ninth good intelligence; and the tenth the cloud of doctrine.a

There is a reason for dividing the grounds of Bodhisattva Superiors into ten grounds, for they are posited as ten through the force of the latter being greater than the former in terms of differences in the mode of realizing objects and the mode of attaining qualities, enhancements in the removal of objects of abandonment, and in the capacity for

---

a 1. rab tu dga' ba, pramuditā
   2. dri ma med pa, vimalā
   3. 'od byed pa, prabhākarī
data 4. 'od 'phro ba, arciṣmaṭi
   5. sbyang dka' ba, sudurjaya
   6. mngon du gyur ba, abhimukhī
   7. ring du song ba, dūramgama
data 8. mi g.yo ba, acafa
   9. legs pa'i blo gros, sādhumaṭi
data 10. chos kyi sprin mnams, dharmamegha.
a
b 1999 TBRC bla brang (17b.4) corrected from 'phro pa to 'phro ba in accordance with 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (16a.2) and 2012 Mundgod digital (19.2).
achieving.

It is from these different points of view that ten are posited.

[The grounds of Bodhisattva Superiors] are limited in number to those ten because the thorough purifiers are limited in number to ten [sets].

There is a purpose for the division into ten grounds because in order to stop the wrong ideas of those who do not assert a presentation of ten grounds in the Great Vehicle, a division of ten grounds in the Great Vehicle is made upon stating as an example the eight grounds of the Lesser Vehicle.

Lo-sang-gyal-tshan explained that the ten sets of thorough purifiers are the main focus on which a Bodhisattva is training over the ten grounds. He explained that in order to pass from a particular ground to a higher one, a Bodhisattva needs to have completed the thorough purifiers and the perfection for that ground, and can only then move to a higher ground. One cannot move to the next ground until one has completed the thorough purifiers of the ground one is on.

The first ground has ten thorough purifiers; the second has eight; third, five; fourth, ten; fifth, ten; sixth, twelve; seventh, twenty; eighth, eight; and ninth, twelve; the tenth ground is described as having “characteristics.” See Hopkins and Yi, Ngag-wang-pal-dan’s Meaning of the Words of Maitreya’s “Ornament for the Clear Realizations” on the Ninth Topic, L.48-69. That section gives the following definition of a thorough purifier: “A quality that clears away the defects of the ground on which it is possessed and brings about completion of the qualities [of that ground].”
c. The meaning of the individual divisions

This has three parts: contextual etymologies, attributes of the mode of abandoning objects of abandonment, and attributes of surpassing qualities.

1) CONTEXTUAL ETYMOLOGIES

There are the two: a contextual etymology of “ground” in general and contextual etymologies of the individual grounds.

A) CONTEXTUAL ETYMOLOGY OF GROUND IN GENERAL

When bhūmi—the [Sanskrit] equivalent for ground (Tibetan sa)—is explained with a contextual etymology, in which letters are added, it is called “ground” because it acts as a basis of the absence of the fright of the two obstructions for immeasurable creatures (byung po, bhūta) who are the trainees and causes the increase of immeasurable qualities higher and higher.a

---

a In a “contextual” or “creative” etymology (nges tshig), to the letters or words given, other letters or words are added to draw out the meaning. In this case, to the Sanskrit letters bhū in bhūmi the letters ta were added to yield bhūta, creatures or beings. Also, it is likely that the mi of bhūmi is creatively being etymologized as “immeasurable” by way of mita (meas-
B) CONTEXTUAL ETYMOLOGIES OF THE INDIVIDUAL GROUNDS

There is a reason for calling the first ground “the very joyful” because it is called such due to the fact that when, from the first ground, one sees that one has become closer to complete enlightenment and that the welfare of sentient beings is being accomplished, a special joy is generated.

Not only that but also at the time of the first ground one attains a surpassing perfection of giving. When a first ground Bodhisattva merely hears someone saying, “Please give me such and such,” a great joy is generated in his or her mind. It is generated just from hearing the sound of those words. To

\( \text{ured) and thus } \text{amita (boundless, without a certain measure), and thus the word “immeasurable” is repeated in both parts of the dual etymology. The etymologies of specific grounds that follow similarly offer creatively elaborative explanations of the meaning of the names of the various grounds, as opposed to stricter etymologies (often called } \text{sgra bshad).} \)

\( ^{a} \text{Correcting } \text{bo in 2012 Mundgod digital edition to } \text{po in accordance with the 1999 TBRC } \text{bla brang (18a.2) and 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (16a.7).} \)

\( ^{b} \text{Correcting } \text{nye pa in 1999 TBRC } \text{bla brang (18a.3) to } \text{nye ba in accordance with 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (16b.1) and 2012 Mundgod digital (18.16).} \)
exemplify the joy, it cannot be equaled by the bliss, or mental ease, that is attained with the actual second and third concentrations. Even the bliss of auspiciousness (cha mnyam pa’i bde ba), which is a bliss of peace that Hearer or Solitary Victor Foe Destroyers generate when they realize that they have abandoned all afflictions, cannot equal it. That this is so is stated clearly in Chandrakīrti’s Supplement to (Nāgārjuna’s) “Treatise on the Middle” (14).¹

Whereas when a Conqueror Child hears and thinks
Of the word “give,” happiness arises,
The subduers abiding in peace have no [such] happiness.
What need is there to mention [the joy of] giving all?

Forget about mere possessions, Bodhisattvas are happy to give away even things they hold very dear such as their spouse or their children. They will cut off pieces of their own bodies to give to someone who needs it. And for them, there is no more suffering associated with such cutting than there would be with cutting a tree. The internal bliss that they have overpowers any suffering that might arise, and so they have the capacity to give even their own flesh without any sense of difficulty. From this it can be seen that internally Bodhisattvas have on the first ground a practice of the perfection of giving that surpasses that of the other perfections. We cannot see from the outside that first grounders have a surpassing perfection of giving, but we can infer it from their non-miserly and very happy giving of even their own arms, legs, head, or whatever. Thus on the first ground, Bodhisattvas attain a surpassing practice of the perfection of giving and they remove even the subtle stains of miserliness.

There is a reason for calling the second ground “the stainless” because it is called such due to the fact that from the second [ground] one is free from the stains of degenerated ethics and of exertion at the mental activities of the Lesser Vehicle.

¹ji ltar byin cig ces sgra thos bsmas las/ rgyal sras bde ’byung de ltar thub rnams la/ zhi bar zhugs pas bde ba byed min na/ thams cad bthang bas lta zhis smos ci dgos/ See Tsong-kha-pa, Ken-sur Nga-wang-lek-den, and Jeffrey Hopkins, Compassion in Tibetan Buddhism, 186.
This definition mentions “degenerated ethics” that is to say, “ethics gone astray” (‘chal ba’i tshul khrims). These are natural infractions. In general, for monastics there are two types of infractions: natural and formulated. The former occur when one engages in what is naturally wrong, the latter when one engages in something that that breaks a codified system such as those among the monastic vows. However, if a person commits an infraction of a formulated code within the thought that even though Buddha codified this, it does not make any difference, then all infractions (ltung ba thams cad) become natural infractions.

A Bodhisattva on the second ground, not just during waking hours, but even during dreams, does not have any such degenerated ethics, that is, any infractions of what is naturally incorrect. Chandrakīrti’s Supplement to (Nāgārjuna’s) “Treatise on the Middle” says that second grounders have abandoned improper ethics even in dreams (18ab):

Because their ethics are sublime and have pure qualities,
They forsake the stains of immorality even while dreaming.
Their actions of body, speech, and mind are pure at all times—during the day, the night, when awake, when dreaming. They do not accumulate any non-virtues of body, speech, and mind, not even the most subtle, and they do not have even subtle stains of faulty ethics, not even in dreams.

Hence, the second ground is called the “stainless” because of being free of the stains of faulty ethics and also because of being free of the stains of the mental application of the Lesser Vehicle. A Bodhisattva would have given up the mental activities of the type of attitude of the Lesser Vehicle a long time ago, but not the subtle exertion of such thought.

There is a reason for calling the third ground “the luminous” because it is called such due to the fact that from the third ground, without concern for one’s own body and life one oneself strives to seek out the verbalized doctrine and one satisfies other trainees with the light of doctrine.

\[\text{rang bzhi gnas kha na tho ba' i ltung ba.}\]

\[\text{de tshul phun tshogs yon tan dag ldan phyi' rim lam du yang 'chal khrims dri ma spangs'. See Tsong-kha-pa, Ken-sur Nga-wang-lek-den, and Jeffrey Hopkins, Compassion in Tibetan Buddhism, 192.}\]
At the third ground, a Bodhisattva attains a surpassing practice of the perfection of patience. What would such patience be like? It is a patience, or forbearance, that is an ability to disregard harmers and harmful situations: If someone speaks harshly to you, you are not disturbed. If someone exaggerates, saying that you did something that you did not do, still you do not get disturbed. Even if others beat you, your mind is not disturbed. If someone struck you with a sharp weapon that might cause you to die, your mind still would not become disturbed.

Further, with such patience one does not have any obstructions with regard to searching out the doctrine. While seeking to hear teachings, one can undergo all sorts of difficulties without any regard for one’s body and life. And, one would not worry about one’s own physical and mental difficulties in explaining the doctrine; one would just explain it to others and thereby satisfy them with the illumination of the doctrine.

It is on the third ground that a Bodhisattva attains a surpassing practice of the perfection of patience, but it is important for people like us to cultivate patience as much as possible and to stop anger as much as possible now. That is very important. As Shāntideva said, “There is no wrongdoing like that of anger and there is no asceticism [meaning practice] like that of patience.” If one is able to cultivate patience, there is great benefit, and if one generates anger in one’s mental continuum, there are great disadvantages; anger generated for even a short period of time destroys the virtues of giving, ethics, and so forth accumulated over a hundred eons. Chandrakīrti’s Supplement to (Nāgārjuna’s) “Treatise on the Middle” says (33):

One moment of hating a Conqueror Child destroys The virtues arising from giving and ethics

---

*a* Correcting yad de in the 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (16b.3) to yod de in accordance with 1999 TBRC bla brang (18a.5).

*b* Shāntideva, Engaging in the Bodhisattva Deeds (bya’ chub sems dpa’i spyod pa la ’jug pa, bodhisattvacaryāvatāra), VI.2.

*c* See Tsong-kha-pa, Ken-sur Nga-wang-lek-den, and Jeffrey Hopkins, Compassion in Tibetan Buddhism, 209.
Accumulated for a hundred eons.
Thus there can be no [worse] ill deed than impatience.

Therefore, it is necessary for us to cultivate patience well in all ways.

There is a reason for calling the fourth ground “the radiant” because it is called such due to the fact that on the fourth ground one radiates out like fire the light of pristine wisdom that burns away the corresponding two obstructions by way of teaching the practices that are harmonious with enlightenment.

On the fourth ground one attains a surpassing practice of the perfection of effort. Chandrakīrti’s Supplement to (Nāgārjuna’s) “Treatise on the Middle” says (41):a

All good qualities follow after effort,
Cause of the two collections of merit
And intelligence. The ground where effort
Flames is the fourth, the Radiant.

Because effort has increased higher and higher, stronger and stronger, it is like a burning flame or radiant light, and hence the fourth ground is called the “radiant.” Because one has attained a level of effort in which the factors of being very strong and also continuous are conjoined, such that it exceeds that of the lower grounds, one has attained a surpassing practice of the perfection of effort. Because intense and continual effort have flamed forth, like a blazing fire, it is called the “radiant;” because the light of the wisdom that burns away the afflictive obstructions and the obstructions to omniscience has blazed forth, it is called the “radiant.”

---
a Yon tan ma lus brtson ’grus rjes ’gro bzhin/ bsod nams blo gros tshogs ni gnyis gyi rgyu/ brtson ’grus gang tu ’bar bar gyur ba yi/ sa de bzhin pa ’od ni ’phro pa ’o. See Tsong-kha-pa, Ken-sur Nga-wang-lek-den, and Jeffrey Hopkins, Compassion in Tibetan Buddhism, 223.
There is a reason for calling the fifth ground “the difficult to overcome” because it is called such due to the fact that [Bodhisattvas] are ripening sentient beings and when doing so, the wrong practices⁵ of trainees are difficult to bear and it is hard for intelligent fourth ground Bodhisattvas and below to overcome [discouragement about them], but here on the fifth [ground] they are able to overcome [such discouragement].

There are sentient beings whose mental continuums have not been ripened, and one is able to ripen their continuums by, for instance, teaching them about impermanence, the limitless sufferings [of cyclic existence], and so on. When ripening beings, there are also those whose wrong ideas, wrong behavior, and so forth are difficult to bear, beings whom persons like ourselves would find very difficult to teach, such that we might feel to just give up on them because they are too much trouble and will not learn no matter what—the kind of persons who do not listen when you tell them something and do not follow it, but instead do the opposite. For intelligent fourth ground Bodhisattvas and below, such people are difficult to train, but here on the fifth ground one has achieved a surpassing practice of the perfection of concentration and is able to train those who are difficult to tame.

Lo-sang-gyal-tshan: “When ripening others” refer to times when one is seeking to help others, serving the purposes of others, benefiting them. To explain what is meant by “the wrong practices” of others, if one is a teacher, one gives advice to one’s students, such as that the student should behave well, should study hard, should speak nicely to

---

⁵ For a more restricted presentation of wrong practices, or wrong achievings, see the 49th Topic in Hopkins and Yi, Ngag-wang-pal-dan’s Meaning of the Words of Maitreya’s “Ornament for the Clear Realizations.”
others, and so forth. But even though one gives them such advice, still some do the opposite of this, and behave badly, don’t study hard, and quarrel with others—basically they do the opposite of what they are told. And when they do such, it is difficult to bear.

Bodhisattvas on the first four grounds are trying to lead beings towards liberation and omniscience, and even if they can’t fully do this, they are trying to do so. Yet beings do not follow their advice and do the opposite, follow wrong paths. Ordinary people like ourselves would feel discouraged, and even Bodhisattvas on the first four grounds feel a discouragement that those on the fifth ground no longer experience. From the fifth ground one’s capacity to train others increases; hence they do not give up, they just try harder—they have a greater capacity to train sentient beings. Hence on the fifth ground, they are “able to train” those who are “difficult to train.” They have “overcome” the discouragement at the mis-deeds of those they are trying to help that is experienced by Bodhisattvas on grounds one through four. What has been “overcome” is a quality of their own minds, not something external.

There is a reason for calling the sixth ground “the ground of manifesting;” because it is called such due to the fact that a Bodhisattva manifests a reversal from cyclic existence through meditating on [the twelve branches of] dependent-arising in the forward process, and approaches, or manifests, a nirvāna through meditating on dependent-arising.

---

a. Jeffrey Hopkins in commenting on Tsong-kha-pa Lo-sang-drang-pa’s Extensive Explanation of (Chandrakīrti’s) “Supplement to (Nāgārjuna’s) ‘Treatise on the Middle’”: Illumination of the Thought. (hereafter referred to by the short title, Illumination of the Thought) VI.1 says:

The name of the sixth ground in Tibetan is either mngon du gyur pa (manifested) or mngon du phyogs pa (approaching). The preferred term in Tsong-kha-pa’s commentary is clearly the former as is indicated by his glossing mngon du phyogs pa (approaching) with mngon du gyur pa (manifested): mngon du phyogs pa ste gyur pa (Tibetan Cultural Printing Press, 62.12). This accords with the predominance in Tibetan of mngon du gyur pa (manifested) over mngon du phyogs pa (approaching). In this stanza the dual meaning of abhimukhi, however, is emphasized when Chandrakīrti explains it as approaching the Buddha qualities and manifesting, or manifestly seeing, the suchness of dependent-arising.

The basic meaning of abhimukhi, given these two etymologies, is “thoroughly facing” in the sense that Bodhisattvas are now faced toward (Poussin, Muséeon 11, 272: “tourné vers”) or are nearing the qualities of a Buddha, such as the ten powers, due to the fact that sixth ground Bodhisattvas are facing the surpassing form of the perfection of wisdom, that is, this wisdom is manifest to them (or its face has been made obvious).”
Meditating on the twelve branches of dependent-arising in the forward order means meditating that from ignorance arise actions, from actions arise consciousness, from consciousness arises name and form, and so forth. From meditating on it in the forward order, Bodhisattvas reverse any attachment to cyclic existence, and they “manifest” an intention that has turned away from cyclic existence. Meditating on dependent-arising in the reverse order is to meditate that through stopping ignorance one stops actions, through stopping actions one stops consciousness, and so forth.\(^c\)

---


\(^a\) The 2012 Mundgod digital (20.1) reads bsgoms both times the term is used. The 1999 TBRC bla brang (18b.3) and 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (16b.6) readings of bsgom on both occasions have been followed.

\(^b\) Correcting mngon du phyogs pa’i mngon du gyur pa’i in the 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (16b.7) and 2012 Mundgod digital (20.3) to mngon du phyogs pa’am mngon du gyur pa’i in accordance with the 1999 TBRC bla brang (18b.3).

\(^c\) The Fourteenth Dalai Lama explains these two procedures in detail in *The Meaning of Life: Buddhist Perspectives on Cause and Effect,* trans. and ed. Jeffrey Hopkins (Boston: Wisdom Publications, 2000), 38-41:

With regard to the twelve links of dependent-arising, there are basically two modes of explanation, one in terms of thoroughly afflicted phenomena and another in terms of pure phenomena. Just as in the four noble truths, which are Buddha’s root teaching, there are two sets of cause and effect, one set for the afflicted class of phenomena and another for the pure class, so here in the twelve links of dependent-arising, there are procedures in terms of both afflicted phe-
nomena and pure phenomena. From among the four noble truths, true suffer-
ings—the first truth—are effects in the afflicted class of phenomena, and true
sources—the second truth—are their causes. In the pure class of phenomena, true
cessations, the third truth, are effects in the pure class, and true paths, the fourth
truth, are their causes. Similarly, when it is explained in the twelve links of de-
pendent-arising that due to the condition of ignorance, action is produced and so
forth, the explanation is in terms of the afflicted procedure, and when it is ex-
plained that due to the cessation of ignorance, action ceases and so forth, it is in
terms of the procedure of the pure class. The first is the procedure of the produc-
tion of suffering, and the second is the procedure of the cessation of suffering.

To repeat: the twelve links of dependent-arising are laid out in terms of a
process of affliction and in terms of a process of purification, and each of these
is presented in forward and reverse orders. Thus, in the forward process, it is
explained that:

Due to the condition of ignorance, action arises;
due to the condition of action, consciousness arises;
due to the condition of consciousness, name and form arise;
due to the condition of name and form, the six sense spheres arise;
due to the condition of the six sense spheres, contact arises;
due to the condition of contact, feeling arises;
due to the condition of feeling, attachment arises;
due to the condition of attachment, grasping arises;
due to the condition of grasping, the potentialized level of karma called “exist-
ence” arises;
due to the condition of “existence”, birth arises;
due to the condition of birth, aging and death arise.

Because this mode describes how suffering is produced, it is an explanation of
the sources’ that produce suffering.

In reverse order it is explained that:

The unwanted sufferings of aging and death are produced in dependence upon
birth;
birth is produced in dependence upon the potentialized level of action called “ex-
istence”; “existence” is produced in dependence upon grasping;
grasping is produced in dependence upon attachment;
attachment is produced in dependence upon feeling;
feeling is produced in dependence upon contact;
contact is produced in dependence upon the six sense spheres;
the six sense spheres are produced in dependence upon name and form;
name and form are produced in dependence upon consciousness;
consciousness is produced in dependence upon action;
action is produced in dependence upon ignorance.

Here the emphasis is on the first of the four noble truths, true sufferings them-
selves, which are the effects.

Then, in terms of the process of purification, it is explained that:

When ignorance ceases, action ceases;
From meditating on and understanding it in the reverse order, they manifest, or approach, a nirvāṇa.

This sort of meditation might not seem to be a feature of Bodhisattvas, but they have an unusual variety of it. Even though sixth grounders have not actually manifested the nirvāṇa, or true cessation, the state of having abandoned the two obstructions if they are Bodhisattvas who have not previously gone on a lower path, nonetheless, they have attained a surpassing practice of the perfection of wisdom. (If they have previously gone on a lower path, they have abandoned the afflictive obstructions but not the obstructions to omniscience.)

Even before the path, one can enumerate the twelve links of dependent-arising in the forward and reverse processes, and one can understand the causal sequence that they indicate, but at this point Bodhisattvas attain

```
when action ceases, consciousness ceases;
when consciousness ceases, name and form cease;
when name and form cease, the six sense spheres cease;
when the six sense spheres cease, contact ceases;
when contact ceases, feeling ceases;
when feeling ceases, attachment ceases;
when attachment ceases, grasping ceases;
when grasping ceases, the potentialized level of karma called “existence” ceases;
when the potentialized level of karma called “existence” ceases, birth ceases;
when birth ceases, aging and death cease.
```

This explanation is in terms of the purified class of phenomena with the emphasis being on the causes, that is to say, true paths, from among the four noble truths. In reverse order, it is explained that:

```
The cessation of aging and death arises in dependence upon the cessation of birth;
the cessation of birth arises in dependence upon the cessation of the potentialized level of karma called “existence”;
the cessation of the potentialized level of karma called “existence” arises in dependence upon the cessation of grasping;
the cessation of grasping arises in dependence upon the cessation of attachment;
the cessation of attachment arises in dependence upon the cessation of feeling;
the cessation of feeling arises in dependence upon the cessation of contact;
the cessation of contact arises in dependence upon the cessation of the six sense spheres;
the cessation of the six sense spheres arises in dependence upon the cessation of name and form;
the cessation of name and form arises in dependence upon the cessation of consciousness;
the cessation of consciousness arises in dependence upon the cessation of action;
the cessation of action arises in dependence upon the cessation of ignorance.
```

Here, within the process of purification the emphasis is on the effects, true cessations, the third of the four noble truths.
an uncommon ascertainment of how to reverse cyclic existence induced by a special wisdom that directly damages (gnod) the final uncommon root of cyclic existence that is within them. The final basic root (gzhi rtsa mthar thug) of cyclic existence is the conception of true existence. The wisdom realizing the lack of true existence is directly contrary to a conception of true existence, and sixth grounders have attained a special capacity to enter into meditative equipoise directly realizing the lack of true existence as much as they want. Through this they have gained, by way of experience, an uncommon ascertaining consciousness with regard to the forward process, the process of being brought into cyclic existence, and the reverse process, the process of getting out of cyclic existence.

It is said that the way in which the first five perfections can serve as a cause of highest enlightenment is through the force of the practice of the perfection of wisdom. Chandrakīrti’s Supplement to (Nāgārjuna’s) “Treatise on the Middle” (VI.2) says:a

Just as all in a blind group are easily lead by a single sighted person
To the place where they want to go,
So here also awareness [wisdom], taking hold of qualities
That lack the eye [of wisdom], goes to the state of a Victor.

Just as one person with eyes can lead a group of twenty, thirty, or even a hundred blind people to wherever they want to go, just so the practice of the first five perfections is similar to the blind people and the practice of the perfection of wisdom is similar to the person with eyes. Thus it is through the force of the surpassing practice of the perfection of wisdom that the practice of the other five perfections, giving and so forth, become causes leading to the state of omniscient Buddhahood.

In a similar way, the great scholar Dharmakīrti said, “Love and so forth, because they are not in opposition to obscuration, cannot eliminate those very great faults.”b In other words, through those virtues such as love, compassion, giving, ethics, and so forth, which are factors of method, one accumulates good merit; although they are virtuous and cause one’s mind to be generated in a good way, they are not capable of removing the

---

a ji ltar long ba’i tshogs kun bde blag tu/ mig ldan skyes bu cig gis ’dod pa yi/ yul du ’khrid pa de bzhin ’dir yang blo/ mig nyams yon tan blangs te rgyal nyid ’gro/. See Preston, Jamyang-shay-pa’s Great Exposition of the Middle: Chapter Six, Introduction, Parts One, Two, and Three: VI.2.

b byams sogs rmons dang ’gal med phyir/ shin tu nyes pa tshar gcig min in Commentary on (Dignāga’s) “Compilation of Prime Cognition” (tshad ma rnam ’grel gyi tshig le’ur byas pa, pramāṇavārttikakārikā) IABS/ACIP: sde dge 4210: vol.174, 115b. 4.
afflictions through realizing that the referent object of an ignorant conception does not exist. Thus they are not final antidotes that can bring an end to cyclic existence.

This is why the pristine wisdoms of the meditative equipoise of all three vehicles—those of Hearers, Solitary Victors, and Bodhisattvas—are posited as being pristine wisdoms directly realizing selflessness. This is true of uninterrupted paths of paths of seeing, uninterrupted paths of paths of meditation, paths of release of paths of seeing, and paths of release of paths of meditation—of Hearer, Solitary Victors, or Bodhisattvas. All are posited as pristine wisdoms directly realizing selflessness; others, such as giving, ethics, love, compassion, and so forth, are not posited as pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise.

If love, compassion, patience, ethics, and so forth could act as an actual antidote to the afflictions, then they could be posited as pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise, as uninterrupted paths, paths of release, and so forth. But they cannot, and so they are not posited as such. That which acts as the actual antidote to the afflictions and the obstructions to omniscience is the pristine wisdom that directly realizes selflessness. From the viewpoint of directly realizing the non-existence of the referent object of a conception of self, it removes or extinguishes them. Because on the sixth ground one attains a surpassing practice of the perfection of wisdom, the pristine wisdom set in meditative equipoise that is directly realizing selflessness attains a special capacity of meditative stabilization beyond what one had before on the lower grounds and is very firm, or stable.

Chandrakīrti’s *Supplement to (Nāgārjuna’s) “Treatise on the Middle,”* (VI.1cd)\(^{\text{a}}\) says:

[They] abide in wisdom through seeing the suchness
Of arising-dependent-upon-this, whereby they attain cessation.

It is because they have attained this greater capacity that they have attained cessation. “Cessation” here refers to a capacity to remain in meditative equipoise directly realizing emptiness as long as one wants without rising from that equipoise.

There is a reason for calling the seventh ground “the gone afar” because it is called such due to the fact that, in dependence upon having cultivated the path for a long time, it is related with the two, the final paths having signs and

\(^{\text{a}}\) *di rt'en 'byung ba'i de nyid mthong ba des/ shes rab gnas pas 'gog pa 'thob par 'gyur.*
having exertion and the path of sole progress.

Having “signs” (mtshan bcas, sanimitta/samitta) refers to having opportunities for the manifest generation for the conception of true existence. Up until the seventh ground, manifest generation of the conception of true existence can still occur. Having “exertion” (rtsol bcas) means that one still has exertion, still has to make effort, with regard to achieving the state of a Buddha. This is the final path on which one has to make such effort. It is on the seventh ground that one finishes the second round of accumulation of merit and wisdom for countless eons. After it there is only one collection left. “Sole progress” then refers to the fact that there is only one period of countless eons left for the accumulation of merit and wisdom.

There is a reason for calling the eighth ground “immovable” because it is called such due to the fact that on the eighth ground there is no fluctuation by either of the two—discrimination having signs or by signless discrimination having exertion.

On the eighth ground, it is not possible for there to be a manifest conception of true existence anymore; this is what is meant by saying that one is

---

\[\text{a}\] The 2012 Mundgod digital (20.4) reads bsgom. The reading of bsgom found in both the 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (17a.1) and the 1999 TBRC bla brang (18b.4) has been followed.

\[\text{b}\] Lo-sang-gyal-tshan elaborated that the first period of countless eons takes place over the paths of accumulation and preparation, the second from the first to the seventh grounds, and the third on the eighth to tenth grounds.
immovable by a discrimination having signs, those “signs” being conceptions of true existence. And further, not only are there no more “signs,” that is, there is no longer any conception of true existence, also there is no longer any discrimination that involves exertion.

On the seventh ground it is possible for there to be a time of not having a manifest conception of true existence but having a discrimination that involves exertion, but on the eighth ground such is not possible; hence there is no fluctuation due to discrimination involving exertion.

There is a reason for calling the ninth ground “the ground of good intelligence” because it is called such due to the fact that one has attained a forbearance called “the intelligence of individual correct knowledge.”

On the ninth ground one attains the uncommon qualities of the four individual correct knowledges. These four are the individual correct knowledge of words, meanings, etymologies, and courage. Here forbearance, or patience, does not refer to the usual patience, such as that included within the six perfections; rather, because one has attained the uncommon qualities of the four individual correct knowledges, one has attained a special facility with regard to bringing about the welfare of others that one did not have on lower grounds. Therefore, it is called a patience, or forbearance.

There is a reason for calling the tenth ground “the clouds of doctrine” because it is called such due to the fact that just as in the world, rain clouds fill the sky and the rainfall increases the worldly harvests, so the mental continuum of the tenth ground Bodhisattva is like a sky filled with the clouds of doctrine of the retentions, meditative stabilizations and so forth, from which the rain of doctrine falls and increases the marvelous harvest of virtues in the continuums of trainees.
The mental continuum of a tenth ground Bodhisattva is vast and extensive like the sky. And it is filled with clouds of doctrine that are the retentions, meditative stabilizations, and so forth. The “retentions” are the ability to maintain the words and meaning of the doctrine without forgetting for even an eon; hence they are retentive consciousnesses. “Meditative stabilizations” indicates the attainment of limitless meditative stabilizations that can be sustained without any fluctuation, free from any and all faults such as laxity, excitement, discursiveness (rnam rtog), inappropriate mental activity (tshul bzhin ma yin pa yid la byed pa), the conception of true existence, and so forth. Also coming together in that Bodhisattva’s mental continuum are love, compassion, the wisdom realizing emptiness—all the many pristine wisdoms that make up the factors of method and wisdom.

When the text says “clouds of doctrine” it indicates the Doctrine Jewel (chos dkon mchog), which are true paths, the consciousnesses that are those realizations, those pristine wisdoms. Those clouds of realizational doctrine (rtogs pa’i chos) fill the sky of the Bodhisattva’s mental continuum; then what rains down from them is the profound and vast “rain of doctrine” that is the verbal teachings (lung gi chos) that are appropriate for the individual dispositions and so forth of trainees. This rain of doctrine falls and causes the increase of the marvelous harvest of virtues and good qualities in the continuums of trainees. Wholesome qualities not yet produced are produced, and those already produced increase more and more. This is why the tenth ground is called “clouds of doctrine.”

\[19a\] 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (17a.4) mistakenly reads pa ‘i; 1999 TBRC bla brang (19a.1) and 2012 Mundgod digital (20.12) have been followed.

\[19b\] 2012 Mundgod digital (20.13) has added a shad at this point. The reading of 1999 TBRC bla brang (19a.1) and 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (17a.4) without the shad has been followed.
2) MODE OF ABANDONING THE OBJECTS OF ABANDONMENT

During the path of seeing, the one hundred and twelve afflictions that are to be abandoned by the path of seeing and the one hundred and eight obstructions to omniscience that are to be abandoned by the path of seeing are abandoned. And, on the first through tenth grounds that are included within the path of meditation, sixteen innate afflictive obstructions [six—desire, hatred, pride, afflicted ignorance, view of the transitory collection, and holding to extremes—included within the level of the desire realm and] five each with regard to the Form and Formless realms—(the above six) minus hatred—making sixteen] and the seeds of one hundred and eight innate obstructions to omniscience are abandoned.

a At the point of the original listing of this topic, p.251 above, it was called “attributes (khyad chos) of the mode of abandoning objects of abandonment.”

b Lo-sang-gyal-tshan identified the sources for presentations of objects of abandonment as being Vasubandhu’s *Treasury of Manifest Knowledge* and Asaṅga’s *Summary of Manifest Knowledge*, with the *Summary of Manifest Knowledge* taking precedence in “Presentations of Grounds and Paths.”

c Correcting brgyad in 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (17a.5) to brgya in accordance with 1999 TBRC bla brang (19a.3).

d Correcting brgyad in 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (17a.6) to brgya in accordance with 1999 TBRC bla brang (19a.3).
These are then individually explained.

The one hundred and twelve artificial afflictive obstructions that are abandoned by the path of seeing do exist. For, there are, included within the level of the Desire Realm, ten afflictions to be abandoned by the path of seeing related with [true] sufferings, ten afflictions to be abandoned by the path of seeing related with [true] sources, ten afflictions to be abandoned by the path of seeing related with [true] cessations, and ten afflictions to be abandoned by the path of seeing related with [true] paths, making forty.

The reason [which is that there are these forty] is established because there are the five views [the view of the transitory collection as real “I” and “mine,” the view of extremes, wrong views, holding bad views to be supreme, and holding bad systems of ethics and codes of conduct to be supreme] and the five non-views [desire, anger, pride, afflicted ignorance, and afflicted doubt] that observe each of the four truths, making four groups of ten.

\[ Correcting \text{ brgyad} \text{ in 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (17a.6) to brgya in accordance with 1999 TBRC bla brang (19a.3).]
The five non-views are the five non-view root afflictions: desire, anger, pride, afflicted ignorance, and afflicted doubt. Since these five are not the sixth root affliction, “view,” they are called the five “non-views.” This sixth itself has five divisions: the view of the transitory collection as real “I” and “mine,” the view of extremes, wrong views, holding bad views to be supreme, and holding bad systems of ethics and codes of conduct to be supreme.

These are all afflictions to be abandoned by the path of seeing. There are the five non-views and five views observing true sufferings, the five non-views and five views observing true sources, the five non-view and five views observing true cessations, and the five non-view and five views observing true paths. These are all included within the level of the Desire Realm, and they add up to forty.

Then there are thirty-six afflictions observing the four truths included within the level of the Form Realm, and thirty-six observing the four truths included within the level of the Formless Realm. In the Form and Formless Realms there is no anger. With no anger observing the four truths, this reduces the number for the two upper realms by four each. Therefore, the afflictions of this type number only thirty-six, rather than forty.

In addition to [the forty included within the level of the Desire Realm], having eliminated anger from within the ten afflictions observing the four truths that are included within the levels of the Form and Formless Realms, there are thirty-six [afflictions to be abandoned by the path of seeing] included within the level of the Form Realm, and thirty-six [afflictions to be abandoned by the path of seeing] included within the level of the Formless Realm, making seventy-two.

---

a ‘dod chags, khong khro, nga rgyal, nyon mongs can gyi ma rig pa, nyon mongs can gyi the tshom.
b ‘jig lta, mthar lta, log lta, lta ba mchog ’dzin, tshul khrims dang rtul zhugs mchog ’dzin. These five taken as one, and added to the above list of five constitute the six root afflictions.
By adding the forty afflictions included within the desire level to the seventy-two afflictions included within the form and formless levels, one gets the total of one hundred and twelve afflictions that are to be abandoned by the path of seeing.

There are one hundred and eight artificial obstructions to omniscience.

These are also abandoned by the path of seeing.

This is because there are thirty-six artificial obstructions to omniscience included within the level of the Desire Realm, and there are thirty-six artificial obstructions to omniscience included within each [of the upper realms] the Form and Formless Realms.

Thus there are one hundred and eight artificial obstructions to omniscience that are abandoned by the path of seeing.

The first reason [which is that there are thirty-six artificial obstructions to omniscience included within the level of the Desire Realm] is established because there are nine conceptions [of true existence] of objects to be engaged in; nine conceptions [of true existence] of objects to be reversed from; nine conceptions [of the true existence of subjects that misapprehend the person as being substantially existent; and nine conceptions [of true existence of subjects] that apprehend the person to be imputedly existent that are obstructions to omniscience to be abandoned by the path of seeing that are included within the level of the Desire Realm.”

a ‘jug pa gzung rtog, ldog pa gzung rtog, rdzats ’dzin rtog pa, btags ’dzin rtog pa. These
Thus there are four sets of nine, making thirty-six. These are all artificial obstructions to omniscience to be abandoned by the path of seeing that are included within the level of the Desire Realm.

The first group of nine conceptions [of true existence] of objects to be engaged in are the conception of objects to be engaged in by Bodhisattvas as truly existent (byang sems rnams kyi ‘jug bya bden par ’dzin pa’i bden ’dzin), these being obstructions to omniscience that are to be abandoned by the path of seeing and are included within the level of the Desire Realm.a

four were also mentioned at the time of the path of preparation; see note, p.198 with added information from Hopkins and Yi, Jam-yang-shay-pa’s Seventy Topics. They describe an ability to overcome increasingly more subtle levels of the conception of true existence, two of objects (gzung rtog) and two of subjects (’dzin rtog).

Ngag-wang-pal-dan’s Meaning of the Words of Maitreya’s “Ornament for the Clear Realizations” (V.8-9) listing the nine conceptualizations of apprehended objects that are objects of engagement (’jug pa gzung rtog) is:

It is asserted that these conceptualizations having as their basis, the class of objects of engagement exist in nine aspects [observing]:
(1) Nature, (2) lineage,
(3) Thorough achievement of the path,
(4) Unmistaken objects of observation of knowledge,
(5) Discordant class, (6) antidotes,
(7) Realization by themselves, (8) acting,
(9) And their actions and the fruits of acting.

It is asserted that these conceptualizations—having as their basis, that is, object, the class of Bodhisattvas’ objects of engagement and adhering to them as truly existent—exist in nine aspects [thinking.] “The class of Bodhisattvas’ objects of engagement are my apprehended objects of engagement,” upon observing:

(1) the nature of—in conventional terms—attaining the fruit, unsurpassed enlightenment, through the causes, the six perfections
(2) definite transformation into the Buddha lineage
(3) thorough achievement of the Great Vehicle path of seeing and so forth
Then there is the group of nine conceptions of true existence of objects to be reversed from. These objects are, for instance, the Hearer and Solitary Victor paths and fruits that Bodhisattvas are to turn away from, and it the conception of those as truly existent that are the obstructions to omniscience to be abandoned by the path of seeing that are included within the level of desire (nyan rang rnams kyi lam ’bras la dmigs nas byang sans rnams kyi ldog bya bden par ’dzin pa ’i bden ’dzin)\(^a\)

\(^a\) Ngag-wang-pal-dan’s *Meaning of the Words of Maitreya’s “Ornament for the Clear Realizations”* (V.10-12) listing the nine conceptualizations of apprehended objects that are objects of disengagement (ldog pa gzung rtok) is:

These entities of nine conceptualizations
Of these called (1) low realization
Due to falling to mundane existence or [solitary] peace,
(2) Lack of restrainers,

(3) Incompleteness of the aspects of the path,
(4) Proceeding under others’ conditions,
(5) Turning away from the intents,
(6) Trifling, (7) various,

(8) Obscured about abiding and entering,
(9) And going afterward
Have as their basis the class of disengagements,
Arising in the minds of Hearers and so forth.

These entities of nine conceptualizations adhering to true [existence, thinking], “These are my apprehended objects of disengagement,” upon observing these called:

(1) **low realization due to falling either to mundane existence or [solitary] peace**
(2) **lack of external and internal restrainers** holding one from falling to the extremes of mundane existence and [solitary] peace
(3) **incompleteness of the aspects of the path** due to not being antidotes to all obstructions to omniscience
(4) **during the final mundane existence proceeding under others’ conditions**
(5) **turning away from seeking the three great intents** [great mind, great abandonment, and great realization]
(6) **trifling** abandonments
(7) **various** realizations such as Stream-Enterer and so forth
(8) **until attaining the position of [solitary] peace, obscured about continually abiding in and initially entering** the Great Vehicle path
Next there is the group of nine conceptions of the true existence of subjects that [mis]apprehend [the person] as being substantially existent, these being obstructions to omniscience that are to be abandoned by the path of seeing and are included within the level of the Desire Realm.\(^a\) Following into another vehicle after attaining the fruit of their own path have as their basis—that is to say, have as their objects—the class of Bodhisattvas' objects of disengagement, arising in the minds or continuums of Hearers and so forth; they are observations of the paths and fruits of Hearers and so forth.

\(^a\) Ngag-wang-pal-dan's *Meaning of the Words of Maitreya's "Ornament for the Clear Realizations"* (V.13-14) listing the nine conceptualizations apprehending substantial existence (rdzás 'dzin rtog pa) is:

(1) Assuming and discarding,
(2) Taking to mind, (3) closely Related with the three realms
(4) Abiding, (5) manifestly adhering,
(6) The actualities of phenomena as imputations,
(7) Attached, (8) the antidotes,
(9) And degenerated from proceeding as wished Are to be known as the first of apprehensions.

Conceptualizations conceiving of a partaker—qualified by substantial existence—as truly existent with respect to:

(1) a person (gang zag, pudgala) who conventionally assumes good qualities and discards defects
(2) a person who [conventionally] takes phenomena to mind as truly existing
(3) a person who [conventionally] due to the influence of having taken true existence to mind is closely related with the three realms [of Desire, Form, and Formlessness]
(4) a person who [conventionally] abides within having conceived forms and so forth as truly existent
(5) a person who [conventionally] manifestly adheres to emptiness as truly existent in the manner of not adhering to things as truly existent
(6) a person who [conventionally] understands all phenomena as only imputations of conventions
(7) a person who [conventionally] by way not adhering to true existence is attached to the six perfections
(8) a person who [conventionally] enacts the antidotes to the [mis]apprehension of signs by meditating on all phenomena as equally empty of true existence
(9) a person who [conventionally] due to not knowing the natural perfection of wisdom degenerates—that is, is prevented for a long time—from proceeding on to an exalted-knower-of-all-aspects as wished

are to be known as being the first conceptualizations of apprehending-subjects
nally, there are the nine conceptions of true existence of subjects that apprehend the person to be imputedly existent that are artificial obstructions to omniscience abandoned by the path of seeing.\(^a\)

Extend this pattern to the other two [to the Form and Formless Realms, making thirty-six for each based on the same four same sets of nine].

The nine artificial obstructions to omniscience in each of these sets of what

\(^a\) Ngag-wang-pal-dan’s Meaning of the Words of Maitreya’s “Ornament for the Clear Realizations” (V.15-16) listing the nine conceptualizations apprehending imputed existence (btags ‘dzin rtog pa) is:

(1) Not going forth in accordance with the intents,
(2) Definitely holding paths to be non-paths,
(3) Production as well as cessation,
(4) Actualities endowed and non-endowed,
(5) Dwelling, (6) destroying the lineage,
(7) No seeking, (8) no cause,
(9) And observing opposition

Are the other conceptualizations of apprehending-subjects.

Conceptualizations conceiving of a partaker—qualified by imputed existence—as truly existent upon observing:

(1) a being (skyes bu, puruṣa) who does not go forth in accordance with the three great intents [great mind, great abandonment, and great realization]
(2) a being who definitely holds Great Vehicle paths to be non-correct paths
(3) a being who realizes the production and cessation of causes and effects as made by entities only imputed conventionally
(4) a being who knows the actualities of forms and so forth as endowed (ldan pa), that is, as not ultimately having divisions, and as non-endowed (mi ldan pa), that is, as conventionally having divisions
(5) a being who dwells adhering to the true existence of forms and so forth
(6) a being who destroys and reverses the attitude of the lineage—that is, seeking mere peace—of Hearers and so forth
(7) a being who when realizing emptiness, holds merely it to be sufficient and thereupon has no desire seeking Buddhahood
(8) a being who has no cause, that is, cultivation of the perfection of wisdom
(9) a being who observes (dmigs pa)—that is, has (yod pa)—opposing actualities interfering with enlightenment such as devilishness and so forth

are conceptualizations of apprehending-subjects other than the previous, that is, conceptualizations apprehending imputed existence.
is abandoned by the path of seeing are distinguished by way of their objects, that is, they are identified by way of various objects that are apprehended as being truly existent.

With regard to the path of meditation, the objects of abandonment by the path of meditation are distinguished by way of the strength of the affliction and are divided by way of “size” into small, middling, and great. These are now described.

There are sixteen innate afflictive obstructions because there are six included within the level of the Desire Realm: desire, hatred, pride, afflicted ignorance, the view of the transitory [collection as real “I” and “mine’], and holding extreme [views]

There are the regular six root afflictions modified by the omission of afflicted doubt and view, and the inclusion of two of the divisions of view in their place. The view of the transitory collection is included here because viewing the aggregates included within one’s own continuum as being established as self is very strong—this is one of the main objects to be abandoned. Extreme views here means viewing what is not a path of liberation as being a path of liberation. This means that afflicted doubt and the remaining views, that is to say, wrong views, conceptions of bad views as supreme, and conception of bad systems of ethics and codes of conduct as supreme, are completely abandoned by the path of seeing.

and excluding hatred from being included within the two upper realms, [the Form and Formless Realms], the remaining five of this set [desire, pride, afflicted ignorance, the view of the transitory collection, and holding extreme views] are to be abandoned with regard to each of the upper realms, making sixteen in all.
Thus there are five for the Form Realm, five for the Formless Realm, and six for the Desire Realm, and that makes the sixteen innate afflictive obstructions that are removed by the first through the tenth grounds.

There are one hundred and eight innate obstructions to omniscience because there are thirty-six [four sets of nine] innate obstructions to omniscience that are included within the levels of each of the three realms, making one hundred and eight.

There are thirty-six included within the level of the Desire Realm, thirty-six included within the level of the Form Realm, and thirty-six included within the level of the Formless Realm. These are the same four sets of nine mentioned earlier: conceptions [of true existence] of objects to be engaged in; conceptions [of true existence] of objects to be turned away from; conceptions of the true existence of subjects that [mis]apprehend [the person] as being substantially existent; and conceptions [of the true existence of subjects] that apprehend [the person] as being imputedly existent.a [The artificial obstructions to omniscience were abandoned previously, on the path of seeing; now the innate form of these obstructions to omniscience is being abandoned.] The number thirty-six is obtained by dividing each of them into nine: small of the small, medium of the small, great of the small, and so forth.

3) **Features of Surpassing Qualities**b

This has seven parts: the feature of a surpassing perfection,

---

a shes sgrin 'jug pa gzung rtog ilhan skyes, shes sgrin ldog pa gzung rtog ilhan skyes, shes sgrin rdzas dzin rtog pa ilhan skyes, and shes sgrin brtags dzin rtog pa ilhan skyes.

b Above (251) at the point of listing the three-fold division of the meaning of the individual divisions of the Bodhisattva grounds it was called “attributes (khyad chos) of surpassing qualities.” Here when explaining the topic with seven sub-divisions, the term has shifted to “features” (khyad par).
the feature of an increase in the number of qualities, the feature of the mode of taking fruitional rebirth,\textsuperscript{a} the feature of an enhancement of the three trainings together with their fruit, the feature of the mode of inducing an ascertaining consciousness in states of subsequent attainment, the feature of thorough purifiers, and the feature of the signs of attaining a ground.

These range from attaining a surpassing perfection of giving on the first ground through to attaining a surpassing perfection of pristine wisdom on the tenth.

\textsuperscript{a} The first three of these are briefly alluded to by Tsong-kha-pa in his \textit{Illumination of the Thought} as having been set forth by Chandrakīrti. See Tsong-kha-pa, Ken-sur Nga-wang-lek-den, and Jeffrey Hopkins, \textit{Compassion in Tibetan Buddhism}, 134-135. The bracketed material there has been added from this section of Kön-chok-jig-may-wang-po’s text. The qualities described can be found in the \textit{Sūtra on the Ten Grounds}. Sources for the fourth and fifth items were not identified, though a suggestion was given that they might be found in Asaṅga’s \textit{Bodhisattva Grounds}. The topic of thorough purifiers is found in Maitreya’s \textit{Ornament for the Clear Realizations}, 1.48-69.
On the first ground there is a surpassing practice of the perfection of giving. On the second ground there is a surpassing practice of the perfection of ethics. On the third ground there is a surpassing practice of the perfection of patience; on the fourth, a surpassing practice of the perfection of effort; on the fifth, a surpassing practice of the perfection of concentration; on the sixth, a surpassing practice of the perfection of wisdom; on the seventh, a surpassing practice of the perfection of skill in means; on the eighth, a surpassing practice of the perfection of aspirational prayers; on the ninth, a surpassing practice of the perfection of power; and on the tenth, a surpassing practice of the perfection of pristine wisdom.

**B) THE FEATURE OF AN INCREASE IN THE NUMBER OF QUALITIES**

On the first ground, in states of subsequent attainment [the Bodhisattva]:

1. sees the faces of one hundred Buddhas in an instant
2. attains knowledge of having been blessed by those [one hundred Buddhas].
3. can go to one hundred Buddha lands
4. can illuminate one hundred Buddha lands
5. can vibrate one hundred different worldly realms
6. can live for one hundred eons

---

Lo-sang-gyal-tshan explained that from the side of the Buddhas and Bodhisattvas, their blessing are always flowing to us, but from our side we do not know whether they have entered us or not. From this point Bodhisattvas know that they have received those blessings, and not just from one, but from one hundred Buddhas.
7 can penetrate the correct perception of pristine wisdom into one hundred eons in the past and one hundred eons in the future.

8 can enter into one hundred different meditative stabilizations.

9 can open one hundred different doors of doctrine.

10 can ripen one hundred sentient beings.

11 can emanate one hundred bodies, and

12 can cause each of those bodies to be surrounded by one hundred Bodhisattva Superiors as their retinue.

[On the first ground these are all one hundred.] On the second ground, these twelve groups of such qualities are one thousand.

On the third, they are twelve groups of one hundred thousand.

---

a Both 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (18a.4) and 1999 TBRC bla brang (20a.3) read brgyar; 2012 Mundgod digital (21.20) reads brgya.
On the fourth, they are twelve groups of one billion.

On the fifth, twelve groups of ten billion.

On the sixth, twelve groups of one trillion.

On the seventh, twelve groups of one hundred trillion.

On the eighth, the twelve groups are a number equal to the subtle particles in a billion worlds.

On the ninth ground, the twelve groups are a number equal to the subtle particles in a million billion worlds.

On the tenth, they are a number equal to the number of subtle particles of an inexpressible number of an inexpressible number of Buddha lands.

---

\[a\] 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (18a.6) and 2012 Mundgod digital (21.24) both read *bye ba phrag* khri phrag 'bum phrag.
C) THE FEATURE OF THE MODE OF TAKING FRUITIONAL REBIRTH

A first grounder takes rebirth as a monarch ruling Jambudvīpa;

A second grounder as [monarch ruling] the four continents;

A third grounder as [monarch ruling the Land of] the Thirty-Three;

A fourth grounder [as monarch ruling the Land] Without Combat;

A fifth grounder as [monarch ruling] the Joyous Land;

A sixth grounder as [monarch ruling the Land of] Liking Emanation;

A seventh grounder as [monarch ruling the Land of] Controlling Others’ Emanations;

An eighth grounder as a Great Brahmā, Lord of One Thousand Worlds;

A ninth grounder as a Great Brahmā, Lord of One Million Worlds;

\(^a\) These are all mentioned in the Sūtra on the Ten Grounds.
A tenth grounder takes rebirth as a Devaputra Maheshvara of the Highest Land.

These are in consideration that it is mostly this way, but these are not necessarily the case. [That is, although all Bodhisattvas can take rebirth in this way, not all do.]

D) The feature of an enhancement of the three trainings together with their fruits

On the first ground, one attains the quality [in general] of practicing the three trainings from the viewpoint of directly realizing the noumenon. On the second ground, one attains this [specifically] with regard to the training in ethics, and on the third ground, with regard to the training in higher meditative stabilization. On the fourth, fifth, and sixth grounds, one attains the training in wisdom. On the remaining four grounds [from the seventh to the tenth], one attains features that are included within the three trainings.

It is said that [Bodhisattvas] attain on the fourth ground the wisdom skilled in the harmonies with enlightenment; on the fifth ground the wisdom skilled in the coarse and subtle four truths; and on the sixth ground the wisdom in the forward and reverse processes of dependent-arising. In this way on this [sixth] ground the three trainings in wisdom are completed.
Lo-sang-gyal-tshan: On all of the Bodhisattva grounds, what is mainly taking place is the realization of emptiness with a pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise. Different practices are being performed over the grounds, but the quality of the pristine wisdom of meditative equipoise is exactly the same and the emptiness that it is realizing is exactly the same. Where some difference can be drawn is when a Bodhisattva

Footnote: 1999 TBRC bla brang (20b.4) and 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (18b.4) both read kyang. 2012 Mundgod digital (22.11) reads yang.
rises from the meditative equipoise; there are differences in the ascer-
taining consciousness induced on the occasion of the pristine wisdom
of subsequent attainment. For example, when you go to sleep, you are
asleep and not doing other things; however, when you wake, your
thoughts, though not the same as when you were asleep, have been
influenced by your dreams and so forth. Just so, the “work” of medit-
tative equipoise is to abandon the respective objects of abandonment,
but since different kinds of ignorance are being eradicated, the medi-
tative equipoise of each ground leads to a slightly different ascertain-
ing consciousness in states of subsequent attainment.

On the occasion of the first ground, due to realizing that
the noumenon, [that is, emptiness,] which is a mere nega-
tive of a self of phenomena, pervades all, oneself and oth-
ers, [Bodhisattvas] realize the noumenon in the manner of
being omnipresent.

Because, on the second ground, the Great Vehicle path re-
alizing the noumenon is realized to be superior to the
Lesser Vehicle path, [Bodhisattvas] realize the noumenon
as having the meaning of being supreme.

For realizing the noumenon, that is, for realizing emptiness, the Great Ve-
hicle path is superior to that of the Lesser Vehicle. On the second ground
a special ascertaining consciousness realizing this is induced, and con-
joined with that one has wisdom realizing that the noumenon is the su-
preme meaning.

Because on the third ground, it is ascertained that much
hearing of scriptures is a concordant cause for realization
of the element of attributes (chos dbying), [Bodhisattvas]
realize the noumenon as having the meaning of a concordant cause.\(^a\)

On the third ground in states of subsequent attainment an ascertaining consciousness is induced realizing that a great deal of hearing scriptures serves as a concordant cause for realizing the element of attributes, that is, for realizing emptiness, and hence that emptiness, the noumenon, also called the element of attributes, is a concordant cause.

On the fourth ground, because there is no pride of being attached to doctrines of verbalization, [Bodhisattvas] realize the meaning of total non-grasping.

On the fifth ground, [Bodhisattvas] realize all, oneself and others, as not having different continuums from the approach of the emptiness of substantial existence in the sense of self-sufficiency of persons.

On the sixth ground, due to realizing that the two—the phenomena of] the thoroughly afflicted class and of the pure class—are not produced causelessly, nor from discordant causes, [Bodhisattvas] realize thoroughly afflicted and pure phenomena as having the meaning of a non-difference.

\(^a\) Emptiness is considered a “cause” in the sense that meditation on it causes the generation of attributes of a Superior.

\(^b\) Correcting pos in 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (18b.7) to pas in accordance with 1999 TBRC bla brang (21a.1).
On the seventh ground, due to the non-arising of signs of doctrine, such as the sūtras and so forth, with regard to the noumenon, [Bodhisattvas] realize the noumenon as having the meaning of non-difference.

On the eighth ground [Bodhisattvas] realize the noumenon as having the meaning of non-increase and non-decrease of the thoroughly afflicted and the pure, and as the situation of the meaning of having power over the two—non-conceptual pristine wisdom and pure lands.

On the ninth ground, due to the fact that the four individual correct knowledges are attained, [Bodhisattvas] realize the noumenon as the situation of the meaning of having power over pristine wisdom.

On the tenth ground, due to having equal exalted activities with a Buddha, [Bodhisattvas] realize the noumenon as the situation of power over actions.
F) THE FEATURE OF THOROUGH PURIFIERS

“Thorough purifiers” or “thorough purification” are the means by which the qualities of that ground are caused to increase higher and higher. Thorough purifiers are the qualities through which one advances higher and higher on the grounds.

There are ten thorough purifiers on the first ground, eight on the second, five on the third. \(^a\)

On the third ground it is said that a Bodhisattva is not satisfied with [previous] hearing but continues to hear a lot from Buddhas and so forth. Thus even on the high grounds one needs to engage in hearing.

There are ten each on the fourth and fifth [grounds], twelve on the sixth, twenty on the seventh, eight on the eighth, and twelve on the ninth.

Although thorough purifiers of the tenth ground are not explicitly indicated in Maitreya’s *Ornament for the Clear Realization*, it is not that there are no thorough purifiers [on the tenth ground]. This is because on the occasion of attaining the tenth ground, one must advance to a higher ground from the approach of removing defects and increasing good qualities.

\(^a\) These are described in Maitreya’s *Ornament for Clear Realization*, I.48-69. See Hopkins and Yi, Ngag-wang-pal-dan’s *Meaning of the Words of Maitreya’s “Ornament for the Clear Realizations”* on the ninth topic.
G) SIGNS OF ATTAINING THE GROUNDS

There arise different dream signs on the occasion of attaining each of the ten grounds.\(^b\)

[An objection, a possible answer to it, and another objection are set forth:]

**Objection:** Since it was explained that from attaining the heat [level of the path of preparation] one does not have the five obstructions—sleep and so forth [that is, aspiration to desire, harmful intent, sleepiness and lethargy, excitement and contrition, and doubt]\(^c\) then how does it come about that there are dream signs with regard to attaining the ten grounds?

**An earlier Tibetan’s answer [to this objection]:** \(^d\) “This is

\(^a\) Correcting sgo nas gong ma in 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (19a.6) to sgo nas sa gong ma in accordance with 1999 TBRC bla brang (21b.1).

\(^b\) Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po does not identify the dreams signs, but addresses some objections by earlier Tibetans who question whether there even are dreams on the Bodhisattva grounds. The signs themselves along with the qualms can be found in Tsong-kha-pa’s *Golden Garland of Eloquence*; see Gareth Sparham, *Golden Garland of Eloquence: legs bshad gser phreng*, vol.1b (Fremont, CA: Jain Publishing Company, 2008), 495-497.

\(^c\) Maitreya’s *Ornament for the Clear Realizations* (IV.41cd) refers to these, saying, “not companying/ With the five aspects of obstructions.” See Hopkins and Yi, Ngag-wang-pal-dan’s *Meaning of the Words of Maitreya’s “Ornament for the Clear Realizations”* on the 38th topic.

a case of an appearance like a dream, this being a visionary appearance (nyams snang) dawning to an adventitious consciousness.”

In one sense this means “to an unusual mind”; when you are meditating, something dream-like happens to you, and so they are said to be “dreams.”

Some other scholars say: Since actual sleep is a mind that is affected by temporary causes of mistake, those on the three pure grounds do not have actual sleep.

Our answer: These are not logically feasible because although on those [ten grounds] there is no afflicted sleep, there is virtuous sleep because (1) Nya-bön Kun-ga-pal’s Commentary on (Maitreya’s) “Ornament for the Clear Realizations” says:

\[1999 \text{TBRC } \text{bla brang} \ (21b.2) \text{reads } \text{sn}y\text{ams }\text{na}; \ 1987 \text{Lhasa Go-mang} \ (19a.7) \text{reads } \text{sn}y\text{ams }\text{na}; \text{ and the } 2012 \text{Mundgod digital } (23.10) \text{reads } \text{sn}y\text{am }\text{na}. \text{The same phrase in the text by Nya-bön Kun-ga-pal (nya dbon kun dga’ dpal) cited just below (561.5) reads sn}y\text{am }\text{na}.\]

\[\text{b } \text{nya dbon kun dga’ dpal, } 1285-1379, \text{ a Jo-nang scholar who was a student of Dol-po-pa and a teacher of Ren-da-ba (red mda’ ba) and Tsong-kha-pa. The full title is } \text{Connected Explanation of Extensive Commentary on (Maitreya’s) “Ornament for the Clear Realizations” and its Commentaries: Dispeller of Mental Darkness (bstan bcos mngon par rtogs pa’i rgyan ’grel pa dang bcas pa’i rgyas ’grel bshad shyar yid kyi mun sel) } \text{TBRC W14076 IIKG8771 and I1KG8772}. \text{This citation is from vol. 1, 281a.5-6/561.5-6.}\]

This first objection mentioned above is found in Nya-bön Kun-ga-pal’s commentary at 561.5, which he immediately answers with the response cited here. Kön-chog-jig-may-
Although on those grounds, there is, from among the two types of sleep, no sleep involved with secondary afflictions in which [the mind] is powerlessly withdrawn [from sense objects], there is sleep that due to intentional blessings furthers [or enhances] the body and is to be counted among virtues. Hence, there is no fallacy.

There is sleep that is engaged in intentionally and is blessed by Buddhas and Bodhisattvas abiding on high grounds.

and (2) Tsong-kha-pa’s *Golden Garland of Eloquence* says:

---

**Notes:**

a Correcting țik in 2012 Mundgod digital (23.13) to țık in accordance with 1999 TBRC *bla brang* (21b.3) and 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (19b.1).

b TBRC W14076 11KG8771, 281a.5/561.5, reads *jug pa rang dbang med par* rather than *'byung ba rang dbang med par*, similar to Tsong-kha-pa’s explanation just below *'jug pa’i shes pa rang dbang med par*.

c 1999 TBRC *bla brang* (21b.4) and 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (17b.3) read *bgrang ba’i*. 2012 Mundgod digital (23.15-16) reads *bgrangs pa’i*.

d *Extensive Explanation of (Maitreya’s) “Treatise of Quintessential Instructions on the Perfection of Wisdom: Ornament for the Clear Realizations” as Well as Its Commentaries: Golden Garland of Eloquence (shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa’i man ngag gi bstan bcos mgon par rtogs pa’i rgyan ’grel pa dang bcas pa’i rgya cher bshad pa legs bshad gser gyi phreng ba)* TBRC W22109.3219, which is a PDF of: gedan sungrab minyam gyunphel series (Ngawang Gelek Demo), 1977. In the ACIP edition this is at 283a and in the Mtsho sngon edition at 464. See Sparham, 496-497. At this point in his text, Tsong-kha-pa references the 12th century Indian scholar Dharmamitra’s *Clear Words (tshig gsal)*: *mgon*
There are two types of sleep: afflicted sleep in which consciousnesses engaging objects operate powerlessly and sleep that furthers the body, which is counted among virtues. Hence to say that there no fallacy since the former does not exist [on the Bodhisattva grounds], but the latter does is a factually concordant answer.

Tsong-kha-pa also distinguishes sleep into two types. There is afflicted sleep in which sense consciousnesses that engage their objects, forms, sounds, odors, tastes, and tangible objects, and so forth are powerlessly drawn within. There is also virtuous sleep that increases, or furthers or replenishes, the body. Although the former afflicted sleep does not occur on the Bodhisattva grounds, the latter virtuous sleep does and hence there is no such fault. [Thus for Tsong-kha-pa, it is definite that there is sleep on the Bodhisattva grounds.]

There is a mode of passing from the lower grounds to the upper grounds because when passing from the lower grounds to the higher, one passes from within meditative equipoise to within meditative equipoise, because beginning from passing from the great supreme quality Great Vehicle path of preparation to the first ground through to

---

\(^a\) 1999 TBRC bla brang (21b.5) reads *lus rtau pa*s as does 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (19b.4) and the ACIP version of Tsong-kha-pa’s text. 2012 Mundgod digital (23.17) reads *lus btaus pa*s.

\(^b\) 1999 TBRC bla ’rang (21b.5) and the 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (19b.4) read *bgra*ng ba*i*; the 2012 Mundgod digital (23.18) reads *bgra*ngs pa*i*. 
passing from the uninterrupted path at the end of the continuum to the first moment of an exalted knower [of all aspects, each of these steps of progress] is this [that is, to pass from within meditative equipoise to within meditative equipoise].

On the great supreme mundane quality Great Vehicle path of preparation, [this being the final path before attaining the path of seeing and the first ground] one is, in the first phase (skad gcig dang po) in meditative equipoise on emptiness, realizing it through the means of a meaning-generality. Then, in whichever following phase within this meditative equipoise one realizes emptiness directly and one-pointedly in a non-conceptual manner, one attains the first ground.

The state of subsequent attainment of the path of seeing is [still] the first ground. [It is both the path of seeing and the first ground.] One does not immediately move from the meditative equipoise of subsequent attainment of the path of seeing to the second ground.

If, from within abiding in the state of subsequent attainment of the path of seeing, one passed to the meditative equipoise of the second ground, would this constitute “passing from within meditative equipoise to within meditative equipoise”? It would not [and hence we do not assert it as the mode of procedure. Rather,] after attaining the state of subsequent attainment of the path of seeing, one then generates a pristine wisdom set in meditative equipoise on emptiness which is called “a mere meditative equipoise” (mnyam bzhag tsam po ba).

It is a pristine wisdom set in meditative equipoise directly realizing
emptiness (*stong nyid la mngon sum tu rtogs pa'i mnyam bzhag ye shes*). This is [again] a first phase of meditative equipoise and is still the first ground, so it is called “a mere meditative equipoise of the first ground.” Then in the next phase, at whatever moment one generates the uninterrupted path that is the actual antidote to the great of the great objects to be abandoned by the path of meditation, one passes to the second ground.

It is the same procedure for all of the other grounds; on the second ground, after the pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment, one would again have to generate a pristine wisdom that is a mere meditative equipoise, this time “a mere meditative equipoise of the second ground.” When, within that meditative equipoise, one generates an uninterrupted path that acts as the actual antidote to the third ground’s respective objects of abandonment, one has passed to the third ground.

One follows this procedure up to the tenth ground. [There, after the uninterrupted path,] there is the path of release of the tenth ground. After that comes a pristine wisdom of subsequent attainment of the tenth ground. And after that comes the uninterrupted path at the end of the continuum. The first moment is the uninterrupted path at the end of the continuum.

At this point there is no “mere meditative equipoise” because the uninterrupted path is itself a tenth ground. One is going from the tenth ground to the ground of Buddhahood. The reason why “a mere meditative equipoise” was needed for the lower grounds was because when one was going from a lower to a higher ground what one was going from was a state of subsequent attainment and what one was going to was an uninterrupted path. Here that which is going to the higher level is itself an uninterrupted path and what it is going to is the ground of Buddhahood. [Both of these are pristine wisdoms of meditative equipoise and] hence “a pristine wisdom that is a mere meditative equipoise” is not needed [to lead into it]. Rather, the first period is the uninterrupted path at the end of the continuum and in the next period one has a path of release that is the first moment of an exalted-knower-of-all-aspects. The most difficult to abandon objects of abandonment have now been abandoned: All the stains of the conception of the two truths as being different entities have been extinguished, and all of the afflictive obstructions and the obstructions to omniscience have been completely abandoned.

This is the first moment of an omniscient consciousness, a pristine wisdom that is an exalted-knower-of-all-aspects realizing in one moment all the various divisions of objects of knowledge that are included within the mode and the varieties, [that is, of emptiness and appearances]. Again, this is a case of passing from meditative equipoise to meditative equipoise. One passes to Buddhahood from within meditative equipoise.
Now Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po sets forth his closing verses:

I have stated clearly the modes of progressing to the good houses of the three enlightenments
In dependence on the stairs of the three liberating paths
In accordance with the texts of the great chariots
Through fine analysis, having abandoned auto-fabrication.

The three liberating paths are those progressing to the liberation of a Hearer, or of a Solitary Victor, or of a practitioner of the Great Vehicle, which is Buddhahood. These paths are like a ladder, or set of stairs, leading upwards towards their three respective enlightenments which are then compared metaphorically to “good houses.” “Modes” refers to the techniques for progressing to these good houses.

Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po has not just made this up from his own side without relying on valid sources in scriptures and commentaries on them by reliable scholars. Rather he has engaged in fine analysis of the words and meanings, and has set this forth in accordance with the texts of the great chariots. Asaṅga heard the Ornament for the Clear Realizations from Maitreya, and in accordance with the commentaries on it by Haribhadra and Vimuktiṣena, Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po has stated this explanation clearly.

Through this virtue, may all embodied beings throughout space without exception,
Put on the armor of the Supreme Vehicle and having raised the weapon of wisdom,
May they overcome all without exception of the host of enemies which are the four demons
And be set on the jeweled throne of the three bodies.
This is the author’s concluding aspirational prayer. In dependence upon the virtue, the merit, of his having stated clearly this presentation of the grounds and paths, may all sentient beings, whose number is equal to the expanse of space, put on the armor of the Supreme Vehicle. The armor of the Supreme Vehicle refers to the great compassion, the precious mind of enlightenment, and so forth of the Great Vehicle, which prevent one being harmed by taking to mind only one’s own welfare, by the afflictions, and so forth. These are like armor. Having put this on, one raises the weapon of wisdom. Wisdom that is the realization of the selflessness of persons and of phenomena is able to completely vanquish the host of enemies of the four demons and hence is like a weapon.

The four demons are the aggregates, the afflictions, the lord of death, and the devaputras (children of gods). Devaputras are sometimes good and sometimes bad. The demon Ga-rab-wang-chug is an example of a devaputra. He initially accumulated merit well, but had very bad wishes. For example, he was staying together with a Bodhisattva, and he made the wish, “In the future when he is about to attain enlightenment, may I obstruct him!” It is from the point of view of his aspirational prayers that he became a demon. He is called Me-tog-da-jan (me tog mda’ can), “One who has a flower-arrow,” because when he shoots his arrow, it leaves no hole in the body, but the mind goes bad.

Maheshvara and his wife Uma were abiding in the bliss of an ascetic practice, and Ga-rab-wang-chug shot an arrow at Maheshvara. Fire came forth from Maheshvara’s eyes, as if he were burning. When the other gods saw him, it was as if he had been burned up. This is the reason why Maheshvara is called Lu-may-dag-po (lus med bdag po), “Bodiless Lord,” his body having been burned by Ga-rab-wang-chug’s arrow.

Whenever Ga-rab-wang-chug even comes near a practitioner, the practitioner generates a lot of desire, hatred, and other afflictions that he or she did not have before. Even without his actually shooting an arrow, just his presence causes problems.

The three bodies are those of a Buddha: the Form Body, Complete Enjoyment Body, and Nature Body. These would be like the throne of a monarch.
Ornament of the Three Vehicles was written by the monk Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po upon being urged, along with the auspicious emblems and a silver maṇḍala, by the excellent guide of beings of the northern direction, the holy Kun-dröl-no-mön Han Rin-po-che of A-lag-sha.

[Notes]

1999 TBRC bla brang (22a.3) is not sufficiently clear to determine if it reads pa or ba. 1987 Lhasa Go-mang (20a.1) reads pa. 2012 Mundgod digital (24.3) reads ba. Lo-sang-gyal-tshan read the line as pa.
Appendix 1:
Eight Forbearances and Eight Knowledges

The four doctrinal forbearances\(^a\) proceed in terms of the four noble truths and are: doctrinal forbearance with regard to true sufferings, doctrinal forbearance with regard to true sources, doctrinal forbearance with regard to true cessations, and doctrinal forbearance with regard to true paths.\(^b\) The four subsequent forbearances are: subsequent forbearance with regard to true sufferings, subsequent forbearance with regard to true sources, subsequent forbearance with regard to true cessations, and subsequent forbearance with regard to true paths.\(^c\)

In general, what is to be abandoned by the Hearer path of seeing is the view of the transitory collection, that is to say, the artificial conception of self that is observing that suffering. This is further specified as the conception of “I” as being substantially existent and the conception of objects of “mine” as being objects of use of a substantially existent I.

To begin, let us look at the term “doctrinal forbearance with regard to suffering” (\(\text{s}\text{dug bsngal chos bzod}\)). Why is it called such? The short explanation is that it is a doctrinal forbearance with regard to suffering because of being the actual antidote to the suffering of the Desire Realm that is to be abandoned by a path of seeing.\(^d\) To draw this out further, one could say: it is a doctrinal forbearance with regard to suffering because of being the actual antidote to the conception of self and so forth observing the suffering that is included within the level of the Desire Realm that is the object to be abandoned by the uninterrupted path of the path of seeing.\(^e\) Included within “and so forth” would be such things as perceiving the unclean to be clean, and so on, but mainly it refers to the conception of self.

---

\(^a\) Continuing Dan-ma-lo-chö’s explanation of this specialized topic.

\(^b\) chos bzod bzhi: sdug bsngal chos bzod, kun 'byung chos bzod, 'gog pa chos bzod, lam chos bzod.

\(^c\) rjes bzod bzhi: sdug bsngal rjes bzod, kun 'byung rjes bzod, 'gog pa rjes bzod, lam rjes bzod.

\(^d\) 'dod pa'i sdug bsngal mthong spang gi dngos gnyen yin pas na sdug bsngal chos bzod. (This can be filled out in a similar fashion for the remaining three: 'dod pa'i kun 'byung mthong spang gvi dngos gnyen yin pas na kun 'byung chos bzod, 'dod pa'i 'gog pa mthong spang gvi dngos gnyen yin pas na 'gog bden chos bzod, 'dod pa'i lam mthong spang gvi dngos gnyen yin pas na lam chos bzod.)

\(^e\) 'dod pa'i sas sdu s pa'i sdug bsngal la dmigs pa'i bdag 'dzin la sogs ba'i mthong lam bar chad med lam gvi spang bya'i dngos gnyen yin pas sdug bsngal chos bzod. Another slight verbal variant is: 'dod pa'i sdug bsngal la dmigs pa'i bdag 'dzin kun btags la sogs pa mthong spang gvi dngos gnyen byed pa yin tsang sdug bsngal chos bzod.
“That to be abandoned by the path of seeing” refers to the objects of aban-
donment contradicted, or eradicated, by the uninterrupted path of the path
of seeing.

Here “doctrinal” (chos) refers to “reality” (chos nyid) or “selflessness”
(bdag med). “Doctrinal forbearance” (chos bzod) is said because [this con-
sciousness] has “facility” with regard to abandoning the suffering with re-
gard to the Desire Realm that is abandoned by the path of seeing and be-
cause it directly realizes selflessness in terms of the suffering of the Desire
Realm.

To draw this forth even more, it does not lack the “facility” to
realize selflessness directly—it is “able” to realize selflessness directly, or
as it is (ji lta ba bzhin du). It also does not lack the “facility” to abandon
those artificial views of the transitory collection in terms of suffering—it is
“able” to abandon those.

So, for “forbearance” one can understand the
facility” to draw forth two things: it can draw forth the path of release and
it can also draw forth the true cessation. Therefore it is not unable (mi bzod
pa) to abandon the object of abandonment; it is able (bzod pa) to abandon
the object of abandonment. And also it is not unable (mi thub pa med pa)
to realize selflessness, it is able to realize (rtogs thub pa) selflessness.
Hence, it has facility.

This can then be filled out in a similar way with regard to the other
three doctrinal forbearances. Hence, the second is a “doctrinal forbearance
with regard to sources [of suffering]” by way of being the actual antidote
to those sources with regard to the Desire Realm that are abandoned by the
path of seeing, and it is a “doctrinal facility with regard to sources” since
it does not lack the capacity to realize directly selflessness in terms of true
sources [of suffering] of the Desire Realm.

The third doctrinal forbearance is with regard to true cessations. It is
a “doctrinal forbearance with regard to true cessations” because it is not
without the capacity to realize directly selflessness in terms of true cess-
ations with regard to the Desire Realm; it has that facility. And, it is not
without the capacity to abandon those erroneous superimpositions observ-
ing true cessations; it has the facility to abandon those.
The fourth is with regard to true paths. It is a “doctrinal forbearance with regard to true paths” because it is not without the capacity to abandon what are to be abandoned by a path of seeing observing true paths with regard to the Desire Realm; it has the facility to abandon those. And, it has the facility to directly realize selflessness in terms of true paths.a

The first four forbearances, the doctrinal forbearances, are in terms of the Desire Realm. The latter four forbearances, the subsequent forbearances (rjes bzod), are in terms of the higher realms, the Form and Formless Realms. So one can say with regard to the first of those, the subsequent forbearance with regard to true sufferings, that it has facility with regard to abandoning all—the conception of self and so forth observing suffering of the higher realms—and it has facility with regard to directly realizing selflessness in terms of the higher realms. b The remaining three would be filled out in a similar fashion.

How do we spell out more specifically what is being observed? In the case of the doctrinal forbearance with regard to true sufferings of the Desire Realm, the referent of the phrase “true sufferings included within the level of the Desire Realm” (’dod pa’i sas sdus gyi sdu gbsngal bden pa) is the contaminated aggregates (zag bcas nye bar len pa’i phung po). This refers to the eyes, ears, and so forth, that are taken to be the objects of use of a self-sufficient substantially existent self.c What is observed is the suffering included within the Desire Realm, specifically the contaminated aggregates, and within this you can also say that it is observing “I” and “mine.” There is a conception of “I” as being substantially existent, and there is a conception of objects of “mine” as being objects of use of a substantially existent I. The object of observation of the artificial conception of I as being substantially existent is the “I,” and it is a suffering. The objects of observation of the artificial conception of the contaminated aggregates as real “mine” are the contaminated aggregates, mind and body themselves, and they are sufferings. This is the meaning of the word “suffering” here.

The difference between these forbearances has to do with what is observed. With regard to the other truths, when we speak of “sources with

---

a ’dod pa’i lam bden la dmigs pa’i mthong spang mi nus pa med pa spang bzod pa dang lam bden gyi steng gi bdag med pa mngon sum du rtogs pa’i bzod pa yin pas na lam chos bzod.

b khams gong ma’i sdu gbsngal la dmigs pa’i bdag ’dzin la sogs pa spang bya kun bzod pa dang khams gong ma’i steng gi bdag med pa mngon sum du rtogs pa bzod pa yin pas na sdu gbsngal rjes bzod.

c zag bcas nyer len gyi phung po la dmigs nas rang rkya thub pa’i rdzas yod kyi bdag gi longs spyod bya, zag bcas nyer len gyi phung po, mig dang rna ba la sogs pa.
regard to the Desire Realm” (’dod pa’i kun ’byung) there are the actions that impel one into rebirth within the Desire Realm in whatever form it will be, human, demi-god, hungry ghost, animal, or whatever. And there are also the afflictions that motivate those actions. Those are all sources, or origins, included within the Desire Realm. Because one has a facility, or forbearance, with regard to the selflessness of these sources of suffering of the Desire Realm, it is called a doctrinal forbearance with regard to Desire Realm sources.a

What is a selflessness of, or with, a Desire Realm source, that is to say, a source that impels one into rebirth within the Desire Realm? We have already identified that source as actions that do so and the afflictions that motivate those actions. Their selflessness is their not being objects of use of a substantially existent person.b

The next is a doctrinal forbearance with regard to cessation. This is a Desire Realm cessation. Cessation is indeed to be actualized, but cessation is not to be actualized by a substantially existent person. Therefore, the doctrinal forbearance with regard to cessations is a facility with regard to directly realizing that the cessation that is the abandonment of the artificial view of the transitory collection is not actualized by a substantially existent person.

Regarding the doctrinal forbearance with regard to true paths, the path is to be cultivated. It is the uninterrupted path that draws forth the true cessation, and that path is to be cultivated, for this is the path that overcomes the artificial view of the transitory as real I and mine within the Desire Realm. However, it is not to be cultivated by a substantially existent person, and here one has attained facility with regard to directly realizing this.

That completes the first four, the doctrinal forbearances. Now to enumerate the latter four, the subsequent forbearances: These four are directed towards the upper realms, the Form and Formless Realms. The first is a subsequent forbearance with regard to the suffering of the upper realms, with the term “subsequent” indicating that it has come after the realization with regard to the Desire Realm. In the Form and Formless Realms, there are aggregates, and so there is an artificial conception of self that observes the aggregates of the upper realms as being established as self. For instance, in the First Concentration, one could be taking as one’s object of observation one’s own mind that is in one-pointed meditative stabilization

---

a ’dod pa’i kun ’byung bden pa’i steng gi chos nyid mngon sum du rtogs pa la bzod pa yin pas na kun ’byung chos bzod.
b zag bcas kyi las de rang rky a thub pa’i rdzas yod kyi bdag gi longs spyod byar du ma sgrub pa de.
and on the basis of this have an artificial conception of a substantially existent I and mine. The subsequent forbearance with regard to the suffering of the upper realms then is a direct realization of the selflessness of the mental and physical aggregates of the upper realms. Because this has facility with, or forbearance, with regard to directly realizing that selflessness, it is called a subsequent forbearance with regard to suffering. What is suffering here? It is the aggregates of the higher realms. There is no suffering of pain, but there is the suffering of change and the suffering of pervasive conditioning, of being under the control of contaminated actions and afflictions.

Then the next subsequent forbearance is with regard to the sources of the two upper realms. The sources here are the actions and afflictions that impel rebirth in the upper realms. Because one has attained facility, or forbearance, with respect to directly realizing the selflessness of these sources of the upper realms, this is called a subsequent forbearance with respect to sources.

Next we have the subsequent forbearance with regard to the cessations; that is cessation with regard to the upper realms, meaning the cessation of the artificial view of the transitory as real I and mine observing the aggregates of the upper realms. One here has facility, or forbearance, with regard to directly realizing the selflessness of such cessations, or in another way, has facility with regard to directly realizing that such cessations are not to be actualized by a substantially existent person.

Then there are paths for attaining these cessations. Thus the next subsequent forbearance is that of the paths with regard to the upper realms; it is a facility, or forbearance, with regard to directly realizing the selflessness of these paths. Or, phrased another way, it is a facility with regard to directly realizing that such paths are not to be cultivated by a substantially existent person.

In the Great Exposition system, each of these eight is an uninterrupted path, and each is followed by a path of release, making eight paths of release, the eight knowledges. The names are very similar: doctrinal knowledge of suffering, doctrinal knowledge of sources, doctrinal knowledge of cessation, and doctrinal knowledge of paths; subsequent knowledge of suffering, subsequent knowledge of sources, subsequent knowledge of cessation, and subsequent knowledge of paths. They are called doctrinal “knowledge” because one is knowing the selflessness of the person directly and completely, but here it is with the qualification that the objects of abandonment by the path of seeing have been abandoned.

\[a\] sug bsgal chos shes, kun 'byung chos shes, 'gog pa chos shes, lam chos shes; sug bsgal rjes shes, kun 'byung rjes shes, 'gog pa rjes shes, lam rjes shes.
The object of observation of the path of release is the same as that of the uninterrupted path. Each uninterrupted path is immediately followed by the path of release it induces. This is then followed by the next uninterrupted path, which induces its respective path of release. All sixteen are one session of meditative equipoise.

According to the Great Exposition School, the first fifteen moments occur on the path of seeing, and with the sixteen one passes to the path of meditation. With the sixteenth moment, one attains the level of Abider in the Fruit of Stream Enterer.
Appendix 2:
Lo-sel-ling College on the Modes of Progress on the Hearer Path of Meditation

There\textsuperscript{a} are in general nine sets of objects to be abandoned by the path of meditation with regard to each of the nine realms of cyclic existence—the Desire Realm, the Four Concentrations that comprise the Form Realm, and the Four Formless Absorptions that comprise the Formless Realm. Thus in total there are 81 objects of abandonment. Within the sets of nine, objects of abandonment are abandoned in a sequence from the most coarse to the most subtle, with each group of nine in three sets of big, medium, and small, each of which is further divided into big, medium, and small. The “big” are easier to abandon than the “small.”

\textit{Objects Abandoned by the Path of Meditation}

\begin{verbatim}
formless realm
    peak of cyclic existence 73-81
    nothingness 64-72
    limitless consciousness 55-63
    limitless space 46-54

form realm
    fourth concentration 37-45
    third concentration 28-36
    second concentration 19-27
    first concentration 10-18

desire realm
    small 9
        small medium 8
        small big 7
    medium 6
        small medium 5
        small big 4
    big 3
        small medium 2
        small big 1
\end{verbatim}

\textsuperscript{a} Continuing Dan-ma-lo-chō’s explanation of this specialized topic.
Go-mang College, whose position is represented by the text of Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po, makes a presentation of those who proceed in a gradual manner to abandon those 81 one by one, in order from 1-81 on the above chart (spang bya rim gyis ba), and those who proceed in a simultaneous manner (spang bya gcig car ba), where the 81 are abandoned in 9 cycles of abandonment. In this “simultaneous” manner, the big of the big afflictions regarding all 9 realms are abandoned at one time, then the medium of the big regarding the nine realms, then the small of the big, and so forth. See Chapter Three, 152-156 where this procedure was set forth.

Dan-ma-lo-chô described an alternative presentation set forth by Lo-sel-ling College that takes into account objects to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation, and hence also references the presentation of the Eight Enterers and Abiders that was briefly discussed in Chapter Two, 76-91. Those who proceed by way of gradual abandonment involve all of the eight levels of Entering and Abiding, whereas those who have simultaneous abandonment involve only the Enterers to and Abiders in Stream Enterer and Foe Destroyer.

Those Approachers or Abiders on the path of meditation who have either actualized or are in the process of actualizing Once Returner or Never Returner are called the gradualists (spang bya rim gyis pa). They are called gradualists because with regard to Desire Realm afflictions, they first begin effort at abandoning the great of the great objects of abandonment by a worldly path of meditation prior to seeking to abandon the great of the great of the objects of abandonment by a supramundane path of meditation.

“Worldly path of meditation” basically means meditation not focused on emptiness. This is meditation leading to advanced levels of concentration. The Lo-sel-ling assertion describes as a “gradualist” someone who initially abandons objects to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation and then abandons those to be abandoned by a supramundane path of meditation focused on realization of selflessness.

Except for the peak of cyclic existence, for the other eight levels—from the nothingness level down to the Desire Realm, there are objects of abandonment to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation. However, with regard to the peak of cyclic existence, there are no objects of abandonment to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation. This is because above that level there are no worldly levels. Thus, once there are no levels of cyclic existence above the peak of cyclic existence, there are no afflictions with regard to the peak of cyclic existence that can be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation.
A simultanist (spang bya gcig car ba) is abandoning at one time all of the objects of abandonment by a path of meditation with regard to the three realms in nine cycles of abandonment, all of the big of the big at one time, all of the big of the medium, at one time, and so forth. However, for Lo-sel-ling, this alone is not sufficient to make such a person a simultanist, for even a gradualist will do such abandonment. What makes these persons simultanists is the fact that that they are abandoning simultaneously both the affictions with regard to the Desire Realm that are to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation (’jig rten pa’i sgom spang su gyur pa’i ’dod nyon)—those affictions that must be abandoned in order to attain an actual concentration—and the general affictions with regard to the Desire Realm (spyir stangs ’dod nyon), in other words, those objects of abandonment to be abandoned by a supramundane path of meditation.a

Hence, for Lo-sel-ling this is the key meaning of a simultanist—that along with abandoning the objects to be abandoned by a supramundane path of meditation, they are simultaneously abandoning those to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation. The simultaneous person is performing both the worldly and the supramundane abandonments at the same time. The objects of abandonment by a worldly path of meditation are abandoned through the force of that general abandonment without making specific effort at abandoning them. Since these have not been abandoned previously, these persons are called those who proceed by way of simultaneous objects of abandonment.

Because they are working on all of these sets of affictions, they are making effort at abandoning even the affictions with regard to the peak of cyclic existence—which are usually to be abandoned by persons who have attained Never Returner and are approaching Foe Destroyer. Thus, such persons become special Approachers to Foe Destroyer right after Stream Enterer. Even though they have not abandoned affictions two through nine in the Desire Realm, they are working on the ones at the peak of cyclic existence; this makes them Approachers to Foe Destroyer right away. Such persons never become Once Returners or Never Returners since the middle two fruits are jumped over; thus, this procedure is also called leap-over (thod rgal). In this context, a leap-over practitioner and one who proceeds by way of separating from desire before the path of seeing are the same. For them, only the two middle fruits, Once Returner and Never Returner, are set forth. The first and last fruits, Stream Enterer and Foe Destroyer, do not apply.

---

a Dan-ma-lo-chö explained that spyir stangs sgom spang and ’jig rten las ’das pa’i sgom spang are the same.
If someone is a Once Returner or Never Returner who has separated from desire beforehand, it means that before the path of seeing, this person, if a Never Returner, has become free from desire with regard to the afflictions of the Desire Realm (*dod pa'i nyon mongs*), for although these have not been eradicated, they have been suppressed in the sense that such afflictions as anger, desire, pride, and so forth will not occur in manifest form as they do for ordinary persons like ourselves.

There is, however, a possibility for mistake because the Great Exposition system uses the term “abandon” (*spang*) for “becoming free from desire” (*chags bral byed pa*)—that is, they actually assert that those have been abandoned. However, the higher tenet systems that follow Asanga’s *Summary of Manifest Knowledge* assert that all that has happened is that one has become “free from desire,” not that these have been “abandoned,” for, in order for them to have been abandoned, their seeds must be abandoned, and this does not happen before the path of meditation. Hence, for the higher tenet systems, these practitioners are only free from attachment to the attributes of the desire realm. Further, just as some mistake the vocabulary and carry the assertion of the lower system over to the higher tenet systems, others make the mistake the other way around and carry the higher system’s explanation over to the lower, saying that for the Great Exposition School there is only freedom from desire and not abandonment. This too is a mistake because the Great Exposition School’s assertion is that these are abandoned, not just suppressed.

Simultanists (*spang bya gcig car ba*) are either Abiders in the Fruit of Stream Enterer who are directly seeking to actualize the fruit of a Foe Destroyer without ever actualizing the fruit of a Once returner or Never Returner, or they are Abiders in the Fruit of Foe Destroyer who have actualized that fruit without ever becoming Once Returners or Never Returners. Such persons simultaneously abandon the big of the big afflictions with regard to the Desire Realm that are to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation and the big of the big afflictions with regard to the Desire Realm that are to be abandoned by the general path of meditation [that is, by a supramundane path of meditation]. Because they abandon both of

---

*a* Lo-sang-gyal-tshan, oral communication, April 28, 2014, supplied more detail about the meaning in this context of “separating from desire beforehand,” that is, before the path of seeing.
these at the same time, they are called abandonment-simultanists (*spang bya gcig car ba*).

A Foe Destroyer who has proceeded in the simultaneous manner of abandonment is called an Unadorned Foe Destroyer because that Foe Destroyer does not have even the first concentration because of not having previously abandoned objects of abandonment by a worldly path of meditation.\(^1\)

Lo-sang-gyal-tshan: In general, For Destroyers have to abandon the afflictions; moreover, there is not just abandonment of the afflictions but also abandonment of the obstructions to meditative stabilization (*snyoms 'jug gi sgrib pa*), and those who have also abandoned those are called Adorned (*rgyan bcas*) Foe Destroyers. There are three types of obstructions: afflicting obstructions (*nyon sgrib*), obstructions to omniscience (*shes sgrib*), and obstructions to meditative stabilization (*snyoms 'jug gi sgrib pa*). A Foe Destroyer primarily needs to have abandoned the afflicting obstructions, and some just work to do this; at the end when they have attained the fruit of Foe Destroyer, they have done what they needed to, which was to abandon the afflicting obstructions, and so they are called “Unadorned Foe Destroyers.” Others do not just do this, but along the way accomplish other tasks due to which the person gets to be named “adorned.” Just as by having a body, and so forth, one is a human but to this one can add ornaments and so forth, so the extra facets that Adorned (*rgyan bcas*) Foe Destroyers accomplish are described under two main terms, meditation alternating concentration (*bsam gtan spel sgom*) and absorption of cessation (*'gog pa'i snyoms 'jug*). Unadorned Foe Destroyers have not engaged in these additional activities and thus have not attained the absorption of cessation, for instance, and there is no necessity that a Foe Destroyer have done such, just as people do not have to wear adornments.

These terms are used the same way in both the Vasubandhu’s *Treasury of Manifest Knowledge* and Asanga’s *Summary of Manifest Knowledge*. Regarding the absorption of cessation, some first attain it and then attain Foe Destroyer, but others first attain Foe Destroyer and then attain meditative absorption of cessation. Hence, in order to attain

\(^1\) Lo-sang-gyal-tshan supplied further interesting detail about the term “unadorned Foe Destroyer, oral communication, April 28, 2014.
an absorption of cessation one does not have to have abandoned all afflictions. In order to attain an absorption of cessation one can attain the first concentration and then go on up through all the others to an actual absorption of the peak of cyclic existence (srid rtse dngos gzhi). At this point one could, if one wanted, attain Never Returner, but one doesn’t have to.

In alternating meditation (spel sgom), meditative absorption on uncontaminated paths and on contaminated paths is alternated. By performing this very quickly, they achieve alternating meditation such that they get rid of the obstructions to meditative absorption. The contaminated here are wanted factors; thus, these would not include the conception of self (btag ’dzin), for instance. This topic of Adorned and Unadorned is discussed during the study of (1) Concentrative and Formless Absorptions (bsam gzugs), (2) the Twentyfold Sangha (dge ’dun nyi shu), and (3) Vasubandhu’s Treasury of Manifest Knowledge.

A simultanist Foe Destroyer would most likely be an Unadorned Foe Destroyer because such is determined by way of way of faculties, and the simultanist is of sharper faculties and so would be unadorned right when becoming a Foe Destroyer. However, having attained Foe Destroyerhood as unadorned, it would then be possible to become adorned. Being of sharp faculties, they could enter into various meditative absorptions and all the rest. They would not have these before becoming a Foe Destroyer because they had not attained a meditative absorption of cessation, which requires having attained the level of the peak of cyclic existence, and would not have alternating meditation because an actual fourth concentration is needed for these, and simultanist Foe Destroyers have not previously attained an actual fourth concentration. However, being of sharp faculties and having attained the status of Foe Destroyer, they could easily accomplish all of these.

In general, a person who is proceeding serially is an Approacher to Stream Enterer when on the fifteen periods of the path of seeing and is an Abider in the Fruit of Stream Enterer in the sixteenth moment of subsequent knowledge of paths. However, if prior to the path of seeing that person has abandoned afflictions one through six, these six being objects of abandonment by a worldly path of meditation, then instead of being an Approacher to a Stream Enterer, this person would be an Approacher to Once Returner and in the sixteenth moment would become an Abider in the Fruit of Once Returner.
In order to be an Approacher to Once Returner while on the path of seeing, one has to have abandoned all six of the first six afflictions prior to the path of seeing. If one has only abandoned one or any number up to five, one is still only an Approacher to Stream Enterer.

If one has abandoned afflictions one through nine, actually attaining the first concentration prior to attaining the path of seeing, then when on the path of seeing, one is an Approacher to Never Returner and when attaining subsequent knowledge of paths becomes an Abider in the Fruit of Never Returner. This is because one has been able to suppress all the afflictions to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation with regard to the Desire Realm. However, this is only within the worldly path of meditation. All of the objects of abandonment of a supramundane path of meditation are yet to be abandoned.

To summarize, one becomes an Approacher to Once Returner when one is working on getting rid of the first six afflictions. Upon abandoning them, one becomes a Once Returner because of having Desire Realm afflictions seven through nine left. If one has abandoned all six afflictions before the path of seeing, one becomes an Approacher to Once Returner; if one abandons all nine, one becomes an Approacher to Never Returner.a

It is possible to have abandoned the objects to be abandoned by a path of meditation with regard to nothingness (ci yang med) but not to have abandoned that which is to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation with regard to nothingness. The reason for this is that a gradualist could have abandoned the first six to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation; then when that person abandons all nine of the medium of the large, those are all gone, but when that person returns to abandoning those afflictions to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation, that person is only at number seven of those. So the numbers do not necessarily match up.

Query: Does a gradualist have to abandon all of the objects of abandonment by a worldly path of meditation and then abandon those to be abandoned by a supramundane path?

---
a When that person manifests the Fruit of Abider in Never Returner is when that person has abandoned those objects to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation. It can be on the occasion of the small of the small paths of meditation. It can be on the occasion of the path of seeing. It can even be before the path of seeing if that person is one who is proceeding in the manner of having previously become free from desire (chags bral sngon song). But for those other than those have become free from desire previously, it must be that they have abandoned the nine afflictions to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation, even if it is before the path of meditation.

b ci yang med gyi sgom spang spang nas ci yang med gyi ’jig rten pa’i sgom spang ma spong pa’i skabs yong gi yod pa red.
Response: There is no certainty as to when this person will begin abandoning the objects of abandonment by a path of meditation in general. A gradualist abandons the afflictions to be abandoned by a worldly path of meditation starting at various points. It can be at the point of middling path of meditation that they are abandoned, and there are some who begin at the point of the great, and there are those who in subsequent attainment attain the fruit of Never Returner, whereas there are others who achieve Never Returner at the point of the path of release.

When we say “worldly path,” we are not speaking of “worldly” in the sense of a contaminated non-Buddhist path. If, on the occasion of subsequent attainment of the path of meditation, one attains the fruit of Once Returner or Never Returner, it is called a worldly path, and this worldly path is contaminated. If, however, on the occasion of the path of release one attains the fruit of Once Returner or Never Returner, one is said to have attained this in dependence on a supramundane path.

These fruits of Once Returner and Never Returner sometimes are attained on the occasion of subsequent attainment and sometimes are attained on the occasion of the path of release. There is no definiteness as to which it will be.

Query: How is it attained? For instance, how are the fruits of Once Returner and Never Returner attained on the occasion of the path of release? It is not contaminated.

Answer: If the fruits of Once Returner and Never Returner are attained on the occasion of the path of release, that is to say, if these are attained by means of a non-contaminated path—then for example, in terms of the medium of the small, if, on the occasion of the middling of the small path of meditation, one abandons that to be abandoned by the path of meditation, then all of the middling of the great are abandoned.

Now, if all of the three cycles of the big and the three cycles of the middling are abandoned, then one has attained the fruit of Never Returner.

---

\[a\] *jig rten pa'i lam zer dus 'di phyi rol pa'i zag bcas kyi rnam pa can gyi 'jig rten pa 'di na red. rjes thob kyi gnas skabs su phyir 'ong dang phyir mi 'ong 'bras bu thob na 'jig rten pa'i lam zer gyi red. rjes thob kyi gnas skabs su phyir 'ong gi 'bras bu dang phyir mi 'ong gi 'bras bu thob na, 'jig rten las 'das pa'i lam la brien nas thob pa zer gyi red.

\[b\] *rnam grol lam gyi gnas skabs su thob pa yin na, zag bcas med pa lam gyi thob pa yin na, dper na sgom lam chung ngu 'bring la shyar na, sgom lam chung ngu 'bring gyi gnas skabs su sgom spang byed na chen po'i 'bring spang gi yod pa red pa.

\[c\] *da 'jig rten pa'i sgom spang nyon mongs chen po'i skor gsun dang 'bring skor sum sgang ga spang song na, phyir mi 'ong gi 'bras bu thob kyi yod pa red.
Abbreviations


“1999 TBRC bla brang” = sa lam gyi rnam bzhag theg gsum mdzes rgyan. 1a-20a. In 'jam dbyangs bzhad pa dkon mchog 'jigs med dbang po'i gsung 'bum, vol. 17. TBRC W2122.7: 421-463, which is a PDF of: bla brang bkra shis 'khyil: bla brang brka shis 'khyil dgon, printed in 1999.

“co ne” = co ne bstan 'gyur. TBRC W1GS66030. co ne dgon chen: co ne, 1926.


“TBRC” = Tibetan Buddhist Resource Center (http://www.tbrc.org).
Bibliography of Works Cited

Sūtras are listed alphabetically by English title in the first section; the terms “glorious” and “supreme” at the beginning of titles are often dropped in the Bibliography. Indian and Tibetan treatises are listed alphabetically by author in the second section; other works are listed alphabetically by author in the third section. Works mentioned in the first or second sections are not repeated in the third section.

1. SŪTRAS

Eight Thousand Stanza Perfection of Wisdom Sūtra

śatasahasrikāprajñāpāramitā

shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa brgyad stong pa

Peking 734, vol. 21; TBRC W22084


One Hundred Thousand Stanza Perfection of Wisdom Sūtra

śatasahasrikāprajñāpaṇītā

shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa stong phrag brgya pa

Peking 730, vols.12-18; Tohoku 8, vols. ka-a (‘bum); TBRC W22084


Sūtra on the Ten Grounds

dasabhūmikasūtra

mdo sde sa bcu pa


Peking 761.31, vol. 25


Twenty-five Thousand Stanza Perfection of Wisdom Sūtra

pañcaviṃśatisahasrikāprajñāpāramitā

shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa stong phrag nyi shu lnga pa

Peking 731, vol. 19; TBRC W22084


White Lotus of Excellent Doctrine Sūtra

Saddharmapundarika

dam pa’i chos pad ma dkar po zhes bya ba theg pa chen po'i rodo

2. OTHER Sanskrit AND TIBETAN WORKS

Asaṅga (thogs med, fourth century)
Summary of Manifest Knowledge
abhidharmasamuccaya
chos mngon pa kun btus
Peking 5550, vol. 112

Atisha (dīpaṃkaraśārimhaṇa, mar me mdzad ye shes, 982-1054)
Lamp for the Path to Enlightenment
bodhipathapradīpa
byang chub lam gyi sgron ma
Peking 5343, vol. 103; sde dge 3947, vol. khī

Chandrakīrti (zla ba grags pa, seventh century)
Supplement to (Nāgārjuna’s) “Treatise on the Middle”
madhyaṃkāvatārā
dbu ma la ’jug pa
Peking 5261, Peking 5262, vol. 98; sde dge 3861, sde dge 3862, vol. ‘a

Dharmakīrti (chos kyi grags pa, seventh century)
Commentary on (Dignāga’s) “Compilation of Prime Cognition”
pramāṇavārttikakārikā
tshad ma rnam ’grel gyi tshig le’ur byas pa

Haribhadra (seng ge bzang po, late eighth century)
Clear Meaning Commentary / Commentary on (Maitreya’s) “Treatise of Quintessential Instructions on the Perfection of Wisdom: Ornament for the Clear Realizations”
spuṭhārtha / abhisamayālāṃkārānāmaprajñāpāramitopadeśaśāstravṛtti
’grel pa’i don gsal / shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa’i man ngag gi bstan bcos mngon par rtogs pa’i rgyan ces bya ba’i ’grel pa

Sanskrit editions:


*Explanation of the “Eight Thousand Stanza Perfection of Wisdom Sūtra”: Illumination of (Maitreyanātha’s) “Ornament for the Clear Realizations” asṭasāhasrikāprajñāpāramitāvyākhyānābhisamayālāṃkārāloka shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa bryad stong pa’i bshad pa mngon par rtogs pa’i rgyan gyi snang ba*

In *bstan ’gyur* (sde dge). TBRC W23703.85: 4-683, which is a PDF of: Delhi, India: Karmapaе chodchey, Gyalwae sungrab partun khang, 1982-1985. Also: sde dge 3791: vol. 85.

*Eloquent Presentation of the Eight Categories and Seventy Topics: Sacred Word of Guru Ajita dngos po bryad don bdun cu’i nam bzhag legs par bshad pa mi pham bla ma’i zhal lung*…

Tibetan editions: *bla brang* edition:

“2011 TBRC bla brang” = In kun mkhyen ’jam dbyangs bzhad pa’i rdo rje mchog gi gsung ’bun, vol. 14. TBRC W22186.14: 115-178, which is a PDF of: bla brang bka’ shis ’khyil: bla brang brka’ shis ’khyil dgon, publishing date unknown. [Preferred edition since it has not been retouched.]


“1999 Tōyō Bunko CD-ROM” = “Tibetan texts of don bdun bcu’o’jam dbyangs bzhad pa and rigs lam ’phrul gyi lde mig of dkon mchog bstan pa’i sgron me.” In the Toyo Bunko Database CD Release II. Tokyo, Japan: Tōyō Bunko, 1999. CD-ROM. [This edition is based on the 1999 Mundgod.]


Go-mang Lhasa edition:


Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po (dkon mchog ’jigs med dbang po, 1728-1791)

Precious Garland of Tenets / Presentation of Tenets: A Precious Garland
grub pa’i mtha’i rnam par bzhag pa rin po che’i phreng ba


Presentation of the Grounds and Paths: Beautiful Ornament of the Three Vehicles
sa lam gyi rnam bzhag theg gsun mdzes rgyan


Thorough Expression of the Natures of the One Hundred Seventy-Three Aspects of the Three Exalted Knowers: White Lotus Vine of Eloquence
mkhyen gsun gyi rnam pa brgya dang don gsun gyi rang bzhin yang dag par brjod pa legs bshad padma dkar po’i khrì shing

Tibetan editions:
In gsung ’bum/ dkon mchog ’jigs med dbang po (bla brang par ma). TBRC W2122.6: 627-646, which is a PDF of: bla brang bkra shis ’khyil, Tibet: bla brang dgon pa, 1999.
Maitreya (byams pa)

Ornament for the Clear Realizations

abhisamayālaṃkāra/ abhisamayālaṃkāra-nāma-prajñāpāramitopadeśāstra-sastra-kārikā

mngon pa rtogs pa'i rgyan/ shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa'i man ngag gi bstan bcos mngon par rtogs pa'i rgyan shes bya ba'i tshig le'ur byas pa

Sanskrit editions:


Tibetan editions:


cn: TBRC W1GS66030:80: 5-30, which is a PDF of: Co ne dgon chen: co ne, 1926.


snar thang: TBRC W22704:89: 5-30, which is a PDF of: Narthang: s. n., 1800?.

dse dge: TBRC W23703:80:3-28, which is a PDF of: Delhi: Karmapae Choedhey, Gyalwae sungrab partun khang, 1982-1985.

English translations:


Ornament for the Great Vehicle Sūtras

mahāyānasūtrālaṃkāra

theg pa chen po'i mdo sde rgyan gyi tshig le'ur byas pa

Peking 5521, vol. 108; Dharma vol. 77


Nāgārjuna (*klu sgrub, first to second century, C.E.)*

*The Commentary of Manners Called the Tree of Wisdom*

prajñādaṇḍa

lugs kyi bstan bcos shes rab sdong bu


Nāgārjuna (*klu sgrub, first to second century, C.E.)*

The Commentary of Manners Called the Tree of Wisdom

prajñādaṇḍa

lugs kyi bstan bcos shes rab sdong bu


Ngag-wang-pal-dan (*ngag dbang dpal ldan, b. 1797*), also known as Pal-dan-chö-jay (*dpal ldan chos rje*)

*Explanation of (Maitreya’s) Treatise “Ornament for the Clear Realizations” from the Approach of the Meaning of the Words: Sacred Word of Maitreyanātha*

bstan bcos mgon par rtogs pa’i rgyan tshig don gyi sgo nas bshad pa byams mgon zhal lung

TBRC W5926-3:221-416, which is a PDF of: Delhi: Mongolian Lama Gurudeva, 1983.

Tsong-kha-pa Lo-sang-drag-pa (*tsong kha pa blo bzang grags pa, 1357-1419*)

*Extensive Explanation of (Chandrakīrti’s) “Supplement to (Nāgārjuna’s) ‘Treatise on the Middle’”: Illumination of the Thought*

dbu ma la ’jug pa’i rgya cher bshad pa dgongs pa rab gsal


Ithaca, N.Y.: Snow Lion Publications, 1980; the portion of the book that is Tsong-kha-pa’s *Illumination of the Thought* (chapters 1-5) is downloadable at: http://uma-tibet.org/edu/Go-mang/dbu_ma/middle.php.


Four Interwoven Annotations on (Tsong-kha-pa’s) “Great Exposition of the Stages of the Path” / The Lam rim chen mo of the incomparable Tsong-kha-pa, with the interleaver notes of Ba-so Chos-kyi-rgyal-mtshan, Sde-drug Mchod-chen Ngag-dbang-rab-rtan, ‘Jam-dbyangs-bslad-pa’i-rdo-rje, and Bra-sti Dge-bshes Rin-chen-don-grub

lam rim mchan bzhi sbrags ma/ myam med rje btsun tsong kha pa chen pos mdzad pa’i byang chub lam rim chen mo’i dka’ ba’i gnad rmons mchan bu bzhi’i sgo nas legs par bshad pa theg chen lam gyi gsal sgron

New Delhi: Chos-phel-legs-ladan, 1972

In lam rim mchan bzhi sbrags ma (bla brang bkra shis ’khyil par ma), TBRC W29037.1:3-978

(PDF of bla brang bkra shis ’khyil edition printed from the 1807 bla brang bkra shis ’khyil blocks in 19997).


legs bshad gser ’phreng / shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa’i man ngag gi bstan bcos mgon par rtogs pa’i rgyan ‘grel pa dang bcas pa’i rgya cher bshad pa legs bshad gser gyi phreng ba

Tibetan editions:


TBRC W22109.3219, which is a PDF of: gedan sungrab minyam gyunphel series (Ngawang Gelek Demo), 1977.

Great Exposition of the Stages of the Path / Stages of the Path to Enlightenment Thoroughly Teaching All the Stages of Practice of the Three Types of Beings
lam rim chen mo / skyes bu gsum gyi nyams su blang ba’i rim pa thams cad tshang bar ston pa’i byang chub lam gyi rim pa


3. OTHER WORKS


Sopa, Geshe Lhundup, and Jeffrey Hopkins. Cutting through Appearances: The Practice and Theory
Elizabeth Napper is Co-Director of the Tibetan Nuns Project, a post she has held for twenty-four years, working to develop opportunities within the Tibetan Buddhist tradition for nuns to receive access to the full education of their various traditions. The first group of nuns to complete the studies and take the required tests for the Geshe degree will be receiving that degree in 2016.

She received a B.A. from University of Wisconsin in Indian Studies in 1971 and a Ph.D. in Tibetan Buddhist Studies in 1985 from the University of Virginia, where she also earned an M.A. and taught for two years as a lecturer. She also taught at Stanford University and at the University of Hawaii.

Her published works include *Mind in Tibetan Buddhism* and *Dependent-Arising and Emptiness*. She was co-editor of *Kindness, Clarity, and Insight* by His Holiness the Dalai Lama and co-author of *Fluent Tibetan*. In 2003 she was a recipient of the “Unsung Heroes of Compassion” award given by Tenzin Gyatso, the Fourteenth Dalai Lama of Tibet, and in 1981-82 received a Fulbright-Hays Doctoral Dissertation Research Grant.
This book is a translation of Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s *Presentation of the Grounds and Paths: Beautiful Ornament of the Three Vehicles*. It is a textbook studied in the Gomang College of Drepung Monastery during the first year of the six-year course of study of the topic of the Perfection of Wisdom, which is based upon Maitreya’s *Ornament for the Clear Realizations*. It serves to introduce students to the core vocabulary and systematic layout of the path structure that is the subject of Maitreya’s text.

This translation of Kön-chog-jig-may-wang-po’s text is enhanced by supplementary commentary, providing extensive contextual explanation, given by the late Dan-ma-lo-chö Rinpoche while teaching at the University of Virginia. Also added for further understanding are explanations and clarifications of difficult points by Lo-sang-gyal-tshan Rinpoche, Abbot of Gomang College.